

# Cofnod y Trafodion

## The Record of Proceedings

### 20/05/2015

Cynnwys Contents

[1. Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol](#)

[1. Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services](#)

[2. Cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol](#)

[2. Questions to the Counsel General](#)

[3. Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad](#)

[3. Questions to the Assembly Commission](#)

[4. Dadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg ar yr Ymchwiliad i Ganlyniadau Addysgol Plant o Gartrefi Incwm Isel](#)

[4. Debate on the Children, Young People and Education Committee's Report on its Inquiry into Educational Outcomes for Children from Low-income Households](#)

[5. Dadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar Helpu Pobl Ifanc i Gael Gwaith](#)

[5. Debate on the Enterprise and Business Committee's Report on Assisting Young People into Work](#)

[6. Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Mynediad at Gyllid ar gyfer Busnesau](#)

[6. Welsh Conservatives Debate: Business Access to Finance](#)

[7. Cyfnod Pleidleisio](#)

[7. Voting Time](#)

[8. Dadl Fer: Ysgogi'r Economi yng Ngorllewin Cymru](#)

[8. Short Debate: Stimulating the Economy in West Wales](#)

*Cyfarfu'r Cynulliad am 13:30 gyda'r Llywydd (y Fonesig Rosemary Butler) yn y Gadair.*

*The Assembly met at 13:30 with the Presiding Officer (Dame Rosemary Butler) in the Chair.*

13:30 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Good afternoon. The National Assembly for Wales is now in session.

Prynhawn da. Mae Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru yn awr yn eistedd.

## 1. Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol

The first item this afternoon is questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services, and question 1 is from Gwenda Thomas.

### Practisiau Meddygon Teulu

13:30 **Gwenda Thomas** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

*1. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am weinyddu practisiau meddygon teulu sy'n croesi ffiniau byrddau iechyd lleol? OAQ(4)0586(HSS)*

## 1. Questions to the Minister for Health and Social Services

### Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer

Cwestiynau i'r Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol yw'r eitem gyntaf y prynhawn yma, a daw cwestiwn 1 gan Gwenda Thomas.

### General Medical Practitioners' Practices

13:30 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

*Y Gweinidog Iechyd a Gwasanaethau Cymdeithasol / The Minister for Health and Social Services*

Patients flow across administrative boundaries every day in Wales and local health boards have to work collaboratively to respond effectively to their needs.

Mae cleifion yn croesi ffiniau gweinyddol bob dydd yng Nghymru ac mae'n rhaid i fyrddau iechyd lleol gydweithio i ymateb yn effeithiol i'w hanghenion.

13:30

**Gwenda Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you, Minister. There is a good example of cross-local health boundaries co-operation in the Amman and Swansea valleys. Hywel Dda and Abertawe Bro Morgannwg university health boards have awarded the contract to provide GP services for various communities in both valleys to the Amman Tawe Partnership. This partnership will, from Monday 1 June, be responsible for the healthcare of around 12,000 people. They will be accountable to ABMU health board for 8,000 and Hywel Dda for 4,000. Minister, will you ensure that this collaboration between health boards and general medical practitioners acts as an example of good practice regarding co-operative working across local health board boundaries?

Diolch yn fawr, Weinidog. Ceir enghraifft dda o gydweithredu ar draws ffiniau iechyd lleol yng Nghwm Aman a ChwmTawe. Mae byrddau iechyd prifysgol Hywel Dda ac Abertawe Bro Morgannwg wedi dyfarnu'r contract i ddarparu gwasanaethau meddyg teulu ar gyfer gwahanol gymunedau yn y ddau gwm i Bartneriaeth Aman Tawe. Bydd y bartneriaeth hon, o ddydd Llun 1 Mehefin, yn gyfrifol am ofal iechyd tua 12,000 o bobl. Byddant yn atebol i fwrdd iechyd Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg am 8,000 o bobl ac i Hywel Dda am 4,000 o bobl. Weinidog, a wnewch chi sicrhau bod y cydweithio hwn rhwng byrddau iechyd ac ymarferwyr meddygol cyffredinol yn gweithredu fel enghraifft o arfer da o ran cydweithio ar draws ffiniau byrddau iechyd lleol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:31

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I'm very grateful to Gwenda Thomas for bringing that to the Assembly's attention, because we discussed it here in the past and undoubtedly, the changes to general medical services in that part of Wales has in the past been a matter of concern to local populations. It's extremely good news that we now have a new permanent contract that will serve patients on both sides of the health borders. There will be six different sites, I know, where the practice will operate from, and patients from Hywel Dda or ABMU will be able to attend whichever site they find most advantageous to them. I saw the press release that the two health boards had put out jointly. I was very taken by the quote in there from Dr Duncan Williams, who will be the lead GP in the new practice, when he said that he and his colleagues were delighted and privileged to be able to continue to provide a service to that part of Wales.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn i Gwenda Thomas am ddod â hynny i sylw'r Cynulliad, gan ein bod wedi ei drafod yma yn y gorffennol ac yn ddi-os, mae'r newidiadau i'r gwasanaethau meddygol cyffredinol yn y rhan honno o Gymru wedi bod yn destun pryder i boblogaethau lleol yn y gorffennol. Mae'r ffaith fod gennym gontract parhaol newydd bellach a fydd yn gwasanaethu cleifion ar ddwy ochr y ffiniau iechyd yn newyddion eithriadol o dda. Gwn y bydd y practis yn gweithredu o chwe safle gwahanol, a bydd cleifion o fwrdd iechyd Hywel Dda neu Brifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg yn gallu mynd i ba safle bynnag sydd fwyaf manteisiol iddynt. Gwelais y datganiad i'r wasg a gafodd ei gyflwyno gan y ddau fwrdd iechyd ar y cyd. Fe'm trawyd yn fawr gan y dyfyniad ynddo gan Dr Duncan Williams, a fydd yn gweithio fel y prif feddyg teulu yn y practis newydd, pan ddywedodd ei fod ef a'i gydweithwyr wrth eu bodd a'i bod yn ffrind iddynt allu parhau i ddarparu gwasanaeth i'r rhan honno o Gymru.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:32

**Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I'm pleased that Gwenda Thomas has raised this question. There is clearly an issue and some problems with services across local health board boundaries. Would you agree with me that those problems are magnified when it comes to issues along the England/Wales border? All of us with constituencies along that border are aware of constituent concerns about the compatibility of NHS services. What guidance are you giving to local health boards and to GPs, so that where those cross-border issues come into play, they can be dealt with swiftly and smoothly?

Rwy'n falch fod Gwenda Thomas wedi gofyn y cwestiwn hwn. Mae'n amlwg fod problem ac mae rhai problemau gyda gwasanaethau ar draws ffiniau byrddau iechyd lleol. A fydddech yn cytuno â mi fod y problemau hynny'n cael eu chwyddo wrth ystyried materion ar hyd ffin Cymru/Lloegr? Mae pob un ohonom sydd ag etholaethau ar hyd y ffin yn ymwybodol o bryderon etholwyr am gysondeb gwasanaethau'r GIG. Pa ganllawiau rydych yn eu rhoi i fyrddau iechyd lleol ac i feddygon teulu, fel y gellid trin y materion trawsffiniol hynny, pan fyddant yn codi, yn gyflym ac yn llyfn?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:33

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank Nick Ramsay for that. There is an agreed protocol between the Welsh Government and the Department of Health that deals with cross-border flows between England and Wales. This whole topic was extensively discussed at the Welsh Affairs Committee, which reported on it just before the break for the general election. The truth is, Llywydd, that thousands more patients who live in England receive their primary care from the Welsh NHS than is true in the opposite direction. We know from that inquiry, because they gave evidence to it, how much they value the service that they're provided by the Welsh NHS, and my aim is to try and make sure that, for people on either side of the border, it is their clinical needs that come first rather than any administrative complexities.

Diolch i Nick Ramsay am hynny. Mae protocol y cytunwyd arno rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru a'r Adran Iechyd sy'n ymdrin â'r llif trawsffiniol rhwng Cymru a Lloegr. Cafodd y pwnc hwn yn ei gyfanwydd ei drafod yn helaeth yn y Pwyllgor Materion Cymreig, a gyflwynodd adroddiad yn ei gylich cyn y toriad ar gyfer yr etholiad cyffredinol. Y gwir yw, Lywydd, fod miloedd yn fwy o gleifion sy'n byw yn Lloegr yn cael gofal sylfaenol gan y GIG yng Nghymru na'r ffordd arall rownd. Rydym yn gwybod o'r ymchwiliad hwnnw, am eu bod wedi cyfrannu tystiolaeth iddo, cymaint y maent yn gwerthfawrogi'r gwasanaeth a gânt gan y GIG yng Nghymru, a fy nod yw ceisio gwneud yn siŵr, i bobl ar y naill ochr a'r llall i'r ffin, mai eu hanghenion clinigol sy'n dod yn gyntaf yn hytrach nag unrhyw gymhlethdodau gweinyddol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:34

**Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Yn ogystal â'r arfer da a'r newyddion da sydd wedi dod o ddyffryn Aman, mae her debyg yn ein hwynebu yn y canolbarth gyda sefydlu'r bwrdd ar y cyd, yn gweithio gyda gofal yn y canolbarth, yn seiliedig ar ysbyty Bronglais a thu hwnt. Mae'r gwaith yn bositif ac yn gadarnhaol ac mae'n dda gen i weld bod y bwrdd wedi cychwyn ar hyn. Ond, mae ambell feddygfa wedi arfer â delio mewn ffordd draddodiadol, delio gyda'r naill ysbyty yn hytrach na'r llall, ac ambell un i'r dwyrain, wrth gwrs, yn delio gyda Lloegr. Beth felly fyddwch chi'n gallu ei wneud fel Llywodraeth i gefnogi, os nad ailwampio, ailfeddwl rhai o'r gwasanaethau yma er mwyn sicrhau bod ysbyty Bronglais yn ganolfan i'r math yma o ofal, fel sydd wedi ei freuddwydio amdano, fel petai, yn yr adroddiad?

In addition to the good practice and the good news that has come from the Amman valley, there is a similar challenge facing us in mid Wales with the establishment of the joint board, working on care in mid Wales, based around Bronglais hospital and beyond. The work is positive and I am pleased to see that the board has commenced this work. However, there are a few surgeries that have become used to dealing with things in a traditional manner, such as dealing with one hospital rather than another, and some in the east, of course, deal with hospitals in England. So, what can you as a Government do to support if not the reconfiguration then the rethinking of some of these services to ensure that Bronglais hospital is a centre for this kind of care, as has been envisaged in the report?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:35

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch i Simon Thomas. Mae'r pwynt y mae e'n ei godi yn dod mas o adroddiad yr Athro Marcus Longley, a oedd yn dweud yr un peth, sef bod y dyfodol yn dibynnu ar bobl yn gweithio mewn ffyrdd newydd ac yn gweithio mewn ffyrdd fwy hyblyg nag yn y gorffennol. Rwyf wedi cael adborth yn ôl nawr, ar ôl cyfarfod cyntaf y grŵp newydd. Maen nhw wedi sefydlu nifer o dasgluoedd, ac rwyf fi'n hyderus, achos maen nhw'n arwain ar y pynciau y mae Simon Thomas wedi eu codi, y bydd hi'n bosibl i greu diwylliant newydd yn y dyfodol, ble mae pobl yn gallu ailfeddwl am y ffordd y maen nhw wedi gwneud pethau o'r blaen, a gwneud pethau mewn ffordd fwy effeithiol yn y dyfodol.

May I thank Simon Thomas? The point that he raise stems from Professor Marcus Longley's report, which stated the same thing, namely that the future is dependent on people working in new ways and in more flexible ways than in the past. I have received feedback following the first meeting of the new group. They've established a number of taskforces, and I'm confident, because they are taking the lead on the issues that Simon Thomas has raised, that it will be possible to create a new culture in the future where people will be able to rethink the way in which they were doing things previously, which means that they will be able to do things in a more effective way in the future.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:36

**John Griffiths** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, you've just stated some facts about cross-border flows in terms of healthcare, yet, in the run up to the general election, we saw the Conservatives constantly referring to so-called refugees from Wales seeking healthcare in England. Would you agree with me that this denigration of the quality of national health service services in Wales, and misinformation, needlessly arouses concern and is damaging to both the health service in Wales and its patients?

Weinidog, rydych chi newydd nodi rhai ffeithiau am lif trawsffiniol o ran gofal iechyd, ac eto, yn y cyfnod cyn yr etholiad cyffredinol, gwelsom y Ceidwadwyr yn cyfeirio'n gyson at yr hyn a elwir yn ffoaduriaid o Gymru yn chwilio am ofal iechyd yn Lloegr. A fyddech yn cytuno â mi fod yr athrod hwn ar ansawdd gwasanaethau'r GIG yng Nghymru, a'r camwybodaeth, yn ennyn pryder diangen a'i fod yn niweidiol i'r gwasanaeth iechyd yng Nghymru yn ogystal â'i gleifion?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:36

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Of course, I do agree with John Griffiths on that, and I hope very much, now that the general election is out of the way, that we'll see no repetition of that sort of language, which, as he says, is neither a reflection of the facts. More patients from England are using services in Wales than ever before. We don't regard them as refugees from what's going elsewhere. They come to Wales because that's the right place for them to receive treatment, and we expect Welsh patients who travel in the opposite direction to be treated with equal respect.

Wrth gwrs, rwy'n cytuno â John Griffiths ar hynny, ac rwy'n gobeithio'n fawr iawn, gan fod yr etholiad cyffredinol wedi dod i ben bellach, na fyddwn yn clywed siarad o'r fath yn cael ei ailadrodd, gan nad yw, fel y dywed, yn adlewyrchu'r ffeithiau. Mae mwy o gleifion o Loegr yn defnyddio gwasanaethau yng Nghymru nag erioed o'r blaen. Nid ydym yn eu hystyried yn ffoaduriaid o'r hyn sy'n digwydd mewn manau eraill. Maent yn dod i Gymru oherwydd mai dyma'r lle iawn iddynt gael triniaeth, ac rydym yn disgwyl i gleifion o Gymru sy'n teithio i'r cyfeiriad arall gael eu trin gyda'r un parch.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Ymarferwyr Cyffredinol (Ysbyty Glan Clwyd)**

**General Practitioners (Ysbyty Glan Clwyd)**

13:37

**Ann Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*2. A wnaiff y Gweinidog ddatganiad am wasanaethau ymarferwyr cyffredinol y tu allan i oriau arferol yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd? OAQ(4)0603(HSS)*

*2. Will the Minister make a statement on out-of-hours GP services at Ysbyty Glan Clwyd? OAQ(4)0603(HSS)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:37

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Y Dirprwy Weinidog Iechyd / The Deputy Minister for Health*

Thank you for the question. The out-of-hours service in the Glan Clwyd area operates from new premises based in Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. The service is integrated with the emergency department, and patients can be directed to the most appropriate service for their needs. Over the last two weekends, more than 1,000 calls were responded to by the central area team around Ysbyty Glan Clwyd.

Diolch am y cwestiwn. Mae'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yn ardal Glan Clwyd yn gweithredu o adeiladau newydd yn Ysbyty Glan Clwyd. Mae'r gwasanaeth wedi ei integreiddio â'r adran achosion brys, a gellir cyfeirio cleifion at y gwasanaeth mwyaf priodol ar gyfer eu hanghenion. Dros y ddau benwythnos diwethaf, ymatebodd y tîm ardal canolog o amgylch Ysbyty Glan Clwyd i fwy na 1,000 o alwadau.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:37

**Ann Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you, Deputy Minister, for that. What I want to do is to develop the question I put to the Minister following the report last week, and to ask whether the Welsh Government will now talk to Betsi Cadwaladr management about the use of salaried GPs. Now, this is something I've been talking about, but I do believe that, if we get instances—and they have a brand-new building, and it works well, and I think it's situated in the right place, alongside the A&E—what I don't want to see happening is people going to A&E unnecessarily, and they should be able to use either out-of-office hours or Choose Well. So, if we have a problem with recruitment of GPs to staff the out-of-hours session, is it not time now to sit down and seriously look at salaried GPs who can be employed to do those shifts, for which they cause problems in the out-of-hours service?

Diolch, Ddirprwy Weinidog. Yr hyn rwyf am ei wneud yw datblygu'r cwestiwn a ofynnais i'r Gweinidog yn dilyn yr adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf, a gofyn a fydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn awr yn siarad â rheolwyr Betsi Cadwaladr ynglŷn â'r defnydd o feddygon teulu cyflogedig. Nawr, mae hyn yn rhywbeth rwyf wedi bod yn siarad amdano, ond rwy'n credu, os cawn achosion—ac mae ganddynt adeilad newydd sbon sy'n gweithio'n dda, ac rwy'n credu ei fod wedi cael ei leoli yn y lle cywir, ochr yn ochr â'r Adran Ddamweiniau ac Achosion Brys—yr hyn nad wyf am ei weld yn digwydd yw pobl yn mynd i'r Adran Ddamweiniau ac Achosion Brys yn ddiangen, a dylent allu defnyddio naill ai'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau neu Dewis Doeth. Felly, os oes gennym broblem gyda recriwtio meddygon teulu i staffio'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau, onid yw'n bryd i ni edrych o ddifrif yn awr ar feddygon teulu cyflogedig y gellir eu defnyddio i wneud y sifftiau sy'n achosi problemau yn y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:38

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for the question, and you make an important and a valid point about the future of the out-of-hours service. We expect that part of the standard provision of GP services will be a greater proportion of salaried GPs, and we expect that to be reflected in the out-of-hours service as well. So, it will be not just a part, but an increasing part of the future, and it's also important to recognise this is an out-of-hours service—it is not just an out-of-hours GP service. A number of the people calling will want help, advice and treatment from other practitioners in the broad primary care team. So, as we move forward, I expect the model to change, to have more practitioners available, to properly meet the needs of all of those people in Wales who, quite rightly, expect a form of treatment that is appropriate to their needs.

Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn, ac rydych yn gwneud pwynt pwysig a dilys am ddyfodol y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Rydym yn disgwyl y bydd cyfran uwch o feddygon teulu cyflogedig yn rhan o'r ddarpariaeth sylfaenol o wasanaethau meddygon teulu, ac rydym yn disgwyl i hynny gael ei adlewyrchu yn y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau hefyd. Felly, nid rhan yn unig fydd hwn, ond rhan gynyddol o'r dyfodol, ac mae hefyd yn bwysig cydnabod mai gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yw hwn—nid gwasanaeth meddyg teulu y tu allan i oriau yn unig. Bydd nifer o'r bobl sy'n ffonio eisiau cymorth, cyngor a thriniaeth gan ymarferwyr eraill yn y tîm gofal sylfaenol cyffredinol. Felly, wrth i ni symud ymlaen, rwy'n disgwyl i'r model newid, i sicrhau bod mwy o ymarferwyr ar gael, i gwrdd ag anghenion pawb yng Nghymru sydd, yn gwbl briodol, yn disgwyl y math o driniaeth sy'n addas i'w hanghenion.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:39

**Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Deputy Minister, the report that was eventually published by the health board last week into GP out-of-hours services in north Wales demonstrated that the health board's performance was failing against each and every single Welsh service standard set by the Welsh Government. But, of course, the figures for the other health boards in Wales are not easy to access or routinely published in the public domain. What are you going to do to ensure that there's openness and transparency around the performance of GP out-of-hours services, so that the health boards can be held to account, because, clearly, you're not holding them to account for their failures?

Ddirprwy Weinidog, roedd yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd yn y diwedd gan y bwrdd iechyd yr wythnos diwethaf ar wasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau yng ngogledd Cymru yn dangos bod perfformiad y bwrdd iechyd yn methu ar bob un safon gwasanaeth ar gyfer Cymru a osodwyd gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Ond wrth gwrs, nid yw'n hawdd cael gafael ar y ffigurau ar gyfer y byrddau iechyd eraill yng Nghymru ac nid ydynt yn cael eu cyhoeddi'n rheolaidd ar gyfer y cyhoedd. Beth rydych chi'n mynd i'w wneud i sicrhau bod agwedd agored a thryloywder ynghlwm wrth berfformiad y gwasanaethau meddygon teulu y tu allan i oriau, er mwyn gallu dwyn y byrddau iechyd i gyfrif, oherwydd mae'n amlwg nad ydych yn eu dwyn i gyfrif am eu methiannau?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:39

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, it was quite a reasonable question until the last particular barbed comment. There are serious points about the future of out-of-hour services and the information that is made available to the public. The question asked about the service based at Glan Clwyd, and that report recognised that there are excellent facilities there. Across north Wales, they're trialling, and we expect to roll this out, different ways of working in different parts of the team. I expect each health board to take seriously the direction they've been given by the Welsh Government on meeting the standards of care, to provide a proper out-of-hours service to all of their population. That's what we expect. It's a key part of accessing healthcare to ensure that, as Ann Jones said, people simply don't default to go into the A&E. We need to ensure that out-of-hours plays its part, as do other parts of the healthcare system that we have here in Wales.

Wel, roedd yn gwestiwn digon rhesymol nes y sylw pigog olaf hwnnw. Mae yna bwyntiau difrifol yn codi am ddyfodol y gwasanaethau y tu allan i oriau a'r wybodaeth sydd ar gael i'r cyhoedd. Roedd y cwestiwn yn holi am y gwasanaeth sydd wedi'i leoli yng Nglan Clwyd, ac roedd yr adroddiad yn cydnabod bod cyfleusterau ardderchog yno. Ar draws gogledd Cymru, maent yn treialu ffyrdd gwahanol o weithio mewn gwahanol rannau o'r tîm ac rydym yn disgwyl cyflwyno hyn. Rwy'n disgwyl i bob bwrdd iechyd fod o ddirif ynglŷn â'r canllawiau y maent wedi eu cael gan Lywodraeth Cymru ar fodloni safonau gofal er mwyn darparu gwasanaeth priodol y tu allan i oriau i'w holl bobl. Dyna a ddisgwyliwn. Mae'n rhan allweddol o gael mynediad at ofal iechyd er mwyn sicrhau, fel y dywedodd Ann Jones, nad yw pobl yn mynd yn syth i'r Adran Ddamweiniau ac Achosion Brys heb ystyried unrhyw opsiwn arall. Mae angen i ni sicrhau bod y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yn chwarae ei ran, fel y rhannau eraill o'r system gofal iechyd sydd gennym yma yng Nghymru.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:40

**Aled Roberts** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I read the report last week with concern. I've also read the report that was put before the quality and safety sub-committee of Betsi Cadwaladr health board yesterday. That refers to concerns that were raised in an NHS Wales audit and assurance services review of the out-of-hours service, but I've been unable to find when that review was undertaken. What's of greater concern to me, as a member of the Public Accounts Committee—given that the questions have been raised previously on governance within Betsi Cadwaladr—is, if you look at appendix 4 of the review, it's actually littered with references to work that's been ongoing since 2013, where there's been no improvement: no evidence, no work done, no minutes and reports not completed. I think, Minister, there's need for this Welsh Government to get a much closer monitoring role as far as Betsi Cadwaladr is concerned and formal intervention because, clearly, this position is not acceptable. There is also reference, as far as Wrexham is concerned, to deplorable conditions and also the fact that it's standard practice in Wrexham for people to go to the emergency department and then as soon as they are within the four hours, they're transferred over to out-of-hours. So, my question is: what will you do to ensure that these recommendations, which were placed before this sub-committee yesterday, do not go exactly the same way as every other report within Betsi Cadwaladr over the last two years?

Roeddwn yn bryderus wrth ddarllen yr adroddiad yr wythnos diwethaf. Rwyf hefyd wedi darllen yr adroddiad a gyflwynwyd i is-bwyllgor ansawdd a diogelwch bwrdd iechyd Betsi Cadwaladr ddoe. Mae'n cyfeirio at bryderon a grybwyllwyd mewn adolygiad archwilio a sicrwydd gan GIG Cymru ar y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau, ond ni lwyddais i ddod o hyd i'r dyddiad y cynhaliwyd yr adolygiad hwnnw. Yr hyn sy'n peri mwy o bryder i mi, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyfrifon Cyhoeddus—o ystyried bod y cwestiynau wedi'u gofyn yn flaenorol ar lywodraethu o fewn Betsi Cadwaladr—yw hyn: os edrychwch ar atodiad 4 i'r adolygiad, mae'n frith o gyfeiriadau, mewn gwirionedd, at waith a fu ar y gweill ers 2013, lle na fu unrhyw welliant—dim tystiolaeth, dim gwaith wedi'i wneud, dim cofnodion a dim adroddiadau wedi'u cwblhau. Rwy'n credu, Weinidog, fod angen i Lywodraeth Cymru gael rôl fonitro lawer fwy manwl mewn perthynas â Betsi Cadwaladr yn ogystal ag ymyrraeth ffurfiol oherwydd mae'n amlwg nad yw'r sefyllfa hon yn dderbyniol. Ceir cyfeiriad, mewn perthynas â Wrecsam, at amodau gresynus ynghyd â'r ffaith ei bod yn arfer safonol yn Wrecsam i bobl fynd i'r adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys ac yna cyn gynted â'u bod o fewn y pedair awr, cânt eu trosglwyddo i'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Felly, fy nghwestiwn yw: beth a wnewch i sicrhau na fydd yr argymhellion hyn, a gyflwynwyd i'r is-bwyllgor ddoe, yn dilyn yr un trywydd yn union â phob adroddiad arall o fewn Betsi Cadwaladr dros y ddwy flynedd ddiwethaf?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

13:42

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you for the question at the end. On the report and the response, if you look at what has happened, the health board recognised they had a problem, which is what they should do. They commissioned an independent report; they received that report and now there's an action plan. My expectation is that they will deal properly and sensibly with the issues that have been highlighted in that report and the actions that they've prescribed to improve the service. This is one of the issues that I discuss with every health board in terms of reviewing their performance across a range of issues. It is on the radar of the Welsh Government, and the health board knows perfectly well the challenges they have to face. The point now is whether they will do that and see those services improve.

Diolch am y cwestiwn ar y diwedd. Ar yr adroddiad a'r ymateb, os edrychwch ar yr hyn sydd wedi digwydd, mae'r bwrdd iechyd wedi cydnabod bod ganddynt broblem, sef yr hyn y dylent ei wneud. Comisiynwyd adroddiad annibynnol ganddynt; cyflwynwyd yr adroddiad hwnnw iddynt ac yn awr mae yna gynllun gweithredu yn bodoli. Yr hyn rwy'n ei ddisgwyl yw y byddant yn ymdrin yn briodol ac yn synhwyrol â'r materion a amlygwyd yn yr adroddiad, a'r camau y maent wedi eu pennu i wella'r gwasanaeth. Dyma un o'r materion rwy'n eu trafod â phob bwrdd iechyd o ran adolygu eu perfformiad ar draws ystod o bynciau. Mae ar radar Llywodraeth Cymru, ac mae'r bwrdd iechyd yn gwybod yn iawn am yr heriau sy'n rhaid iddynt eu hwynebu. Y pwynt yn awr yw a ydynt yn mynd i wneud hynny a gweld y gwasanaethau hynny'n gwella.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

13:42

**Sandy Mewies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I understand that Betsi Cadwaladr university health board is piloting an initiative that allows people to go straight to their local pharmacy for repeat prescriptions rather than through the out-of-hours service. Minister, what impact is this having on the out-of-hours service in north Wales and will it then be rolled out across the whole of Wales?

Rwy'n deall bod Bwrdd Iechyd Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr yn treialu menter sy'n galluogi pobl i fynd yn syth i'w fferylfa leol am bresgripsiynau amlroddadwy yn hytrach na mynd drwy'r gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau. Weinidog, pa effaith y mae hyn yn ei gael ar y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yng nogledd Cymru ac a fydd yn cael ei gyflwyno ar draws Cymru gyfan ymhnen amser?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)



**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for the question. This is an important point that we should not lose sight of because, previously, the out-of-hours service had a significant amount of its time, energy and effort taken up in providing repeat prescriptions. We've changed the way of working with the health board in north Wales to trial this, and we've had recent experience back from people working in the out-of-hours service who confirmed that it took out extra capacity that they didn't need to deal with. People can go to a pharmacy now for those repeat prescriptions if they do run out, and it's made the service a much better place for the staff, who described the service in Wrexham as a lovely place in which to work over the Easter weekend, whereas, otherwise, they would normally have expected a significant additional volume that would have made it very difficult for them, and it means that they are providing a better service for their patients. So, we're looking at the evidence, but we do expect to be able to roll out that service across the rest of Wales.

Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Mae hwn yn bwynt pwysig na ddylem golli golwg arno, oherwydd yn flaenorol, roedd cryn dipyn o amser, egni ac ymdrech y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau yn cael eu defnyddio ar ddarparu presgripsiynau amlroddadwy. Rydym wedi newid y ffordd o weithio gyda'r bwrdd iechyd yng ngogledd Cymru i dreialu hyn, ac rydym wedi clywed am brofiadau diweddar y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y gwasanaeth y tu allan i oriau a oedd yn cadarnhau bod hyn yn creu mwy o waith nad oedd angen iddynt ymdrin ag ef. Gall pobl fynd i fferyllfa yn awr i gael y presgripsiynau amlroddadwy hynny os yw eu meddyginiaeth yn dod i ben, ac mae hynny wedi gwneud y gwasanaeth yn lle gwell o lawer i staff, a ddisgrifiodd y gwasanaeth yn Wrecsam fel lle hyfryd i weithio dros benwythnos y Pasg. Fel arall, byddent wedi disgwyl gweld niferoedd ychwanegol sylweddol o bobl a fyddai wedi ei gwneud yn anodd iawn iddynt, ac mae'n golygu eu bod yn darparu gwasanaeth gwell i'w deifion. Felly, rydym yn edrych ar y dystiolaeth, ond rydym yn disgwyl gallu cyflwyno'r gwasanaeth hwn ledled gweddill Cymru.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Cwestiynau Heb Rybudd gan Lefarwyr y Pleidiau****Questions Without Notice from Party Spokespeople****Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

We now move to questions to the party spokespeople and first this afternoon is the Plaid Cymru spokesperson, Elin Jones.

Symudwn yn awr at gwestiynau i lefarwyr y pleidiau ac yn gyntaf y prynhawn yma, llefarydd Plaid Cymru, Elin Jones.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Elin Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Weinidog, beth yw eich dadansoddiad chi o'r nifer o welyau aciwt iechyd meddwl yng Nghymru? A oes digon i gwrdd â'r angen?

Minister, what's your analysis of the number of acute mental health beds in Wales, and is it sufficient to meet the demand?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae digon i gwrdd â'r angen, rwy'n meddwl. Mae mwy o welyau aciwt yma yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr. Nid oes dystiolaeth gennym ni, fel y mae yn Lloegr, o bobl yn teithio'n hir iawn i gael gwelyau. Rydym yn cadw llygad ar bopeth drwy'r amser ond, ar hyn o bryd, rwy'n meddwl fod digon o welyau aciwt gennym ni.

I believe that there is a sufficient number to meet the need. There are more acute beds here in Wales than in England. We have no evidence, as they have in England, of people travelling very long distances to get beds. However, we monitor this very closely, and, at present, I believe that we have a sufficient number of acute beds.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Elin Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae'n rhaid i mi anghytuno â chi ynglŷn â theithio'n hir am wely aciwt iechyd meddwl—nid oes gwely aciwt iechyd meddwl wedi bod rhwng Bangor a Chaerfyrddin ers 2012, pan gaewyd ward Afallon Aberystwyth. Hefyd, mae amcan ffigurau diweddar Cymru a Lloegr—rwy'n derbyn hynny—yn dangos bod tua 20 y cant o gleifion iechyd meddwl brys mewn cell heddlu yn hytrach nag mewn gwely NHS. Nid yw hynny'n awgrymu i fi bod yna leoliadau a lefelau digonol o welyau iechyd meddwl aciwt yng Nghymru. Ac ystyried bod celloedd heddlu yn cael eu defnyddio yng Nghymru, a ydych chi'n dal o'r farn bod y nifer neu lefelau'r gwelyau yn ddigonol?

Well, I must disagree with you on travelling long distances for acute mental health beds—there has been no acute bed between Bangor and Carmarthen since 2012, when the Afallon ward in Aberystwyth was closed. The latest estimate figures for England and Wales—I accept that—show that some 20 per cent of emergency mental health patients are in police cells rather than in NHS beds. That doesn't suggest to me that there are sufficient numbers of beds and placements available for acute mental health patients in Wales. Given that police cells are being used in Wales, are you still of the opinion that the number or the level of beds is adequate?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 13:45 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I'm quite definitely of that view, Llywydd. We don't have the same problems as they do in England in terms of patients accessing acute beds in the mental health sector. Actually, the biggest problem I think we have is that there are parts of the Welsh NHS where we have too many acute mental health beds, where there has been an insufficient investment in alternative services in the community, and where the number of beds that we have in some parts of Wales, compared with the population, is far higher than in any other part of England and Wales. So, there is reform that is needed, but it's not in the direction that the Member suggests.
- Rwy'n eithaf sicr o'r farn honno, Lywydd. Nid oes gennym yr un problemau â Lloegr o ran gwelyau aciwt i gleifion yn y sector iechyd meddwl. Mewn gwirionedd, rwy'n credu mai'r broblem fwyaf sydd gennym yw bod gormod o welyau iechyd meddwl aciwt mewn rhannau o'r GIG yng Nghymru, lle na chafwyd digon o fuddsoddiad mewn gwasanaethau amgen yn y gymuned, a lle y mae nifer y gwelyau sydd gennym mewn rhai rhannau o Gymru o'i gymharu â'r boblogaeth yn llawer uwch na mewn unrhyw ran arall o Gymru a Lloegr. Felly, mae angen diwygio, ond nid yn y modd y mae'r Aelod yn ei awgrymu.
- 13:46 **Elin Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Wel, os ydych o'r farn bod yna ormod o welyau mewn rhai mannau yng Nghymru, ac mae'n amlwg bod yna ddiffyg gwelyau mewn mannau eraill—dim gwely o gwbl rhwng Caerfyrddin a Bangor—yna efallai y byddech chi'n hoffi ystyried lleoli'r gwelyau yna mewn ffordd mwy addas ar gyfer y genedl yn gyfan. Fe fyddwch chi yn ymwybodol bod Theresa May heddiw wedi datgan y bydd hi yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth i wahardd y defnydd o gelloedd heddlu ar gyfer plant a phobl ifanc sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl. Tybed a ydy hi wedi trafod hynny gyda chi, a tybed a ydych chi o'r farn efallai nad yw hynny yn mynd yn ddigon pell, a bod angen nawr inni fod yn cyflwyno deddfwriaeth a fydd yn gwahardd y defnydd o gelloedd heddlu ar gyfer oedolion yn ogystal â phlant a phobl ifanc.
- Well, if you are of the view that there are too many beds in certain parts of Wales, and it's clear that there's a shortage in other parts—with no beds at all between Carmarthen and Bangor—then perhaps you would like to consider allocating those beds in a more appropriate manner for the benefit of the nation as a whole. You will be aware that Theresa May has today announced that she will be bringing forward legislation to ban the use of police cells for children and young people who have mental health problems. I wonder whether she has discussed that with you, and I wonder whether you are of the opinion that that perhaps doesn't go far enough, and that we now need to introduce legislation that will prohibit the use of police cells for adult, as well as for children and young people.
- 13:46 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, let me start by agreeing with what Elin Jones said about the need to make sure that we have the beds in the right place, and if we've got an oversupply in some places, we need to make sure that we have the supply where they are needed. I'm aware of the discussions that have gone on with the Home Office. It's absolutely our position in Wales that we would not want any young person to be held in a police cell where there is a mental health component of that young person's behaviour. We work very closely with police services here in Wales, and the numbers in Wales are very low, but need to be eliminated. It's equally true that we wouldn't want any adult whose behaviour has been affected by a mental health condition to end up in a police cell when they could be held elsewhere. A great deal of work has gone on in Wales, and a great deal of success has been achieved, working between the health service and our police services to reduce those numbers.
- Wel, gadewch i mi ddechrau drwy gytuno â'r hyn a ddywedodd Elin Jones am yr angen i sicrhau bod y gwelyau yn y lle cywir, ac os oes gennym orgyflenwad mewn rhai mannau, mae angen i ni wneud yn siŵr fod gennym gyflenwad ohonynt lle y mae eu hangen. Rwy'n ymwybodol o'r trafodaethau a fu gyda'r Swyddfa Gartref. Ein safbwynt pendant ni yma yng Nghymru yw na fyddem eisiau i unrhyw berson ifanc gael ei gadw mewn cell heddlu os yw ei ymddygiad yn cynnwys ystyriaethau iechyd meddwl. Rydym yn gweithio'n agos iawn gyda'r gwasanaethau heddlu yma yng Nghymru, ac mae'r niferoedd yng Nghymru'n isel iawn, ond mae angen eu dileu. Mae'r un mor wir na fyddem eisiau i oedolyn â chyflwr iechyd meddwl sy'n effeithio ar ei ymddygiad gael ei gadw mewn cell heddlu os oes modd eu cadw mewn man arall. Mae llawer iawn o waith wedi'i wneud yng Nghymru, a chafwyd cryn dipyn o lwyddiant, yn gweithio rhwng y gwasanaeth iechyd a'r gwasanaethau heddlu i leihau'r niferoedd hynny.
- 13:47 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- We now move to the Welsh Conservatives' spokesperson, Darren Millar.
- Symudwn yn awr at lefarydd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig, Darren Millar.
- 13:48 **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you, Presiding Officer.
- Diolch i chi, Lywydd.



Minister, this week saw the publication of the latest emergency department performance figures, which showed that over 2,000 patients spent more than 12 hours in emergency departments across Wales, compared with fewer than 50 over the same period in England, and that the Welsh Government's NHS continues to miss its targets, as it has done since 2009, against the four-hour performance target for emergency departments. What is your Government doing to address these problems in the NHS so that it meets the performance targets that you set?

Weinidog, yr wythnos hon cafodd y ffigurau diweddaraf ar berfformiad adrannau achosion brys eu cyhoeddi, a oedd yn dangos bod dros 2,000 o gleifion wedi treulio mwy na 12 awr mewn adrannau achosion brys ledled Cymru, o'i gymharu â llai na 50 dros yr un cyfnod yn Lloegr, a bod GIG Llywodraeth Cymru yn parhau i fethu ei dargedau, fel y mae wedi ei wneud ers 2009, yn erbyn y targed perfformiad pedair awr ar gyfer achosion brys. Beth y mae eich Llywodraeth yn ei wneud i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn yn y GIG er mwyn iddo gyrraedd y targedau perfformiad a osodwyd gennych?

13:48

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Well, as the Member often conveniently forgets to mention, performance in the Welsh NHS, in those figures, has shown an improvement over the previous month, and that month was an improvement over the month before that. More than eight out of 10 people in the Welsh NHS are seen, treated and discharged within four hours, and, in the Welsh NHS, that is actually what happens, rather than a beat-the-clock system as they have across the border, where people are artificially admitted to a hospital at three hours and 58 minutes in order to appear to meet the target.

Wel, fel y mae'r Aelod yn aml yn anghofio ei grybwyll, yn gyfleus iawn, mae perfformiad y GIG yng Nghymru, yn y ffigurau hynny, wedi dangos gwelliant o gymharu â'r mis blaenorol, ac roedd y mis hwnnw'n well na'r mis cyn hynny. Mae mwy nag wyth o bob 10 o bobl yn y GIG yng Nghymru yn cael eu gweld, eu trin a'u rhyddhau o fewn pedair awr, ac yn y GIG yng Nghymru, dyna sy'n digwydd go iawn, yn hytrach na system 'curo'r dloc' fel sydd ganddynt ar draws y ffin, lle y caiff pobl eu derbyn i'r ysbyty yn artiffisial ar ôl tair awr a 58 munud er mwyn rhoi'r argraff eu bod yn cyrraedd y targed.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Where I do agree with Darren Millar is that the number of people waiting more than 12 hours is higher than it ought to be. Some people are properly retained in an emergency department while another test is being carried out, or while a period of observation is concluded, so that people can be discharged home, but that does not explain the whole of that number by any means, and I expect health boards, as part of the improving pattern, to bear down on that number over the coming months.

Yr hyn rwy'n cytuno â Darren Millar yn ei gylch yw bod nifer y bobl sy'n aros mwy na 12 awr yn uwch nag y dylai fod. Mae rhai pobl yn cael eu cadw yn briodol mewn adran ddamweiniau ac achosion brys tra bo prawf arall yn cael ei gynnal, neu tra bo cyfnod o arsylwi yn dod i ben, er mwyn gallu rhyddhau pobl i fynd adref, ond nid yw hynny'n egluro'r nifer cyfan mewn unrhyw fodd, ac rwy'n disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd, fel rhan o'r patrwm o welliant, fwrw iddi i leihau'r nifer dros y misoedd nesaf.

13:49

**Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You say that you expect health boards to improve performance, but, of course, the reality is that this figure has doubled in the past 12 months, when compared with April last year. So, you talk about performance improvements over the past month, but forget that the trend over the 12 months has been one of significant deterioration. I ask you again, Minister, rather than just communicating with health boards and telling them that you're not very pleased with their performance, what specific action are you taking to improve this performance, so that patients can benefit from timely access to treatment and be discharged from emergency departments in accordance with the targets that you may well try to wish away but that your Government actually sets?

Rydych yn dweud eich bod yn disgwyl i fyrddau iechyd wella'u perfformiad, ond wrth gwrs, y gwir amdani yw bod y ffigur wedi dyblu yn ystod y 12 mis diwethaf, o'i gymharu â mis Ebrill y llynedd. Felly, rydych yn siarad am y gwelliannau perfformiad dros y mis diwethaf, ond yn anghofio bod y duedd dros y 12 mis wedi dangos dirywiad sylweddol. Rwy'n gofyn i chi eto, Weinidog, yn hytrach na chyfathrebu â byrddau iechyd a dweud wrthynt nad ydych yn fodlon iawn ar eu perfformiad, pa gamau penodol rydych yn eu rhoi ar waith i wella'r perfformiad hwn, er mwyn i gleifion allu elwa ar driniaeth amserol a chael eu rhyddhau o'r adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys yn unol â'r targedau y gallech yn hawdd geisio eu hanwybyddu, ond a osodwyd, mewn gwirionedd, gan eich Llywodraeth chi?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

- 13:50 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, the Welsh Government takes a whole series of actions, of course, in order to assist health boards in the discharge of their responsibilities. We've appointed a national clinical lead for unscheduled care. The director general of the national health service here in Wales now chairs the unscheduled care board. We make sure that health boards learn from one another so that, where there are successes in Wales—of which there are many and of which the opposition party spokesperson never troubles himself to mention—those successes are learned across Wales. That's the role that Government properly plays in this.
- Wel, mae gan Lywodraeth Cymru gyfres gyfan o gamau gweithredu, wrth gwrs, er mwyn cynorthwyo byrddau iechyd i gyflawni eu cyfrifoldebau. Rydym wedi penodi arweinydd clinigol cenedlaethol ar gyfer gofal heb ei drefnu. Mae cyfarwyddwr cyffredinol y gwasanaeth iechyd gwladol yng Nghymru bellach yn cadeirio'r bwrdd gofal heb ei drefnu. Rydym yn gwneud yn siŵr fod byrddau iechyd yn dysgu gwersi gan ei gilydd er mwyn sicrhau ein bod yn dysgu o'r llwyddiannau hynny ledled Cymru—ac mae llawer ohonynt er nad yw llefarydd yr wrthblaid yn trafferthu sôn amdanynt. Dyna'r rhan briodol y mae Llywodraeth yn ei chwarae yn hyn.
- 13:50 **Darren Millar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Quite clearly, the action taken to date has been insufficient to deliver the step change in improvement that we need to see in emergency department performance. Isn't the honest truth, Minister, that you need to admit, as have other Members of the governing party, that you've lost the argument on the NHS, and that you need to pull your socks up, pull your finger out and deliver the improvements that the patients of Wales need to see—not just in terms of emergency department performance, but in terms of performance across the board?
- Yn amlwg, mae'r camau a roddwyd ar waith hyd yn hyn wedi bod yn annigonol i gyflawni'r newid sylweddol o ran y gwelliannau rydym angen eu gweld ym mherfformiad adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys. Onid y gwir plaen, Weinidog, yw bod angen i chi gyfaddef, fel y mae Aelodau eraill y blaid lywodraethol wedi gwneud, eich bod wedi colli'r ddadl ar y GIG, a bod angen i chi dorchi eich llewys, tynnu eich bys allan a chyflawni'r gwelliannau y mae cleifion Cymru angen eu gweld—nid yn unig o ran perfformiad adrannau damweiniau ac achosion brys, ond o ran y perfformiad yn gyffredinol?
- 13:51 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Llywydd, it is disappointing that, once again, the contribution of Darren Millar is a triumph of prejudice over analysis. The idle bile that is his stock in trade when it comes to the NHS in Wales is noticed every single day by people who work in it and use it. His party have not a single good word to say about the NHS in Wales, and their consistent attempts to denigrate and run down what people achieve every day in Wales is well understood by people who take a proper interest in these matters.
- Llywydd, mae'n siomedig fod cyfraniad Darren Millar, unwaith eto, yn gadael i ragfarn drechu dadansoddiad. Mae'r bustl gwag sydd mor nodweddiadol ohono wrth drafod y GIG yng Nghymru i'w weld bob dydd gan y bobl sy'n gweithio yn y GIG ac yn ei ddefnyddio. Nid oes gan ei blaid yr un gair da i'w ddweud am y GIG yng Nghymru, ac mae'r bobl sydd â diddordeb priodol yn y materion hyn yn ymwybodol iawn o'u hymdrechion cyson i fychanu a lladd ar yr hyn y mae pobl yn ei gyflawni bob dydd yng Nghymru.
- 13:52 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- We now move to the Welsh Liberal Democrats' spokesperson—[Interruption.] Kirsty Williams. Not Darren Millar, Kirsty Williams.
- Symudwn yn awr at lefarydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru—[Torri ar draws.] Kirsty Williams. Nid Darren Millar, Kirsty Williams.
- 13:52 **Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Arweinydd Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol Cymru / The Leader of the Welsh Liberal Democrats*
- Thank you, Presiding Officer. Minister, on Monday, your Government department issued a press release stating that you were investing £2 million to develop specific services to better diagnose and support young people with attention-deficit hyperactivity disorder and autism spectrum disorder. Could you inform me whether that £2 million is new money or whether that £2 million had already been committed for those purposes?
- Diolch i chi, Lywydd. Weinidog, ddydd Llun cyhoeddodd eich adran o'r Llywodraeth ddatganiad i'r wasg yn nodi eich bod yn buddsoddi £2 filiwn i ddatblygu gwasanaethau penodol i wella'r broses o wneud diagnosis a chynorthwyo pobl ifanc sydd ag anhwylder diffyg canolbwytio a gorfywiogrwydd ac anhwylder ar y sbectrwm awtistig. A wnewch chi fy hysbysu a yw'r £2 filiwn yn arian newydd neu ai £2 filiwn sydd eisoes wedi ei ymrwymo at y dibenion hynny yw hwn?
- 13:52 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Llywydd, I'm very happy to confirm to the Member that that is entirely new money.
- Llywydd, rwy'n hapus iawn i gadarnhau i'r Aelod fod hwnnw'n arian hollol newydd.

13:52

**Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you very much, Minister. I'm sure that clarification will be good news to those people concerned with this area of policy. You'll be aware that there are continuing concerns about families of young people getting a diagnosis of an autism spectrum disorder. Your interim delivery action plan, also published on Monday, said that your No. 1 action in the following year was to secure improvements in ASD diagnosis services for children, young people and adults. But actually, all that does, in the action column, is set up yet another group to talk about how you're going to improve access to diagnostic services. Could you inform Members what your expectations are of how long people should wait for a diagnosis, and when your Government will be in a position to move beyond setting up a group and actually ensure that people get a diagnosis in a timely fashion?

Diolch yn fawr iawn, Weinidog. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd yr eglurhad hwnnw'n newyddion da i'r bobl sy'n ymwneud â'r maes polisi hwn. Fe wyddoch fod pryderon parhaus ynghylch teuluoedd pobl ifanc sy'n cael diagnosis o anhwylder ar y sbectrwm awtistig. Roedd eich cynllun cyflawni interim, a gyhoeddwyd ddydd Llun hefyd, yn dweud mai eich blaenoriaeth gyntaf ar gyfer gweithredu yn y flwyddyn ddilynol oedd sicrhau gwelliannau mewn gwasanaethau diagnostig ar gyfer anhwylder ar y sbectrwm awtistig i blant, pobl ifanc ac oedolion. Ond mewn gwirionedd, y cyfan y mae hynny'n ei wneud, yn y golofn weithredu, yw sefydlu grŵp arall i siarad ynglŷn â sut rydych yn mynd i wella mynediad at wasanaethau diagnostig. A wnewch chi hysbysu'r Aelodau beth yw eich disgwyliadau ynglŷn â pha mor hir y dylai pobl aros am ddiagnosis, a rhoi gwybod pa bryd y bydd eich Llywodraeth mewn sefyllfa i symud y tu hwnt i sefydlu grŵp a sicrhau, mewn gwirionedd, fod pobl yn cael diagnosis mewn modd amserol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:53

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Llywydd, we are well beyond simply setting up a group. That would not be a fair reflection of where the work that goes on in the sector has already got to. Kirsty Williams will be aware that the expert group that was established to refresh the autism strategy advised me earlier this year that they wanted more time to conclude some quite tricky discussions that they need to have in this quite difficult area, but that there were a series of immediate actions that we could take. That's why we published an interim, one-year strategy earlier this week. I won't do what she suggests and arbitrarily identify a period of waiting. For young people in particular, this is a developmental condition. It is important sometimes to wait a little longer to make sure that the right diagnosis is being made of a child, for example, who is two or three years old, rather than—and I do understand why parents are anxious for a diagnosis—to rush to provide a label that may turn out later on not to be correct, and will have had an adverse effect on that young person's treatment and health.

Llywydd, rydym ymhell y tu hwnt i sefydlu grŵp. Ni fyddai hynny'n adlewyrchiad teg o'r gwaith a gyflawnwyd yn y sector eisoes. Bydd Kirsty Williams yn ymwybodol fod y grŵp arbenigol a sefydlwyd i adnewyddu'r strategaeth awtistiaeth wedi dweud wrthyf yn gynharach eleni eu bod eisiau mwy o amser i gwblhau rhai trafodaethau anodd sy'n rhaid eu cael yn y maes cymhleth hwn, ond bod cyfres o gamau gweithredu y gallem eu cymryd ar unwaith. Dyna pam y cyhoeddwyd strategaeth un flwyddyn interim gennym yn gynharach yr wythnos hon. Ni fyddaf yn gwneud yr hyn y mae'n awgrymu a nodi cyfnod aros ar fympwy. Mewn pobl ifanc yn arbennig, mae hwn yn gyflwr datblygiadol. Mae'n bwysig aros ychydig yn hwy weithiau i wneud yn siŵr fod y diagnosis cywir yn cael ei roi ar gyfer plentyn, er enghraifft, sy'n ddwy neu'n dair oed, yn hytrach na rhuthro—ac rwy'n deall pam y mae rhieni'n awyddus i gael diagnosis—i roi label a allai gael ei brofi'n anghywir yn nes ymlaen, gan arwain at effaith niweidiol ar iechyd a thriniaeth y person ifanc dan sylw.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:55

**Kirsty Williams** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Presiding Officer, I have the Government's document right here before me, and the only mention it makes of securing better diagnostic services is action 1, and the responsibility, it says, is the Welsh Government's, who will establish a diagnostic task and finish group. That's exactly what the Government document says, and it does not go beyond that.

Minister, you'll be aware that, until recently, resources to develop ASD infrastructure in local authorities were ring-fenced. The Government has taken the decision to move that money into the revenue support grant. What steps will your Government be taking to ensure that local authorities do indeed use those resources to develop ASD infrastructure within their local authorities? Is it your intention that all local authorities should continue to provide a liaison committee, so that those people who have a concern about ASD—patients, their carers—have an opportunity to work alongside those who are commissioning and providing services?

Llywydd, mae gennyf ddogfen y Llywodraeth yma o fy mlaen, a daw'r unig sylw y mae'n ei roi i sicrhau gwasanaethau diagnostig gwell yng ngham gweithredu 1, a dywed ei fod yn gyfrifoldeb i Lywodraeth Cymru, a fydd yn sefydlu grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar y broses ddiagnostig. Dyna'n union y mae dogfen y Llywodraeth yn ei ddweud, ac nid yw'n mynd y tu hwnt i hynny.

Weinidog, tan yn ddiweddar, fe fyddwch yn ymwybodol fod adnoddau ar gyfer datblygu seilwaith anhwylder ar y sbectrwm awtistig mewn awdurdodau lleol wedi cael eu neilltuo. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi penderfynu symud yr arian i mewn i'r grant cynnal refeniw. Pa gamau y bydd eich Llywodraeth yn eu cymryd i sicrhau bod awdurdodau lleol yn defnyddio'r adnoddau hynny i ddatblygu seilwaith anhwylder ar y sbectrwm awtistig yn eu hawdurdodau lleol? Ai eich bwriad yw sicrhau y dylai pob awdurdod lleol barhau i ddarparu pwyllgor cyswllt, er mwyn rhoi cyfle i'r bobl sy'n pryderu ynghylch anhwylder ar y sbectrwm awtistig—cleifion, eu gofalwyr—i weithio ochr yn ochr â'r rhai sy'n comisiynu ac yn darparu gwasanaethau?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:56

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Llywydd, the leader of the Liberal Democrats began by pointing to the £2 million that was also announced on Monday for additional services for young people with ADHD. That's why I'm perfectly confident in saying to her that our actions on diagnosis and on waiting times go far beyond simply a working group. There will be extra services provided as a result of that money, and those services will be very relevant to many young people who are on the autistic spectrum.

In relation to the money that went into the RSG, that is the agreement that we have with local authorities. I wrote specifically to them at the time, making it clear that Welsh Government would look very carefully at the way that that money is spent. I understand the anxieties of families that the money may disappear into other uses. It's for local authorities to demonstrate to them and to Welsh Government that they use that money in the way that they say transferring it to the RSG allows them—that's to say, with more flexibility and an ability to get more out of the money that we invest. The £660,000 extra that I also announced on Monday will go directly to these services, and we will certainly expect local authorities to maintain the machinery they have for communicating what they do to their local populations.

Llywydd, dechreuodd arweinydd y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol drwy gyfeirio at y £2 filiwn a gafodd ei gyhoeddi ddydd Llun ar gyfer gwasanaethau ychwanegol i bobl ifanc sydd ag anhwylder diffyg canolbwyntio a gorfywiogrwydd. Dyna pam rwy'n berffaith hyderus yn dweud wrthi fod ein camau gweithredu ar ddiagnosis ac amseroedd aros yn mynd ymhell y tu hwnt i weithgor. Bydd gwasanaethau ychwanegol yn cael eu darparu o ganlyniad i'r arian hwnnw, a bydd y gwasanaethau hynny'n berthnasol iawn i lawer o bobl ifanc sydd ar y sbectrwm awtistig.

Mewn perthynas â'r arian a aeth i mewn i'r grant cynnal refeniw, dyna'r cytundeb sydd gennym ag awdurdodau lleol. Ysgrifennais atynt yn benodol ar y pryd i'w gwneud yn glir y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru yn edrych yn ofalus iawn ar y ffordd y byddai'r arian hwnnw'n cael ei wario. Rwy'n deall pryderon teuluoedd y gallai'r arian ddiflannu ar bethau eraill. Mater i'r awdurdodau lleol yw dangos iddynt hwy ac i Lywodraeth Cymru eu bod yn defnyddio'r arian hwnnw yn y ffordd y maent yn dweud y mae ei drosglwyddo i'r Grant Cynnal Refeniw yn caniatáu iddynt ei wneud—hynny yw, gyda mwy o hyblygrwydd a'r gallu i gael mwy allan o'r arian rydym yn ei fuddsoddi. Mae'r £660,000 ychwanegol a gyhoeddais ddydd Llun hefyd yn mynd yn uniongyrchol tuag at y gwasanaethau hyn, a byddwn yn sicr yn disgwyl i awdurdodau lleol gynnal y systemau sydd ganddynt ar gyfer cyfathrebu'r hyn y maent yn ei wneud i'w poblogaethau lleol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:57

**Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

We now move back to questions on the paper, and question 3 is Simon Thomas's.

Symudwn yn ôl yn awr at y cwestiynau ar y papur, a daw cwestiwn 3 gan Simon Thomas.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Cronfa Gofal Canolraddol (y Canolbarth a'r Gorllewin)**

**The Intermediate Care Fund (Mid and West Wales)**

13:57

**Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*3. Pa asesiad y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'i wneud o berfformiad y gronfa gofal canolraddol yng Nghanolbarth a Gorllewin Cymru? OAQ(4)0598(HSS)*

*3. What assessment has the Minister made of the performance of the intermediate care fund in Mid and West Wales? OAQ(4)0598(HSS)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

13:57

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch am y cwestiwn. Mae cyrff statudol a'r trydydd sector yng nghanolbarth a gorllewin Cymru yn nodi canlyniadau cadarnhaol iawn i bobl leol o'r gwasanaethau a ddarperir trwy gronfa gofal canolraddol.

Thank you for the question. Statutory bodies and the third sector in mid and west Wales have noted the very positive outcomes for local people of the services provided by the intermediate care fund.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

- 13:58 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Diolch, Weinidog, ac yn wir, mae yna ganlyniadau addawol —rwyf wedi gweld tystiolaeth ar gyfer rhai ohonyn nhw: tystiolaeth bod pobl yn peidio â chael eu cludo i'r ysbyty, er enghraifft, a thystiolaeth o addasu cartrefi i leddfu'r angen am ofal tymor hir, a 12 claf penodol wedi gweld gwelliant yn eu hamodau byw oherwydd y gronfa honno. I fi, mae'r gronfa yn dangos budd o gydweithio agos, os nad uno, rhwng gwasanaethau cymdeithasol ac iechyd, ond y cwestiwn sy'n cael ei godi, yn enwedig gan y mudiadau gwirfoddol yn y canolbarth ar hyn o bryd, yw sut mae modd i'r gronfa yma, ac ysbryd y gronfa, barhau, a sut mae modd i fudiadau gwirfoddol wybod am y ffordd y maen nhw'n gallu ymwneud â'r gronfa ac ymwneud â rhagor o gynlluniau fel hyn?
- Thank you, Minister, and indeed, there are promising outcomes—I have seen evidence of some of them: evidence of people not being taken to hospital, for example, and evidence of home adaptations to alleviate the need for long-term care, as well as 12 specific patients who have seen an improvement in their living conditions as a result of that fund. For me, the fund shows the benefits of close collaboration, if not mergers, between social services and health, but the question being raised, particularly by voluntary organisations in mid Wales at the moment, is how can this fund, and the spirit of it, be maintained, and how can voluntary organisations find out about how they can become engaged with the fund and engaged with more programmes such as this?
- 13:58 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Wel, diolch yn fawr i Simon Thomas am beth mae e wedi'i ddweud am lwyddiant y gronfa ar hyn o bryd. Mae'r Llywodraeth wedi buddsoddi £20 miliwn yn fwy yn y flwyddyn ariannol yma i gadw i fynd ymlaen gyda gwaith y gronfa, ac mae'n hollol bwysig i fi fod yn glir am beth mae'r trydydd sector yn gallu ei roi i mewn gyda'r bobl yn yr awdurdodau lleol a'r byrddau iechyd. Mae enghreifftiau ledled Cymru o ble y maen nhw wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth, ac rwy'n glir am beth yr wyf i wedi'i ddweud wrth bobl gyda'r cyfrifoldebau am y gronfa nawr: mae'n bwysig bwrw ymlaen â'r ffordd yna o weithio.
- Well, I thank Simon Thomas for what he has said about the success of the fund at this time. The Government has invested an additional £20 million in this financial year to carry on with the work of the fund, and it is very important for me to be clear about what the third sector can contribute with the staff from the local authorities and the health boards. There are examples throughout Wales of where they've been able to make a difference, and I'm clear about what I have told the people with responsibility for the fund now: it is important to carry on with that way of working.
- 13:59 **Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thank you for your earlier answers, Minister. Can I ask how is the intermediate care fund operating in a cross-border context, with situations like that in my own constituency, where constituents are accessing care across the border from services in England?
- Diolch i chi am eich atebion yn gynharach, Weinidog. A gaiff ofyn sut y mae'r gronfa gofal canolraddol yn gweithredu mewn cyd-destun trawsffiniol, gyda sefyllfaoedd fel a geir yn fy etholaeth i, lle y mae etholwyr yn cael gofal ar draws y ffin gan wasanaethau yn Lloegr?
- 14:00 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Thanks, Russell George, for that. Of course, the intermediate care fund is only available for services in Wales, but, because they are very often focused around getting people out of hospital more quickly, or preventing flow into hospital, then they do have a direct relationship with some services that are provided across our border. I've been fortunate enough myself to visit a number of intermediate care fund projects, including those provided by local health boards and authorities that operate along the border, and I know that, in the way that I said earlier to Nick Ramsay, they are keen to put that money and those services to work in a way that is focused entirely on the needs of the patient rather than on any artificial administrative boundaries that may get in the way of providing that care.
- Diolch, Russell George. Wrth gwrs, nid yw'r gronfa gofal canolraddol ond ar gael ar gyfer gwasanaethau yng Nghymru, ond oherwydd eu bod yn canolbwyntio'n aml ar gael pobl allan o'r ysbyty'n gynt, neu atal llif i mewn i'r ysbyty, mae perthynas uniongyrchol rhyngddynt a rhai gwasanaethau sy'n cael eu darparu ar draws ein ffin. Bùm yn ddigon ffodus i ymweld â nifer o brosiectau cronfa gofal canolraddol, gan gynnwys y rhai a ddarperir gan fyrddau iechyd lleol ac awdurdodau sy'n gweithredu ar hyd y ffin, ac rwy'n gwybod, yn y ffordd a ddywedais yn gynharach wrth Nick Ramsay, eu bod yn awyddus i roi'r arian hwnnw a'r gwasanaethau hynny ar waith mewn ffordd sy'n canolbwyntio'n gyfan gwbl ar anghenion y claf yn hytrach nag ar unrhyw ffiniau gweinyddol artiffisial a allai amharu ar y modd y caiff y gofal hwnnw ei ddarparu.
- 14:01 **Gwenda Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Weinidog, rwy'n falch iawn o weld y bydd y gronfa ofal canolraddol yn parhau. A allech ddweud wrthym sut y gallem sicrhau bod enghreifftiau unigol o arfer da yn un rhan o Gymru yn cael eu rhannu ac yn dod yn norm arferol yng ngweddill ein gwlad?
- Minister, I'm extremely pleased to see that the intermediate care fund is to continue. Can you tell us how we can ensure that individual examples of good practice in one part of Wales can be shared and become the norm in the rest of the country?

14:01

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch yn fawr i Gwenda Thomas am y cwestiwn. Wrth gwrs, mae hi, rwy'n gwybod, wedi gweld nifer o enghreifftiau o'r gronfa a'i gwaith ledled Cymru nawr. Dywedais i wrth Simon Thomas bod £20 miliwn yn y gyllideb ar gyfer y flwyddyn ariannol yma. Beth rwyf wedi ei wneud yw cadw £2.5 miliwn yn ôl achos fy mod yn awyddus i hybu beth mae Gwenda Thomas wedi'i ddweud. Lle rydym ni'n gwybod bod enghraifft da—er enghraifft, yn Hywel Dda—rwy'n awyddus i fod yn glir gyda'r byrddau iechyd eraill a'r awdurdodau lleol eraill hefyd fy mod i eisïau eu gweld nhw'n gwneud yr un peth. Dyna pam rwyf wedi tynnu £2.5 miliwn yn ôl i helpu ariannu'r byrddau iechyd eraill i wneud beth sydd wedi—ble mae tystiolaeth ar gael o bethau sy'n gweithio yng Nghymru.

I thank Gwenda Thomas very much for that question. Of course, I know that she has seen a number of examples of the fund at work and in action across the whole of Wales. I told Simon Thomas that there's £20 million in the budget for this current financial year. What I've done is kept back £2.5 million because I am eager to promote Gwenda Thomas's suggestion. Where we know that there is a good example—for example, in Hywel Dda—then I am very eager to be clear with other health boards and local authorities that I want to see them do the same thing. That is why I have reserved £2.5 million to help to fund other health boards to do what has—where there is evidence of things that work in Wales.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:02

**Joyce Watson** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The Bro Preseli extra healthcare scheme in Crymch is one scheme benefitting from the fund, and it does help to ensure that people don't stay in hospital any longer than they need to. Integration and partnership is of course key to all of this, and it's already been mentioned. So, could you outline, Minister, just how the fund is helping the third sector and other partners to support the work of the statutory service?

Mae cynllun gofal iechyd ychwanegol Bro Preseli yng Nghrymch yn un cynllun sy'n elwa o'r gronfa, ac mae'n helpu i sicrhau nad yw pobl yn aros yn yr ysbyty yn hwy nag y bo angen. Mae integreiddio a phartneriaeth yn allweddol i hyn oll wrth gwrs, ac mae eisoes wedi cael ei grybwyll. Felly, Weinidog, a allech chi amlinellu yn union sut y mae'r gronfa yn helpu'r trydydd sector a phartneriaid eraill i gefnogi gwaith y gwasanaeth statudol?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:02

**Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank Joyce Watson for that. I have myself visited the Bro Preseli extra-care facility in Pembrokeshire, and it's an absolutely outstanding example of what can be achieved by different public services working together. It draws extensively on the work of the third sector in its immediate locality to make sure that those people who are living in that extra-care facility are as well-connected to their local community as they can be. More broadly, in Pembrokeshire, the Member will be aware we have PIVOT, the Pembrokeshire intermediate voluntary organisations team, which is a project funded by the intermediate care fund that is entirely to do with bringing third sector organisations together to promote rehabilitation, re-ablement and independent living.

Hoffwn ddiolch i Joyce Watson am hynny. Rwyf wedi ymweld â chyfleuster gofal ychwanegol Bro Preseli yn Sir Benfro, ac mae'n enghraifft hollol ragorol o'r hyn y gellir ei gyflawni pan fo gwahanol wasanaethau cyhoeddus yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Mae'n defnyddio gwaith y trydydd sector yn ei ardal leol i wneud yn siŵr fod y bobl sy'n byw yn y chyfleuster gofal ychwanegol wedi'u cysylltu gystal ag y bo modd â'u cymuned leol. Yn fwy cyffredinol, yn Sir Benfro, bydd yr Aelod yn ymwybodol fod gennym dîm sefydliadau gwirfoddol canolraddol Sir Benfro, sef prosiect sy'n cael ei ariannu gan y gronfa gofal canolraddol ac sy'n ymwneud yn llwyr â dod â sefydliadau trydydd sector at ei gilydd i hyrwyddo adsefydlu, ail-alluogi a byw'n annibynnol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Lleihau Nifer y Bobl Ifanc sy'n Dechrau Ysmygu**

**Reducing the Uptake of Smoking Among Young People**

14:03

**David Rees** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*4. Pa gynnydd y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud o ran lleihau nifer y bobl ifanc sy'n dechrau ysmygu? OAQ(4)0597(HSS)*

*4. What progress has the Welsh Government made in reducing the uptake of smoking among young people? OAQ(4)0597(HSS)*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:03

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for the question. We are implementing a range of measures to discourage young people from taking up smoking. Our health behaviour in school-aged children survey shows the proportion of 15 to 16-year-olds who have tried smoking has at least halved between 2002 and 2014.

Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Rydym yn gweithredu amryw o fesurau i atal pobl ifanc rhag dechrau ysmygu. Mae ein harolwg ar ymddygiad iechyd plant ysgol yn dangos bod cyfran y plant 15 i 16 mlwydd oed sydd wedi rhoi cynnig ar ysmygu wedi haneru fan lleiaf rhwng 2002 a 2014.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



14:04

**David Rees** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Deputy Minister for that answer. Last week I hosted Action on Smoking and Health Cymru here in the Senedd, and I know that the Deputy Minister was actually there, and spoke, so he understands the excellent project that they were sponsoring, the Filter project, which tackles smoking amongst young people and engages with young people on the need to not take it up in the first instance and not to succumb to peer pressure. What's the Welsh Government doing to support projects like that, to ensure that, as the years go by and I get a lot older, the next generation coming through is going to be healthier because there are fewer of them actually smoking?

Diolch i'r Dirprwy Weinidog am ei ateb. Yr wythnos diwethaf cynhaliais ddiwyddiad Gweithredu ar Ysmygu ac Iechyd Cymru yma yn y Senedd, a gwn fod y Dirprwy Weinidog yno, a'i fod wedi siarad, felly mae'n amlwg ei fod yn deall y prosiect rhagorol roeddent yn ei noddi, prosiect Filter, sy'n mynd i'r afael ag ysmegu ymhlith pobl ifanc ac yn ymgysylltu â phobl ifanc ar yr angen i beidio â dechrau ysmegu yn y lle cyntaf ac i beidio ag ildio i bwysau gan gyfoedion. Beth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei wneud i gefnogi prosiectau fel hwn, er mwyn sicrhau, wrth i'r blynyddoedd fynd heibio ac wrth i mi fynd yn llawer hŷn, y bydd y genhedlaeth nesaf yn iachach oherwydd bod llai ohonynt yn ysmegu?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:04

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for the question. I did indeed, as you know, attend the evening event here with ASH Wales looking at their Filter project, and I've met ASH Wales and I've discussed the project with them on a couple of occasions, and I recently met them to talk about the future of their project. What I'm really clear about is seeing that they look and sound like good ideas, where they've got a track record of engaging with people.

Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Yn wir, fel y gwyydych, mynychais y digwyddiad gyda'r nos yma gydag ASH Cymru, a edrychai ar eu prosiect Filter, ac rwyf wedi cwrrd ag ASH Cymru ac wedi trafod y prosiect gyda hwy ar un neu ddau o achlysuron. Cefais gyfarfod â hwy'n ddiweddar i drafod dyfodol eu prosiect. Yr hyn rwy'n glir yn ei gyloch yw gweld eu bod yn edrych ac yn swnio fel syniadau da, ac mae ganddynt hanes o ymgysylltu â phobl.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I'm really interested and the Government will be interested in the evidence of what works. If they can demonstrate the project works and is effective, we'll be interested in seeing how that's further rolled out. I've encouraged them to have a conversation with Public Health Wales about how they can look to see if their model has the evidence to support it and they can work with Public Health Wales to see if that is something that could be rolled out on a wider basis. I look forward to hearing the outcome of those discussions.

Mae gennyf ddiddordeb gwirioneddol a bydd y Llywodraeth â diddordeb yn y dystiolaeth ynghylch yr hyn sy'n gweithio. Os gallant ddangos bod y prosiect yn gweithio a'i fod yn effeithiol, bydd gennym ddiddordeb mewn gweld sut y caiff hynny ei gyflwyno ymhellach. Rwyf wedi eu hannog i gael sgwrs gydag Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru ynglŷn â sut y gallant edrych i weld a oes tystiolaeth i gefnogi eu model a gallant weithio gydag Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru i weld a yw hynny'n rhywbeth y gellid ei gyflwyno ar sail ehangach. Edrychaf ymlaen at glywed canlyniad y trafodaethau hynny.

14:05

**Mohammad Asghar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Deputy Minister, according to ASH, almost 90 per cent of regular cigarette smoking begins at the age of 18. What discussions has the Deputy Minister had with the Minister of education about promoting effective youth smoking prevention programmes in schools to reduce the uptake of smoking among young people in Wales?

Ddirprwy Weinidog, yn ôl ASH, mae bron i 90 y cant o'r rhai sy'n ysmegu sigarêts yn rheolaidd yn dechrau yn 18 oed. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi'u cael gyda'r Gweinidog Addysg ynglŷn â hyrwyddo rhaglenni effeithiol ar atal ysmegu ymhlith pobl ifanc mewn ysgolion i leihau nifer y bobl sy'n dechrau ysmegu ymhlith pobl ifanc yng Nghymru?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:05

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank the Member for the question. We undertake a range of activity with colleagues in education to run programmes in schools. For example, the ASSIST programme, which Public Health Wales helped to run, is continuing to be rolled out in secondary schools and the evidence is that, where schools have the ASSIST programme, they are more effective at having a smaller number of people starting smoking at school age. In particular, it uses children themselves, pupils themselves, as peers to try and actually promote the non-smoking message. So, we undertake a range of work. We always, again, need to see if it is effective. On this particular programme, there is good evidence that it is.

Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Rydym yn cyflawni ystod o weithgareddau gyda chydweithwyr ym maes addysg i ddarparu rhaglenni mewn ysgolion. Er enghraifft, mae'r rhaglen Treial Rhoi'r Gorau i Ysmegu mewn Ysgolion (ASSIST), rhaglen yr oedd Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru yn arfer helpu i'w darparu, yn parhau i gael ei chyflwyno mewn ysgolion uwchradd ac mae'r dystiolaeth yn dangos bod ysgolion sy'n cyflwyno rhaglen ASSIST yn fwy effeithiol o ran bod llai o bobl ifanc oedran ysgol yn dechrau ysmegu yn yr ysgolion hynny. Yn benodol, mae'n defnyddio'r plant eu hunain, y disgyblion eu hunain, fel cyfoedion i geisio hyrwyddo neges dim ysmegu. Felly, rydym yn gwneud amrywiaeth o waith. Unwaith eto, mae angen i ni weld bob amser ei bod yn effeithiol. O ran y rhaglen benodol hon, mae tystiolaeth dda ei bod hi'n un effeithiol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:06

**Lindsay Whittle** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Deputy Minister, there is conflicting evidence on the use of e-cigarettes as a means of reducing the health risks of smoking other cigarettes. What is your opinion on the health impact of e-cigarettes on young people, some of whom I've seen as young as 11 years of age?

Ddirprwy Weinidog, ceir tystiolaeth sy'n gwrthdaro ar y defnydd o e-sigaréts fel modd o leihau peryglon ysmegu sigaréts eraill i iechyd. Beth yw eich barn ar effaith e-sigaréts ar iechyd pobl ifanc, a gwelais rai mor ifanc ag 11 oed?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:06

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The Member will know that the Welsh Government takes a cautionary approach to the use of e-cigarettes. There's mixed evidence about the impact of e-cigarettes, but I think we're right to take a cautionary approach. Part of our concern comes from the fact that they aren't properly regulating what's in e-cigarettes at present. But we do know that they're marketed heavily at young people, the way they're branded, the way they're marketed and the flavours they use. There are over 7,000 flavours in e-cigarettes, and you can't tell me that a bubble-gum flavoured e-cigarette isn't really primarily aimed at young people. So, we're right to be cautious. It will continue to guide our approach until there's clear evidence there won't be harm produced from using e-cigarettes.

Bydd yr Aelod yn gwybod bod Llywodraeth Cymru ag agwedd ragofalus tuag at ddefnyddio e-sigaréts. Ceir tystiolaeth gymysg ynghylch effaith e-sigaréts, ond rwy'n credu ein bod yn iawn i fabwysiadu agwedd ragofalus. Mae rhan o'n pryder yn deillio o'r ffaith nad ydynt yn rheoleiddio'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnwys mewn e-sigaréts yn briodol ar hyn o bryd. Ond rydym yn gwybod eu bod yn eu marchnata'n drwm i bobl ifanc, o ran y modd y cânt eu brandio a'u marchnata a'r blasau a ddefnyddiant. Mae dros 7,000 o flasau e-sigaréts, ac ni allwch ddweud wrthyf nad yw e-sigarét blas gwm swigod wedi'i anelu'n bennaf tuag at bobl ifanc. Felly, rydym yn iawn i fod yn ofalus. Bydd hynny'n parhau i lywio ein dull o weithredu hyd nes y ceir tystiolaeth glir na fydd defnyddio e-sigaréts yn creu unrhyw niwed.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:07

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Deputy Minister, I was very grateful for your comments on the Filter project, and I too attended that event. You'll be aware that it is both a prevention and a cessation service for young people. Whilst the prevention statistics that you've mentioned are obviously very encouraging, in fact, over six months last year, only 34 people under the age of 18 were treated by Stop Smoking Wales, compared with more than 3,000 older adults. So, there is clearly a gap in the market for cessation services for younger people perhaps.

Ddirprwy Weinidog, roeddwn yn ddiolchgar iawn am eich sylwadau ar brosiect Filter, ac roeddwn innau hefyd yn bresennol yn y digwyddiad hwnnw. Fe wyddoch ei fod yn wasanaeth atal ysmegu a rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Er bod yr ystadegau atal rydych wedi eu crybwyll yn amlwg yn galonogol iawn, mewn gwirionedd, dros chwe mis y llynedd, 34 o bobl yn unig o dan 18 oed a gafodd eu trin gan Dim Smygu Cymru, o'i gymharu â thros 3,000 o oedolion hŷn. Felly, mae'n amlwg efallai fod bwlch yn y farchnad ar gyfer gwasanaethau rhoi'r gorau i ysmegu ar gyfer pobl iau.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Big Lottery funding ends for the Filter project at the end of October. I'm wondering if you can give me some assurance that you'll work with ASH Wales to make sure that there isn't a gap perhaps between their funding ending and the work that you'd like to do on looking at rolling out some of these elements beginning.

Mae cyllid y Loteri Fawr ar gyfer prosiect Filter yn dod i ben ddiwedd mis Hydref. Tybed a allwch roi rhywfaint o sicrwydd y byddwch yn gweithio gydag ASH Cymru i wneud yn siŵr nad oes bwlch, o bosibl, rhwng eu cyllid yn dod i ben a dechrau'r gwaith y byddech yn hoffi ei wneud o ran ystyried cyflwyno rhai o'r elfennau hyn.

14:08

**Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The two points that I'd reiterate are that we recognise there is a gap in an effective smoking cessation project for younger people, but, to see if Filter could fill that gap, there has to be the evidence they could do that effectively. Unless that evidence is provided to us, we can't, in all honesty, fund the project. We wait to see a proper proposal coming forward. That's why I've directed ASH Wales to go and have a conversation with Public Health Wales to try and look at what evidence exists. Again, as I said in answer to David Rees, I look forward to seeing what the outcome of that discussion is to see if there is real evidence that this is the effective intervention that we should be supporting.

Y ddau bwynt y byddwn yn eu hailadrodd yw ein bod yn cydnabod bod bwlch o ran prosiect rhoi'r gorau i smegu effeithiol i bobl iau, ond er mwyn gweld a allai Filter lenwi'r bwlch hwnnw, mae'n rhaid cael tystiolaeth sy'n profi y gallent wneud hynny'n effeithiol. Oni ddarperir y dystiolaeth honno i ni, a bod yn onest, ni allwn ariannu'r prosiect. Rydym yn aros i weld cynnig priodol yn cael ei gyflwyno. Dyna pam rwyf wedi cyfeirio ASH Cymru i gael sgwrs gydag Iechyd Cyhoeddus Cymru i geisio edrych ar ba dystiolaeth sy'n bodoli. Unwaith eto, fel y dywedais wrth ateb David Rees, edrychaf ymlaen at weld beth fydd canlyniad y drafodaeth honno er mwyn gweld a oes tystiolaeth go iawn mai dyma'r ymyriad effeithiol y dylem fod yn ei gefnogi.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:09 **Gwyn R. Price** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Deputy Minister, what assessment has the Welsh Government made of Cardiff University's research that shows young children are experimenting with e-cigarettes? Ddirprwy Weinidog, pa asesiad y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud o ymchwil Prifysgol Caerdydd sy'n dangos bod plant ifanc yn arbrofi gydag e-sigaréts?

14:09 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Again, this is part of the evidence that we wish to consider in forming our approach. It's why, when you see the public health Bill and you think about the comments the Minister's made on a very consistent basis, it will continue to underscore our approach, which is to take a precautionary approach to the issue of e-cigarettes. We look forward to what comes from the tobacco control directive about trying to regulate what goes into e-cigarettes in the first place. So, there's no shifting from this Government's view, and I think we're taking the right approach to actually safeguarding the health and wellbeing of children when it comes to the use of e-cigarettes. Unwaith eto, dyma ran o'r dystiolaeth rydym am ei hystyried wrth lunio ein dull o weithredu. Pan welch y Bil iechyd cyhoeddus a phan fyddwch yn meddwl am y sylwadau y mae'r Gweinidog wedi'u gwneud yn gyson iawn, dyma pam y bydd yn parhau i fod yn sail i'n dull o weithredu, sef mabwysiadu agwedd ragofalus tuag at e-sigaréts. Edrychwn ymlaen at weld yr hyn a ddaw o'r gyfarwydddeb rheoli tybaco ynglŷn â cheisio rheoleiddio'r hyn sy'n cael ei gynnwys mewn e-sigaréts yn y lle cyntaf. Felly, nid yw'r Llywodraeth hon am newid ei safbwynt ar y mater, ac rwy'n credu mai dyma'r dull cywir, mewn gwirionedd, o ddiogelu iechyd a lles plant o ran y defnydd o e-sigaréts.

## Cefnogi Nyrsys Arbenigol

14:09 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
*5. A wnaiff y Gweinidog amlinellu sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cefnogi nyrsys arbenigol yng Nghymru? OAQ(4)0593(HSS)* *5. Will the Minister outline how the Welsh Government is supporting specialist nurses in Wales? OAQ(4)0593(HSS)*  
Will the Minister or Deputy Minister—oh, it is the Minister, sorry—outline how the Welsh Government is supporting specialist nurses in Wales? Sorry, I wasn't sure who was standing up and who was sitting down. [Laughter.] A wnaiff y Gweinidog neu'r Dirprwy Weinidog—O, y Gweinidog, mae'n ddrwg gennyf—aminellu sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cefnogi nyrsys arbenigol yng Nghymru? Mae'n ddrwg gennyf, nid oeddwn yn siŵr pwy oedd yn sefyll a phwy oedd yn eistedd. [Chwerthin.]

14:09 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Thank you for the question. In any event, here in Wales, we have created a cadre of specialist nurses working at advanced level. Funding of advanced practice education has doubled in 2014-15, and is being maintained at that higher level in this financial year. Diolch am y cwestiwn. Beth bynnag, yma yng Nghymru, rydym wedi creu cnewyllyn o nyrsys arbenigol sy'n gweithio ar lefel uwch. Mae ariannu addysg ymarfer uwch wedi dyblu yn 2014-15, ac mae'n cael ei gynnal ar y lefel uwch honno yn y flwyddyn ariannol hon.

14:10 **Mark Isherwood** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#) [Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Thank you. Specialist nurses, as you know, provide a vital service, saving money and easing pressure for health boards. Parkinson's UK want to be involved in succession planning for specialist Parkinson's nurses in north Wales, reflecting both the number approaching retirement and, they tell me, good practice in Abertawe Bro Morgannwg University Local Health Board, looking at Parkinson's nurses with dementia specialisms. What action can you as Minister take to encourage their involvement in this succession planning in north Wales, so that they can then go forward and deliver the service together into the long term? Diolch yn fawr. Mae nyrsys arbenigol, fel y gwyddoch, yn darparu gwasanaeth hanfodol, gan arbed arian a lleddfu pwysau ar fyrdau iechyd. Mae Parkinson's UK yn awyddus i fod yn rhan o'r gwaith o gynllunio ar gyfer olyniaeth ymhlith nyrsys arbenigol clefyd Parkinson yng ngogledd Cymru, gan adlewyrchu'r nifer sydd bron â chyrraedd oed ymddeol yn ogystal â'r hyn y maent yn ei ddweud wrthyf sy'n arfer da ym Mwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Abertawe Bro Morgannwg, o ran edrych ar nyrsys Parkinson gydag arbenigeddau ym maes dementia. Pa gamau y gallwch chi fel Gweinidog eu cymryd i annog eu cyfranogiad yn y gwaith o gynllunio ar gyfer olyniaeth yn y Gogledd, er mwyn iddynt allu parhau i ddarparu'r gwasanaeth gyda'i gilydd yn y tymor hir?

- 14:10 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- I thank Mark Isherwood for what he said about specialist nurses, with which I agree. I will make sure that, at my next meeting with the chair of the local health board, which will not be too long delayed, I will take up that specific issue with him.
- Diolch i Mark Isherwood am yr hyn a ddywedodd am nyrsys arbenigol, ac rwy'n cytuno ag ef. Yn fy nghyfarfod nesaf gyda chadeirydd y bwrdd iechyd lleol na fydd yn hir cyn cael ei gynnal, byddaf yn gwneud yn siŵr fy mod yn tynnu ei sylw at y mater dan sylw.
- 14:11 **Alun Ffred Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Wel, mae nyrsys arbenigol, wrth gwrs, angen hyfforddiant a chynllunio ar gyfer yr angen yn y dyfodol. Yn ddiweddar, bu'n rhaid i Fwrdd Iechyd Lleol Prifysgol Betsi Cadwaladr fynd i Sbaen, i Barcelona, i recriwtio 60 o nyrsys, sy'n dod â'i broblemau ei hun gyda fo, wrth gwrs. Rŵan, yn y gogledd, mae yna rai cannoedd o nyrsys iechyd meddwl, ac mae canran uchel ohonyn nhw yn dod at oed ymdeol. Felly, pa gynllunio sy'n digwydd i sicrhau bod pobl o Gymru'n cael eu hyfforddi i gymryd eu lle nhw yn y blynyddoedd nesaf?
- Well, specialist nurses, of course, require training and planning for future need. Recently, Betsi Cadwaladr University Local Health Board had to go to Spain, to Barcelona, to recruit 60 nurses, which, of course, brings with it its own problems. Now, in north Wales, there are several hundred mental health nurses, and a high percentage of them are approaching retirement age. So, what planning is taking place to ensure that people from Wales are being trained to replace them in ensuing years?
- 14:11 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- It's an important point that the Member raises, and it is exactly why we took the decision to double the investment that we are making in the training of specialist nurses. We have increased the number of nurses entering training here in Wales by 22 per cent in the next academic year, exactly in order to meet the points that the Member raises.
- Mae'r Aelod yn nodi pwynt pwysig, a dyna'r union reswm pam ein bod wedi penderfynu dyblu ein buddsoddiad ar gyfer hyfforddi nyrsys arbenigol. Rydym wedi sicrhau cynnydd o 22 y cant yn nifer y nyrsys sy'n cael hyfforddiant yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn academaidd nesaf yn unswydd er mwyn ateb y pwyntiau y mae'r Aelod wedi eu gwneud.
- 14:12 **William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Minister, as you'll be aware, yesterday was World IBD Day, which seeks to raise awareness of inflammatory bowel disease. According to Crohn's and Colitis UK, which recently brought a petition to the National Assembly, Wales is lagging severely behind the rest of the UK in terms of specialist IBD nurse provision. For instance, a recent survey reported that 42 per cent of patients in Wales didn't have access to a specialist IBD nurse, and there are significantly fewer whole-time equivalent IBD nurses on site in Wales than is the case in the rest of the UK. In this context, Minister, do you agree that we need to make progress in this area, and what steps can you outline in that direction?
- Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch, ddoe oedd Diwrnod Clefyd Llid y Coluddyn y Byd, sy'n ceisio codi ymwybyddiaeth o glefyd llid y coluddyn. Yn ôl Crohn's and Colitis UK, sydd wedi cyflwyno deiseb i'r Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn ddiweddar, mae Cymru ar ei hôl hi'n ddifrifol o gymharu â gweddill y DU o ran y ddarpariaeth o nyrsys yn arbenigo ar glefyd llid y coluddyn. Er enghraifft, nododd arolwg diweddar nad yw 42 y cant o gleifion yng Nghymru yn gallu cael mynediad at nyrs sy'n arbenigo ar glefyd llid y coluddyn, ac mae llawer llai o nyrsys clefyd llid y coluddyn cyfwerth ag amser llawn ar gael yng Nghymru nag yng ngweddill y DU. Yn y cyd-destun hwn, Weinidog, a ydych yn cytuno bod angen i ni wneud cynnydd yn y maes hwn, a pha gamau y gallwch eu hamlinellu i'r perwyl hwnnw?
- 14:12 **Mark Drakeford** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Well, I'm aware of the report that William Powell refers to, and I agree that progress needs to be made. I was glad to see that, on the back of the report, a stakeholder event was held here in Wales in March. It included Crohn's and Colitis UK. That meeting agreed key actions for the service at local health board level, and I'm keen to see the momentum that was created at that meeting being kept up.
- Wel, rwy'n ymwybodol o'r adroddiad y mae William Powell yn cyfeirio ato, ac rwy'n cytuno bod angen gwneud cynnydd. Roeddwn yn falch o weld, ar gefn yr adroddiad, fod digwyddiad rhanddeiliaid yn cael ei gynnal yma yng Nghymru ym mis Mawrth. Roedd yn cynnwys Crohn's and Colitis UK. Cytunodd y cyfarfod hwnnw ar gamau gweithredu allweddol ar gyfer y gwasanaeth ar lefel y byrddau iechyd lleol, ac rwy'n awyddus i weld y momentwm a grëwyd yn y cyfarfod hwnnw yn cael ei gynnal.
- 14:13 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)
- Question 6, OAQ(4)0599(HSS), is withdrawn. Question 7, Suzy Davies.
- Mae Cwestiwn 6, OAQ (4)0599(HSS), yn cael ei dynnu'n ôl. Cwestiwn 7, Suzy Davies.

## Gwella Mynediad at Wasanaethau Iechyd

## Improving Access to Health Services

14:13 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
*7. A wnaiff y Gweinidog roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf am y camau y mae'n eu cymryd i wella mynediad at wasanaethau iechyd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru? OAQ(4)0600(HSS)*

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

*7. Will the Minister provide an update on actions he is taking to improve access to health services in South Wales West? OAQ(4)0600(HSS)*

14:13 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Thank you for the question. Health boards in Wales continue to take a range of actions to improve access to healthcare services that are safe and sustainable and as close to people's homes as possible. A good example in South Wales West is the dialysis at home service, including dialysis at night. This has significantly improved access and the patient experience, with current evidence being that it also leads to improved patient outcomes.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Diolch am y cwestiwn. Mae byrddau iechyd yng Nghymru yn parhau i roi amrywiaeth o gamau ar waith i wella mynediad at wasanaethau gofal iechyd sy'n ddiogel ac yn gynaliadwy ac mor agos at gartrefi pobl ag sy'n bosibl. Enghraifft dda yng Ngorllewin De Cymru yw'r gwasanaeth dialysis yn y cartref, gan gynnwys dialysis yn y nos. Mae hyn wedi gwella mynediad a phrofiad y claf yn sylweddol, gyda thystiolaeth gyfredol yn dangos ei fod hefyd yn arwain at ganlyniadau gwell i gleifion.

14:13 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
Thank you very much for the answer there, Deputy Minister, and I'm pleased to hear what you said about the renal service, but, of course, constituents, while they continue to be concerned about access to accident and emergency services and GPs in particular, are also concerned about the delays in access to diagnostic services. April figures show that a number of constituents in my region are still waiting for an MRI scan. At the Princess of Wales Hospital, actually, the waiting list figures are up again. As you know, delayed diagnosis can have very serious consequences on medical treatment.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Diolch yn fawr iawn am eich ateb, Ddirprwy Weinidog, ac rwy'n falch o glywed yr hyn a ddywedoch am y gwasanaeth arenol, ond wrth gwrs, er bod etholwyr yn parhau i bryderu ynglŷn â mynediad at wasanaethau damweiniau ac achosion brys a meddygon teulu yn arbennig, maent hefyd yn pryderu am yr oedi cyn cael mynediad at wasanaethau diagnostig hefyd. Mae ffigurau mis Ebrill yn dangos bod nifer o etholwyr yn fy rhanbarth yn dal i aros am sgan MRI. Mae ffigurau'r rhestrau aros wedi codi eto yn Ysbyty Tywysoges Cymru. Fel y gwyddoch, gall oedi cyn cael diagnosis arwain at ganlyniadau difrifol iawn o ran triniaeth feddygol.

Could you go beyond what your expectations of the health board might be and tell me how you will oblige the health board to provide a diagnostic service that my constituents can access in a timely way, so that they can have appropriate, medically efficient, and probably cost-efficient, medical intervention, please?

A allech chi fynd y tu hwnt i'r hyn rydych yn ei ddisgwyl gan y bwrdd iechyd a dweud wrthyf sut y byddwch yn ei gwneud hi'n ofynnol i'r bwrdd iechyd ddarparu gwasanaeth diagnostig y gall fy etholwyr gael mynediad amserol ato, iddynt allu cael ymyrraeth feddygol briodol, effeithiol yn feddygol, a chosteffeithiol hefyd yn ôl pob tebyg, os gwelwch yn dda?

14:14 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)  
It is important to be clear about the Welsh Government's expectations. We provided extra resource in the last financial year, and that's helped to lead to the best figures on diagnostics since 2012. So, this is a picture of an improving service. The challenge is how to sustain and maintain the progress that's been made and continue to make further progress. The health board in South Wales West has been part of improving that service. So, my expectations remain the same about a service that will improve so people do get the service they're entitled to expect.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae'n bwysig bod yn glir ynglŷn â disgwyliadau Llywodraeth Cymru. Rydym wedi darparu adnoddau ychwanegol yn y flwyddyn ariannol ddiwethaf, ac mae hynny wedi helpu i arwain at y ffigurau gorau o ran diagnosteg ers 2012. Felly mae hwn yn ddarlun o wasanaeth sy'n gwella. Yr her yw sut i gynnal y cynnydd a wnaed a pharhau i wneud cynnydd pellach. Mae'r bwrdd iechyd yng Ngorllewin De Cymru wedi bod yn rhan o'r gwaith o wella'r gwasanaeth hwnnw. Felly, mae fy nisgwyliadau yn parhau yr un fath am wasanaeth a fydd yn gwella er mwyn i bobl gael y gwasanaeth y mae ganddynt hawl i'w ddisgwyl.

14:15 **Mike Hedges** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Minister, as you know I have congratulated you and your predecessors on what's happening in renal services, but it's not just renal services. Will the Deputy Minister join with me in congratulating the staff at the Welsh Centre for Burns and Plastic Surgery at Morriston Hospital for their pioneering work, including, most recently, reconstructive surgery for young burns victim, Sidra Afzal, reattaching Edryd Jones's arm and the microsurgery that has given Craig Stewart the use of his fingers again?

Weinidog, fel y gwyddoch rwyf wedi eich llongyfarch chi a'ch rhagflaenwyr ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd yn y gwasanaethau arenol, ond nid yw'n gyfyngedig i'r gwasanaethau arenol yn unig. A wnaiff y Ddirprwy Weinidog ymuno â mi i longyfarch y staff yn y Ganolfan Llosgiadau a Llawfeddygaeth Blastig yn Ysbyty Treforys am eu gwaith arloesol, gan gynnwys, yn fwyaf diweddar, y llawdriniaeth adluniol i Sidra Afzal, merch ifanc a ddiodeffodd losgiadau, ailgysylltu braich Edryd Jones a microlawdriniaeth a alluogodd Craig Stewart i ddefnyddio ei fysedd eto?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:15 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank Mike Hedges for three examples of truly fantastic treatment at the centre for burns and plastic surgery—all of them remarkably resilient people and remarkable work from people within the health service. The burns and plastic surgery centre treats 750 patients a year—a significant volume. In the points that you mentioned, it's not just what happens there; when you think about the challenge of the paramedic treatment that takes place, the transfer to a hospital, the treatment that takes place and the recovery and rehabilitation as well. It's the whole NHS working together. It's not just for Welsh patients as well, because Craig Stewart, the former services man that you mentioned, actually lives in Devon and he's come here for specialist treatment because he couldn't get this quality of treatment in the health service in England. This is a real world-leading success story and I'm really proud that this work takes place here in NHS Wales.

Diolch i Mike Hedges am dair enghraifft o driniaethau gwirioneddol wych yn y ganolfan llosgiadau a llawfeddygaeth blastig—pob un ohonynt yn bobl hynod o wydn a gwaith rhyfeddol gan bobl yn y gwasanaeth iechyd. Mae'r ganolfan llosgiadau a llawfeddygaeth blastig yn trin 750 o gleifion y flwyddyn—nifer sylweddol. Yn y pwyntiau a grybwyllwyd gennych, nid yr hyn sy'n digwydd yno yw'r unig beth; pan feddylwch am her y driniaeth barafeddygol sy'n digwydd, y trosglwyddo i'r ysbyty, y driniaeth sy'n digwydd, yn ogystal â'r broses adfer ac adsefydlu. Mae'r GIG cyfan yn gweithio gyda'i gilydd. Nid rhywbeth ar gyfer cleifion yng Nghymru yn unig yw hyn chwaith, gan fod Craig Stewart, y cyn-aelod o'r lluoedd arfog a grybwyllwyd gennych, yn byw yn Nyfnaint a daeth yma i gael triniaeth arbenigol am na allai gael triniaeth o ansawdd tebyg yn y gwasanaeth iechyd yn Lloegr. Mae hon yn stori am lwyddiant sy'n arwain y byd ac rwy'n falch iawn fod y gwaith hwn yn digwydd yma yng Ngwasanaeth Iechyd Gwladol Cymru.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:16 **Bethan Jenkins** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Ddirprwy Weinidog, roeddwn jest am fynd yn ôl at y mater o fynediad at GPs. Mae lot o bobl yn fy ardal i yn dweud wrthyf i eu bod nhw mewn un 'surgery' yn benodol yn Aberafan—King's Surgery—yn methu â gwneud apwyntiad gyda'r 'secretary' yn benodol. Maen nhw'n gorfod siarad efo'r doctor i esbonio'r hyn sydd yn bod efo nhw cyn y gallan nhw weld y doctor, ac mae hynny'n peri problem i bobl sydd â phroblemau iechyd meddwl, sy'n methu ag esbonio'n iawn dros y ffôn, a phobl gydag anableddau penodol. Rwyf wedi ysgrifennu atyn nhw ond a oes yna ryw fath o gyngor cenedlaethol y gallwch ei roi i ni i sicrhau bod pobl sydd eisiau gweld GP yn gallu gweld GP pan fo angen?

Deputy Minister, I just wanted to return to the issue of access to GPs. I've had a number of people in my region telling me that one specific surgery in Aberafan—King's Surgery—can't now make appointments through the secretary. They have to speak to the doctor to explain their problem before they are able to see the GP, and that causes problems for people with mental health issues, who can't necessarily explain these things properly over the phone, and people with specific disabilities. I have written to them, but is there any national guidance that you can provide in order to ensure that people who want to see a GP can do so when they need to?

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



14:17 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I thank the Member for the question. Access to GP services is one of the areas where we recognise there is a continuing challenge. It's a persistent issue that Members from all parties raise with me. But, in terms of the point you make about the service that you've just described, I can't comment in particular, but I would say that telephone triage has a place. Actually, having a medical professional perform that telephone triage can be particularly helpful in directing people to the right care. The point is: how appropriate is it? We are considering the best way in which GP services can be provided and the way people access them. It's not an easy area, because these are not just independent contractors. They need to understand the specific circumstances in each area and the whole team that could be seen. So, this is a matter that I'm giving some active consideration to, and when I reach a point when there is going to be national guidance, I'll make sure that Members are properly informed.

Diolch i'r Aelod am y cwestiwn. Mae mynediad at wasanaethau meddygon teulu yn un o'r meysydd lle rydym yn cydnabod bod yna her barhaus. Mae'n broblem gyson sy'n cael ei chrybwyll gan Aelodau o bob plaid. Ond o ran y pwynt a wnewch am y gwasanaeth a ddisgrifiwyd gennych yn awr, ni allaf roi sylwadau penodol, ond byddwn yn dweud bod lle i frysennu dros y ffôn. Mewn gwirionedd, gallai cael gweithiwr meddygol proffesiynol i gyflawni'r gwaith o frysennu dros y ffôn fod yn arbennig o ddefnyddiol ar gyfer cyfeirio pobl at y gofal cywir. Y pwynt yw: pa mor briodol ydyw? Rydym yn ystyried y ffordd orau o ddarparu gwasanaethau meddyg teulu a'r ffordd y mae pobl yn eu defnyddio. Nid yw'n faes hawdd, gan nad contractwyr annibynnol yn unig yw'r rhain. Mae angen iddynt ddeall yr amgylchiadau penodol ym mhob maes a'r tîm cyfan y gellid ei weld. Felly, mae hwn yn fater rwy'n rhoi rhywfaint o ystyriaeth weithredol iddo, a phan gyrhaeddaf y pwynt lle y bydd canllawiau cenedlaethol i'w darparu, byddaf yn gwneud yn siŵr fod yr Aelodau'n cael y wybodaeth briodol.

14:18 **Peter Black** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Deputy Minister, will you give us an update on access to neuroendocrine cancer services for constituents in the South Wales West region please?

Ddirprwy Weinidog, a wnewch chi roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i ni ynglŷn â mynediad at wasanaethau cancr niwroendocrin ar gyfer etholwyr yn rhanbarth Gorllewin De Cymru os gwelwch yn dda?

14:18 **Vaughan Gething** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I will happily write to the Member with the detail on the matter.

Byddaf yn hapus i ysgrifennu at yr Aelod gyda'r manylion ar y mater.

14:18 **2. Cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**2. Questions to the Counsel General**

**Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Y Symudwn yn awr at yr eitem nesaf ar yr agenda, sef cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol. Daw Cwestiwn 1 gan Simon Thomas.

Symudwn yn awr at yr eitem nesaf ar yr agenda, sef cwestiynau i'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol. Daw Cwestiwn 1 gan Simon Thomas.

### Y Model Cadw Pwerau

### The Reserved Powers Model

14:18 **Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*1. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wedi'u cael gyda swyddogion y gyfraith ynghylch y model cadw pwerau? OAQ(4)0079(CG)*

*1. What discussions has the Counsel General had with law officers regarding the reserved powers model? OAQ(4)0079(CG)*

14:18 **Theodore Huckle** [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*Y Cwnsler Cyffredinol / The Counsel General*

Good afternoon, everyone. It is not my intention to make statements about discussions I've had with law officers or to disclose the content of any such discussions. This is an established convention designed to preserve the confidentiality of those discussions and the relationship between law officers.

Prynhawn da, bawb. Nid yw'n fwiad gennyf i wneud datganiadau am drafodaethau rwyf wedi eu cael gyda swyddogion y gyfraith na datgelu cynnwys trafodaethau o'r fath. Mae hwn yn gonfensiwn sefydledig a gynlluniwyd i gadw cyfrinachedd y trafodaethau hynny a'r berthynas rhwng swyddogion y gyfraith.

14:18

**Simon Thomas** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Nid yw'r etholiad wedi newid dim byd yng nghyd-destun y Cwnsler Cyffredinol, rwy'n gweld. Ond, efallai, er eich bod chi uwch law gwleidyddiaeth, Gwnsler, eich bod chi wedi sylwi bod un o brif swyddogion y Llywodraeth newydd, pan oedd e'n Ganghellor gyda'r Llywodraeth flaenorol hefyd, George Osborne, wedi dod i Gymru ac wedi dweud y bydd yna ddeddfwriaeth ynghylch y mater yma o fewn 100 diwrnod. Nid wyf yn gwybod a ydym yn cadw at y 100 diwrnod ai peidio, ond un peth roeddwn yn awyddus i'w glywed oedd nid y cynnwys, ond a oes yna drafodaethau o gwbl yn digwydd ynghylch darparu'r model yma a chynnwys unrhyw Ddeddf bosib a fydd yn ein symud ni tuag at y model cadw pwerau.

The election has changed nothing in the context of the Counsel General, I see. But, although you are, perhaps, above politics, Counsel General, you may have noticed that one of the chief officials of the new Government, when he was Chancellor with the previous Government, George Osborne, came to Wales and said that there will be legislation on this issue within 100 days. I don't know if we're going to stick to that or not, but the one thing I was eager to hear was not the contents, of course, but whether there are any negotiations or discussions happening on providing this model and its inclusion in any possible Bill that will move us towards a reserved powers model.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:19

**Theodore Huckle**

I think the best answer I can give to that is this: largely these matters are proceeding at the political level and the discussions are largely about what's going to be in the list and what's not going to be in the list. Therefore, these are not matters that are operating strictly at the legal level. The First Minister is on record as expressing concern about the possibility of attempts to row back the settlement—those are his words, not mine—and you would not expect me to do anything other than agree with him. But, in terms of the legal position and the advice that I may or may not be asked to give, it's a bit early.

Rwy'n credu mai'r ateb gorau y gallaf ei roi ar hynny yw hyn: at ei gilydd, mae'r materion hyn yn mynd rhagddynt ar y lefel wleidyddol ac mae'r trafodaethau'n ymwneud yn bennaf â'r hyn sy'n mynd i fod ar y rhestr, a'r hyn nad yw'r mynd i fod ar y rhestr. Felly, nid yw'r rhain yn faterion sy'n gweithredu'n llwyr ar y lefel gyfreithiol. Cofnodwyd bod y Prif Weinidog yn mynegi pryder ynglŷn â'r posibilrwydd y ceir ymdrechion i droi cefn ar y setliad—ei eiriau ef yw'r rheini, nid fy ngeiriau i—ac ni fydddech yn disgwyl i mi wneud unrhyw beth heblaw cytuno ag ef. Ond o ran y sefyllfa gyfreithiol a'r cyngor y gallai fod gofyn i mi ei roi, neu beidio, mae hi braidd yn gynnar.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:20

**Mick Antoniw** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Counsel General, on the issue of reserved powers, and the precise mechanics of reserved powers, of course, we had two major conflicting cases in some ways, on the Agricultural Sector (Wales) Bill and also on the Recovery of Medical Costs for Asbestos Diseases (Wales) Bill. On the one hand, devolved in those areas that were devolved to us in a broad sense, and on the other basically raising the whole issue of fiscal powers that were associated with devolved responsibilities. And that's a conundrum that still remains. I wonder whether, in the consideration of the mechanics of reserved powers, though, the issue is the nature of the definition of what is reserved, and in order to overcome the fiscal issue, whether in the consideration of those areas that are to be reserved or not reserved, the issue of fiscal powers relevant to and associated with those powers would be a way of overcoming the issue that was raised in the judgment in the asbestos recovery of benefits legislation.

Gwnsler Cyffredinol, ar fater cadw pwerau, ac union beirianwaith cadw pwerau, wrth gwrs, roedd gennym ddau brif achos a oedd yn gwrthdaro mewn rhai ffyrdd, yn ymwneud â Bil y Sector Amaethyddol (Cymru) a'r Bil Adennill Costau Meddygol ar gyfer Clefydau Asbestos (Cymru). Ar y naill law, roeddent yn faterion wedi'i datganoli yn y meysydd a gafodd eu datganoli i ni mewn ystyr gyffredinol, ac ar y llaw arall, yn tynnu sylw yn y bôn at holl fater pwerau cyllidol a oedd yn gysylltiedig â chyfrifoldebau datganoledig. Ac mae honno'n benbleth sy'n parhau o hyd. Wrth ystyried peirianwaith cadw pwerau, fodd bynnag, tybed a yw'r broblem yn ymwneud â natur y diffiniad o'r hyn sy'n cael ei gadw'n ôl, ac er mwyn goresgyn y broblem gyllidol, wrth ystyried y meysydd sydd i'w cadw neu i beidio â'u cadw, byddai mater pwerau cyllidol sy'n berthnasol i'r pwerau hynny ac yn gysylltiedig â hwy yn ffordd o oresgyn y broblem a gododd yn y dyfarniad ar y ddeddfwriaeth asbestos ynghylch adennill budd-daliadau.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

14:21

**Theodore Huckle**

The Member raises some very interesting questions, and he may well be right to suggest that that is a possible way forward, but it's not something upon which I can really express an opinion, or would wish to do so.

Mae'r Aelod yn gofyn cwestiynau diddorol iawn, ac mae'n bosibl ei fod yn iawn yn awgrymu fod honno'n ffordd bosibl ymlaen, ond nid yw'n rhywbeth y gallaf fynegi barn arno, ac ni fyddwn yn dymuno gwneud hynny.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

**Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 a Deddf Cymru 2014**

**The Human Rights Act 1998 and the Wales Act 2014**

14:21	<p><b>Simon Thomas</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p><i>2. Pa drafodaethau y mae'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wedi'u cael gydag aelodau o'r proffesiwn cyfreithiol ynghylch goblygiadau Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 a Deddf Cymru 2014? OAQ(4)0078(CG)</i></p>	<p><i>2. What discussions has the Counsel General held with members of the legal profession regarding the implications of the Human Rights Act 1998 and the Wales Act 2014? OAQ(4)0078(CG)</i></p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:22	<p><b>Theodore Huckle</b></p> <p>Mr Thomas will be glad to hear that I can confirm that I've had no discussions with members of the legal profession regarding the implications of the Human Rights Act 1998 in light of the Wales Act 2014.</p>	<p>Bydd Mr Thomas yn falch o glywed fy mod yn gallu cadarnhau nad wyf wedi cael unrhyw drafodaethau gydag aelodau o'r proffesiwn cyfreithiol ynglŷn â goblygiadau Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 yng ngoleuni Deddf Cymru 2014.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:22	<p><b>Simon Thomas</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Diolch, Gwnsler, am yr ateb cadarnhaol hwnnw. Yn fy marn i, serch hynny, mae Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998 yn rhan bellach o gyfansoddiad Cymru drwy ei hymgorffori yn y Deddfau gwahanol cyfansoddiadol rydym ni wedi eu cael yn sefydlu'r Cynulliad hwn. A gaf i ofyn dau gwestiwn penodol i chi? Yn eich barn chi, a oes angen cydsyniad deddfwriaethol gan y Cynulliad i unrhyw ymgais i ddiddymu neu newid Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, oherwydd ei bod wedi ei hymgorffori yn ein deddfwriaeth ni? Ac yn ail, a oes hawl gennych chi fel Cwnsler Cyffredinol i fynd i'r Goruchel Lys ar eich liwt eich hunan, fel petai, pe bai'r Ddeddf yn cael ei diddymu heb gydsyniad y Cynulliad?</p>	<p>Thank you, Counsel General, for that positive response. In my view, however, the Human Rights Act 1998 is now part of the Welsh constitution, through its incorporation in various constitutional Acts that we've had establishing this Assembly. May I ask you two specific question? In your view, is the legislative consent of the Assembly needed for any attempt to abolish or change the Human Rights Act 1998, because it is incorporated in our own legislation? Secondly, do you, as Counsel General, have a right to go to the Supreme Court off your own bat, as it were, if the Act were to be abolished without the agreement of this Assembly?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:23	<p><b>Theodore Huckle</b></p> <p>The simple answer is that, of course, this is a matter that is forming the basis of a lot of discussion, not only in this Assembly but also, as you will know and be entitled to infer, in Government and elsewhere amongst academics and so on, and it raises some very interesting questions. I am not going to be in a position to answer them, because this is not a matter, subject to the second point that you raised, which I will enter upon as exercising an independent function—independent Government function, that is. So, therefore, I'm not at liberty to say anything about this on behalf of Government until such time as Welsh Government has determined its position on it, and that is not yet the case. Whether there is a requirement to have a legislative consent memorandum, effectively, in relation to the proposal to abolish or replace the Human Rights Act 1998, it's a question that has to be determined in relation to what we sometimes call the Sewel convention, as to whether it is a constitutional principle that the devolved powers of this Assembly will not be, if you like, abrogated or changed without the consent of the Assembly. And I think there are differing views about what the position is in relation to that. It's not simply a matter of interpretation of the Government of Wales Act 2006, and it is does impinge on the whole question of parliamentary sovereignty, of course.</p> <p>On the second point, it really comes to this, I suppose: does that matter become a devolution issue? And exactly the same issues arise for consideration as to whether there is a devolution issue. I will await with interest the formulation of the Government's policy and position on that matter as well. And then I may have to make a decision about it.</p>	<p>Yr ateb syml, wrth gwrs, yw bod hwn yn fater sy'n sail i lawer o drafod, nid yn unig yn y Cynulliad hwn, ond hefyd, fel y byddwch yn gwybod ac fel y bydd hawl gennych i gasglu, yn y Llywodraeth ac mewn mannau eraill ymhlith academyddion ac yn y blaen, ac mae'n codi rhai cwestiynau diddorol iawn. Nid wyf yn mynd i fod mewn sefyllfa i'w hateb, am nad yw hwn yn fater, yn ddarostyngedig i'r ail bwynt a nodwyd gennych, yr ystyriaeth ei fod yn arfer swyddogaeth annibynnol—swyddogaeth lywodraethol annibynnol, hynny yw. Felly, nid wyf yn rhydd i ddweud dim yn ei gylch ar ran y Llywodraeth hyd oni fydd Llywodraeth Cymru wedi pennu ei safbwynt arno, ac nid yw hynny wedi digwydd eto. Pa un a oes gofyniad i gael memorandwm cydsyniad deddfwriaethol, i bob pwrpas, mewn perthynas â'r cynnig i ddiddymu neu ddisodli Deddf Hawliau Dynol 1998, mae'n gwestiwn sy'n rhaid ei benderfynu mewn perthynas â'r hyn rydym weithiau yn ei alw'n gonfensiwn Sewel, ynglŷn ag a yw'n egwyddor gyfansoddiadol na fydd pwerau datganoledig y Cynulliad hwn, os mynnwch, yn cael eu dileu neu eu newid heb ganiatâd y Cynulliad. Ac rwy'n credu bod safbwyntiau gwahanol ynglŷn â beth yw'r sefyllfa mewn perthynas â hynny. Nid yw'n fater sy'n ymwneud yn syml â dehongli Deddf Llywodraeth Cymru 2006, ac nid yw'n gwrthdaro â holl gwestiwn sofraniaeth seneddol, wrth gwrs.</p> <p>Ar yr ail bwynt, mae'n debyg ei fod yn ymwneud â hyn mewn gwirionedd: a yw'n dod yn fater datganoli? Ac mae'n un cwestiynau'n union i'w hystyried o ran a oes mater yn codi mewn perthynas â datganoli. Byddaf yn disgwyl yn eiddgar i weld y Llywodraeth yn ffurfio polisi a safbwynt ar y mater hwnnw hefyd. Ac yna efallai y bydd yn rhaid i mi wneud penderfyniad ynglŷn â'r mater.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

14:25	<p><b>Mick Antoniw</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>Counsel General, on the same issue of the Human Rights Act, I think that what would be helpful from you as a member of Government would be perhaps a paper that sets out the Welsh Government's views on the potential abolition of the Human Rights Act and any of the potential legal issues that might arise that would be relevant to us as a legislature. If it's difficult to give an opinion on it, a wink would do. [Laughter.]</p>	<p>Gwnsler Cyffredinol, ar yr un mater, sef y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol, rwy'n credu mai'r hyn a fyddai'n ddefnyddiol gennych chi fel aelod o'r Llywodraeth fyddai papur sy'n nodi barn Llywodraeth Cymru ar ddiddymiad posibl y Ddeddf Hawliau Dynol ac unrhyw un o'r materion cyfreithiol posibl a allai godi a fyddai'n berthnasol i ni fel deddfwrfa. Os yw'n anodd rhoi barn arno, byddai winc yn gwneud y tro. [Chwerthin.]</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:25	<p><b>Theodore Huckle</b></p> <p>I don't do winks. [Laughter.] The simple answer again, without wishing to avoid it, is that this is a very important matter, and I have no doubt, and it is already pretty clear to me, that the First Minister will lead on this matter, and it is therefore the First Minister who we can expect to articulate the position of the Government.</p>	<p>Nid wyf yn un am roi winc. [Chwerthin.] Yr ateb syml eto, heb ddymuno ei osgoi, yw bod hwn yn fater pwysig iawn, ac nid oes amheuaeth gennyf, ac mae eisoes yn eithaf amlwg i mi, y bydd y Prif Weinidog yn arwain ar y mater hwn, ac felly gallwn ddisgwyl i Brif Weinidog Cymru fynegi safbwynt y Llywodraeth.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
<b>Cyngor gan Drydydd Partion</b>		<b>Advice from Third Parties</b>	
14:26	<p><b>Mike Hedges</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p><i>3. Wrth roi cyngor cyfreithiol i Lywodraeth Cymru, a yw'r Cwnsler Cyffredinol wedi gofyn am gyngor gan drydydd partion? OAQ(4)0077(CG)</i></p>	<p><i>3. In providing legal advice to the Welsh Government, has the Counsel General sought advice from third parties? OAQ(4)0077(CG)</i></p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:26	<p><b>Theodore Huckle</b></p> <p>The Welsh Government maintains a panel of counsel, selected through open competition. As will have been evident from the Supreme Court hearings considering the competence of Bills passed in this place, I take advice from and am supported by counsel as I consider necessary.</p>	<p>Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn cynnal panel cwnsleriaid, a ddetholwyd drwy gystadleuaeth agored. Fel y bydd yn amlwg o wrandawiadau'r Goruchaf Lys a oedd yn ystyried cymhwysedd Biliau a basiwyd yn y lle hwn, rwy'n cymryd cyngor ac yn cael fy nghefnogi gan gwnsleriaid yn ôl yr hyn a ystyriaif yn angenrheidiol.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:26	<p><b>Mike Hedges</b> <a href="#">Bywgraffiad</a> <a href="#">Biography</a></p> <p>How do you decide which leading counsel to consult?</p>	<p>Sut rydych chi'n penderfynu pa gwnsler arweiniol i ymgynghori ag ef?</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>
14:26	<p><b>Theodore Huckle</b></p> <p>Well, as I've said, there is a panel of counsel that we use. I'm not going to suggest that we only use the panel. The panel of counsel is a matter of public record. It includes both the leading counsel, or silks, QCs, and also junior counsel who fall into two categories, A and B, depending on seniority. A decision is made as to which counsel to seek advice from based upon the perception of the complexity, seriousness et cetera of the issue in question. I should add, for completeness, that, whilst we make every effort to use counsel from the panel of counsel itself, there are occasions where, for reason of particular speciality, for example, if an issue bears upon matters that aren't within the expertise of those on the panel, we reserve the right, and do sometimes, instruct other counsel to help.</p>	<p>Wel, fel y dywedais, rydym yn defnyddio panel o gwnsleriaid. Nid wyf am awgrymu mai'r panel hwnnw'n unig a ddefnyddiwn. Mae'r panel cwnsleriaid wedi'i gofnodi'n gyhoeddus. Mae'n cynnwys cwnsleriaid arweiniol, neu sidanwyr, Cwnsleriaid y Frenhines, a chwnsleriaid iau hefyd sy'n perthyn i ddau gategori, A a B, yn dibynnu ar statws. Gwneir penderfyniad ynglŷn â pha gwnsleriaid i ofyn am gyngor ganddynt yn seiliedig ar y canfyddiad o gymhlethdod, difrifoldeb ac ati y mater dan sylw. Dylwn ychwanegu, er mwyn rhoi'r darlun cyflawn, er ein bod yn gwneud pob ymdrech i ddefnyddio cyngor y panel cwnsleriaid ei hun, ceir adegau pan fyddwn yn cadw'r hawl i ofyn am gymorth gan gwnsleriaid eraill am resymau'n ymwneud ag arbenigedd penodol, er enghraifft os yw mater yn ymwneud ag agweddau nad ydynt yn rhan o arbenigedd aelodau'r panel, a byddwn yn gwneud hynny weithiau.</p>	<p>Senedd.tv <a href="#">Fideo</a> <a href="#">Video</a></p>

14:27 **3. Cwestiynau i Gomisiwn y Cynulliad**

**Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Item 3 has been withdrawn.

**3. Questions to the Assembly Commission**

Y [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Mae Eitem 3 wedi cael ei thynnu'n ôl.

14:27 **4. Dadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg ar yr Ymchwiliad i Ganlyniadau Addysgol Plant o Gartrefi Incwm Isel**

**Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

We now move to item 4, which is the debate on the Children, Young People and Education Committee's report on its inquiry into educational outcomes for children from low-income households. I call on the Chair of the committee, Ann Jones.

Cynnig NDM5764 Ann Jones

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg ar yr ymchwiliad i Ganlyniadau Addysgol Plant o Gartrefi Incwm Isel, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 27 Chwefror 2015.

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.*

**4. Debate on the Children, Young People and Education Committee's Report on its Inquiry into Educational Outcomes for Children from Low-income Households**

Y [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Symudwn yn awr at eitem 4, sef y ddadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg ar ei ymchwiliad i ganlyniadau addysgol plant o gartrefi incwm isel. Galwaf ar Gadeirydd y pwyllgor, Ann Jones.

Motion NDM5764 Ann Jones

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

Notes the report of the Children, Young People and Education Committee on the inquiry into Educational Outcomes for Children from Low Income Households, which was laid in the Table Office on 27 February 2015.

*Motion moved.*

14:27 **Ann Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you, Presiding Officer. I'm pleased to be opening this debate on the Children, Young People and Education Committee's report on educational outcomes for children from low-income households. I would like to start by thanking all of those who took the time to contribute to the committee's work. There were many pieces of written evidence, but in particular I thank those members of the public and parents who shared their experiences so readily with the committee, which made it a lot easier for us to come to conclusions. As usual, I do want to thank the committee clerking team for their assistance in helping us to produce this report. It is a vitally important issue for members of the committee, and we will continue to monitor Welsh Government progress and we will hold the Minister to account on this issue, but I guess the Minister knows that anyway.

Diolch i chi, Lywydd. Rwy'n falch o gael agor y ddadl hon ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg ar ganlyniadau addysgol plant o gartrefi incwm isel. Hoffwn ddechrau drwy ddiolch i bawb a roddodd eu hamser i gyfrannu at waith y pwyllgor. Roedd llawer o ddarnau o dystiolaeth ysgrifenedig, ond yn arbennig, diolch i'r aelodau o'r cyhoedd a'r rhieni a oedd mor barod i rannu eu profiadau â'r pwyllgor, gan ei gwneud yn llawer haws i ni ddod i gasgliadau. Fel arfer, rwyf am ddiolch i dîm clercio'r pwyllgor am eu cymorth yn ein helpu i gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Mae'n fater hanfodol bwysig i aelodau'r pwyllgor, a byddwn yn parhau i fonitro cynnydd Llywodraeth Cymru ac yn dwyn y Gweinidog i gyfrif mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn, ond rwy'n dyfalu bod y Gweinidog yn gwybod hynny beth bynnag.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The first part of our report deals with the effectiveness of Welsh Government strategy. There are considerable challenges for Welsh Government in closing the attainment gap for children from low-income families. There have been many programmes and initiatives introduced over recent years, but we feel they haven't succeeded in closing the gap. Policies aimed at generally improving attainment levels are welcomed, but they do often result in a rising-tide-raises-all-boats effect and do not succeed in closing that all-important attainment gap. Policies must, therefore, be specifically targeted at raising the attainment of pupils from low-income families. Now, we welcome the Minister's personal commitment to this issue and the fact that he has identified it as his priority for the department. However, whilst some progress has been made in recent years, the scale of the change needed to meet this challenge should not be underestimated.

We felt that the Welsh Government should closely monitor whether its funding and policy initiatives aimed at closing the gap are delivering both the intended outcomes for pupils and also value for money. It should also respond quickly where there is evidence of limited impact. Welsh Government must continue to engage with schools, local authorities and regional consortia to ensure that they have bought in to this agenda fully. Everyone needs to understand the scale of change that is expected. There is a lot of mention in the report of the foundation phase but, given the debate yesterday on the evaluation of the foundation phase, I think there's very little that we need to rehearse again this afternoon, other than, if I may, just one reference around the Donaldson review said, where Graham Donaldson himself said there is continuing support for the foundation phase amongst stakeholders. However, it must continue to be improved and its impact must be maximised. The committee will continue to keep this under review.

A great deal of the second part of our report is around the pupil deprivation grant. We welcomed some of the positive outputs resulting from the pupil deprivation grant, as outlined in the year 1 evaluation report of the programme. There are a number of areas that are still a cause for concern, including whether the use of the grant is being targeted at children from disadvantaged backgrounds. Another concern was whether the investment demonstrates improved outcomes for children in the longer term. The year 1 evaluation report has acknowledged that it is too early in the process to properly assess the impact of the pupil deprivation grant and so we will look forward to the publication of the second annual evaluation report this autumn.

In terms of how schools are using the pupil deprivation grant, there are too many that aren't using interventions that are proven to be effective in improving outcomes for pupils from low-income houses. We agree with the Minister that children's needs are complex and a variety of interventions are needed in response. Schools should be allowed to respond to the specific needs of their children in imaginative ways. However, all these approaches should be based on evidence.

Mae rhan gyntaf ein hadroddiad yn ymdrin ag effeithiolrwydd strategaeth Llywodraeth Cymru. Mae yna heriau sylweddol i Lywodraeth Cymru o ran cau'r bwch cyrhaeddiad i blant o deuluoedd incwm isel. Cyflwynwyd llawer o raglenni a mentrau dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ond teimlwn nad ydynt wedi llwyddo i gau'r bwch. Mae polisiau sy'n anelu at wella lefelau cyrhaeddiad yn gyffredinol i'w croesawu, ond yn aml arweiniant at effaith y llanw sy'n codi'r holl gyhoch ac nid ydynt yn llwyddo i gau'r bwch cyrhaeddiad hollbwysig hwnnw. Mae'n rhaid targedu polisiau'n benodol felly at godi cyrhaeddiad disgyblion o deuluoedd incwm isel. Nawr, rydym yn croesawu ymrwymiad personol y Gweinidog i'r mater hwn a'r ffaith ei fod wedi nodi mai dyma yw ei flaenoriaeth ar gyfer yr adran. Fodd bynnag, er bod rhywfaint o gynnydd wedi'i wneud yn y blynyddoedd diwethaf, ni ddylid tanbriso graddfa'r newid sydd ei angen i ateb yr her.

Teimlem y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru fonitro'n fanwl a yw ei chynlluniau cyllido a'i pholisi sy'n anelu i gau'r bwch yn cyflawni'r canlyniadau a fwriadwyd ar gyfer disgyblion yn ogystal â rhoi gwerth am arian. Dylai hefyd ymateb yn gyflym lle y ceir tystiolaeth mai cyfyngedig yw'r effaith. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru barhau i ymgysylltu ag ysgolion, awdurdodau lleol a chonsortia rhanbarthol i sicrhau eu bod wedi ymrwmo'n llwyr i'r agenda hon. Mae angen i bawb ddeall graddfa'r newid a ddisgwylir. Mae llawer o sôn yn yr adroddiad am y cyfnod sylfaen, ond o ystyried y ddadl ddoe ar y gwerthusiad o'r cyfnod sylfaen, rwy'n credu nad oes angen i ni ailadrodd fawr ddim eto y prynhawn yma, ac eithrio un cyfeiriad at adolygiad Donaldson, os caf, lle y dywedodd Graham Donaldson ei hun fod cefnogaeth barhaus i'r cyfnod sylfaen ymysg rhanddeiliaid. Fodd bynnag, mae'n rhaid iddo barhau i gael ei wella a rhaid sicrhau ei fod mor effeithiol â phosibl. Bydd y pwyllgor yn parhau i adolygu hyn.

Mae cryn dipyn o ail ran ein hadroddiad yn cynnwys y grant amddifadedd disgyblion. Rydym wedi croesawu rhai o'r allbynnau cadarnhaol sy'n deillio o'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion, fel yr amlinellwyd yn adroddiad gwerthuso blwyddyn gyntaf y rhaglen. Mae yna nifer o feysydd sy'n dal i beri pryder, gan gynnwys i ba raddau y mae defnydd o'r grant yn cael ei dargedu at blant o gefndiroedd difreintiedig. Pryder arall oedd i ba raddau y mae'r buddsoddiad yn dangos canlyniadau gwell i blant yn y tymor hwy. Mae adroddiad gwerthuso'r flwyddyn gyntaf wedi cydnabod ei bod yn rhy gynnar yn y broses i asesu effaith y grant amddifadedd disgyblion ac felly edrychwn ymlaen at gyhoeddi'r ail adroddiad gwerthuso blynyddol yn yr hydref.

O ran sut y mae ysgolion yn defnyddio'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion, ceir gormod ohonynt nad ydynt yn defnyddio ymyriadau y profwyd eu bod yn effeithiol ar gyfer gwella deilliannau disgyblion o gartrefi incwm isel. Rydym yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog fod anghenion plant yn gymhleth a bod angen ymateb drwy ddefnyddio amrywiaeth o ymyriadau. Dylai ysgolion allu ymateb i anghenion penodol eu plant mewn ffyrdd dychmygus. Fodd bynnag, dylai pob dull fod yn seiliedig ar dystiolaeth.



There needs to be more transparency about the activities and programmes that schools are funding through the pupil deprivation grant. We note the Minister's response that schools are required to publish details of what their PDG is being spent on, either on their own school website or the website of the relevant consortium. We'd be interested to see whether this is actually happening in practice, and would like the Minister, in his response, to outline what oversight arrangements are in place to ensure that such requirements are complied with.

I note the Minister's response to recommendation 5, relating to the extension of the PDG to three and four-year-olds. We understand the argument for extending the grant and the benefits that result from it, and we note that that has actually happened in this year's budget. The Welsh Government must put in place arrangements to monitor the effectiveness of the overall programme rigorously, to ensure that it is having the necessary impact and is delivering value for money.

The third part of this report deals with Schools Challenge Cymru. We've said before that this is an ambitious programme and the committee was open-minded about whether it can deliver improvements on the scale that is needed. Similar programmes in other parts of the UK have had some success, but others have not. We were clear in our conclusions that Welsh Government must ensure that the lessons of the previous challenge programmes are learned, be they successes or failures. Effective interventions must be identified and best practice must be shared to realise the full benefit of the programme. We also felt that Welsh Government should identify any factors outside the challenge programme that may have contributed to success and, if possible, put them in place.

We had a number of concerns about the funding arrangements for the challenge. As outlined in Welsh Government's response, £7.9 million has needed to be found from existing education and skills budgets to fund the challenge programme. We were concerned about the impact this would have on other programmes or initiatives and we will as a committee keep this under review. Of the total budget, £3.9 million has been allocated directly to the consortia. The Minister has outlined the purpose of this funding in his response. Again, the use of this funding, which has been taken away from other education and skills budgets, must be kept under review to ensure that value for money exists. I would be grateful if the Minister again could outline the monitoring arrangements he has put in place for this, so that we as a committee can keep it under scrutiny.

Mae angen mwy o dryloywder ynglŷn â'r gweithgareddau a'r rhaglenni y mae ysgolion yn eu hariannu gan ddefnyddio'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion. Nodwn ymateb y Gweinidog ei bod yn ofynnol i ysgolion gyhoeddi manylion yr hyn y mae eu grant amddifadedd disgyblion yn cael ei wario arno, naill ai ar wefan eu hysgol neu ar wefan y consortiwm perthnasol. Byddai'n ddi-ddorol gweld a yw hyn yn digwydd yn ymarferol a byddwn yn dymuno i'r Gweinidog amlinellu yn ei ymateb pa drefniadau trosolwg sydd ar waith i sicrhau bod gofynion o'r fath yn cael eu bodloni.

Nodaf ymateb y Gweinidog i argymhelliad 5, sy'n ymwneud ag ymestyn y grant amddifadedd disgyblion i blant tair a phedair blwydd oed. Rydym yn deall y ddadl dros ymestyn y grant a'r manteision sy'n deillio ohono, a nodwn fod hynny wedi digwydd yn y gyllideb eleni. Rhaid i Lywodraeth Cymru roi trefniadau ar waith i fonitro effeithiolrwydd y rhaglen gyffredinol yn drylwyr, er mwyn sicrhau ei bod yn cael yr effaith angenrheidiol ac yn darparu gwerth am arian.

Mae trydedd ran yr adroddiad yn ymdrin â Her Ysgolion Cymru. Rydym wedi dweud o'r blaen fod hon yn rhaglen uchelgeisiol ac roedd gan y pwyllgor feddwl agored ynglŷn ag a all y rhaglen gyflawni gwelliannau ar y raddfa sydd ei hangen. Mae rhaglenni tebyg mewn rhannau eraill o'r DU wedi cael rhywfaint o lwyddiant ond nid yw'n wir am bob un. Roeddem yn eglur yn ein casgliadau y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru sicrhau bod y gwersi o'r rhaglenni her blaenorol wedi'u dysgu, boed yn llwyddiannau neu'n fethiannau. Rhaid nodi ymyriadau effeithiol a rhaid rhannu arfer gorau er mwyn elwa'n llawn ar y rhaglen. Teimlem hefyd y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru nodi unrhyw ffactorau y tu allan i'r rhaglen her a allai fod wedi cyfrannu at lwyddiant a'u rhoi ar waith os yn bosibl.

Roedd gennym nifer o bryderon ynghylch y trefniadau cyllido ar gyfer yr her. Fel yr amlinellwyd yn ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru, roedd angen dod o hyd i £7.9 miliwn o gyllidebau addysg a sgiliau presennol i ariannu'r rhaglen her. Roeddem yn pryderu am yr effaith y byddai hyn yn ei chael ar raglenni neu fentrau eraill a byddwn fel pwyllgor yn parhau i adolygu hyn. Mae £3.9 miliwn o gyfanswm y gyllideb wedi'i ddyrannu yn uniongyrchol i'r consortia. Mae'r Gweinidog wedi amlinellu pwrpas yr arian yn ei ymateb. Unwaith eto, dylid cadw'r defnydd a wneir o'r arian, a gymerwyd o gyllidebau addysg a sgiliau eraill, dan adolygiad er mwyn sicrhau gwerth am arian. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Gweinidog amlinellu'r trefniadau monitro y mae wedi'u rhoi ar waith ar gyfer hyn eto, er mwyn i ni fel pwyllgor ei graffu.

The final section of our report deals with the delivery of Welsh Government policy. A key message emerging from our inquiry was that, no matter how ambitious a programme or policy, its impact will be limited without effective methods of delivery. Leadership in schools is vital for this agenda. The right headteacher can drive things forward and make a real difference. But it will be difficult for schools alone to deliver change on the scale that is needed. We heard lots of evidence that better engagement between schools and parents could make an important contribution. We heard some excellent examples of this happening in both primary and secondary schools, but practice is inconsistent, and, in some cases, engagement with parents is non-existent.

But, of course, our leaders in schools need support. A number of questions were raised about the role of the consortia, and we are concerned as a committee that, since they were created, their roles in relation to local authorities may have led to a lack of clarity, particularly in relation to responsibility and accountability. This is something that I know the Wales Audit Office is investigating, and I'm sure that our committee will want to follow up work in due course.

During our inquiry, as I said, we spoke to a number of parents about the hidden cost of education and school trips. We heard of one parent spending a significant proportion of the family's weekly food shopping budget on ingredients for a home economics GCSE practical exam. We also heard that some schools are arranging overseas trips with negligible educational value. Now, we all know school trips can be a valuable part of a rounded education—we understand that, and we don't want to see those stop. But, they need to have an educational value, or contribute to the development of the pupil. And, therefore, we expect that, for any school trip, if it is of an educational value, no child should be prevented from participating because of cost.

Parents also told us that it wasn't made clear to them that certain payments were voluntary. Now, I appreciate that the Minister has outlined what guidance exists, and where it can be found, but if this is still a problem—and it still is a problem, Minister—then the only possible explanation is that the guidance is just being ignored by some schools, or some local authorities.

Finally, the committee noted the positive response received from parents to non-teaching staff, such as school liaison officers. They can play an important role, particularly in engaging with the hardest-to-reach families, by building relationships and trust. I am pleased with the work the Minister has already done, and I think is considering doing, to evaluate the impact of this important resource. So, I would like to thank the Minister for his positive response to our report. There is still work to do, and the Minister does know we will be keeping a close eye on his progress.

Mae adran olaf ein hadroddiad yn ymdrin â chyflwyno polisi Llywodraeth Cymru. Un neges allweddol a ddeilliodd o'n hymchwiliad oedd y byddai effaith polisi neu raglen yn gyfyngedig heb ddulliau effeithiol o'u cyflwyno, ni waeth pa mor uchelgeisiol ydyw. Mae arweiniad mewn ysgolion yn hanfodol ar gyfer yr agenda hon. Gall y pennaeth iawn symud pethau yn eu blaenau a gwneud gwahaniaeth go iawn. Ond bydd yn anodd i ysgolion gyflawni newid ar y raddfa sydd ei hangen ar eu pen eu hunain. Clywsom lawer o dystiolaeth y gallai ymgysylltu gwell rhwng ysgolion a rhieni wneud cyfraniad pwysig. Clywsom am rai enghreifftiau gwych o hyn yn digwydd mewn ysgolion cynradd ac uwchradd ond mae ymarfer yn anghyson ac mewn rhai achosion, ni cheir unrhyw ymgysylltu â rhieni.

Ond wrth gwrs, mae angen cefnogaeth ar ein harweinwyr yn yr ysgolion. Gofynnwyd nifer o gwestiynau ynglŷn â rôl y consortia ac rydym yn pryderu fel pwyllgor, ers iddynt gael eu creu, y gall eu rolau mewn perthynas ag awdurdodau lleol fod wedi arwain at ddiffyg eglurder, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â chyfrifoldeb ac atebolrwydd. Mae hyn yn rhywbeth y gwn fod Swyddfa Archwilio Cymru yn ymchwilio iddo ac rwy'n siŵr y bydd ein pwyllgor yn awyddus i roi camau dilynol ar waith maes o law.

Yn ystod ein hymchwiliad, fel y dywedais, buom yn siarad â nifer o rieni ynglŷn â chostau cudd addysg a theithiau ysgol. Clywsom am un rhiant yn gwario cyfran sylweddol o gyllideb siopa bwyd wythnosol y teulu ar gynhwysion ar gyfer arholiad ymarferol TGAU economeg y cartref. Clywsom hefyd fod rhai ysgolion yn trefnu teithiau tramor heb fawr o werth addysgol iddynt. Nawr, rydym i gyd yn gwybod y gall teithiau ysgol fod yn rhan werthfawr o addysg gyflawn—deallwn hynny, ac nid ydym am eu gweld yn dod i ben. Ond mae angen iddynt fod â gwerth addysgol neu gyfrannu at ddatblygiad y disgybl. Ac felly, rydym yn disgwyl na ddylai'r gost rwystru unrhyw blentyn rhag mynd ar daith ysgol, os yw o werth addysgol.

Dywedodd rhieni wrthym hefyd na wnaed yn eglur iddynt fod rhai taliadau'n wirfoddol. Nawr, rwy'n derbyn bod y Gweinidog wedi amlinellu'r canllawiau sy'n bodoli a lle y gellir dod o hyd iddynt, ond os yw hyn yn dal i fod yn broblem—ac mae'n dal yn broblem, Weinidog—yna'r unig esboniad posibl yw bod rhai ysgolion, neu rai awdurdodau lleol yn anwybyddu'r canllawiau.

Yn olaf, nododd y pwyllgor ymateb cadarnhaol rhieni i staff nad ydynt yn addysgu, megis swyddogion cyswllt ysgolion. Maent yn gallu chwarae rhan bwysig, yn enwedig wrth ymgysylltu â'r teuluoedd anoddaf eu cyrraedd, gan gryfhau cysylltiadau ac ymddiriedaeth. Rwy'n falch o'r gwaith y mae'r Gweinidog eisoes wedi'i wneud, ac yn ystyried ei wneud, rwy'n meddwl, i werthuso effaith yr adnodd pwysig hwn. Felly, hoffwn ddiolch i'r Gweinidog am ei ymateb cadarnhaol i'n hadroddiad. Mae gwaith eto i'w wneud ac mae'r Gweinidog yn gwybod y byddwn yn cadw llygad barcud ar ei gynnydd.

14:37

**Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

May I also thank other members of the committee, the Minister, and the witnesses who came to give evidence to our inquiry?

A gaf fi ddiolch hefyd i aelodau eraill y pwyllgor, y Gweinidog, ac i'r tystion a ddaeth i roi tystiolaeth i'n hymchwiliad?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I suspect that, for Members, perhaps, who sat in previous Assemblies, this inquiry might have felt a little bit like groundhog day, covering ground where we might have hoped, I think, that Welsh Government would already have had greater success. While I think the Government still has questions to answer on progress on narrowing the attainment gap between children from low-income households and their better-off counterparts, I think this inquiry did remind us about how complex the issue actually is.

Now, Members have observed before in this Chamber that low income and deprivation are different animals, and that income-poor families can be amongst the richest in terms of values, motivation, aspiration, and social responsibility, and that children in comparatively wealthy households can be emotionally neglected, or left without the boundaries or values that guide them towards stable adulthood. So, I think it does remain difficult, in my view, to grasp the true reasons why there is a gap, and a persistent and wide gap, between the attainment of children eligible for free school meals and those who are not.

I'm wondering whether the free-school-meal-eligibility test has now become too much of a blunt instrument, because it genuinely doesn't distinguish between households where there is inherited worklessness, where there is a chaotic family environment, where there is a temporary and unexpected period of unemployment, or even where there's a mix of low-paid employment and a tax credit. And I wonder does this then kind of skew the data on which we rely, in order to try and inform the kind of inquiry that we were undertaking.

While I accept that a Government develops policy around the common needs of the many—if I can put it like that—I think that does hide, or disguise, solutions that are more bespoke. That's why, as well as this report, I draw the Minister's attention to our findings on parental engagement, in our attendance and behaviour report, because each family is so different. Children need buy-in from home as well as school—I mean, I don't think that's news to any of us. But, I'm afraid, Minister, you don't have an awful lot of time left to comply with recommendation 12 of the report that we're discussing today, which asks you to report back on the effectiveness of your parental engagement initiatives.

Welsh Government has been on this territory before, of course, with the RAISE programme, which was intended to focus practitioners' attention more sharply on the implications of deprivation. That initiative, I think, cost several million pounds over its four-year lifespan, more or less, but failed to produce discernible benefits for its target group of pupils. So, Minister, I would like you, in your response, to tell us what practitioners are learning now that is different enough to help reduce the attainment gap, because what constituents are looking for now, as you might expect, is improved attainment across the board, but also in the attainment gap.

I'r rhai ohonoch a fu'n Aelodau o Gynulliadau blaenorol, rwy'n amau efallai bod yr ymholiad hwn wedi teimlo braidd yn ailadroddus, yn trafod pethau lle y byddwn wedi gobeithio, rwy'n meddwl, y byddai Llywodraeth Cymru eisoes wedi cael mwy o lwyddiant. Er fy mod yn meddwl bod gan y Llywodraeth gwestiynau i'w hateb o hyd o ran y cynnydd ar gau'r bwloch cyrhaeddiad rhwng plant o gartrefi incwm isel a'u cymheiriad mwy cefnog, credaf fod yr ymholiad wedi ein hatgoffa pa mor gymhleth yw'r mater mewn gwirionedd.

Nawr, mae Aelodau wedi nodi yn y Siambr o'r blaen fod incwm isel ac amddifadedd yn ddau beth gwahanol ac y gall teuluoedd incwm isel fod ymhlith y cyfoethocaf o ran gwerthoedd, cymhelliant, dyhead a chyfrifoldeb cymdeithasol, ac y gall plant mewn cartrefi cymharol gyfoethog fod wedi'u hesgeuluso yn emosïynol neu eu gadael heb ffiniau neu werthoedd sy'n eu harwain i fod yn oedolion cadarn. Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod deall y gwir resymau pam fod bwloch, a bwloch cyson a llydan, rhwng cyrhaeddiad plant sy'n gymwys i gael prydau ysgol am ddim a'r rhai nad ydynt yn gymwys, yn parhau i fod yn anodd, yn fy marn i.

Rwy'n meddwl tybed a yw'r prawf cymhwyster i gael prydau ysgol am ddim bellach wedi dod yn arf rhy ddi-awch, gan nad yw'n gwahaniaethu o ddifrif rhwng aelwydydd heb waith yn etifeddol, amgylchiadau teuluol caotig, cyfnodau o ddiweithdra dros dro ac annisgwyl, neu lle y ceir cymysgedd o gyflogaeth ar gyflog isel a chredyd treth hyd yn oed. Ac rwy'n meddwl tybed a yw hyn yn ystumio'r data rydym yn dibynnu arno er mwyn ceisio llywio'r math o ymholiad rydym yn ei wneud.

Er fy mod yn derbyn bod Llywodraeth yn datblygu polisi o amgylch anghenion cyffredin y lliaws—os gallaf ei roi felly—credaf fod hynny'n cuddio atebion sy'n fwy pwrpasol. Dyna pam, yn ogystal â'r adroddiad hwn, rwy'n tynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at ein canfyddiadau ar ymgysylltu â rhieni yn ein hadroddiad ar bresenoldeb ac ymddygiad, gan fod pob teulu mor wahanol. Mae angen i blant gael cefnogaeth gartref yn ogystal â'r ysgol—nid wyf yn credu bod hynny'n newyddion i neb ohonom. Ond yn anffodus, Weinidog, nid oes gennych lawer o amser ar ôl i gydymffurfio ag argymhelliad 12 yr adroddiad rydym yn ei drafod heddiw, sy'n gofyn i chi gyflwyno adroddiad ar effeithiolrwydd eich cynlluniau ymgysylltu â rhieni.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi bod yn trafod y mater hwn o'r blaen, wrth gwrs, gyda'r rhaglen Rhagori, y bwriadwyd iddi ganolbwyntio sylw addysgwyr yn fwy manwl ar oblygiadau amddifadedd. Costiodd y fenter honno sawl miliwn o bunnoedd, rwy'n meddwl, dros ei hoes o bedair blynedd, fwy neu lai, ond methodd â chynhyrchu manteision amlwg ar gyfer y grŵp o ddisgyblion a dargedai. Felly, Weinidog, yn eich ymateb, hoffwn i chi ddweud wrthym beth y mae ymarferwyr yn ei ddysgu yn awr sy'n ddigon gwahanol i helpu i leihau'r bwloch cyrhaeddiad, gan mai'r hyn y mae etholwyr yn chwilio amdano yn awr, fel y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl, yw gwella cyrhaeddiad yn gyffredinol, a chau'r bwloch cyrhaeddiad hefyd.

While I would be the first to congratulate you on any improvement, particularly, on attainment levels, obviously we've heard from the head of Estyn, recently retired, that there's a good 10 years or so to go before we can be confident of a sustained and meaningful improvement at general population level. So, those from poorer backgrounds have even further to climb. There have been some modest improvements in closing the attainment gap for looked-after children, but I'd like to hear from you, Minister, whether your current target for the percentage of children eligible for school meals gaining five good GCSEs by 2017 is still just 37 per cent. I know you may want to talk about comparisons with England, but really I'm a bit more interested in whether our young people, whatever their background, are leaving school better equipped to reach out for a life beyond low income.

I think that's why the recommendations in our report that we're discussing today are essentially about evidence: where's your money coming from? Who has the responsibility for spending it? Is it being used for its intended purposes and what evaluations of initiatives have you made and then acted upon? I think you can feel a sort of undercurrent of frustration in this report, Minister, one of which, of course, is an area of frustration dealing with the consortia. I think Ann Jones has highlighted some of our concerns about that.

I did want to ask you, finally, about the recommendations about the foundation phase in our report because, obviously, our findings corresponded with the evaluation report that came out a few days ago on the foundation phase. Yesterday, you said, quite enthusiastically, that the foundation phase delivery had, in fact, made a change to the attainment gap, even though you'd said in evidence to us in committee that that wasn't the purpose of the foundation phase—slightly worryingly. If, indeed, the foundation phase has closed the attainment gap, will you be publishing your evidence of that claim with equal enthusiasm? Thank you.

Er mai fi a fyddai'r cyntaf i'ch llongyfarch ar unrhyw welliant, yn enwedig ar lefelau cyrhaeddiad, yn amlwg rydym wedi clywed gan bennaeth Estyn, sydd wedi ymddeol yn ddiweddar, y bydd hi'n 10 mlynedd dda cyn y gallwn fod yn hyderus o weld gwelliant parhaus ac ystyrllon ar lefel y boblogaeth yn gyffredinol. Felly, mae gan y rhai o gefndiroedd tlotach ffordd bellach byth i'w dringo. Bu rhai gwelliannau cymedrol o ran cau'r bwllch cyrhaeddiad ymhlith plant sy'n derbyn gofal ond hoffwn glywed gennyh, Weinidog, ai 37 y cant yn unig yw eich targed cyfredol yn dal i fod ar gyfer y ganran o blant cymwys i gael prydau ysgol sy'n cael pump TGAU da erbyn 2017. Gwn eich bod am siarad efallai am gymariaethau â Lloegr ond mewn gwirionedd, mae gennyf ychydig mwy o ddiddordeb mewn gwybod a yw ein pobl ifanc, beth bynnag fo'u cefndir, yn gadael yr ysgol wedi'u harfogi'n well i anelu am fywyd heb fod ar incwm isel.

Rwy'n meddwl mai dyna pam y mae'r argymhellion yn yr adroddiad a drafodwn heddiw yn ymwneud â thystiolaeth yn y bôn: o ble y daw eich arian? Pwy sydd â chyfrifoldeb dros ei wario? A yw'n cael ei ddefnyddio yn ôl y bwriad a pha fentrau a werthuswyd gennyh, ac yna'u gweithredu? Rwy'n credu y gallwch deimlo rhyw fath o rwystredigaeth o dan yr wyneb yn yr adroddiad hwn, Weinidog, ac un ohonynt, wrth gwrs, yw'r rhwystredigaeth wrth ymwneud â'r consortia. Rwy'n meddwl bod Ann Jones wedi amlygu rhai o'n pryderon ynglŷn â hynny.

Yn olaf, roeddwn am ofyn i chi ynglŷn â'r argymhellion ar y cyfnod sylfaen yn ein hadroddiad gan fod ein canfyddiadau yn amlwg yn cyfateb i'r adroddiad gwerthuso a gyflwynwyd ychydig ddyddiau'n ôl ar y cyfnod sylfaen. Ddoe, fe ddywedoch, yn eithaf brwdfrydig, fod darpariaeth y cyfnod sylfaen, mewn gwirionedd, wedi newid y bwllch cyrhaeddiad, er i chi ddweud yn dystiolaeth i ni yn y pwyllgor nad dyna oedd pwrpas y cyfnod sylfaen—sy'n peri rhywfaint o bryder. Os yw'r cyfnod sylfaen wedi cau'r bwllch cyrhaeddiad yn wir, a fyddwch yn cyhoeddi eich tystiolaeth ynghylch yr honiad gyda'r un brwdfrydedd? Diolch yn fawr.

14:42

## Bethan Jenkins [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Just to echo what others have already said in terms of thanking the committee staff and those who gave evidence, it was especially good to go out and visit some schemes in the Communities First area of Swansea, where we talked to parents about how they were affording to pay for their children's extra-curricular activities and also how the school was communicating with them in a more novel way, such as sending postcards to them when the child in question would do well in school, because sometimes they were finding that children weren't telling their parents exactly what was happening in school. That all paints a picture as to how we can really help those from low-income households to feel inspired and feel that their work is going to progress, as opposed to sometimes feeling at the fringes of the educational system, and their parents too for that matter.

I adleisio'r hyn y mae eraill eisoes wedi dweud o ran diolch i staff y pwyllgor a'r rhai a roddodd dystiolaeth, profiad arbennig o dda oedd ymweld â chynlluniau yn ardal Cymunedau yn Gyntaf Abertawe, lle y buom yn siarad â rhieni ynglŷn â sut roeddent yn dod i ben â thalu am weithgareddau allgyrsiol eu plant a hefyd sut y mae'r ysgol yn cyfathrebu â hwy mewn ffyrdd newydd, fel anfon cardiau post atynt pan fydd y plentyn dan sylw yn gwneud yn dda yn yr ysgol, gan eu bod weithiau'n sylwi nad oedd plant yn dweud wrth eu rhieni beth yn union oedd yn digwydd yn yr ysgol. Mae hyn oll yn cynnig darlun i ni o sut y gallwn ysbrydoli disgyblion o aelwydydd incwm isel a'u cynorthwyo i deimlo bod eu gwaith yn mynd i wella, yn hytrach na'u bod weithiau'n teimlo ar ymylon y gyfundrefn addysg, a'u rhieni hefyd o ran hynny.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

With regard to the foundation phase, I don't need to rehearse the arguments that Suzy Davies put forward, but it was very worrying that no evidence was found that it had had an impact on raising the attainment of pupils from disadvantaged backgrounds. If that isn't what it's supposed to do, then we really need to understand the core reasoning for that particular project.

With regard to the fact that the Minister has highlighted that the Government has exceeded its targets for narrowing the attainment gap for the foundation phase, the target in place was very low from the outset, so we therefore welcome the fact that, following the committee's recommendation, the Welsh Government will be, in fact, raising this target.

Obviously, we raised concerns about the truancy tax with regard to fining parents for truancy activities. The Minister will know that well—we've said that as a party—because we believe that connecting with the families is much more viable and much more important. I read a lot of comments on social media where parents actually rebel against the system even more if they are facing a fine by a school. I know that the Government only want to use it in the worst-case scenario, but we need clear definitions of when that will be so that, again, we engage positively with the parents of children from low-income families as opposed to, like I said earlier, turning them off entirely.

Again, we are here after the committee report in 2008; we don't want to be here again in another three years saying the same things. So, yes, it is a bit of a groundhog day, because lessons don't seem to have been learnt from that committee inquiry. For me, I think it's important, with the pupil deprivation grant, what we say in this current inquiry with regard to how the pupil deprivation grant is used. Because, we say that the Minister should report back to the committee as soon as possible on progress towards meeting the Welsh Government's requirement that schools are required to publish details on their use of PDG on their website, and that we should ensure that they deliver what it is intended for and that it has real value for money. The Minister then responds by saying that the consortia has responsibility for monitoring it and for recovering funding if it is used inappropriately. Well, we need to know, as a committee, if that will happen, because we do know that the capacity of the consortia and its resources has been raised with us. So, that's something that we have to get to grips with.

O ran y cyfnod sylfaen, nid oes angen i mi ailadrodd y dadleuon a gyflwynodd Suzy Davies, ond roedd yn destun pryder na chanfuwyd unrhyw dystiolaeth ei fod wedi cael effaith o ran codi cyrhaeddiad disgyblion o gefndiroedd difreintiedig. Os nad dyna y mae i fod i'w wneud, yna mae gwir angen i ni ddeall y rhesymeg graidd sy'n sail i'r prosiect hwnnw.

O ran y Gweinidog yn tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod y Llywodraeth yn rhagori ar ei thargedau ar gyfer lleihau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad yn y cyfnod sylfaen, roedd y targed a oedd ar waith yn isel iawn o'r cychwyn, felly rydym yn croesawu'r ffaith, y bydd Llywodraeth Cymru yn codi'r targed yn sgil argymhelliad y pwyllgor.

Yn amlwg, rydym wedi mynegi pryderon ynglŷn â'r dreth driwantiaeth a dirwyo rhieni am driwantiaeth. Bydd y Gweinidog yn gwybod hynny'n dda—rydym wedi dweud hynny fel plaid—oherwydd ein bod yn credu bod cysylltu gyda'r teuluoedd yn llawer mwy ymarferol ac yn llawer pwysicach. Rwy'n darllen nifer o sylwadau ar gyfryngau cymdeithasol lle y mae rhieni yn gwrthryfela yn erbyn y system hyd yn oed yn waeth os ydynt yn wynebu dirwy gan ysgol. Gwn fod y Llywodraeth ond am ddefnyddio trefn o'r fath yn yr amgylchiadau gwaethaf yn unig, ond mae angen diffiniadau clir arnom ynglŷn â pha bryd y bydd hynny fel ein bod, unwaith eto, yn ymgysylltu'n gadarnhaol â rhieni plant o deuluoedd incwm isel yn hytrach na'u dadrithio'n llwyr, fel y dywedais yn gynharach.

Dyma lle rydym, unwaith eto, ar ôl adroddiad y pwyllgor yn 2008; nid ydym eisiau bod yma eto mewn tair blynedd arall yn dweud yr un pethau. Felly, ydy, mae'n ailadroddus oherwydd nid yw'n ymddangos bod gwersi wedi'u dysgu o ymchwiliad y pwyllgor. O ran y grant amddifadedd disgyblion, credaf fod yr hyn a ddywedwn yn yr ymchwiliad presennol ynghylch y defnydd o'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion yn bwysig. Oherwydd rydym yn dweud y dylai'r Gweinidog gyflwyno adroddiad i'r pwyllgor cyn gynted ag y bo modd ar gynnydd tuag at fodloni gofyniad Llywodraeth Cymru y dylai ysgolion gyhoeddi manylion am eu defnydd o'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion ar eu gwefan, ac y dylem sicrhau eu bod yn cyflawni'r hyn y'i bwriadwyd ar ei gyfer a'i fod yn darparu gwerth da am arian. Mae'r Gweinidog yn ymateb wedyn drwy ddweud mai'r consortia sy'n gyfrifol am ei fonitro ac am adfer arian os caiff ei ddefnyddio'n amhriodol. Wel, fel pwyllgor, mae angen i ni wybod os yw hynny'n digwydd, gan ein bod yn gwybod bod gallu'r consortia a'i adnoddau yn faterion a dynnwyd i'n sylw ni. Felly, mae hynny'n rhywbeth y mae'n rhaid i ni fynd i'r afael ag ef.

My final point, as I started off with, I think, is quite compelling in terms of the guidance that schools need to receive on school trips and extra-curricular activities. You mentioned your children yesterday, Minister, and I will mention my sister, who is 15, going on many, many trips. But, we need to understand their educational values. While sometimes they don't have to necessarily be educational—they can go and have fun at the end of term—if they're going to be going to Iceland or if they're going to be going to New York on trips, well, they need to be accessible to all students. We really have to understand how they benefit the future educational outcomes of those young children. Again, some young people are priced out of that opportunity and the more affluent children will get a raft of opportunities and will be able to put that on their CVs, but other children will be able to only go on trips to, say, Cardiff or London, because that's what they can afford and that's what the school can afford to subsidise. The school won't be able to afford to subsidise them to go to New York. So, I think that's something that really has to be looked at by you as a Government.

Mae fy mhwynt olaf, fel y dechreuais ag ef, rwy'n meddwl, yn eithaf pwysig o ran y canllawiau y mae angen i ysgolion eu cael ynghylch teithiau ysgol a gweithgareddau allgyrsiol. Fe sonioch am eich plant ddoe, Weinidog, a soniaf am fy chwaer, sy'n 15, yn mynd ar lawer iawn o deithiau. Ond mae angen i ni ddeall eu gwerthoedd addysgol. Er nad oes rhaid iddynt fod yn addysgol o anghenraid—gallant fynd a chael hwyl ar ddiwedd y tymor—os ydynt am fynd i Wlad yr Iâ neu os ydynt am fynd i Efrog Newydd ar deithiau, wel, mae angen iddynt fod yn hygyrch i bob myfyriwr. Mae'n rhaid i ni ddeall sut y maent o fudd i ganlyniadau addysgol y bobl ifanc hyn yn y dyfodol. Unwaith eto, mae cyfleoedd o'r fath yn rhy ddrud i rai pobl ifanc a bydd y plant mwy cefnog yn cael lluo o gyfleoedd ac yn gallu rhoi hynny ar eu CV, ond bydd plant eraill ond yn gallu mynd ar deithiau i Gaerdydd neu Lundain, er enghraifft, am mai dyna y maent yn gallu ei fforddio a dyna y mae'r ysgol yn gallu fforddio rhoi cymhorthdal tuag ato. Ni fydd yr ysgol yn gallu fforddio rhoi cymhorthdal iddynt fynd i Efrog Newydd. Felly, credaf fod hynny'n rhywbeth sy'n rhaid i chi, fel Llywodraeth, edrych arno.

14:47

### **Aled Roberts** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae Suzy Davies, Bethan Jenkins ac, i ryw raddau, y Cadeirydd, wedi ymddiheuro ein bod yn dod yn ôl at yr unpwn fel pwyllgor. Ond, i ddweud y gwir, mae cyrhaeddiad plant o gefndiroedd difreintiedig yn ei gwneud hi'n hollol bwysig ein bod ni, fel pwyllgor, yn dod yn ôl at hyn os nad ydy'r sefyllfa wedi symud ymlaen. Mi oedd y Gweinidog yn dweud ddoe fod y sefyllfa wedi gwella ar ddiwedd y cyfnod sylfaen ac nad oedd cymaint o wahaniaeth erbyn hyn. Ond, wrth gwrs, mae'r sefyllfa ar gyfer y rhai sydd ar ddiwedd cyfnod allweddol 4 yn dal yn un sy'n ein pryderu ni, fel aelodau'r pwyllgor.

Rwyf i am ganolbwyntio, yn yr amser byr sydd gennyf i, ar y grant amddifadedd, achos rwy'n meddwl bod rhai o'r canlyniadau rydym ni wedi eu darganfod yn achos pryder, i ryw raddau. Rwy'n gwybod bod y Gweinidog wedi cyhoeddi canllawiau newydd sy'n rhoi mwy o bwysau ar yr ysgolion a hefyd ar y consortia i sicrhau bod y gwaith yma'n cymryd lle. Ond, jest er mwyn dewis rhai ffigurau, mae yna welliant wedi bod; mae rhai rhaglenni, rwan, yn cael eu defnyddio mewn ysgolion nad oedd yn cael eu defnyddio cyn i'r grant amddifadedd dod i mewn—rhyw 58 y cant mewn ysgolion cynradd a 71 y cant mewn ysgolion uwchradd.

Ond, os ydych chi'n edrych ar rai o'r ffigurau eraill, maen nhw'n dal i achosi pryder i mi. Dim ond 60 y cant o raglenni mewn ysgolion cynradd a oedd yn cael eu hanelu at blant a oedd yn cael prydau ysgol am ddim, ond roedd 72 y cant o raglenni'n cael eu hanelu at y plant mewn ysgolion uwchradd. Felly, yn amlwg, nid yw'r ffordd y mae'r Llywodraeth wedi bod yn monitro'r sefyllfa hyd yn hyn wedi bod yn llwyddiant. Dim ond 36 y cant o ysgolion cynradd a 49 y cant o ysgolion uwchradd, yn ein hadroddiad ni, sy'n dweud eu bod yn defnyddio canllawiau'r Sutton Trust, er enghraifft.

Suzie Davies, Bethan Jenkins and, to some extent, the Chair, have apologised that we've returned to the same subject as a committee. But, to be honest, the attainment of children from deprived backgrounds makes it essential that we, as a committee, come back to this if the situation has not improved. The Minister said yesterday that the situation has improved at the end of the foundation phase and that there wasn't such a discrepancy by now. But, of course, the situation for those at the end of key stage 4 is still one that concerns us, as members of the committee.

I am going to focus, in the short time that I have, on the deprivation grant, because I think that some of the outcomes that we have discovered do cause concern, to some extent. I know that the Minister has published new guidelines that put greater pressure on the schools and also the consortia to ensure that this work is undertaken. But, just to pick out some figures, there has been an improvement; some programmes are being used now in schools that weren't used before the deprivation grant was introduced—about 58 per cent in primary schools and 71 per cent in the secondary sector.

But, if you look at some of the other figures, they are still a cause of concern. Only 60 per cent of the programmes in primary schools were being targeted at children in receipt of free school meals, but 72 per cent of programmes were aimed at the children in secondary schools. So, evidently, the way in which the Government has been monitoring the situation to date has not been a success. Only 36 per cent of the primary schools and 49 per cent of the secondary schools, in our report, state that they use the Sutton Trust guidelines, for example.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



Felly, rydych chi'n dweud bod y consortia yn mynd i fonitro'r sefyllfa, ond pa fath o sicrwydd y gallwn ni ei gael, fel aelodau'r pwyllgor, fod y consortia yn mynd i wneud hynny? Rwy'n diolch i chi am eich llythyr yr wythnos yma sy'n dweud eich bod yn awyddus i weld y consortia yma'n bod yn fwy agored efo ni fel Aelodau Cynulliad, ond mae'n rhaid imi ddweud bod yna dipyn bach o waith iddyn nhw ei wneud er mwyn llwyddo ar hynny. Rwyf i hefyd yn gofyn ichi sut ydych chi'n mynd i sicrhau, o ran argymhelliaid 4, fod y ffordd mae ysgolion yn gwario'r grant amddifadedd yn glir i'r rhieni y gwnaeth Ann Jones sôn amdany'n nhw. Hyd at rŵan, mae yna ysgolion, tua dwy flynedd ar ôl i hyn gael ei ddweud yn y lle cyntaf, nad ydynt o hyd yn cyhoeddi'r wybodaeth i rieni. Rwy'n deall bod y consortia, erbyn hyn, yn dweud eu bod nhw'n awyddus i weld hynny'n digwydd. Rwy'n gweld bod y llythyr y maen nhw wedi'i anfon allan at yr ysgolion yn dweud bod yn rhaid iddyn nhw wneud hynny, ond sut ydych chi fel Llywodraeth yn mynd i fonitro bod y consortia yn monitro yn y lle cyntaf?

Hefyd, mae yna sôn yn y llythyr fod y consortia, os nad ydyn nhw'n gweld bod yr arian yma'n cael ei ddefnyddio ar gyfer y dibenion mae'r Llywodraeth wedi dweud ei fod i gael ei ddefnyddio, yn mynd i dynnu'r grant yn ôl oddi wrth yr ysgolion. A allwch chi ddweud wrthym ni sut yn union mae hynny'n mynd i ddigwydd a ble fydd yr arian yna'n eistedd os ydy'r grant yn cael ei dynnu'n ôl?

Wrth imi frysio, rwy'n meddwl, erbyn hyn, fod yna nifer o strategaethau sydd yn ceisio mynd i'r afael â'r un broblem. Rydym ni'n sôn am Teuluoedd yn Gyntaf, rhai o raglenni Cymunedau yn Gyntaf a'r holl strategaethau yma. Rwyf i wedi cyfrif bod yna tua 17 o raglenni unigol gan Lywodraeth Cymru—ac nid yw pob un ohonynt yn eich adran chi—sydd, i ryw raddau, yn mynd i'r afael â phroblemau teuluoedd difreintiedig a'r ffaith bod eu plant nhw, pan maen nhw'n cyrraedd pump oed, yn cael rhywun yn dweud wrthyn nhw beth yw ei siawns nhw o lwyddo mewn bywyd. Rwy'n meddwl ei bod hi'n angenrheidiol nad ydym ni, fel Aelodau Cynulliad, erbyn hyn yn derbyn sefyllfa lle mae unrhyw blentyn yng Nghymru yn cael rhywun yn dweud wrtho fo neu wrthi hi sut mae o neu hi yn mynd i lwyddo mewn bywyd o achos y cefndir y maen nhw'n dod ohono fo. Nid ydy o'n dderbyniol. Rwy'n gwybod eich bod chi'n derbyn hynny, ond, i ryw raddau, rwy'n meddwl mai'r casgliad rydym ni wedi dod iddo fel pwyllgor ydy bod yna lawer iawn o ewyllys da o ran y Llywodraeth ynglŷn â mynd i'r afael â'r broblem yma, ond, hyd at rŵan, ansicr iawn ydy mesur llwyddiant hynny. Rwy'n meddwl bod yn rhaid ichi fod tipyn bach yn fwy cadarn ar y consortia yma ac ar yr ysgolion yn y dyfodol, hwyrach, nag ydym ni wedi bod yn y gorffennol.

So, you state that the consortia are going to monitor the situation, but what kind of assurance can we be given, as committee members, that the consortia are going to do that? I thank you for your letter of this week stating that you are eager to see the consortia being more open with us as Assembly Members, but I must say that there is quite a way for them to go in order to attain that ambition. I also ask you how you are going to ensure, as regards recommendation 4, that the way in which schools spend their PDG is clear to the parents whom Ann Jones mentioned. To date, there are schools, two years after this was first announced, that still do not publish the data for parents. I understand that the consortia, by now, are saying that they are eager to see that happening. I see that the letter that they have issued to the schools states that they are compelled to do so, but how are you as a Government going to ensure that the consortia are monitoring it in the first place?

Also, in the letter, there is mention that, if consortia see that this funding isn't used for the purposes that the Government has said it wishes it to be used for, they will withdraw the grant from the schools. Can you tell us exactly how this will happen and where that money will then lie if this grant is withdrawn?

As I hurry through this, I believe, by now, that there are a number of strategies that are trying to address the same problem. We're talking about Families First, some of the Communities First programmes and all of these strategies. I have counted approximately 17 individual schemes from Welsh Government—not all within your department—that, to some extent, address the problems of disadvantaged families and the fact that their children, when they reach the age of five, are told what their life chances are to be. I believe that we must now say as Assembly Members that we won't accept a situation where any child in Wales is told how he or she will succeed in life just because of their background. It is not acceptable. I know that you accept that, but, to some extent, I think that the conclusion that we as a committee have come to is that there's a great deal of goodwill from the Government as regards addressing this problem, but, to date, the measure of the success of all the schemes has been very unclear and uncertain. I think that you have to perhaps be more firm with these consortia and schools in the future than we have been in the past.

14:52

## Keith Davies [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Fel pawb arall, fe wnaif i ddiolch i Ann Jones fel Cadeirydd, aelodau'r pwyllgor a hefyd y tîm clerico am eu gwaith yn yr ymchwiliad. Mae'n wir fod tirlun addysg yn newid yn gyson yng Nghymru. Mae wedi bod yn destun newid strwythurol a pholisi ers imi fod yn gweithio yn gyntaf fel athro ac yna fel cyfarwyddwr addysg. Ond rwy'n falch ein bod ni fel pwyllgor wedi codi i fyny ac adrodd ar y pwnc a ddatganwyd gan y Gweinidog addysg yn brif flaenoriaeth iddo. Credaf fod ein ffocws wedi aros yn dda ar y polisi a'r allbwn o ran cyrhaeddiad.

Like everyone else, I will thank Ann Jones, our Chair, committee members and the clerking team for their work during this inquiry. It's true that the education landscape faces consistent changes in Wales. It has been the subject of structural and policy changes since I first started working as a teacher and then as a director of education. But I am pleased that we as a committee have actually reported on the issue that the education Minister identified as his main priority. I think that our focus has remained on the policy and the outcomes in terms of attainment.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae gennym ni yng Nghymru hanes o weithredu cynlluniau cymorth a fyddai'n gwella'r hyn y mae disgyblion yn ei ennill. Y peth nodweddiadol, wrth gwrs, yw clymu'r rhain at ei gilydd ac ystyried y rheng flaen ar gyrhaeddiad. I mi, mae'r sefyllfa bresennol wedi bod am flynyddoedd, a soniodd Bethan Jenkins yn gynharach am 2008, ond, yn fy marn i, mae e'n gynharach na hynny o ran y cyfnod y mae'r plant hyn wedi bod yn dioddef. Er enghraifft, rwy'n cofio mynd i ysgol fabanod yng nghwm Rhymni rai blynyddoedd yn ôl, at ddsbarth o blant pedair i bum mlwydd oed, a gofyn i'r athrawes, 'Beth yw'r peth anoddaf i chi gyda'r dosbarth hwn?' Fe ddywedodd yr athrawes wrthyf i, 'Cael y plant i wrando'. Beth oedd yn digwydd yn eu cartrefi nhw oedd nad oedd y rhieni yn siarad â nhw. Dyna'i gyd yr oedd y plant yn ei wneud oedd edrych ar y teledu a neb yn siarad â nhw. Wedyn, roedd yr ysgol yn gorfod newid y sefyllfa yna.

Dyna pam roeddwn i'n falch ddoe, yn y datganiad oddi wrth y Gweinidog addysg, am ei ymfalchiad yn y cyfnod sylfaen. Fel yr wyf i'n ei weld, dyma'r cychwyn cyntaf yn y mater o dorri'r linc rhwng incwm y cartref a chyrhaeddiad. Felly, mi roedd yn chwa o awyr iach wrth iddo fe ddatgan heb flewyn ar ei dafod am lwyddiant un o bolisiau blaenllaw'r Cynulliad hwn. Ond nid yw'r pendantsrwydd hwnnw yn gorffen yno:

'The evaluation also reports that the introduction of the foundation phase is having a positive impact on children and their behaviour, their wellbeing, their attitudes to learning and their engagement.'

Un peth yw llunio polisiau ar sail tystiolaeth ac ymchwil; cam arall yw cyflwyno'r polisi mewn ffordd ymarferol. Y cam nesaf—y cam angenrheidiol—yw monitro ac asesu llwyddiant neu fethiant polisi yng ngoleuni'r disgwyliadau gwreiddiol. Gwn nad yw'r cyfnod cyntaf o blant dan y cyfnod sylfaen wedi cyrraedd cyfnod allweddol 2, ond edrychaf ymlaen at ddadansoddi'r data hyn pan fyddwn yn edrych yn ôl yn y dyfodol—ymhen tair neu bedair blynedd—i weld a yw'r cyfnod sylfaen wedi symud i'r cyfnod iau.

Mae teitl ymchwiliad y pwyllgor, sef y berthynas rhwng canlyniadau addysg a phlant o deuluoedd ar gyflogau is, yn dangos yn blwmp ac yn blaen fod tloedi a llwyddiant mewn addysg yn gyfuniad digymysg. Nid mater o farn ydyw ond mater o ffaith. Dangosir hyn yn glir yn ail argymhellid y pwyllgor ac yn ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru iddo. Mae'r paragraff cyntaf yn dangos pa mor llwyddiannus y mae anelu at y nod o leihau'r bwch a achoswyd gan dloedi ar gyfer plant saith mlwydd oed. Ar sail yr ymchwil, newidir y targed, nid yn is ond yn uwch na'r nod gwreiddiol. Dyma brawf fod y polisi yn gweithio.

Cyn hynny, hyd yn oed, anghofwyd am Dechrau'n Deg. Ymwelais, yn ddiweddar, â darpariaeth Llanelli, a fu'n cyfuno cyswllt rhwng plant tair a phedair blwydd oed gyda'r ysgol gynradd leol. Gwelais yn uniongyrchol sut y mae'r rhaglen hon sydd wedi'i thargedu yn cynorthwyo plant o ardaloedd difreintiedig i gychwyn yn yr ysgol gyda'r un gallu â gweddill eu dosbarth. Yn yr ysgol, wrth gwrs, yr oedd eu rhieni yn bresennol.

We in Wales have a history of implementing assistance programmes that improve the attainment of our pupils. The characteristic thing, of course, is to bring all of these together and to consider attainment on the front line. For me, the current situation has existed for many years, and Bethan Jenkins said that it was a problem in 2008, but, in my view, it goes back much further than that in terms of the period over which these children have suffered. For example, I recall going to an infants school in the Rhymney valley some years ago, and visited a classroom of four and five-year-olds, where I asked the teacher, 'What's the most difficult thing for you in dealing with this class?' The teacher told me, 'Getting the children to listen.' Because, what happened at home was that the parents simply didn't speak to them. All the children would do was watch television and nobody spoke to them at all. The school had to then turn that on its head.

That's why I was pleased to hear in yesterday's statement from the education Minister his pride in the foundation phase. As I see it, this is the first step in breaking the link between home incomes and attainment. Therefore, it was a breath of fresh air to hear him refer quite clearly to the success of one of the Assembly's flagship policies. But that determination doesn't end there:

'Mae'r gwerthusiad hefyd yn nodi bod cyflwyno'r cyfnod sylfaen yn cael effaith gadarnhaol ar blant a'u hymddygiad, eu lles, eu hagweddau at ddysgu a'u hymrwymiad.'

It's one thing to draw up evidence on the basis of evidence, but it's another to actually introduce the policy in a practical way. The next step—and the necessary step—is to monitor and assess the success or failure of policy in light of the original expectations. I know that the first tranche of children in the foundation phase hasn't yet reached key stage 2, but I look forward to seeing an analysis of this data when we look back, in future—in three or four years' time—to see whether the foundation phase has delivered and actually progressed things for key stage 2.

The title of the committee's inquiry, namely the inquiry into educational outcomes for children from low-income households, does demonstrate quite clearly that poverty and educational success is undeniable in its relationship. It's not a matter of opinion; it's a matter of fact. This is clearly demonstrated in the second recommendation and in the Government's response to it. The first paragraph shows how successful targeting the aim of reducing the gap caused by poverty is for children at seven years of age. On the basis of the evidence, the target will be changed. It won't be actually brought down but, rather, uplifted. This is proof that the policy is working.

Before then, we forgot Flying Start. I recently visited the provision in Llanelli, which nurtured a relationship between three and four-year-olds with the local primary school. I saw directly how this targeted programme assists children from disadvantaged areas to start in school on a level playing field with the rest of the class. Of course, the parents were in attendance at school.

Nid trafod ystadegau ydym yn unig yn yr adroddiad, ond aelodau o ddynolryw—plant a'u teuluoedd. Hoffwn roi teyrnged i'm cyfaill, Julie Morgan, am ein hatgoffa yn gyson am blant Sipsiwn a Theithwyr, er enghraifft.

We're not only discussing statistics in this report, but we are looking at human beings—children and their families. I would like to pay tribute to my colleague, Julie Morgan, for reminding us regularly about the children of Gypsies and Travellers, for example.

Mae'r adroddiad yn bwysig iawn i mi oherwydd yr ymgysylltiad gyda rhieni. Gwn fod y Llywodraeth wedi lansio apêl yn annog darllen gyda phlant yn y cartref, yn seiliedig ar ymchwil academaidd a ddengys cyswllt llywyddiant ieithyddol gyda darllen yn ifanc. Mae rôl i ni wrth werthuso strategaethau ysgolion o ymgysylltiad gyda rhieni er mwyn lledaenu arferion gorau. Mae addysg yn newid yn gyson. Credaf, oherwydd newidiadau fel Donaldson, sydd ar y gweill, mai dyma'r adeg synhwyrol i fod yn craffu ar, ac yn mesur strategaethau llywodraethol fel ein bod yn siŵr o wireddu a pharhau gyda'r arferion gorau. Mae bleser gennyf i gymeradwyo'r adroddiad.

The report is very important to me in terms of engagement with parents. I know that the Government has launched an appeal encouraging parents to read with their children at home, based on academic research that demonstrates the link between educational success and reading at an early age. We have a role in evaluating school strategies on engagement with parents in order to spread good practice. Education is changing consistently and regularly. I believe, with changes such as Donaldson in the pipeline, that this was the right time to be looking and scrutinising strategies so that we can achieve and maintain best practice. I am pleased to commend this report.

14:57 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I call on the Minister for education to speak on behalf of the Government—Huw Lewis.

Galwaf ar y Gweinidog addysg i siarad ar ran y Llywodraeth—Huw Lewis.

14:58 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

*Y Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau / The Minister for Education and Skills*

Thank you, Presiding Officer. Could I begin by thanking the committee for its very important work in producing this report? I welcome the opportunity today to respond to its recommendations.

Diolch i chi, Lywydd. A gaf fi ddechrau drwy ddiolch i'r pwyllgor am eu gwaith pwysig iawn yn cynhyrchu'r adroddiad? Rwy'n croesawu'r cyfle heddiw i ymateb i'w hargymhellion.

Although it's still relatively early days, we are beginning to see important progress in the performance of our poorest pupils. As I have said on many occasions before, in raising the attainment of these children to our core national priorities—our three national priorities; something that I did early upon taking office—I am attempting to give meaning to my conviction that if these children do not succeed, then Wales as a whole will not succeed.

Er ei bod yn dal i fod yn ddyddiau eithaf cynnar, rydym yn dechrau gweld cynnydd pwysig ym mherfformiad ein disgyblion tlotaf. Fel rwyf wedi'i ddweud droeon o'r blaen, wrth godi cyrhaeddiad y plant i'n blaenoriaethau cenedlaethol craidd—ein tair blaenoriaeth genedlaethol; rhywbeth a wneuthum yn gynnar ar ôl dechrau yn fy swydd—rwy'n ceisio rhoi ystyr i fy argyhoeddiad, os nad yw'r plant hyn yn llwyddo, yna ni fydd Cymru gyfan yn llwyddo.

The attainment of Wales's free-school-meal pupils is at an all-time high. Last year, the performance of these pupils rose at every key stage, and the gap in attainment between free-school-meal pupils and the rest of the school population narrowed at each of the first three phases of statutory education. We've already exceeded our 2017 target for reducing the performance gap by 10 per cent at the end of the foundation phase, and I have committed—just yesterday—to setting a more stretching target during the summer term. But, there is still a 16 per cent gap, and there is a considerable amount of heavy lifting yet to be undertaken. 'Rewriting the future' places a similarly strong emphasis on the importance of early intervention in mitigating the effects of poverty on children's educational attainment.

Mae cyrhaeddiad disgyblion sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim yng Nghymru ar ei lefel uchaf erioed. Y llynedd, cafwyd gwelliant ym mherfformiad y disgyblion hyn ym mhob cyfnod allweddol a lleihaodd y bwlch cyrhaeddiad rhwng disgyblion sy'n cael prydau ysgol am ddim a gweddill y boblogaeth ysgol ym mhob un o'r tri chyfnod cyntaf o addysg statudol. Rydym eisoes wedi rhagori ar ein targed erbyn 2017 ar gyfer lleihau'r bwlch perfformiad 10 y cant ar ddiwedd y cyfnod sylfaen, ac rwyf wedi ymrwymo—ddoe ddiwethaf—i osod targed mwy ymestynnol yn ystod tymor yr haf. Ond mae yna fwlch o 16 y cant o hyd ac mae cryn dipyn o waith caled i'w wneud eto. Mae 'Ailysgrifennu'r dyfodol' yn rhoi pwyslais yr un mor gryf ar bwysigrwydd ymyrraeth gynnar i liniaru effeithiau tloti ar gyrhaeddiad addysgol plant.

I am delighted that we are able to further support early intervention through extending the pupil deprivation grant to nursery-age children. I'm sure that that will make a very real and substantial difference. That evidence is there—in response to Suzy Davies's point—through the statistical service bulletin published back in January.

Rwyf wrth fy modd ein bod yn gallu cefnogi ymyrraeth gynnar ymhellach drwy ymestyn y grant amddifadedd disgyblion i blant oed meithrin. Rwy'n siŵr y bydd yn gwneud gwahaniaeth gwirioneddol a sylweddol iawn. Mae'r dystiolaeth ar gael—mewn ymateb i bwynt Suzy Davies—drwy fwletin ystadegol y gwasanaeth a gyhoeddwyd ym mis Ionawr.

In response to some of the Members' points this afternoon in relation to the foundation phase and the raising of attainment generally of our youngest children—I think Bethan Jenkins mentioned this point—I don't think there's any mystery or contradiction in saying that whatever curriculum or pedagogical structure you have around an entire school population, it is not in and of itself going to close the attainment gap. It can make it easier to close the attainment gap, but what will close the attainment gap is the relentless targeting of those children, the relentless monitoring of their attainment and their needs, and the relentless application of resource, like the pupil deprivation grant, in order to target the attainment of that particular group of young people within the entire school population. So, we can make things easier through the adoption of the foundation phase, but we must have the courage and the wit to actually target that group of young people, frankly, with extra resource, time and effort.

We are talking about culture changes here—cultures long embedded. It wasn't so very long ago that you could engage in a conversation with a teacher or headteacher who would accept the God-given fact that, because a child was from a more deprived background, there was only so much the school would ever be able to do in terms of boosting the life chances of that young person. This wasn't very long ago; just a year or two ago, that was common currency in conversations that I had with many teachers. That myth, now, is beginning to be—[Interruption.]

*Suzy Davies a gododd—*

15:01 **Huw Lewis** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

In a second. That myth is beginning to be exploded. I give way.

15:02 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you very much for taking the intervention, Minister. Just on that point, I think it was back in 2011, in response to the report that Bethan Jenkins talked about earlier, that consortia were working apparently very closely with schools and school leaders in order to deal with the problem we're discussing today. Yet, we took evidence that consortia themselves are still asking for guidelines on how to narrow the attainment gap. I've got to ask: what on earth are consortia for if they're wanting this sort of spoon-feeding?

Mewn ymateb i rai o bwytiau'r Aelodau y prynhawn yma o ran y cyfnod sylfaen a chodi cyrhaeddiad ein plant ieuengaf yn gyffredinol—credaf i Bethan Jenkins grybwyll y pwynt hwn—nid wyf yn meddwl bod unrhyw ddirgelwch neu wrthddweud yn codi o honni, pa gwricwlwm neu strwythur addysgol bynnag sydd gennych gogyfer â phoblogaeth ysgol gyfan, nid yw'n mynd i gau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad ar ei ben ei hun. Gall ei gwneud yn haws cau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad ond yr hyn a fydd yn cau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad yw targedu'r plant hyn yn ddi-baid, monitro eu cyrhaeddiad a'u hanghenion yn ddi-baid, a defnydd di-baid o adnoddau, fel y grant amddifadedd disgyblion, er mwyn targedu cyrhaeddiad y grŵp penodol hwn o bobl ifanc o fewn poblogaeth yr ysgol gyfan. Felly, gallwn wneud pethau'n haws drwy fabwysiadu'r cyfnod sylfaen ond rhaid i ni gael y dewrder a'r crebwyll mewn gwirionedd i dargedu'r grŵp hwn o bobl ifanc gydag adnoddau, amser ac ymdrech ychwanegol.

Rydym yn sôn am newid diwylliannau yma—diwylliannau sydd wedi'u gwreiddio ers amser hir. Nid oes cymaint â hynny o amser er pan allech gynnal sgwrs ag athro neu bennaeth a fyddai'n derbyn y ffaith ddiymwad, gan fod plentyn yn dod o gefndir mwy difreintiedig, hyn a hyn yn unig y gallai'r ysgol ei wneud o ran hybu cyfleoedd bywyd y person ifanc dan sylw. Nid oedd hyn ond amser byr yn ôl; blwyddyn neu ddwy yn ôl, roedd yn gred gyffredin mewn sgysiau a gefais gyda nifer o athrawon. Mae'r myth, yn awr, yn dechrau—[Torri ar draws.]

*Suzy Davies rose—*

Mewn eiliad. Mae'r myth yn dechrau cael ei chwalu. Rwy'n ildio.

Diolch yn fawr iawn am gymryd yr ymyrraeth, Weinidog. Ar y pwynt hwnnw, yn ôl yn 2011, mewn ymateb i'r adroddiad roedd Bethan Jenkins yn ei drafod yn gynharach, rwy'n credu bod y consortia yn gweithio'n agos iawn gydag ysgolion ac arweinwyr ysgolion, mae'n debyg, er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem rydym yn ei thrafod heddiw. Eto i gyd, clywsom dystiolaeth fod y consortia eu hunain yn dal i ofyn am ganllawiau ar sut i leihau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad. Mae'n rhaid i mi ofyn: beth ar y ddaear yw pwrpas consortia os ydynt angen bwyd llwy o'r fath?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Well, I'm not aware of that particular issue, and if it's going back to 2011, I would hope that things have changed considerably by now. But we do have a wealth of evidence and examples of interventions that we know work, and we do have examples out there of schools currently operating in Wales that have, for some time, without any of this assistance or interventions from consortia or Government and all the rest of it, have raised the attainment level of their poorest pupils, so that they're well-nigh indistinguishable from the attainment levels of the general school population. If that can happen in one school, it can happen in every single school. I hope that the changes in regime—around culture change, expectation, the categorisation programme that we have out there amongst primary schools now, which effectively bars a school from a top-level green category unless it's addressing and tackling this issue, and new expectations around the work of Estyn, in terms of drilling down into the work for the poorest pupils that's going on in each and every school—will come together to shift attitudes and to raise expectations.

Important research work undertaken by the Early Intervention Foundation clearly demonstrates the value of getting additional support to younger children, for example on language development, which is preventing costly, long-term and traumatic consequences and enabling children to flourish. We all know this is true.

Many early years settings will be receiving PDG for the very first time, so we have commissioned the Wales Centre for Equity in Education to draft guidance to help them to spend it effectively. This will signpost them to the Education Endowment Foundation's new early years toolkit—and I'd encourage Members to take a look at that—and will supplement support given by the regional educational consortia and foundation phase advisers. I hope, in that single regard, that the answer to Suzy Davies's question of what makes this different to RAISE is answered in large part. This is evidence based, it's specific, it's targeted, and it will be monitored, and people will be held to account about the real achievements of real children.

We have taken the opportunity this year to reconsider the role of the regional school improvement consortia in supporting schools to make effective use of PDG funding. This forms a central part of the challenge and review process for the consortia, in which I take part.

Wel, nid wyf yn ymwybodol o'r mater penodol hwnnw ac os yw'n mynd yn ôl i 2011, byddwn yn gobeithio fod pethau wedi newid yn sylweddol erbyn hyn. Ond mae gennym gyfoeth o dystiolaeth ac enghreifftiau o ymyriadau y gwyddom eu bod yn gweithio ac mae gennym enghreifftiau o ysgolion ar waith yng Nghymru ar hyn o bryd sydd wedi codi lefel cyrhaeddiad eu disgyblion tlotaf ers peth amser heb unrhyw gymorth neu ymyrraeth gan gonsortia na'r Llywodraeth a'r cyfan arall, fel nad oes modd gwahaniaethu rhyngddynt bron a lefelau cyrhaeddiad poblogaeth yr ysgol yn gyffredinol. Os gall hynny ddigwydd mewn un ysgol, gall ddigwydd ym mhob ysgol. Rwy'n gobeithio y bydd y newidiadau yn y gyfundrefn—o ran newid diwylliant, disgygliad, y rhaglen gategoreiddio sydd gennym yn yr ysgolion cynradd yn awr, sy'n rhwystro ysgol i bob pwrpas rhag cyrraedd categori gwyrdd y lefel uchaf oni bai ei bod yn mynd i'r afael â'r mater hwn, a disgygliadau newydd mewn perthynas â gwaith Estyn, o ran mynd i wraidd y gwaith ar gyfer y disgyblion tlotaf, sy'n digwydd ym mhob ysgol—yn dod at ei glydd i newid agweddau a chodi disgygliadau.

Mae gwaith ymchwil pwysig a wnaed gan y Sefydliad Ymyrraeth Gynnar yn dangos gwerth eglur cael cymorth ychwanegol i blant iau, er enghraifft, ar gyfer datblygu iaith, sy'n atal canlyniadau costus, hirdymor a thrawmatig ac sy'n galluogi plant i ffynnu. Mae pawb ohonom yn gwybod bod hyn yn wir.

Bydd llawer o sefydliadau blynyddoedd cynnar yn cael grant amddifadedd disgyblion am y tro cyntaf erioed, felly rydym wedi comisiynu Canolfan Cymru er Cydraddoldeb mewn Addysg i ddrafftio canllawiau i'w helpu i'w wario yn effeithiol. Bydd y rhain yn eu cyfeirio at becyn cymorth blynyddoedd cynnar newydd y Sefydliad Gwaddol Addysg—a byddwn yn annog yr Aelodau i gymryd golwg arno. Bydd yn ychwanegu at gymorth y consortia addysgol rhanbarthol ac ymgynghorwyr y cyfnod sylfaen. Yn hynny o beth, rwy'n gobeithio bod yr ateb i gwestiwn Suzy Davies ynglŷn â beth sy'n gwneud hyn yn wahanol i Rhagori wedi'i ateb i raddau helaeth. Mae'n seiliedig ar dystiolaeth, mae'n benodol, mae'n cael ei dargedu, bydd yn cael ei fonitro, a bydd pobl yn cael eu dwyn i gyfrif am lwyddiannau go iawn plant go iawn.

Rydym wedi manteisio ar y cyfle eleni i ailystyried rôl y consortia gwella ysgolion rhanbarthol yn cefnogi ysgolion i wneud defnydd effeithiol o gyllid grant amddifadedd disgyblion. Mae'n rhan ganolog o'r her a'r broses adolygu ar gyfer y consortia, ac rwyf innau'n rhan o hynny hefyd.

We've given each consortium a capacity-building grant of £50,000 to help them develop skills and knowledge to better support schools in tackling the impact of poverty. We've also sought to rationalise planning and reporting, to keep bureaucracy to a minimum. Capacity building is also a key feature of the Schools Challenge Cymru programme, and we have given the consortia approximately £3.9 million for building capacity and driving collaboration therein. Schools Challenge Cymru is not only about improving outcomes in the 40 Pathways to Success schools and their cluster primaries; it's also about creating the conditions whereby knowledge and expertise can be moved to where it needs to be. Through partnerships, school-to-school working and collaboration, we are making better use of existing expertise to drive sustainable results.

I've seen for myself that schools that adhere closely to the kinds of strategies advocated in the Sutton Trust toolkit are those that are making the most progress on this agenda. This year, we've given schools clear, more concise PDG-related guidance and a catalogue of third and private sector interventions that will help them tackle, head on, the debilitating effects of deprivation on children's learning and attainment. Next month, I'll launch our family and community engagement guidance and toolkit at a family and community engagement conference, hosted by the Wales Centre for Equity in Education. This is our response to a call from schools for practical help to engage with families, and it will link closely with our Education Begins at Home programme.

Presiding Officer, I believe time is beginning to defeat me here this afternoon, and there are many questions, perhaps, that I've not been able to get around to answering, but I hope I have convinced the Members of the committee and the wider membership of this Assembly that there is a regime of rigour being developed around this issue throughout the school system in Wales, and we will not let go of these priorities.

Rydym wedi rhoi grant meithrin gallu o £50,000 i bob consortiwm i'w helpu i ddatblygu sgiliau a gwybodaeth er mwyn cynorthwyo ysgolion yn well i fynd i'r afael ag effaith tloedi. Rydym hefyd wedi ceisio rhesymoli dulliau cynllunio ac adrodd er mwyn cyfyngu ar fiwrocratiaeth. Mae meithrin gallu yn nodwedd allweddol yn y rhaglen Her Ysgolion Cymru hefyd ac rydym wedi rhoi oddeutu £3.9 miliwn i'r consortia ar gyfer meithrin gallu a hybu cydweithio o'u mewn. Nid ymwneud yn unig â gwella canlyniadau 40 ysgol y Rhaglen Llwybrau Llwyddiant a'u clystyrau cynradd y mae Her Ysgolion Cymru; mae'n ymwneud hefyd â chreu'r amodau lle y gellir symud gwybodaeth ac arbenigedd i'r lle y mae eu hangen. Trwy bartneriaethau, gweithio rhwng ysgolion a chydweithio, rydym yn gwneud gwell defnydd o arbenigedd sydd eisoes yn bodoli i ysgogi canlyniadau cynaliadwy.

Rwyf wedi gweld â'm llygaid fy hun mai'r ysgolion sy'n glynu'n agos at y mathau o strategaethau a argymhellir yn mhecyn cymorth Ymddiriedolaeth Sutton yw'r rhai sy'n gwneud y cynnydd mwyaf ar yr agenda hon. Eleni, rydym wedi rhoi canllawiau eglur a mwy cryno i ysgolion mewn perthynas â'r grant amddifadedd disgyblion, a chatalog o ymyriadau trydydd sector a'r sector preifat a fydd yn eu helpu i fynd i'r afael yn uniongyrchol ag effeithiau niweidiol amddifadedd ar ddysgu a chyrhaeddiad plant. Y mis nesaf, byddaf yn lansio ein canllawiau a'n pecyn cymorth ar ymgysylltu â theuluoedd a'r gymuned mewn cynhadledd ar ymgysylltu â theuluoedd a'r gymuned a gynhelir gan Ganolfan Cymru er Cydraddoldeb mewn Addysg. Dyma ein hymateb i alwad gan ysgolion am gymorth ymarferol i ymgysylltu â theuluoedd a bydd yn cysylltu'n agos â'n rhaglen, Mae Addysg yn Dechrau yn y Cartref.

Lywydd, credaf fod amser yn dechrau mynd yn drech na mi y prynhawn yma ac mae llawer o gwestiynau nad wyf wedi cael cyfle i'w hateb o bosibl, ond rwy'n gobeithio fy mod wedi argyhoeddi Aelodau'r pwyllgor ac Aelodau'r Cynulliad yn ehangach fod cyfundrefn drylwyr yn cael ei datblygu mewn perthynas â'r mater hwn ar draws y system ysgolion yng Nghymru ac ni fyddwn yn colli golwg ar y blaenoriaethau hyn.

15:07 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I call on Ann Jones to reply to the debate.

Galwaf ar Ann Jones i ymateb i'r ddadl.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

15:07 **Ann Jones** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Thank you, Presiding Officer. Can I thank those Members who took part in this debate? I think every Member made a different contribution to the way in which the report was penned. I take what Suzy was saying that free school meals are a blunt instrument now, and there are many other things that we need to be looking at before we start to look at what we mean around closing the attainment gap. Then, Bethan talked about the truancy tax. I think that's a very important thing to think about, in terms of how we then expect parents to engage, especially those who are hardest to reach. Often, some of those parents perhaps didn't get an understanding within their own schooling, and so have a disparate or different approach to schooling. When the truancy tax comes along, then it's just—in their view—another stick with which to beat them, rather than offering them some sort of discussion and engagement in schools.

Diolch i chi, Lywydd. A gaf fi ddiolch i'r Aelodau a gymerodd ran yn y ddadl hon? Rwy'n credu bod pob Aelod wedi gwneud cyfraniad gwahanol i'r ffordd y cafodd yr adroddiad ei ysgrifennu. Rwy'n derbyn yr hyn a ddywedodd Suzy mai arf di-awch yw pryddau ysgol am ddim bellach ac mae llawer o bethau eraill sydd angen i ni edrych arnynt cyn i ni ddechrau edrych ar yr hyn rydym yn ei olygu o ran cau'r bwlch cyrhaeddiad. Yna, soniodd Bethan am y dreth driwantiaeth. Credaf ei fod yn beth pwysig iawn i feddwl amdano, o ran sut rydym yn disgwyl i rieni ymgysylltu, yn enwedig y rhai anoddaf i'w cyrraedd. Yn aml, efallai nad oedd gan rai o'r rhieni hynny ddealltwriaeth ynghylch eu haddysg eu hunain ac felly, mae ganddynt agwedd wahanol at addysg. Pan ddaw sôn am dreth driwantiaeth, nid yw ond yn ffon arall i'w curo â hi—yn eu barn hwy—yn hytrach na'i bod yn cynnig rhyw lun o drafodaeth ac ymgysylltiad â'r ysgolion.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)



On Aled's point around the monitoring, I think that's the point that worries us all. We don't doubt your commitment, Minister, and we don't doubt the commitment of the Welsh Government in terms of where the policy priority is, but unless we have the data and the monitoring, then I think there are issues around how we can see whether these strategies—. Aled mentioned 17 or 19 programmes, all geared at a particular set of families. We need to make sure that that is having the effect that it turns the child out as a well-rounded adult at the end of the education process.

Keith drew on his experiences, and we're grateful that Keith has those experiences, but what it also tells us is that those issues that Keith was talking about, we're still facing now. It might be different. It might be that the challenge is now that they're playing computer games rather than just watching 'Watch with Mother', with 'The Woodentops' and whatever else was on. It used to be 'Rag, Tag and Bobtail' on a Wednesday, didn't it, and 'The Woodentops' on a Friday, if you were my age? Now, they're playing 'The Ninja Warriors' or whatever they play, but the issue is still the same: if there's no support at home, then the child does lose out. We're grateful that Keith reminds us about those things.

So, all in all, Minister, I think the committee is prepared to work with you to realise those ambitions. We want to see the attainment gap raised for everybody, but not raised in the same way as I said before—the tide that raises all the boats. We do need to fetch those boats that are further down the harbour to the same level as those that are riding on the crest of that wave. So, all in all, I think this is a report that I think we will hold in our legacy for the next Assembly to look at, and we will hope that, by the time the next Assembly does look at it, there will be some tangible differences to pupil attainment, wherever that pupil resides or goes to school. Thank you.

O ran pwynt Aled ynglŷn â'r monitro, credaf mai dyna'r pwynt sy'n ein poeni ni i gyd. Nid ydym yn amau eich ymrwymiad, Weinidog, ac nid ydym yn amau ymrwymiad Llywodraeth Cymru o ran lle y mae'r flaenoriaeth polisi, ond oni fo gennym y data a'r gwaith monitro, yna rwy'n meddwl bod yna broblemau'n codi o ran sut y gallwn weld a yw'r strategaethau hyn—. Crybwyllodd Aled 17 neu 19 o raglenni, pob un wedi'i thargedu at set benodol o deuluoedd. Mae angen i ni sicrhau mai effaith hynny fydd gwneud y plentyn yn oedolyn cyflawn ar ddiwedd y broses addysg.

Disgrifiodd Keith ei brofiadau ac rydym yn ddiolchgar fod Keith wedi cael y profiadau hynny, ond yr hyn y mae'n ei ddangos yw ein bod yn dal i wynebu'r problemau roedd Keith yn siarad amdanynt. Gallai fod yn wahanol. Efallai mai'r her yn awr yw eu bod yn chwarae gemau cyfrifiadurol yn hytrach na gwyllo 'Watch with Mother' gyda 'The Woodentops' a beth bynnag arall oedd ymlaen. 'Rag, Tag a Bobtail' oedd yn arfer bod ar ddydd Mercher, ynte, a 'The Woodentops' ar ddydd Gwener, os ydych yr un oed â mi? Bellach, maent yn chwarae 'The Ninja Warriors' neu beth bynnag y maent yn ei chwarae, ond yr un yw'r broblem: os nad oes cefnogaeth yn y cartref, yna bydd y plentyn ar ei gollod. Rydym yn ddiolchgar fod Keith yn ein hatgoffa am y pethau hynny.

Felly, ar y cyfan, Weinidog, rwy'n meddwl bod y pwyllgor yn barod i weithio gyda chi i wireddu'r uchelgeisiau hynny. Rydym am weld y bwch cyrhaeddiad yn codi i bawb, ond nid ei godi yn yr un modd ag y dywedais o'r blaen—y llan sy'n codi'r holl gychod. Mae angen i ni i roi'r cychod sydd ymhellach i lawr yr harbwr ar yr un lefel â'r rhai sy'n hwylio ar grib y tonnau. Felly, ar y cyfan, credaf ei fod yn adroddiad y bydd y Cynulliad nesaf yn ei etifeddu gennym i edrych arno a byddwn yn gobeithio, erbyn yr adeg y bydd y Cynulliad nesaf yn edrych arno, y bydd yna rai gwahaniaethau pendant yng nghyrrhaeddiad disgyblion, lle bynnag y bo'r disgybl yn byw neu'n mynd i'r ysgol. Diolch yn fawr.

15:10 **Y Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The proposal is to agree that we note the Children, Young People and Education Committee's report. Does any Member object? No objections, therefore the motion is agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36*

Y cynnig yw cytuno ein bod yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Plant, Pobl Ifanc ac Addysg. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Nid oes gwrthwynebiad, felly, caiff y cynnig ei dderbyn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

*Motion agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:10 **5. Dadl ar Adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar Helpu Pobl Ifanc i Gael Gwaith**

**Llywydd / The Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

We now move on to item 5, which is a debate on the Enterprise and Business Committee's report on assisting young people into work. I call on Eluned Parrott to move the motion on behalf of the committee. Eluned Parrott.

Cynnig NDM5763 William Graham

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

**5. Debate on the Enterprise and Business Committee's Report on Assisting Young People into Work**

Symudwn ymlaen yn awr at eitem 5, sef dadl ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar gynorthwyo pobl ifanc i gael gwaith. Galwaf ar Eluned Parrott i gynnig y cynnig ar ran y pwyllgor. Eluned Parrott.

Motion NDM5763 William Graham

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

**Y** Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Yn nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar ei Ymchwiliad i Helpu Pobl Ifanc i Gael Gwaith, a osodwyd yn y Swyddfa Gyflwyno ar 18 Mawrth 2015.

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.*

Notes the report of the Enterprise and Business Committee on its Inquiry into Assisting Young People into Work, which was laid in the Table Office on 18 March 2015.

*Motion moved.*

15:10

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch, Lywydd. Indeed, it gives me great pleasure to open today's debate on behalf of the Chair of the Enterprise and Business Committee.

*Daeth y Dirprwy Lywydd (David Melding) i'r Gadair am 15:11.*

**Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

The debate today, obviously, focuses on the Enterprise and Business Committee's report on assisting young people into work. I am very grateful to all of those who took the time to contribute to our inquiry, particularly the young people who spoke to us very directly about the difficulties they faced. Their experiences of employment and training meant that the inquiry was informed by those who are closest to the issues. Young people experience numerous barriers to employment. If you're under 24 in Wales, you are three times more likely to be unemployed than those over 24. Whether it is not having the chance to choose work-based alternatives to academic study, not being prepared for the world of work, or not having the means to access employment due to the cost of transport, they all add up to significant challenges.

Our report makes 16 recommendations to the Welsh Government, seven of which have been accepted, six have been accepted in principle, and the remaining three have been rejected. This is a positive response, but the report makes clear that the scale of the challenge should not be underestimated. There remain concerns that the Government's approach, as outlined in its response, will not deliver the changes we would all like to see.

I want to start by talking about support that young people need to enable them to be ready to access jobs in the first place. We have recommended that vulnerable young people should be supported by more lead workers, that all young people who need it should have face-to-face advice and guidance from Careers Wales, and that the Welsh Government should fund flexible courses for those who need longer to achieve the required outcomes. These recommendations have been made because the current approach needs to be improved. The Government's response, however, does not seem to acknowledge that a change in approach is needed. The provision of traineeships, for example, is under review, and the Deputy Minister accepts that having more start dates for courses is restricted by qualification and staffing contracts. But I would like the Deputy Minister to let us know how she is ensuring that traineeships are available for young people who need this training now.

Diolch, Lywydd. Yn wir, mae'n rhoi pleser mawr i mi agor y ddadl heddiw ar ran Cadeirydd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes.

*The Deputy Presiding Officer (David Melding) took the Chair at 15:11.*

Mae'r ddadl heddiw, yn amlwg, yn canolbwyntio ar adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar gynorthwyo pobl ifanc i gael gwaith. Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn i bawb a roddodd o'u hamser i gyfrannu at ein hymchwiliad, yn enwedig y bobl ifanc a siaradodd â ni yn onest iawn am yr anawsterau a wynebent. Golygodd eu profiadau o gyflogaeth a hyfforddiant fod yr ymchwiliad wedi'i lywio gan y rhai sydd agosaf at y materion sy'n codi. Mae pobl ifanc yn profi rhwystrau niferus i gyflogaeth. Os ydych o dan 24 oed yng Nghymru, rydych dair gwaith yn fwy tebygol o fod yn ddi-waith na'r rhai dros 24 oed. Pa un a yw'n ymwneud â bod heb gael cyfle i ddewis dewisiadau eraill yn seiliedig ar waith yn hytrach nag astudiaethau academaidd, y ffaith nad yw person yn barod ar gyfer byd gwaith, neu fethu cael gwaith oherwydd costau trafniadaeth, gyda'i gilydd maent yn heriau sylweddol.

Mae ein hadroddiad yn gwneud 16 o argymhellion i Lywodraeth Cymru, ac mae saith ohonynt wedi'u derbyn, chwech wedi'u derbyn mewn egwyddor, a'r tri arall wedi'u gwrthod. Mae'n ymateb cadarnhaol ond mae'r adroddiad yn nodi'n glir na ddylid diystyru maint yr her. Erys pryderon na fydd ymagwedd y Llywodraeth, fel yr amlinellir yn ei hymateb, yn sicrhau'r newidiadau y byddem i gyd yn hoffi eu gweld.

Rwyf am ddechrau drwy sôn am y gefnogaeth sydd ei hangen ar bobl ifanc i'w galluogi i fod yn barod i gael gfael ar swyddi yn y lle cyntaf. Rydym wedi argymhell y dylid cefnogi pobl ifanc sy'n agored i niwed gan fwy o weithwyr blaen, y dylai'r holl bobl ifanc sydd ei angen gael cyngor a chyfarwyddyd wyneb yn wyneb gan Gyrfa Cymru, ac y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru ariannu cyrsiau hyblyg ar gyfer y rhai sydd angen mwy o amser i gyflawni'r deilliannau gofynnol. Gwnaed yr argymhellion hyn am fod angen gwella'r dull cyfredol o weithredu. Fodd bynnag, nid yw ymateb y Llywodraeth i'w weld yn cydnabod bod angen newid y dull o weithredu. Mae'r ddarpariaeth o hyfforddeiaethau, er enghraifft, yn cael ei hadolygu ac mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn derbyn bod cael mwy o ddyddiadau cychwyn ar gyfer cyrsiau wedi'i gyfyngu gan gytundebau cymhwysu a staffio. Ond hoffwn i'r Dirprwy Weinidog ein hysbysu sut y mae'n sicrhau bod hyfforddeiaethau ar gael i bobl ifanc sydd angen yr hyfforddiant hwn yn awr.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Web chats, online information and telephone calls are, I'm sure, very useful as sources of advice and guidance, but they cannot replace a face-to-face meeting with a careers adviser who can offer proactive support, rather than wait for a reactive response. Many young people, not just the most vulnerable, may need additional support and one-to-one guidance to be able to understand the choices available to them, let alone ask the appropriate questions to then be able to engage in a meaningful web chat on their smartphone. Moving with the times is, obviously, very commendable, but it's clear from the evidence that more is needed still.

The response shows how the Welsh Government and local authorities are working to address the anomalies in the system that mean that a young person's tenancy can be difficult to maintain if their housing benefit is reduced when they take up low-paid employment. I note the new framework on the use of discretionary housing payments, which came in last month, and I hope that this will go some way to addressing the problem. There is plenty of opportunity to maximise the gains from financial support to the third sector in this area. I am pleased the Deputy Minister agrees with the committee on this and is developing a programme for action to cover all portfolios. Anything that reduces duplication is to be welcomed, but I would be grateful if the Deputy Minister would give a commitment to report back to the committee on the results of this and the work with the voluntary youth services.

Recommendation 7, that the Welsh Government should undertake a feasibility study into extending the youth concessionary fares scheme to young people aged 18 to 24, was accepted in principle by the Welsh Government. However, the Welsh Government's response states that—and I quote:

'there are no plans to commission a specific study to examine the costs and feasibility of extending this scheme to young people aged 18-24'.

I'm not sure, therefore, how it's possible that the Deputy Minister can suggest that the recommendation has been accepted in principle under those circumstances. I'd be grateful if the Deputy Minister could clarify the position.

In terms of education, I'm pleased to see that the Government has accepted our recommendation that there should be a strengthening of work-ready skills through the whole curriculum. I welcome the fact that the revised Welsh baccalaureate includes essential and employability skills. I also welcome the roll-out of common application process, which will begin in September. Online access to information on vocational and academic courses can't come soon enough for young people. It's an area where I think we have lagged behind. This will help in promoting the parity of esteem that the committee so wanted to see, and I'm sure that the Deputy Minister does as well. I await the results of this project. However, I am concerned that £50,000 of an existing budget allocation may not be sufficient to deliver a high-quality platform, and perhaps the Deputy Minister can give us her comments on that.

Rwy'n siŵr fod sgysiau ar y we, gwybodaeth ar-lein a galwadau ffôn yn ddefnyddiol iawn fel ffynonellau cyngor a chyfarwyddyd ond ni allant gymryd lle cyfarfod wyneb yn wyneb gyda chyngorydd gyrfa sy'n gallu cynnig cefnogaeth ragweithiol, yn hytrach nag aros am ymateb adweithiol. Efallai y bydd llawer o bobl ifanc, nid y rhai mwyaf agored i niwed yn unig, angen cymorth ychwanegol ac arweiniad un i un er mwyn gallu deall y dewisiadau sydd ar gael iddynt, heb sôn am ofyn y cwestiynau priodol er mwyn gallu cymryd rhan mewn sgwrs ystyrllon ar y we ar eu ffôn clyfar wedyn. Yn amlwg, mae symud gyda'r oes yn glodwiw iawn ond mae'n amlwg o'r dystiolaeth fod angen mwy eto.

Mae'r ymateb yn dangos sut y mae Llywodraeth Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol yn gweithio i fynd i'r afael â'r anghysondebau yn y system sy'n golygu y gall tenantiaeth person ifanc fod yn anodd ei chynnal os yw eu budd-dal tai yn cael ei leihau pan fyddant yn cael gwaith ar gyflog isel. Nodaf y fframwaith newydd ar y defnydd o daliadau tai yn ôl disgrisiwn, a roddwyd ar waith y mis diwethaf, ac rwy'n gobeithio y bydd yn helpu i fynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Mae digon o gyfle i uchafu'r budd o gymorth ariannol i'r trydydd sector yn y maes. Rwy'n falch fod y Dirprwy Weinidog yn cytuno â'r pwyllgor ar hyn ac yn datblygu rhaglen weithredu i gynnwys pob portffolio. Mae unrhyw beth sy'n lleihau dyblygu i'w groesawu ond byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn rhoi ymrwymiad i gyflwyno adroddiad i'r pwyllgor ar ganlyniadau hyn a'r gwaith gyda'r gwasanaethau ieuencid gwirfoddol.

Cafodd argymhelliad 7, y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru gynnal astudiaeth ddichonoldeb i ymestyn y cynllun tocynnau teithio rhatach ieuencid i bobl ifanc 18 i 24 oed, ei dderbyn mewn egwyddor gan Lywodraeth Cymru. Fodd bynnag, mae ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru yn nodi—a dyfynnaf:

'nad oes unrhyw gynlluniau i gomisiynu astudiaeth benodol i edrych ar y costau a dichonoldeb ymestyn y cynllun hwn i bobl ifanc 18-24 oed'.

Nid wyf yn siŵr, felly, sut y mae'n bosibl i'r Dirprwy Weinidog awgrymu bod yr argymhelliad wedi'i dderbyn mewn egwyddor o dan yr amgylchiadau hynny. Byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe gallai'r Dirprwy Weinidog egluro'r sefyllfa.

O ran addysg, rwy'n falch o weld bod y Llywodraeth wedi derbyn ein hargymhelliad y dylid cryfhau sgiliau parod at waith drwy'r cwricwlwm cyfan. Croesawaf y ffaith fod bagloriaeth Cymru ar ei newydd wedd yn cynnwys sgiliau cyflogadwyedd hanfodol. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu'r ffaith fod proses ymgeisio gyffredin yn cael ei chyflwyno, gan ddechrau ym mis Medi. Ni all mynediad ar-lein i wybodaeth am gysiau galwedigaethol ac academaidd ddod yn ddigon buan i bobl ifanc. Mae'n faes lle rydym wedi bod ar ei hôl hi, yn fy marn i. Bydd hyn yn helpu i hybu'r parch cydradd roedd y pwyllgor cymaint o eisiau ei weld ac rwy'n siŵr fod y Dirprwy Weinidog eisiau ei weld hefyd. Rwy'n aros i weld canlyniadau'r prosiect. Fodd bynnag, rwy'n bryderus na fydd £50,000 o ddyraniad o gyllideb a fodola'n barod yn ddigon i ddarparu llwyfan o safon uchel ac efallai y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog roi ei sylwadau ar hynny i ni.

The Deputy Minister assures us that our recommendation to evaluate the opportunities that young people have to choose vocational courses as a result of the Learning and Skills (Wales) Measure 2009 has been covered in the 14-19 task and finish review, which reported in September 2013. With respect, I disagree. The recommendation was to evaluate the opportunities to choose vocational courses, and the recommendations she highlights relate to developing the appropriate qualifications in this area. There is obviously a slight difference there, and I'd be grateful if the Deputy Minister would revisit this recommendation and give it some consideration.

We also made a recommendation that the Welsh Government should produce an analysis of the balance between academic and work-based learning, and assess whether the current provision is appropriate for the modern Welsh economy. Time and again we heard from employers that young people needed more work experience, and that the skills they had on leaving school were simply not suitable for the employment market, and, given this, I'm surprised that our recommendation on this area was rejected. It's difficult to see how the development of a policy statement on skills will address the concerns employers raised with us in this area.

In terms of work experience, we've recommended that the Welsh Government should make fundamental changes to work experience for young people. It should be made longer, employers should be more involved, and the whole effort should be better resourced. I look forward to the launch of the enhanced employer engagement project this September, as this was something the committee was keen to see progressed. It is an ambitious project, and I seek reassurance from the Minister that she is confident that the funding earmarked for this will be sufficient, particularly as it must cover the setting-up costs of a new scheme with many expensive objectives.

In terms of ensuring work placements are safe, the Deputy Minister has said that this responsibility lies with schools and employers. I do accept that, but I am concerned that the response to our recommendation for a national work experience database is to say that

'the review of guidance on Careers and the World of Work will provide an opportunity to explore with partners how work placement matching is best supported in future'.

With respect, this is rather vague, and I'd be grateful for the Deputy Minister's reassurance that this is not a case of kicking the issue into the long grass. Clearly, there is a provision that was available previously about guaranteeing the safety of placements that were available, and that has now gone.

Mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn sicrhau bod ein hargymhelliad i werthuso'r cyfleoedd sydd gan bobl ifanc i ddewis cyrsiau galwedigaethol o ganlyniad i Fesur Dysgu a Sgiliau (Cymru) 2009 wedi'i gynnwys yn adolygiad gorchwyl a gorffen 14-19, a gyflwynodd ei adroddiad ym mis Medi 2013. Gyda phob parch, rwy'n anghytuno. Yr argymhelliad oedd gwerthuso cyfleoedd i ddewis cyrsiau galwedigaethol ac mae'r argymhellion y mae hi'n tynnu sylw atynt yn ymwneud â datblygu'r cymwysterau priodol yn y maes. Yn amlwg, mae ychydig o wahaniaeth yno a byddwn yn ddiolchgar pe bai'r Dirprwy Weinidog yn ailedrych ar yr argymhelliad ac yn rhoi rhywfaint o ystyriaeth iddo.

Rydym hefyd yn gwneud argymhelliad y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru lunio dadansoddiad o'r cydbwysedd rhwng dysgu academaidd a dysgu sy'n seiliedig ar waith, ac asesu a yw'r ddarpariaeth bresennol yn addas ar gyfer economi'r Gymru fodern. Dro ar ôl tro rydym yn clywed gan gyflogwyr fod angen mwy o brofiad gwaith ar bobl ifanc ac nad oedd y sgiliau a oedd ganddynt ar ôl gadael yr ysgol yn addas ar gyfer y farchnad gyflogaeth ac o ystyried hyn, rwy'n synnu bod ein hargymhelliad ar y maes wedi'i wrthod. Mae'n anodd gweld sut y bydd datblygu datganiad polisi ar sgiliau yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon y mae cyflogwyr yn eu dwyn i'n sylw yn y maes hwn.

O ran profiad gwaith, rydym wedi argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru wneud newidiadau sylfaenol i brofiad gwaith ar gyfer pobl ifanc. Dylid ei wneud yn hwy, dylai fod gan gyflogwyr mwy o ran ynddo, a dylai'r ymdrech gyfan gael gwell adnoddau. Edrychaf ymlaen at lansio'r prosiect estynedig ar gyfer ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr ym mis Medi, gan fod hwn yn fater roedd y pwyllgor yn awyddus i'w weld yn cael ei ddatblygu. Mae'n brosiect uchelgeisiol, ac rwy'n gofyn am sicrwydd gan y Gweinidog ei bod yn hyderus y bydd y gyllideb a glustnodwyd ar gyfer hyn yn ddigonol, yn enwedig gan fod yn rhaid iddo gwmpasu costau sefydlu cynllun newydd gyda llawer o amcanion drud.

O ran sicrhau bod lleoliadau gwaith yn ddiogel, mae'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi dweud mai gydag ysgolion a chyflogwyr y mae'r cyfrifoldeb hwn. Rwy'n derbyn hynny, ond rwy'n bryderus mai'r ymateb i'n hargymhelliad ar gyfer cronfa ddata genedlaethol ar brofiad gwaith yw dweud y bydd

'yr adolygiad o ganllawiau Gyrfaedd a'r Byd Gwaith yn rhoi cyfle i fynd ati i archwilio, gyda phartneriaid, sut y bydd paru lleoliadau gwaith yn cael ei gefnogi orau yn y dyfodol'.

Gyda phob parch, mae hyn yn braidd yn amwys, a byddwn yn ddiolchgar am sicrwydd y Dirprwy Weinidog nad achos o roi'r mater ar y silff yw hyn. Yn amlwg, roedd darpariaeth ar gael yn flaenorol i sicrhau diogelwch y lleoliadau gwaith a oedd ar gael, ac mae hynny bellach wedi mynd.

Finally, turning to apprenticeships and traineeships, the value of which we all agree on, I'm very pleased to see that work has been done to promote apprenticeships via social media and via apprenticeship ambassadors. We recommended that the Welsh Government should do more to provide pre-entry-level training to help young people undertake a traineeship. I note that the traineeship programme is also undergoing a comprehensive review. It would be helpful if the Minister would give some indication of when and how the revised programme might be expected to relaunch.

In conclusion, whilst there are positive aspects to the Government's response to the committee's report that we are grateful for, overall, we believe that the Deputy Minister has not entirely succeeded in allaying the concerns that the committee has raised. While the word 'delivery' appears frequently in the Government's response, more frequent are references to plans, reviews and proposed approaches to improvements. The first tangible outputs of the employer engagement project are not projected for all schools until 2018, and the feeling I have on reading this response is that changes may come too late for many young people who are struggling to make choices and gain employment now and in the near future. I hope the Deputy Minister can reassure the Assembly that young people will not be left to drift towards a state of unemployability, and employers will not continue to complain that our system of education does little to prepare them for today's job market. Thank you.

15:19

### **Jeff Cuthbert** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I'm very grateful for the opportunity to speak in this important debate today. As a member of the Enterprise and Business Committee, I very much enjoyed working on this inquiry as it is an area in which I have a great deal of interest. I also welcome the Welsh Government's response to the committee's recommendations and the chance to discuss them constructively today.

Youth unemployment and the problem of those not in employment, education or training has long been an issue that has dogged the Welsh economy and society, and indeed across the whole of the UK. It's important that we target our limited resources as effectively as possible in order to tackle it. The committee's inquiry, as has been outlined, looked in depth at a number of issues surrounding youth unemployment and took evidence from a wide range of organisations as part of our work. I would like to thank all those who came to give evidence, our officials, and the other members of the committee. I know that the report, which was published on 19 March, strove to reflect those views as much as possible and I very much welcome the report.

As a former Deputy Minister for Skills, I eagerly anticipated the Welsh Government's response and I am in broad agreement with it. I would like today to focus on three particular recommendations of the committee's report.

Yn olaf, gan droi at brentisiaethau a hyfforddeiaethau, ac rydym i gyd yn gytûn ar eu gwerth, rwy'n falch iawn o weld bod gwaith wedi'i wneud i hyrwyddo prentisiaethau drwy gyfryngau cymdeithasol a thrwy genhadon prentisiaeth. Rydym yn argymhell y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru wneud mwy i ddarparu hyfforddiant cyn y lefel mynediad i helpu pobl ifanc i ddechrau hyfforddeiaethau. Nodaf fod y rhaglen hyfforddeiaeth hefyd yn mynd drwy adolygiad cynhwysfawr. Byddai o gymorth pe bai'r Gweinidog yn rhoi rhyw syniad o sut a phryd y gellir disgwyl ail-lansio'r rhaglen ddiwygiedig.

I gloi, er ein bod yn ddiolchgar am yr agweddau cadarnhaol ar ymateb y Llywodraeth i adroddiad y pwyllgor, ar y cyfan, credwn nad yw'r Dirprwy Weinidog wedi llwyddo i leddfu'r pryderon y mae'r pwyllgor wedi eu mynegi yn llwyr. Er bod y gair 'darparu' yn ymddangos yn aml yn ymateb y Llywodraeth, mae cyfeiriadau at gynlluniau, adolygiadau ac ymagweddau arfaethedig at welliannau yn ymddangos yn amlach. Ni ragamcanir canlyniadau pendant cyntaf y prosiect ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr ar gyfer pob ysgol tan 2018, a'r teimlad y caf wrth ddarllen yr ymateb hwn yw efallai y bydd newidiadau yn dod yn rhy hwyr i lawer o bobl ifanc sy'n ei chael hi'n anodd gwneud dewisiadau a chael swydd yn awr ac yn y dyfodol agos. Gobeithiaf y gall y Dirprwy Weinidog roi sicrwydd i'r Cynulliad na fydd pobl ifanc yn cael eu gadael i fynd yn anghyflogadwy, ac na fydd cyflogwyr yn parhau i gwyno nad yw ein system addysg yn gwneud fawr ddim i'w paratoi ar gyfer y farchnad swyddi heddiw. Diolch yn fawr.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn am y cyfle i siarad yn y ddadl bwysig hon heddiw. Fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes, mwynheais weithio ar yr ymchwiliad hwn yn fawr iawn gan fod cryn ddiddordeb gennyf yn y maes. Rwyf hefyd yn croesawu ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru i argymhellion y pwyllgor a'r cyfle i'w trafod yn adeiladol heddiw.

Mae diweithdra ymysg pobl ifanc a'r sawl nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg na hyfforddiant yn broblem sydd wedi blino economi a chymdeithas Cymru, a'r DU gyfan mewn gwirionedd, ers tro. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn targedu ein hadnoddau cyfyngedig mor effeithiol â phosibl er mwyn mynd i'r afael â'r broblem. Fel yr amlinellwyd, edrychodd ymchwiliad y pwyllgor yn fanwl ar nifer o faterion sy'n ymwneud â diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc, a derbyn tystiolaeth gan amrywiaeth eang o sefydliadau fel rhan o'n gwaith. Hoffwn ddiolch i bawb a ddaeth i roi tystiolaeth, i'n swyddogion, ac i aelodau eraill y pwyllgor. Gwn fod yr adroddiad, a gyhoeddwyd ar 19 Mawrth, wedi ymdrechu i adlewyrchu'r safbwyntiau hynny gystal â phosibl ac rwy'n croesawu'r adroddiad yn fawr.

Fel cyn Ddirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau, bûm yn aros yn eiddgar am ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru ac rwy'n cytuno ag ef ar y cyfan. Hoffwn ganolbwyntio heddiw ar dri argymhellid penodol o adroddiad y pwyllgor.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

First of all, recommendation 14, which focuses on the availability and provision of pre-entry-level training to better equip young people to undertake a traineeship: I'm pleased that the Welsh Government has accepted this recommendation, if only in principle. I welcome that the Welsh Government is reviewing the traineeship programme and I trust that the review will take into account the committee's thoughts on this matter. I would urge a more refined focus on pre-entry-level support for disadvantaged young people from the programme's engagement strand. We cannot afford to waste young talent in Wales and intervention is crucial, even if that talent doesn't yet understand its own capabilities.

Secondly, recommendation 15, which calls on the Welsh Government to go further in promoting apprenticeships: I'm pleased that the Welsh Government has accepted this recommendation outright. We have a good record on apprenticeships in Wales, with much better completion rates than across the border in England. We have prioritised funding, despite financial pressures, and there is much buy-in from employers, learners and training providers. I meet regularly with organisations such as the National Training Federation for Wales and it's important that we continue to work with training providers to ensure more awareness of and support for apprenticeships. It is also important that employer engagement is secured and the example set here by our anchor companies is crucial.

Last week, the First Minister rightly pointed out that the Conservative UK Government is late to the party when it comes to boosting our productivity levels. But, in Wales, we are already doing it by investing in high-quality apprenticeships. But we must review regularly our apprenticeship frameworks to make sure that they are up to date and are relevant to the needs of the Welsh economy.

Finally, recommendation 16, which looks at a number of reviews and calls on the Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology to move ahead at the earliest opportunity: once again, I'm pleased that the Welsh Government has accepted this recommendation outright. Issues such as work experience, the structure of Careers Wales, and the relationship between employer engagement and labour market intelligence are all crucial to an effective and employment support policy. I am familiar with a lot of this work from my time as Deputy Minister and it's important that the Welsh Government moves forward quickly on these matters so that we get the best deal for young people and build on the success of existing schemes, such as Jobs Growth Wales.

Yn gyntaf oll, argymhelliad 14, sy'n canolbwyntio ar argaeledd a darpariaeth hyfforddiant cyn y lefel mynediad i baratoi pobl ifanc yn well er mwyn dechrau hyfforddeiaethau: rwy'n falch fod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn, hyd yn oed mewn egwyddor yn unig. Croesawaf y ffaith fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn adolygu'r rhaglen hyfforddeiaeth ac rwy'n hyderus y bydd yr adolygiad yn ystyried barn y pwyllgor ar y mater. Byddwn yn annog ffocws manylach ar ochr ymgysylltu'r rhaglen ar gymorth cyn y lefel mynediad i bobl ifanc dan anfantais. Ni allwn fforddio gwastraffu talent ifanc yng Nghymru ac mae ymyrraeth yn hollbwysig, hyd yn oed os nad yw'r dalent honno eto'n ymwybodol o'i galluedd ei hun.

Yn ail, argymhelliad 15, sy'n galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i wneud mwy i hyrwyddo prentisiaethau: rwy'n falch fod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn yn llwyr. Mae gennym record dda o ran prentisiaethau yng Nghymru, gyda chyfraddau cwblhau llawer gwell na thros y ffin yn Lloegr. Rydym wedi blaenoriaethu cyllid, er gwaethaf pwysau ariannol, ac mae llawer o ymrwymiad gan gyflogwyr, dysgwyr a darparwyr hyfforddiant. Rwy'n cyfarfod yn rheolaidd â sefydliadau megis Ffederasiwn Hyfforddiant Cenedlaethol Cymru ac mae'n bwysig ein bod yn parhau i weithio gyda darparwyr hyfforddiant i sicrhau mwy o ymwybyddiaeth o brentisiaethau a chefnogaeth ar eu cyfer. Mae hefyd yn bwysig sicrhau ymgysylltiad â chyflogwyr, ac mae'r esiamp l a osodir yma gan ein cwmnïau angori yn hanfodol.

Yr wythnos ddiwethaf, roedd y Prif Weinidog yn iawn i nodi bod Llywodraeth Geidwadol y DU ar ei hól hi'n mynd ati i hybu ein lefelau cynhyrchiad. Ond yng Nghymru, rydym yn gwneud hynny eisoes drwy fuddsoddi mewn prentisiaethau o safon uchel. Ond mae'n rhaid i ni adolygu ein fframweithiau prentisiaeth i sicrhau eu bod yn gyfoes ac yn berthnasol i anghenion economi Cymru.

Yn olaf, argymhelliad 16, sy'n edrych ar nifer o adolygiadau ac yn galw ar y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg i symud ymlaen cyn gynted ag y bo modd: unwaith eto, rwy'n falch bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi derbyn yr argymhelliad hwn yn llwyr. Mae materion fel profiad gwaith, strwythur Gyrfa Cymru, a'r berthynas rhwng ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr a gwybodaeth am y farchnad lafur i gyd yn hanfodol ar gyfer polisi cymorth cyflogaeth effeithiol. Rwy'n gyfarwydd â llawer o'r gwaith hwn ers fy nghyfnod fel Dirprwy Weinidog ac mae'n bwysig fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn symud ymlaen yn gyflym ar y materion hyn er mwyn i ni allu sicrhau'r fargen orau i bobl ifanc ac adeiladu ar lwyddiant cynlluniau sy'n bodoli eisoes, megis Twf Swyddi Cymru.



In conclusion, Deputy Llywydd, I want to reiterate my appreciation for the attention given to this very important subject in the Chamber this afternoon. We have looked specifically at issues such as apprenticeships in the past, but they are just a part, albeit an important one, of a more holistic and comprehensive strategy for getting young people back into work. I'm encouraged by the Welsh Government's broadly positive response to this report and I look forward to engaging further with the Deputy Minister, employers, training providers, and, most importantly, young people themselves, in order to ensure that we do not let a vast pool of potential talent go to waste.

I gloi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, hoffwn ailadrodd fy ngwerthfawrogiad o'r sylw a roddwyd i'r pwnc pwysig hwn yn y Siambr y prynhawn yma. Rydym wedi edrych yn benodol ar faterion megis prentisiaethau yn y gorffennol, ond er eu bod yn bwysig, un rhan yn unig yw'r rhain o strategaeth fwy cyfannol a chynhwysfawr ar gyfer cael pobl ifanc yn ôl i waith. Rwy'n hapus gydag ymateb cadarnhaol at ei gilydd Llywodraeth Cymru i'r adroddiad hwn, ac edrychaf ymlaen at ragor o ymgysylltiad â'r Dirprwy Weinidog, cyflogwyr, darparwyr hyfforddiant, ac yn bwysicaf oll, y bobl ifanc eu hunain, er mwyn sicrhau nad ydym yn gadael i gronfa helaeth o dalent bosibl fynd yn wastraff.

15:24

## Rhun ap Iorwerth [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Mae'n braf cael cyfrannu i'r drafodaeth y prynhawn yma fel aelod o'r pwyllgor. Buaswn i'n dymuno diolch o galon i'r bobl ifanc hynny wnaeth wneud cyfraniadau mor werthfawr i'r ymchwiliad yma. Rydym yn gwybod bod diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc yn frawychus o uchel. Mae'n sefyll ar rwy 17.4 y cant i'r rhai rhwng 16 a 24 oed ar hyn o bryd—hynny fyfyr yn uwch na'r gyfradd yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Ond 'pam?' ydy'r cwestiwn, wrth gwrs. Mi wnaeth y pwyllgor ganfod cyfres, rwy'n meddwl, o resymau rydym yn meddwl sy'n cyfrannu at fethiant pobl ifanc i ddod o hyd yn hawdd i lwybrau i waith.

Efallai bod y neges ganolog yn yr adroddiad yn cael ei chrynhai gan yr un canfyddiad yma: un o'r prif bethau ddaeth i'r amlwg oedd bod y glorian yn dal i bwysu'n drwm ar ochr astudiaethau academiaidd. Mae hynny'n anghydnaws â'r cyfleoedd gwaith sydd ar gael i bobl ifanc, ac nid yw'n gwneud fawr i'w paratoi ar gyfer bywyd gwaith. Mae hynny'n crynhai, rwy'n meddwl, llawer o'r pryderon. Mi wna fanylu ar ychydig o'r argymhellion a chanfyddiadau rwy'n meddwl sy'n bwysig. Mae gormod o bobl ifanc yn gadael ysgol heb sgiliau llythrennedd a rhifedd hanfodol, wrth gwrs, ond mae yna hefyd ddiffyg sgiliau i baratoi am y gweithle yn gyffredinol—y sgiliau meddal yma rydym wedi clywed amdany'n nhw, fel pwysigrwydd prydlondeb, ymddygiad priodol yn y gweithle, ac ati. Mae yna ddiffyg gwybodaeth ymarferol am sut i ymgeisio am swyddi a sut i gyflwyno'ch hun i ddarpar gyflogwyr. Mae yna bryderon sylfaenol am y drefniadaeth o ran profiad gwaith ac o ran cyngor gyrfaoedd. Mae cylch dieflig yna, hefyd, o fethu â chael digon o brofiad i gael swydd, ond wedyn methu â bod mewn sefyllfa i gael y profiad gwaith hwnnw, yn fater a ddaeth i'r amlwg droeon.

I'm pleased to contribute to the debate this afternoon as a committee member. I would like to express my heartfelt thanks to those young people who made such valuable contributions to this inquiry. We know that youth unemployment is shockingly high. It stands at around 17.4 per cent for those aged between 16 and 24 at present—that is a little higher than the rate in England and Scotland. But the question is 'why?', of course. The committee identified a series of reasons that we believe contribute to the failure of young people to easily identify pathways into work.

Perhaps the central message of the report is brought together in this one finding: one of the main things to emerge was that the balance is still heavily weighed on the academic side. That is not in keeping with the job opportunities available to young people, and does little to prepare them for the world of work. I think that summarises many of the concerns. I will concentrate on some of the recommendations and findings that I think are most important. Too many young people leave school without crucial numeracy and literacy skills, of course, but there is also a lack of skills in preparing for the workplace more generally—the soft skills that we've heard about, such as the importance of punctuality, appropriate conduct in the workplace, and so on. There is a lack of information on a practical level in terms of how to apply for jobs, and how to present yourself to prospective employers. There are basic concerns about the arrangements in terms of work experience and careers advice. There is that vicious circle, also, of not getting enough experience in order to get a job, and then failing to be in a position to acquire that work experience, and that was an issue that was identified a number of times.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Mae yna bryderon rydym wedi clywed amdany'n nhw, yn ddi-sail yn aml, am y costau o gymryd swyddi, efo llawer yn dewis rhwyd ddiogelwch y wladwriaeth les fel rhywbeth saff i fynd amdano fo. Mi wnaeth pobl ifanc hefyd eu hunain ddweud nad oedd ganddyn nhw'r sgiliau llythrennedd ariannol a sgiliau bywyd ac ati sydd eu hangen arny'n nhw, a chrybwyllaf yn fan hyn y gefnogaeth a gafodd ei ddangos yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad i'r Bil y gwnaeth Bethan Jenkins ei gynbig ar lythrennedd ariannol, ac mae yna alw, yn sicr, gan y pwyllgor ar y Llywodraeth i weithredu amcanion y Bil hwnnw cyn gynted â phosibl. Yn olaf, er bod yna ganmoliaeth i sawl elfen o'r cynllun Twf Swyddi Cymru, mi ddaeth yna gryn anghysondeb, rwy'n meddwl, i'r amlwg yn y profiad oedd yn cael ei gynbig i bobl ifanc mewn rhai cwmnïau o'i gymharu ag eraill. Felly, ystod eang iawn o ganfyddiadau, ac mi roddaf innau ychydig o sylwadau pellach ynglŷn â'n safbwynt ni fel Plaid Cymru, wedyn, yn deillio o'r hyn a welsom yn ystod yr ymgynghoriad.

Ar Dwf Swyddi Cymru, wrth gwrs ein bod ni'n gweld gwerth mawr i'r rhaglen, ond does fiw inni feddwl amdano fel yr un ateb i broblem diweithdra'r ifanc, ac, yn aml iawn, dyna'r awgrym sy'n cael ei roi gan y Llywodraeth. Mae'r adroddiad yn tanlinellu rhai pryderon: er enghraifft, bod rhai cyflogwyr ddim yn prynu i mewn, os liciwch chi, i'r cynllun gystal â chyflogwyr eraill, a hefyd y gallai llawer o'r swyddi fod wedi cael eu creu—waeth inni fod yn blwmp ac yn blaen—gan yr un cyflogwyr heb gefnogaeth gan Dwf Swyddi Cymru. Ein prif feirniadaeth ni, am wn i, am y cynllun yw nad ydyw'n helpu, efallai, y rheini sydd bellaf i ffwrdd oddi wrth y farchnad waith, y rheini sydd heb gymwysterau, y rheini sydd heb y sgiliau iawn sy'n golygu eu bod nhw'n barod am y byd gwaith. Fel y dywedais i, mae llawer gormod o bobl ifanc yn gadael yr ysgol heb y sgiliau meddal yma. Mae'n rhaid i'r Llywodraeth gydnabod y broblem yna yn fwy a gweithredu ar y broblem yma yn fwy, fel y mae Plaid Cymru wedi galw am weithredu arno fwy ers cyfnod maith.

Mi wna'f glou efo datganiad o'r hyn sy'n berffaith amlwg mewn difrif, sef na allwch chi greu swyddi heb gael economi gref a heb sector breifat gref. Mae'n rhaid inni wneud yn siŵr bod yr amgylchedd y mae busnesau yn gweithio o'i fewn yng Nghymru heb ei ail. Mae eisiau gwneud i fusnesau allu a bod eisiau tyfu yng Nghymru. Dyna sut mae sicrhau, yn y pen draw, bod y cyfleoedd swyddi ar gael i'n pobl ifanc ni, iddyn nhw allu chwarae rhan fel y maen nhw'n dymuno ei wneud, mewn creu Cymru fwy llewyrchus.

There are concerns that we have heard about, which are often without foundation, about the costs of taking jobs, with many choosing the safety net of the welfare state as a safe option. Young people themselves told us that they didn't have the financial literacy skills and life skills that they needed, and I will mention here the support given during the consultation on the Bill that Bethan Jenkins brought forward on financial literacy, and the committee has, certainly, called on the Government to implement the objectives of that Bill as soon as possible. Finally, although there was praise for a number of elements of Jobs Growth Wales, there was some inconsistency, I think, that emerged in terms of the experience on offer to young people in some companies as compared to others. So, there was a wide range of findings, and I will then just make a few further comments on our point of view as Plaid Cymru—The Party of Wales, emerging from what we heard and saw during the consultation.

On Jobs Growth Wales, of course we see great value in that programme, but we must not think of it as the one silver bullet to solve all the problems of youth unemployment, and that, very often, is the suggestion made by the Government. The report highlights some concerns: for example, that some employers don't buy in, if you like you, to the scheme as well as others, and also that many of the jobs could have been created—let us be clear here—by the same employers without support from Jobs Growth Wales. Our main criticism, I suppose, is that the scheme doesn't assist those people who are furthest away from the labour market, those who don't have qualifications, those who don't have the necessary skills that would make them ready for the world of work. As I said, there are far too many young people leaving school without these soft skills. The Government must concentrate more on that problem and take more action, as Plaid Cymru has called for for a long period of time.

I will conclude with a statement of the blatantly obvious, which is that you can't create jobs without having a strong economy and without a strong private sector. We must ensure that the environment that businesses work within in Wales is the best it can possibly be. We must ensure that businesses can and want to grow in Wales. That is how we will ultimately ensure that the job opportunities are available for our young people, so that they can play the part that they wish to play in creating a more prosperous Wales.

I agree with many of the points made by Rhun ap Iorwerth on the important role of schools, and I appreciate that a great deal of work has been done by the Welsh Government on getting people into apprenticeships, and Jobs Growth Wales in every other respect has done a good job. Nevertheless, the report points out that the scale of the task that Wales faces in helping our young people into work is immense, and I particularly want to focus on the 19 to 24-year-olds for whom there is a much bigger problem of young people not in education, training or work. In preparation for this debate, I went to talk to some of the young people in this category in my constituency to find out what it looks like on the ground and I found it very interesting to learn about that in the light of all the comments made in the report and the Government's response. I met one young man who has had good support from Interserve, who have helped him get a call centre job in a large company, which might have led to a permanent job, but it didn't work out because, after three months, he didn't pass the probation period. His Interserve work coach continues to work with him fortnightly, but she says the issue is not so much about getting a job, but staying in it, because she says that he only seems to last a few months in each job.

I have to say that for this bright and articulate young man, his aspirations are not in retail or customer service, where he has plenty of experience. His aspiration is to start a career in animal management or nursing. But he has few qualifications and it would take a long time to acquire those qualifications and there's a big question mark over where he would get the funding. This is a former looked-after child, so the local authority is, or was, his corporate parent. In fact, Fostering Network Wales's evidence to the committee about care leavers could have been written about this young man. They require a unique set of interventions and support in recognition of their lack of family support and vulnerability. It is critical that statutory services work in partnership with the voluntary sector to be able to prioritise and support improved employment outcomes for this vulnerable group of young people.

I met a young woman aged 19. Now, she hadn't been in care, but there'd been a massive family breakdown, so that although she'd achieved her AS qualifications, she still needs to complete her A-levels so that she can go to art college, which is her aspiration. So, aged 19, she's already on employment support allowance because of depression and anxiety, and if she wants to get a job using her artistic skills in a very competitive field, she is likely to need many more qualifications, not just A-levels, but art school or some other technical qualification, if she's going to follow what she wants to do in life. Now, she thinks she's unlikely to be eligible for funding as she's not lived independently of her parents for three years yet, and there's no chance of her parents funding her education even if they were financially able to do so. I understand that she might be eligible for a Welsh Government learning grant of up to £1,500. Now, that's better than nothing, but she couldn't live off that, and tuition fees, after she gets her A-levels, and living costs, are major barriers. Would she be able to work at the same time as studying?

Cytunaf â llawer o'r pwyntiau a wnaed gan Rhun ap Iorwerth ynghylch y rôl bwysig sydd gan ysgolion, ac rwy'n derbyn bod llawer iawn o waith wedi'i wneud gan Lywodraeth Cymru i gael pobl i mewn i brentisiaethau, ac mae Twf Swyddi Cymru wedi gwneud gwaith da ym mhob ffordd arall. Serch hynny, mae'r adroddiad yn dangos bod maint y dasg sy'n wynebu Cymru o ran helpu ein pobl ifanc i gael gwaith yn enfawr, ac rwy'n awyddus i ganolbwyntio'n benodol ar y rhai rhwng 19 a 24 mlwydd oed, sydd â phroblem lawer mwy o ran pobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, hyfforddiant neu waith. I baratoi ar gyfer y ddatl hon, bûm yn siarad â phobl ifanc yn y categori hwn yn fy etholaeth i gael gwybod sut y mae pethau ar lawr gwlad, ac roedd yn ddiddorol iawn dysgu am hynny yng ngoleuni'r holl sylwadau a wnaed yn yr adroddiad ac ymateb y Llywodraeth. Cyfarfûm ag un dyn ifanc a oedd wedi cael cefnogaeth dda gan Interserve, a'i cynorthwyodd i gael swydd mewn canolfan alwadau gyda chwmni mawr, a gallai hyn fod wedi arwain at swydd barhaol, ond ni ddigwyddodd hynny gan na lwyddodd i basio'r cyfnod prawf wedi tri mis. Mae ei hyfforddwr gwaith o Interserve yn parhau i weithio gydag ef bob pythefnos, ond mae hi'n dweud nad cael swydd yw'r broblem fwyaf, ond aros ynndi, oherwydd nad yw'r dyn ifanc i'w weld yn para mwy nag ychydig fisoedd ym mhob swydd.

Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud nad ym maes manwerthu neu wasanaethau cwsmeriaid, lle y mae ganddo ddigon o brofiad, y mae dyheadau'r dyn ifanc deallus a huawdl hwn. Ei uchelgais yw dechrau gyrfa ym maes rheoli anifeiliaid neu nyrsio. Ond nid oes ganddo lawer o gymwysterau. Byddai'n cymryd cryn dipyn o amser i ennill y cymwysterau hynny ac mae marc cwestiwn mawr ynglŷn â lle y byddai'n dod o hyd i'r arian. Yn blentyn, roedd yn derbyn gofal, felly'r awdurdod lleol yw, neu oedd, ei riant corfforaethol. Yn wir, gallai tystiolaeth Rhwydwaith Maethu Cymru i'r pwyllgor ynglŷn â phobl sy'n gadael gofal fod wedi ei hysgrifennu am y dyn ifanc hwn. Maent angen set unigryw o ymyriadau a chefnogaeth oherwydd eu diffyg cefnogaeth deuluol a'u sefyllfa agored i niwed. Mae'n hollbwysig fod gwasanaethau statudol yn gweithio mewn partneriaeth â'r sector gwirfoddol i allu blaenoriaethu a sicrhau canlyniadau cyflogaeth gwell i'r grŵp hwn o bobl ifanc sy'n agored i niwed.

Cyfarfûm a merch ifanc 19 oed. Nawr, nid oedd wedi bod mewn gofal, ond roedd wedi wynebu chwalfa deuluol enfawr, felly er ei bod wedi cyflawni ei chymwysterau AS, mae angen iddi gwblhau ei Lefelau A i allu mynd i goleg celf, fel sy'n uchelgais ganddi. Felly, yn 19 oed, mae hi eisoes ar lwfans cyflogaeth a chymorth oherwydd iselder a gorbryder, ac os yw am gael swydd sy'n defnyddio ei sgiliau artistig mewn maes cystadleuol iawn, mae'n debygol y bydd angen llawer mwy o gymwysterau arni, nid Lefelau A yn unig, ond ysgol gelf neu ryw gymhwyster technegol arall, os yw am wneud yr hyn y mae am ei wneud gyda'i bywyd. Nawr, mae hi'n meddwl ei bod hi'n annhebygol o fod yn gymwys i gael arian gan nad yw wedi byw'n annibynnol oddi ar ei rhieni am dair blynedd eto, ac nid oes obaith yn y byd y byddai ei rhieni'n ariannu ei haddysg hyd yn oed pe bai'r gallu ariannol ganddynt i wneud hynny. Rwy'n deall y gallai fod yn gymwys i gael grant dysgu Llywodraeth Cymru o hyd at £1,500. Nawr, mae hynny'n well na dim byd, ond ni allai fyw ar hynny, ac mae ffioedd dysgu, ar ôl cael ei Lefelau A, a chostau byw, yn rhwystrau mawr. A fyddai'n gallu gweithio ac astudio ar yr un pryd?

Neither of these young people have the support that young people would normally get from their parents. So, ongoing support is vital to ensure that they make good career choices and develop the resilience they need to keep going despite the setbacks that all young people come across when they're setting out in their life. There simply is no justice in imposing on them the shortcomings in support that is normally available from parents to encourage, cajole, advise and unconditionally support young people whatever career path they choose. What we also know is that the best guarantee of ensuring that we're not passing deprivation from one generation to another is to ensure that parents are in work.

Another young man whom I met, who has already started a family, who is already on ESA, and has depression and anxiety, remains keen to work. He needs to get a Level 3 in personal fitness in order to take up the career path that he has chosen. It's an intensive 21-hour course a week, but he fears that this would cause him to lose all his housing benefit and ESA. Is that correct? The jobcentre personal adviser told him he would look into it, but four months later, he still hasn't come back to him. I have established that there are two groups of people on ESA, the workplace activity group, almost work-ready, and the support group —

Nid yw'r un o'r bobl ifanc hyn yn cael y gefnogaeth y byddai pobl ifanc fel arfer yn ei chael gan eu rhieni. Felly, mae cymorth parhaus yn hanfodol i sicrhau eu bod yn gwneud dewisiadau da o ran gyrfa ac yn datblygu'r cydnheredd sydd ei angen arnynt i ddal ati er gwaethaf y rhwystrau y mae pobl ifanc yn eu hwynebu ar ddechrau eu bywydau. Yn syml, nid yw'n gyfiawn eu gadael heb y gefnogaeth sydd ar gael fel arfer gan rieni i annog, cymell, cyngori a chefnogi pobl ifanc yn ddiamod pa lwybr gyrfa bynnag a ddewisant. Gwyddom hefyd mai'r ffordd orau o sicrhau nad ydym yn trosglwyddo amddifadedd o un genhedlaeth i'r llall yw sicrhau bod rhieni yn gweithio.

Mae dyn ifanc arall y cyfarfûm ag ef eisoes wedi dechrau teulu ac mae eisoes ar lwfans cyflogaeth a chymorth. Mae'n dioddef o iselder a gorbryder, ond mae'n dal i fod yn awyddus i weithio. Mae angen Lefel 3 mewn ffitrwydd personol arno er mwyn manteisio ar y llwybr gyrfa y mae wedi'i ddewis. Mae'n gwrs dwys 21 awr yr wythnos, ond mae'n ofni y byddai hyn yn peri iddo golli ei fudd-dal tai a'i Lwfans Cyflogaeth a Chymorth i gyd. A yw hynny'n gywir? Dywedodd ymgynghorydd personol y ganolfan waith wrtho y byddai'n edrych ar hynny, ond bedwar mis yn ddiweddarach, nid yw wedi dod yn ôl ato. Rwyf wedi cadarnhau bod dau grŵp o bobl ar Lwfansau Cyflogaeth a Chymorth, y grŵp gweithgareddau yn y gweithle, bron yn barod at waith, a'r grŵp cymorth—

15:35 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

You must bring your speech to a conclusion now, please.

Mae'n rhaid i chi ddod â'ch araith i ben yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

15:35 **Jenny Rathbone** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

But it is unclear to this young man, and Jobcentre Plus has failed to come back to him. I found out some information, but really Cardiff and the Vale finance team immediately came back, with the pathway that he needs to choose. And we need to get better at ensuring that Jobcentre Plus has this information, too.

Ond nid yw'n glir i'r dyn ifanc hwn, ac mae'r Ganolfan Byd Gwaith wedi methu â dod yn ôl ato. Cefais rywfaint o wybodaeth, ond daeth tîm cyllid Caerdydd a'r Fro yn ôl ato'n syth, gyda'r llwybr y mae angen iddo'i ddewis. Ac mae angen i ni ddod yn well am sicrhau bod y wybodaeth honno gan y Ganolfan Byd Gwaith, hefyd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

15:35 **Joyce Watson** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I want to congratulate my colleagues, and the Assembly staff, on the production of this report. But, mostly, I want to congratulate the young people who engaged with us, who gave us their stories, and who have helped to form this report, in the way that it is. And the data that was collected by the committee is, undoubtedly, invaluable. The policies recommended reflect the importance given to the evidence received, and the implementation of those policies, and how satisfactorily they'll address the worries brought to us, is now our main concern.

Hoffwn longyfarch fy nghydweithwyr, a staff y Cynulliad, ar gynhyrchu'r adroddiad hwn. Ond yn bennaf, rwyf am longyfarch y bobl ifanc a ymgysylltodd â ni i roi eu hanesion, ac sydd wedi helpu i ffurfio'r adroddiad hwn yn y modd y cafodd ei lunio. Ac mae'r data a gasglwyd gan y pwyllgor, heb os, yn amhrisiadwy. Mae'r polisiau a argymhellir yn adlewyrchu'r pwysigrwydd a roddir i'r dystiolaeth a ddaeth i law, a'r hyn sydd bwysicaf i ni yn awr yw bod y polisiau hynny'n cael eu rhoi ar waith, a pha mor foddhaol y byddant yn mynd i'r afael â'r pryderon a ddygwyd ger ein bron.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

We need to consider the title of the report. It is: 'Assisting Young People into Work'. And the word 'assisting' is all-important here. This is neither the nanny state, nor the do-nothing state. It fosters enterprise, but it's not so naive as to believe that enterprise grows out of nothing. We have a responsibility to create the conditions that encourage enterprise; we also need to motivate, and to make aspirational the possible.

Mae angen i ni ystyried teitl yr adroddiad. Y teitl yw: 'Helpu Pobl Ifanc i Gael Gwaith'. Ac mae'r gair 'helpu' yn hollbwysig yma. Nid gwladwriaeth faldodus mo hon, na gwladwriaeth 'gwneud dim byd' chwaith. Mae'n meithrin menter, ond nid yw mor naif â chredu bod menter yn tyfu o ddim. Mae gennym gyfrifoldeb i greu'r amodau sy'n hybu menter; mae angen i ni ysgogi hefyd, a gwneud yr uchelgeisiol yn bosibl.

Nowhere is this dilemma more evident than in recommendation 3, and the Welsh Government's response to it. The Welsh Government rejected the recommendation, having thought long and hard about it; I think the Welsh Government was right. We can all, in our more robust, Jeremy Clarkson moods, make sardonic observations about health and safety. And yet, workplace death and injuries are fewer by far than they were a few generations ago. Death at work was once commonplace; it isn't now. If we cut corners—even for the best of motives—it should not be in health and safety.

The Welsh Government states:

'Employers who are taking on students for work experience have the primary responsibility for their health and safety.'

I would add that, to share responsibility, can be to dilute that responsibility. What, after all, is a young person? I'm acutely aware of the position of young people who've gone through the school system, who may even have gone through the higher education system, and who have obtained a qualification. They no longer have the support of a school, or of a college, or of a university, behind them, and, more crucially, they do not have the possibility of sustained work ahead of them. They, more than anyone—and Jenny referred to a couple just now—need the statutory support of the health and safety legislation, and other forms of welfare, in the workplace.

I was going to say much that has already been said before; I see little point in doing that. The only extra point that I would make in this, and the evidence that we had, was that, where you have large employers, it seemed that people understood very well the training opportunities available to them. That seemed to be less so in rural areas—like the one that I represent. And it also seemed evident that there is still a stereotypical advice that is going on. And I know that the Minister has started to address some of that, through Careers Wales, but I still think that there is a fair way to go.

Gwelir y cyfng-gyngor hwn ar ei fwyaf amlwg yn argymhelliad 3, ac ymateb Llywodraeth Cymru iddo. Gwrthododd Llywodraeth Cymru yr argymhelliad, ar ôl meddwl yn hir ac yn ddwys amdano; rwy'n meddwl bod Llywodraeth Cymru yn iawn. Gall pob un ohonom, yn ein hwyliau mwy cadarn, Jeremy Clarkson-aid, wneud arsylwadau coeglyd am iechyd a diogelwch. Ac eto, mae llai o lawer o farwolaethau ac anafiadau yn y gweithle nag oedd ychydig o genedlaethau yn ôl. Roedd marwolaeth yn y gwaith yn arfer bod yn beth cyffredin; nid yw'n gyffredin yn awr. Os ydym yn torri corneli—hyd yn oed am y rhesymau gorau—ni ddylid gwneud hynny ar draul iechyd a diogelwch.

Dywed Llywodraeth Cymru mai:

'Y cyflogwyr sy'n derbyn myfyrwyr ar brofiad gwaith sy'n bennaf gyfrifol am eu hiechyd a'u diogelwch.'

Byddwn yn ychwanegu y gallai rhannu cyfrifoldeb wanhu'r cyfrifoldeb hwnnw. Beth, wedi'r cyfan, yw person ifanc? Rwy'n ymwybodol iawn o sefyllfa pobl ifanc sydd wedi mynd drwy'r system ysgolion, a hyd yn oed wedi mynd drwy'r system addysg uwch efallai, ac wedi ennill cymhwyster. Nid oes ganddynt gefnogaeth ysgol, neu goleg, neu brifysgol, mwyach ac yn bwysicach, nid oes ganddynt bosibilrwydd o waith parhaus o'u blaenau. Maent hwy, yn fwy na neb—a chyfeiriodd Jenny at un neu ddau yn awr—angen cefnogaeth statudol y ddeddfwriaeth iechyd a diogelwch, a mathau eraill o les, yn y gweithle.

Roeddwn yn mynd i ddweud llawer sydd eisoes wedi'i ddweud; nid wyf yn gweld fawr o bwynt mewn gwneud hynny. Yr unig bwynt ychwanegol y byddwn yn ei wneud o ran hyn, a'r dystiolaeth a gawsom, oedd ei bod yn ymddangos, lle y mae gennyh gyflogwyr mawr, fod pobl yn deall pa gyfleoedd hyfforddi sydd ar gael iddynt yn dda iawn. Ymddengys bod hynny'n llai gwir mewn ardaloedd gwledig—fel yr un rwy'n ei chynrychioli. Ac ymddengys hefyd fod cyngor ystrydebol yn dal i gael ei roi. A gwn fod y Gweinidog wedi dechrau mynd i'r afael â pheth o hynny, drwy Gyrfa Cymru, ond rwy'n dal i gredu bod cryn dipyn o fordd i fynd.

15:39 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

And I call on the Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology, Julie James.

A galwaf ar y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg, Julie James.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

15:39 **Julie James** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Y Dirprwy Weinidog Sgiliau a Thechnoleg / The Deputy Minister for Skills and Technology*

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I very much want to welcome the report on assisting young people into work, and to thank the Chair and members of the committee for the thoroughness of their work, which addresses issues every Member in this Chamber is concerned and interested in. I also want to thank the young people who took part in that inquiry, and also the five Members who've contributed to the debate today, with some very important points.

Rwyf am groesawu'r adroddiad ar helpu pobl ifanc i gael gwaith, a diolch i'r Cadeirydd ac aelodau'r pwyllgor am drylwyredd eu gwaith, sy'n mynd i'r afael â materion o bwys a diddordeb i bob Aelod yn y Siambr hon. Rwyf hefyd am ddiolch i'r bobl ifanc a gymerodd ran yn yr ymchwiliad, a hefyd i'r pum Aelod a gyfrannodd at y ddatl heddiw, gan dynnu sylw at bwytiau pwysig iawn.

The Welsh Government is very much stepping up to the challenge of assisting young people get into work, and I'm very proud that, through programmes like Jobs Growth Wales, we have put in place and delivered practical and meaningful solutions, helping many thousands of young people get the experience and chance they need to begin successful careers. We've had several debates about Jobs Growth Wales over the last weeks in this Chamber, so I'll not go through all of the points that were raised today again. But I think it's really important to make two points here. Jobs Growth Wales is a scheme that not only helps young people, but helps to deliver the economic growth necessary for more jobs to be created. Also, Jobs Growth Wales is deliberately aimed at young people who are job-ready, but have no work experience—that's the purpose of the programme.

In addressing the rest of the issues raised by the committee, I want to put them into three key themes due to the shortness of time. The first one is developing young people's employability skills and delivering improvements to work experience. Irrespective of the learning pathway, the transition from education and training into work should build on employability and enterprise skills, developed throughout the time young people spend in learning. To support this, we are committed to developing an engaging curriculum in Wales, which develops within young people an independent ability to apply knowledge and skills.

Professor Donaldson's report, 'Successful Futures', has established a dynamic vision for curriculum and assessment in Wales, which we will be responding to in full before the summer break. We are already making progress with the revised Welsh baccalaureate skills challenge certificate, focusing on essential and employability skills that both universities and employers want learners to have.

We're also committed to building on the success of our numeracy employer engagement project, which has involved over 100 secondary schools so far. Also, led by Careers Wales, our enhanced employer engagement project will invest £0.5 million over the next two years to foster a more consistent and high-value partnership between schools and employers.

Work experience and employer engagement, as nearly everybody who has contributed today has pointed out, can be particularly significant in motivating those who may be at risk of disengaging from their learning. That is why we are also actively pursuing European structural fund funding for our 'Activate Your Potential' project. Through 'Activate', we plan to engage young people at risk of becoming not in employment, education or training with employer and work-related activities, starting in key stage 3 and going on to involve tailored work experience in key stage 4.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ymateb i'r her o helpu pobl ifanc i gael gwaith, ac rwy'n falch iawn, drwy raglenni megis Twf Swyddi Cymru, ein bod wedi gweithredu a darparu atebion ymarferol ac ystyrlon, gan helpu miloedd lawer o bobl ifanc i gael y profiad a'r cyfle sydd eu hangen arnynt i ddechrau gyrfaedd llwyddiannus. Rydym wedi cael nifer o drafodaethau am Twf Swyddi Cymru dros yr wythnosau diwethaf yn y Siambr hon, felly nid af drwy bob un o'r pwyntiau a godwyd heddiw eto. Ond rwy'n credu ei bod yn bwysig iawn gwneud dau bwynt yma. Mae Twf Swyddi Cymru yn gynllun sy'n helpu pobl ifanc, a hefyd yn helpu i sicrhau'r twf economaidd sy'n angenrheidiol ar gyfer creu mwy o swyddi. Hefyd, mae Twf Swyddi Cymru wedi'i anelu yn fwriadol at bobl ifanc parod at waith, ond heb brofiad o waith—dyna bwrpas y rhaglen.

I fynd i'r afael â gweddill y materion a nodwyd gan y pwyllgor, rwyf am eu dosbarthu'n dair thema allweddol gan fod amser yn brin. Y gyntaf yw datblygu sgiliau cyflogadwyedd pobl ifanc a gwelliannau i brofiad gwaith. Beth bynnag y bo'r llwybr dysgu, dylai'r pontio rhwng addysg a hyfforddiant a gwaith adeiladu ar y sgiliau cyflogadwyedd a menter a ddatblygir drwy gydol yr amser y mae pobl ifanc yn ei dreulio'n dysgu. I gefnogi hyn, rydym wedi ymrwmo i ddatblygu cwricwlwm atyniadol yng Nghymru sy'n datblygu gallu annibynnol mewn pobl ifanc i gymhwyso gywbodaeth a sgiliau.

Mae adroddiad yr Athro Donaldson, 'Dyfodol Llwyddiannus', wedi sefydlu gweledigaeth ddynamig ar gyfer y cwricwlwm ac asesu yng Nghymru, a byddwn yn ymateb iddo'n llawn cyn toriad yr haf. Rydym eisoes yn gwneud cynnydd gyda thystysgrif her sgiliau bagloriaeth Cymru ar ei newydd wedd, gan ganolbwyntio ar y sgiliau cyflogadwyedd hanfodol y mae prifysgolion a chyflogwyr am i ddysgwyr feddu arnynt.

Rydym hefyd wedi ymrwmo i adeiladu ar lwyddiant ein prosiect ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr ym maes rhifedd, sydd wedi cynnwys dros 100 o ysgolion uwchradd hyd yn hyn. Hefyd, o dan arweiniad Gyrfa Cymru, bydd ein prosiect ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr estynedig yn buddsoddi £0.5 miliwn dros y ddwy flynedd nesaf er mwyn meithrin partneriaeth fwy cyson a gwerthfawr rhwng ysgolion a chyflogwyr.

Gall profiad gwaith ac ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr, fel y mae bron bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu heddiw wedi'i nodi, fod yn arbennig o arwyddocaol i ysgogi rhai a allai fod mewn perygl o droi cefn ar eu haddysg. Dyna pam rydym yn mynd ati hefyd i ymgeisio am gyllid cronfeydd strwythurol Ewropeaidd ar gyfer ein prosiect 'Ysgogwch Eich Dyfodol'. Drwy 'Ysgogwch Eich Dyfodol', rydym yn bwriadu ymgysylltu â phobl ifanc sydd mewn perygl o ddod yn bobl nad ydynt mewn cyflogaeth, addysg neu hyfforddiant gyda gweithgareddau sy'n gysylltiedig â chyflogwyr a gwaith, gan ddechrau yng nghyfnod allweddol 3 a mynd ymlaen i gynnwys profiad gwaith wedi'i deilwra yng nghyfnod allweddol 4.



We also have work experience for those in FE clearly on the radar. The evaluation of the pathways to apprenticeship programme highlighted that work experience is a key component of its success according to employers. Responding to this, the Welsh Government has incorporated work experience into the enhanced engineering programme, and we are looking to every college to build work experience into any learning programme where it adds value, because we know that, for many young people, work experience motivates and helps shape their career thinking. It also helps young people better understand the sorts of attitudes, skills and behaviours that their future employers will value.

I absolutely agree with the committee that we want to see the bar raised in terms of the quality and relevance of this work experience. To give clear leadership on this point, this year, I will be reviewing work experience as part of the broader revision of guidance on the delivery of careers and the world of work curriculum. Just while I'm on that point, I think that Joyce Watson made some very important points about the health and safety issues around work experience. We want to concentrate Careers Wales on careers advice and not on giving additional support for health and safety. It is the employers' responsibility and it's very firmly the employers' responsibility. But I want to assure Members that, for those employers that are very small indeed, we will be looking at alternative pathways to ensuring that they can also deliver work experience.

The second theme I want to look at is that of ensuring that young people receive the right advice and guidance and an opportunity to understand and pursue learning pathways, which help prepare them for their working lives in the career of their choice. The committee's report highlights the need to open up access to apprenticeships and to extend opportunities for young people to follow vocational routes. In Wales in 2013-14, there were just over 24,000 young people under 25 on foundation apprenticeships. Our ambition is to work with employers and providers to further expand opportunities for young people to get into apprenticeships.

Addressing the balance between the type of provision on offer and the needs of employers and the economy is a concern. Here I'm pleased that work on planning post-16 provision, linked to local labour market needs, is very much in development. This is supported by the three regional skills partnerships that have been tasked with driving up investment and skills based on local and regional economic needs.

Improving our understanding of learners' destinations will further help to get this balance right in Wales. We are actively developing measures that can be used for further education, sixth forms and work-based learning. I completely agree with members of the committee that it is vitally important that young people who need support are able to access it.

Mae profiad gwaith ar gyfer pobl mewn Addysg Bellach hefyd yn amlwg ar ein radar. Amlygodd y gwerthusiad o'r rhaglen Llwybrau at Brentisiaethau fod profiad gwaith yn elfen allweddol o'i llwyddiant yn ôl cyflogwyr. Mewn ymateb i hyn, mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi ymgorffori profiad gwaith yn y rhaglen peirianeg estynedig, ac rydym am i bob coleg gynnwys profiad gwaith ym mhob rhaglen ddysgu lle y mae'n ychwanegu gwerth, oherwydd gwyddom fod profiad gwaith yn ysgogi ac yn helpu llawer o bobl ifanc o ran y ffordd y maent yn meddwl am eu gyrfa. Mae hefyd yn helpu pobl ifanc i ddeall y mathau o agweddau, sgiliau ac ymddygiad y bydd eu cyflogwyr yn y dyfodol yn eu gwerthfawrogi.

Cytunaf yn llwyr â'r pwyllgor ein bod am weld y bar yn codi o ran ansawdd a pherthnasedd y profiad gwaith. Er mwyn rhoi arweiniad clir ar y pwynt hwn, eleni, byddaf yn adolygu profiad gwaith fel rhan o'r adolygiad ehangach o ganllawiau ar gyflwyno'r cwricwlwm gyrfaoedd a byd gwaith. Ar y mater hwnnw, rwy'n meddwl bod Joyce Watson wedi gwneud pwyntiau pwysig iawn am y materion iechyd a diogelwch sy'n ymwneud â phrofiad gwaith. Rydym am ganolbwyntio sylw Gyrfa Cymru ar gyngor gyrfaoedd yn hytrach nag ar roi cymorth ychwanegol o ran iechyd a diogelwch. Cyfrifoldeb y cyflogwyr yw hynny'n bendant iawn. Ond rwyf am sicrhau'r Aelodau y byddwn yn edrych ar lwybrau gwahanol ar gyfer cyflogwyr sy'n fach iawn er mwyn sicrhau y gallant hwy ddarparu profiad gwaith hefyd.

Yr ail thema rwyf am edrych arni yw sicrhau bod pobl ifanc yn cael y cyngor a'r arweiniad cywir a chyfle i ddeall a dilyn llwybrau dysgu, sy'n eu helpu i baratoi ar gyfer eu bywyd gwaith yn eu gyrfa ddewisol. Mae adroddiad y pwyllgor yn tynnu sylw at yr angen i wella hygyrchedd prentisiaethau ac i ymestyn cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc ddilyn llwybrau galwedigaethol. Yng Nghymru yn 2013-14, roedd ychydig dros 24,000 o bobl ifanc o dan 25 oed ar brentisiaethau sylfaen. Ein huchelgais yw gweithio gyda chyflogwyr a darparwyr i ymestyn cyfleoedd pellach i bobl ifanc ym maes prentisiaethau.

Mae mynd i'r afael â'r cydbwysedd rhwng y math o ddarpariaeth sydd ar gael ac anghenion cyflogwyr a'r economi yn destun pryder. Yma, rwy'n falch fod y gwaith ar gynllunio darpariaeth ôl-16, yn gysylltiedig ag anghenion y farchnad lafur leol, yn bendant yn y broses o gael ei ddatblygu. Caiff ei gefnogi gan y tair partneriaeth sgiliau rhanbarthol sydd wedi cael y gwaith o wella buddsoddiad a sgiliau yn seiliedig ar anghenion economaidd lleol a rhanbarthol.

Bydd gwella ein dealltwriaeth o gyrchfannau dysgwyr yn ein cynorthwyo ymhellach i sicrhau'r cydbwysedd iawn yng Nghymru. Rydym wrthi'n datblygu mesurau y gellir eu defnyddio ar gyfer addysg bellach, dosbarthiadau chwech a dysgu seiliedig ar waith. Cytunaf yn llwyr ag aelodau'r pwyllgor ei bod yn hanfodol bwysig fod pobl ifanc yn cael cymorth os ydynt ei angen.

Last year, Careers Wales worked with over 103,000 clients in one-to-one support during the year, compared to just short of 83,000 in the year before that—an increase of about 20,000 people, or 25 per cent. While responding to new challenges, Careers Wales has been working hard to underpin quality and release efficiency savings. Unlike the situation across the border in England, we do not have a careers service in crisis. A recent independent satisfaction survey carried out for Careers Wales shows that 92% of schools and 93% of colleges are satisfied with the careers guidance given to their pupils, and that 89% of businesses were satisfied with the support they received through Careers Wales in recruiting school leavers. But, we acknowledge that there remain challenges, including the quality and consistency of school-based careers education. But, I am confident that when young people need support and guidance that support will continue to be available.

The third theme in the committee's recommendations concerns overcoming barriers that stand in the way of young people successfully progressing from education into sustained work. Supporting these young people is an ambition we all share. None of us want to see young lives on hold or talent going to waste. I completely agree that the Welsh Government needs to work with the Department for Work and Pensions to address anomalies in the benefits system—a number of people have highlighted those anomalies here today—especially the difficulties some young people face in sustaining a tenancy, for example, if their housing benefit is cut as a result of taking up low-paid employment. Another barrier can arise when courses which are a critical gateway into work have inflexible start dates and place young people in limbo for extended periods of time. The Minister for Education and Skills priorities letter for further education in 2015-16 highlighted this issue and has urged institutions to timetable more start dates throughout the year to address some of these anomalies.

Finally, I want so say something about the role of lead workers, be they youth workers, careers advisers, Communities First managers, learning coaches or other professionals working with young people. The youth engagement and progression framework has catalysed a revolution in partnership working, information sharing and collaborative support. This is delivering real results right now. Recent statistics on 15 April from the annual population survey show that in the 12 months ending 31 December 2014, 8.1 per cent of 16 to 18 year-olds are estimated to be not in education, employment or training compared with 11.9 per cent at the end of 2013. During that period, results for 19 to 24 year-olds also improved. I think this shows that our measures across Wales, in which we are investing in our ambitions for young people, from stronger links between schools and employers through to the support offered by lead workers, are having an effect. But, this is work to build on and there is work in hand to do just that.

Y llynedd, gweithiodd Gyrfa Cymru gyda thros 103,000 o gleientiaid drwy roi cymorth un i un yn ystod y flwyddyn, o gymharu ag ychydig o dan 83,000 y flwyddyn cynt—cynnydd o tua 20,000 o bobl, neu 25 y cant. Wrth ymateb i heriau newydd, mae Gyrfa Cymru wedi bod yn gweithio'n galed i gynnal ansawdd a rhyddhau arbedion effeithlonrwydd. Yn wahanol i'r sefyllfa dros y ffin yn Lloegr, nid yw ein gwasanaeth gyrfaoedd mewn argyfwng. Dangosodd arolwg annibynnol o fodlonrwydd a gynhaliwyd yn ddiweddar ar gyfer Gyrfa Cymru fod 92 y cant o ysgolion a 93 y cant o golegau yn fodlon â'r arweiniad gyrfaoedd a roddir i'w disgyblion, a bod 89 y cant o fusnesau yn fodlon ar y cymorth a gawsant drwy Gyrfa Cymru i recriwtio rhai sy'n gadael yr ysgol. Ond rydym yn cydnabod bod heriau'n bodoli o hyd, gan gynnwys ansawdd a chysondeb addysg gyrfaoedd mewn ysgolion. Ond rwy'n hyderus y bydd y gefnogaeth yn parhau i fod ar gael i bobl ifanc sydd angen cymorth ac arweiniad.

Mae'r drydedd thema yn argymhellion y pwyllgor yn ymwneud â goresgyn rhwystrau i bobl ifanc rhag llwyddo i gamu ymlaen o addysg i waith parhaol. Mae cefnogi'r bobl ifanc hyn yn uchelgais i bawb ohonom. Nid oes yr un ohonom am weld bywydau ifanc yn cael eu dal yn ôl neu dalent yn cael ei wastraffu. Cytunaf yn llwyr fod angen i Lywodraeth Cymru weithio gyda'r Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau i fynd i'r afael ag anghysondebau yn y system fudd-daliadau—mae nifer o bobl wedi tynnu sylw at yr anghysondebau yma heddiw—yn enwedig yr anawsterau y mae rhai pobl ifanc yn eu hwynebu i gynnal tenantiaeth, er enghraifft, os yw eu budd-dal tai yn cael ei dorri o ganlyniad i gael gwaith ar gyflog isel. Gall rhwystr arall godi o ganlyniad i ddyddiadau cychwyn anhyblyg i gyrsiau sy'n hanfodol ar gyfer gwaith gan olygu nad yw pobl ifanc yn gwybod beth sy'n mynd i ddiwydd am gyfnodau estynedig o amser. Tynnwyd sylw at y mater yn llythyr blaenoriaethau'r Gweinidog Addysg a Sgiliau ar gyfer addysg bellach yn 2015-16 ac anogodd sefydliadau i amserlennu rhagor o ddyddiadau cychwyn drwy gydol y flwyddyn i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r anghysondebau hyn.

Yn olaf, rwyf am ddweud rhywbeth am rôl gweithwyr arweiniol, boed yn weithwyr ieuencid, cynghorwyr gyrfaoedd, rheolwyr Cymunedau yn Gyntaf, anogwyr dysgu neu weithwyr proffesiynol eraill sy'n gweithio gyda phobl ifanc. Mae'r fframwaith ymgysylltu a datblygu ieuencid wedi catalyddu chwyldro mewn gweithio mewn partneriaeth, rhannu gwybodaeth a chymorth cydweithredol. Mae hyn yn creu canlyniadau go iawn ar hyn o bryd. Mae ystadegau diweddar ar 15 Ebrill o'r arolwg poblogaeth blynyddol yn dangos bod 8.1 y cant amcangyfrifedig o bobl 16 i 18 oed heb fod mewn addysg, cyflogaeth na hyfforddiant yn y 12 mis hyd at 31 Rhagfyr 2014 o gymharu ag 11.9 y cant ar ddiwedd 2013. Yn ystod y cyfnod hwnnw, roedd y canlyniadau ar gyfer pobl 19 i 24 oed wedi gwella hefyd. Credaf fod hyn yn dangos bod ein camau ar gyfer buddsoddi yn ein huchelgeisiau ar gyfer pobl ifanc ledled Cymru, o gysylltiadau cryfach rhwng ysgolion a chyflogwyr i'r cymorth a gynigir gan weithwyr blaen, yn cael effaith. Ond gwaith i adeiladu arno yw hwn ac mae gwaith ar y gweill i wneud hynny.

I am committed to doing all I can to improve the outcomes for all our young people, including working with other agencies, the DWP and the UK Government. I once again welcome the committee's report and the debate today. I am delighted that we're all travelling in the same direction and I will certainly be taking the recommendations forward in every way that I possibly can.

Rwyf wedi ymrwymo i wneud popeth yn fy ngallu i wella'r canlyniadau ar gyfer pob un o'n pobl ifanc, gan gynnwys gweithio gydag asiantaethau eraill, yr Adran Gwaith a Phensiynau a Llywodraeth y DU. Unwaith eto, rwy'n croesawu adroddiad y pwyllgor a'r ddatl heddiw. Rwyf wrth fy modd ein bod i gyd yn teithio i'r un cyfeiriad a byddaf yn sicr yn symud yr argymhellion yn eu blaen ym mhob ffordd y gallaf.

15:48 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I call Eluned Parrott to reply to the debate.

Galwaf ar Eluned Parrott i ymateb i'r ddatl.

15:48 **Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Firstly, I would like to thank all of the contributors to this debate and for focusing on different aspects of the inquiry too. I think this was a very broad inquiry in fact and the committee found that when we were trying to answer that big question, 'Why do we have an issue here?', a lot of different roads opened up before us.

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Yn gyntaf, hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddatl hon ac am ganolbwyntio ar wahanol agweddau ar yr ymchwiliad hefyd. Rwy'n credu bod hwn yn ymchwiliad eang iawn mewn gwirionedd a phan oeddem yn ceisio ateb y cwestiwn mawr hwnnw, 'Pam y mae gennym broblem gyda hyn?', darganfu'r pwyllgor bod llawer o wahanol ffyrdd wedi agor o'n blaenau.

Turning to the comments of Members, clearly, Jeff Cuthbert in his contribution talked about the long-term challenge that we have had over a period of many years, not only in Wales but in other places too, of young people who are not engaged in education or employment or training. The importance of pre-entry level traineeships and those first steps to bring people into the world of vocational training and work, I think, can't be underestimated. Indeed, we've spoken on many occasions about the importance of apprenticeships. It is good to see the Welsh Government going further in promoting apprenticeships, but there can be no resting on the laurels. We need to make sure that there is a continual push towards having a parity of esteem between vocational subjects and academic subjects. I don't think that we can honestly say that we are anywhere near that point in time at the moment. But, Jeff, you're absolutely right to say that the best evidence in the world suggests that if we want to boost the productivity of a nation then, surely, that is what we want to do. We must invest in skills and training of the people in that nation.

Gan droi at sylwadau'r Aelodau, yn amlwg, siaradodd Jeff Cuthbert yn ei gyfraniad am yr her hirdymor sydd wedi ein hwynebu ers blynyddoedd lawer, nid yn unig yng Nghymru ond mewn mannau eraill hefyd, mewn perthynas â phobl ifanc nad ydynt mewn addysg, gwaith neu hyfforddiant. Yn fy marn i, ni ellir tanbrizio pwysigrwydd hyfforddeiaethau cyn y lefel mynediad a'r camau cyntaf hynny i ddod â phobl i mewn i fyd hyfforddiant a gwaith galwedigaethol. Yn wir, rydym wedi siarad droeon am bwysigrwydd prentisiaethau. Mae'n dda gweld Llywodraeth Cymru yn mynd ymhellach o ran hyrwyddo prentisiaethau, ond ni allwn orffwys ar ein rhwyfau. Mae angen i ni ymdrechu'n barhaus i sicrhau parch cydradd i bynciau galwedigaethol a phynciau academaidd. Nid wyf yn credu y gallwn ddweud yn onest ein bod yn agos at hynny ar hyn o bryd. Ond Jeff, rydych yn hollol gywir i ddweud bod y dystiolaeth orau yn y byd yn awgrymu os ydym am roi hwb i gynhyrchiant cenedl, yna yn sicr, dyna sydd eisiau i ni ei wneud. Mae'n rhaid i ni fuddsoddi yn sgiliau a hyfforddiant y bobl yn y wlad honno.

Rhun ap Iorwerth talked about the fact that youth unemployment still remains, sadly, higher in Wales than it is in either England or Scotland. Again, he addressed that question, 'Why is that?' Rhun suggested that there was, perhaps, a balance too heavily weighed on the academic side and also talked about the importance of those soft skills, those life skills, which are sometimes such a challenge, particularly for those young people who are, perhaps, furthest from the jobs market, and for those who don't have that supportive family life to fall back on. That was a point very well made, I thought, by Jenny Rathbone in her contribution too: the importance of a family infrastructure, or the lack thereof, can be critical in determining the outcome for a young person if the state doesn't then step in to make sure that those opportunities are available. Those peer studies, I think, were very illuminating in terms of the conversations you had, and again as part of the committee, we heard from young people and about their experiences too.

Siaradodd Rhun ap Iorwerth am y ffaith anffodus fod diweithdra ymhlith pobl ifanc yn dal i fod yn uwch yng Nghymru nag yn Lloegr a'r Alban. Unwaith eto, aeth i'r afael â'r cwestiwn, 'Pam hynny?' Awgrymodd Rhun fod gormod o bwysio efallai ar yr ochr academaidd a soniodd hefyd am bwysigrwydd sgiliau meddal, sgiliau bywyd sydd weithiau'n gymaint o her, yn enwedig i'r bobl ifanc sydd bellaf oddi wrth y farchnad swyddi efallai, a rhai heb fywyd teuluol cefnogol i bwysio arno. Roedd hwnnw'n bwynt a wnaed yn dda iawn, rwy'n meddwl, gan Jenny Rathbone yn ei chyfraniad hefyd: gall pwysigrwydd strwythur teuluol, neu ddiffyg strwythur teuluol, fod yn allweddol o ran pennu'r canlyniadau i berson ifanc os nad yw'r wladwriaeth yn camu i mewn wedyn i sicrhau bod y cyfleoedd hynny ar gael. Credaf fod yr astudiaethau cymheiriaid hynny'n ddadlennol iawn o ran y sgyrsiau a gawsoch, ac unwaith eto fel rhan o'r pwyllgor, clywsom gan bobl ifanc ac am eu profiadau hefyd.

Those issues around the cost of training are also pertinent, and the funding for further education, particularly for those kinds of flexible courses where we have seen cuts to further education budgets, are a big concern, I think, for all of us.

Joyce Watson talked about the danger of sharing the responsibility for health and safety, and making sure that that didn't become confused and diluted and that no-one was falling between two stools, if you like. I absolutely take on board the points you make. But, I think that there is a potential role here for Careers Wales, because if you remember from the evidence we took, there had previously been a database providing a list of people who were fit and proper persons, if you like. It wasn't a detailed health and safety check, but it was a check to see whether or not there were people within the organisation who had appropriate criminal records checks, and so on. I think there is potentially a role for that, so I welcome the Deputy Minister's comments that this is something that she will keep in mind and continue to consider.

I do welcome the Minister's statement that the bar does need to be raised on work experience, and I welcome, of course, the review that you are undertaking. But, I would stress that there was an opportunity here provided by the committee's report to address some of the gaps that we did identify, and sadly it feels like, in many areas, that the response has been to postpone some of those difficult decisions, and answer those recommendations that we made to you with reviews of current delivery, rather than actual changes in practice, and that is disappointing. In fact, if you look through the Minister's response, the answer to almost every other recommendation was the launch of the enhanced employer engagement project, which is, of course, very important, and the review of 'Careers and the world of work'. But, I repeat: the impact of some of these things will not reach all schools in Wales until 2018, and so for three more years some young people will miss out on the best practice that we hope that those things will bring. And it goes nowhere near the fundamental reforms that we have recommended.

I strongly endorse the Deputy Minister's emphasis on the importance of apprenticeships. As I say, I think what we need to see now is where the Minister is prepared to go next in terms of moving forward with those recommendations that she has agreed with.

We will, as a committee, you can be sure, be scrutinising the progress that is made against these recommendations before the end of this Assembly. It is something that we think is incredibly important, as I know the Deputy Minister does too. I also anticipate that as part of the Enterprise and Business Committee's legacy work, we'll encourage the relevant committee of the next Assembly to keep a watching brief on this area and to keep it at the forefront of their minds. We cannot, as an economy, move forward together if so many young people remain unemployed or underemployed in our society. It's an area we mustn't lose our focus on, and I'd like to thank everyone who's contributed to this debate today.

Mae'r materion sy'n ymwneud â chost hyfforddiant hefyd yn berthnasol, ac rwy'n credu bod cyllid ar gyfer addysg bellach, yn enwedig ar gyfer y mathau o gyrsiau hyblyg lle rydym wedi gweld toriadau i gyllidebau addysg bellach, yn destun pryder mawr i bob un ohonom.

Siaradodd Joyce Watson am berygl rhannu cyfrifoldeb am iechyd a diogelwch, a gwneud yn siŵr nad oedd yn cael ei ddrysu a'i wanychu, ac nad oedd neb yn syrthio rhwng dwy stôl, os mynnwch. Rwy'n bendant yn derbyn y pwyntiau a wnewch. Ond credaf fod rôl bosibl yma ar gyfer Gyrfa Cymru, oherwydd os cofiwch o'r dystiolaeth a gawsom, cafwyd cronfa ddata o'r blaen a ddarparai restr o bobl addas a phriodol, os hoffwch. Nid oedd yn archwiliad iechyd a diogelwch manwl, ond roedd yn gwirio pa bobl o fewn y sefydliad a oedd wedi cael y gwiriadau cofnodion troseddol priodol ai peidio, ac yn y blaen. Rwy'n meddwl bod rôl ar gyfer hynny o bosibl, felly croesawaf sylwadau'r Dirprwy Weinidog fod hwn yn fater y bydd yn ei gadw mewn cof ac yn parhau i'w ystyried.

Croesawaf ddatganiad y Gweinidog fod angen codi'r bar ar gyfer profiad gwaith, a chroesawaf yr adolygiad rydych yn ei gynnal, wrth gwrs. Ond byddwn yn pwysleisio bod adroddiad y pwyllgor wedi rhoi cyfle i fynd i'r afael â rhai o'r diffygion a nodwyd gennym, ac yn anffodus mae'n teimlo, mewn llawer o feysydd, mai gohirio rhai o'r penderfyniadau anodd yw'r ymateb wedi bod, ac ateb ein hargymhellion gydag adolygiadau o'r ddarpariaeth gyfredol, yn hytrach na newidiadau ymarferol, ac mae hynny'n siomedig. Yn wir, os edrychwch drwy ymateb y Gweinidog, yr ateb i i bob yn ail argymhelliad bron oedd lansiad y prosiect estynedig ar gyfer ymgysylltu â chyflogwyr, sydd wrth gwrs yn bwysig iawn, a'r adolygiad o 'Gyrfaedd a'r byd gwaith'. Ond rwy'n ailadrodd: ni fydd effaith rhai o'r pethau hyn yn cyrraedd pob ysgol yng Nghymru tan 2018, ac felly am dair blynedd arall, bydd rhai pobl ifanc yn colli cyfle i fanteisio ar yr arferion gorau y gobeithiwn eu gweld yn sgil y pethau hyn. Ac nid yw'n mynd yn agos at y diwygiadau sylfaenol rydym wedi eu hargymhell.

Rwy'n gefnogol iawn i bwyslais y Dirprwy Weinidog ar bwysigrwydd prentisiaethau. Fel y dywedais, rwy'n meddwl mai'r hyn y mae angen i ni ei weld yn awr yw lle y mae'r Gweinidog yn barod i fynd nesaf o ran symud ymlaen â'r argymhellion y mae hi wedi cytuno â hwy.

Fel pwyllgor, gallwch fod yn sicr y byddwn yn craffu ar y cynnydd sy'n cael ei wneud ar yr argymhellion cyn diwedd y Cynulliad hwn. Mae'n rhywbeth rydym yn ei ystyried yn eithriadol o bwysig, a gwn fod hynny'n wir am y Dirprwy Weinidog hefyd. Fel rhan o'r gwaith y mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yn ei drosglwyddo ymlaen, rwy'n rhagweld hefyd y byddwn yn annog pwyllgor perthnasol y Cynulliad nesaf i wyllo'r maes hwn ac i'w gadw ar flaen eu meddyliau. Fel economi, ni allwn symud ymlaen gyda'n gilydd os oes cynifer o bobl ifanc yn parhau i fod yn ddi-waith neu wedi'u tangyflogi yn ein cymdeithas. Mae'n faes na ddylem golli ein ffocws arno, a hoffwn ddiolch i bawb sydd wedi cyfrannu at y ddatl hon heddiw.

15:53

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

The proposal is to note the Enterprise and Business Committee's report. Does any Member object? The motion is therefore agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.

Y cynnig yw nodi adroddiad y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes. A oes unrhyw Aelod yn gwrthwynebu? Felly, mae'r cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.

*Derbyniwyd y cynnig yn unol â Rheol Sefydlog 12.36.*

*Motion agreed in accordance with Standing Order 12.36.*

## 6. Dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: Mynediad at Gyllid ar gyfer Busnesau

## 6. Welsh Conservatives Debate: Business Access to Finance

*The following amendments have been selected: amendments 2 and 3 in the name of Elin Jones, and amendment 4 in the name of Aled Roberts. Amendment 1 has been withdrawn.*

*Detholwyd y gwelliannau canlynol: gwelliannau 2 a 3 yn enw Elin Jones, a gwelliant 4 yn enw Aled Roberts. Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl.*

15:53

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Eitem chwech yw dadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig: myniediad at gyllid ar gyfer busnesau. Galwaf ar Nick Ramsay i wneud y cynnig.

Item 6 is the Welsh Conservatives' debate on business access to finance. I call on Nick Ramsay to move the motion.

Cynnig NDM5765 Paul Davies

Motion NDM5765 Paul Davies

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi nad yw Cyllid Cymru yn diwallu anghenion busnesau bach ledled Cymru a bod myniediad at gyllid yn parhau i fod yn broblem i lawer o fusnesau bach a chanolig;

1. Notes that Finance Wales does not meet the needs of small businesses across Wales and that access to finance is still a problem for many SMEs;

2. Yn croesawu'r posibilrwydd o Fanc Datblygu i Gymru, fel y cydnabyddir yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans; a

2. Welcomes the prospect of a Welsh Development Bank, as recognised in the report published by Professor Dylan Jones-Evans; and

3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried rhinweddau'r cynigion a amlinellir yn 'Gweledigaeth ar gyfer Buddsoddi yng Nghymru: Buddsoddi Cymru' a, lle y bo'n briodol, ystyried eu hymgorffori yn y gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei rhoi i fusnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.

3. Calls on the Welsh Government to consider the merits of the proposals outlined in 'A Vision for Welsh Investment: Invest Wales' and, where appropriate, consider incorporating them into Welsh Government support for SMEs in Wales.

*Cynigiwyd y cynnig.*

*Motion moved.*

15:53

## Nick Ramsay [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. I'm pleased to move the motion today in the name of Paul Davies. At the heart of the wording of today's motion is a simple truth: if we can't get the economy right, then we won't be able to get anything else right. And key to getting the economy right is having the right support regime in place, at the right time for our businesses.

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Rwy'n falch o gynnis y cynnig heddiw yn enw Paul Davies. Wrth wraidd geiriad y cynnig heddiw mae gwirionedd syml: os na allwn gael yr economi'n iawn, yna ni allwn gael dim arall yn iawn. A'r allwedd i gael yr economi'n iawn yw sicrhau bod y gyfundrefn gymorth gywir ar waith ar yr adeg iawn ar gyfer ein busnesau.

As is now widely accepted, Finance Wales does not meet the needs of small businesses across Wales, and accessing finance remains a key problem for many small and medium-sized enterprises. Let's look at the broad picture. There were 11,320 enterprise births during 2013—a rate of little over 12 per cent and the third lowest rate of the 12 UK countries and regions. On the other hand, there was a lower rate of business deaths than elsewhere in the UK, but then, of course, there is a link with the number of start-ups. Business start-ups are inevitably inhibited by the estimated £500 million—and that is estimated—funding gap facing those businesses needing support. Access to finance is vital for funding investment, ensuring businesses are able to reach their full growth potential, but it is simply not up to scratch at the moment. Those aren't just my words, not just the words of the Welsh Conservatives on the opposition benches, which, I'm sure, you would say, Minister, is predictable, but the words of Professor Dylan Jones-Evans, whose report in 2013 declared Finance Wales not fit for purpose—a damning indictment of the situation we find ourselves in.

Now I know that, in previous debates, Minister, you've said that you don't see any point in attacking Finance Wales. Well, we are here to scrutinise, so I think it is necessary for us to make points, and if those points are exposing some harsh truths then so be it. Established in 2001, the Finance Wales Group is one of the largest SME investment companies in the UK—sounds good. It can make equity investments of up to £2 million. Again, great stuff. However, Professor Jones-Evans's report found that Finance Wales is too often and, on the face of it, inexplicably seen as a last resort by businesses, with Lloyds being the biggest lender to Welsh SMEs. It's not really surprising that businesses feel this way, is it? The key to supporting business is providing a competitive business rate, and yet that is the last thing that some of them have been getting. As we know from when the scale of the exorbitant interest rates was revealed, some of the rates being charged are ridiculously over the top—2.5 per cent in a quarter of all cases, and it's difficult to see why. A business with an average level of collateral and a weak credit rating could be borrowing with an interest rate of 10 per cent—5 per cent higher than elsewhere at the time the report was commissioned. And before we get into the details of state aid rules, which I know some have used as an argument as to why the Government-backed funding is higher, well, state aid rules do come into play and do demand a minimum charge of 2 per cent, but 2 per cent is far less than what we saw in practice with interest rates in some cases of 8 per cent or, as I mentioned, 10 per cent.

Fel sy'n cael ei dderbyn yn gyffredinol erbyn hyn, nid yw Cyllid Cymru yn diwallu anghenion busnesau bach ledled Cymru, ac mae cael gafael ar gyllid yn parhau i fod yn broblem allweddol i lawer o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint. Gadewch i ni edrych ar y darlun cyffredinol. Cafwyd 11,320 o fentrau newydd yn ystod 2013—cyfradd o ychydig dros 12 y cant a'r gyfradd isaf ond dwy o blith 12 gwlad a rhanbarth y DU. Ar y llaw arall, roedd cyfradd is o fusnesau'n dod i ben na mewn mannau eraill yn y DU, ond wrth gwrs, mae yna gysylltiad â'r nifer o fusnesau newydd. Mae busnesau newydd yn cael eu rhwystro'n anochel gan y bwch cyllid o £500 miliwn—ac amcangyfrif yw hynny—sy'n wynebu busnesau sydd angen cymorth. Mae cael gafael ar gyllid yn hanfodol ar gyfer ariannu buddsoddiad, gan sicrhau bod busnesau yn gallu llawn wireddu eu potensial i dyfu, ond yn syml, nid yw'n ddigon da ar hyn o bryd. Nid fy ngeiriau i'n unig yw'r rheini, nid geiriau'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ar feinciau'r gwrthbleidiau yn unig, y bydddech yn dweud eu bod yn ddisgwyliedig, rwy'n siŵr, Weinidog. Geiriau'r Athro Dylan Jones-Evans ydynt, a ddywedodd yn ei adroddiad yn 2013 nad oedd Cyllid Cymru yn addas i'r diben—cyhuddiad damniol o'r sefyllfa rydym ynddi.

Nawr rwy'n gwybod, mewn dadleuon blaenorol, Weinidog, eich bod wedi dweud nad ydych yn gweld unrhyw bwynt mewn ymosod ar Cyllid Cymru. Wel, rydym yma i graffu, felly rwy'n meddwl bod angen i ni wneud pwyntiau, ac os yw'r pwyntiau hynny'n datgelu rhai gwirioneddau anodd, yna felly y bo. Sefydlwyd Grŵp Cyllid Cymru yn 2001 ac mae'n un o gwmnïau buddsoddi BBaChau mwyaf y Deyrnas Unedig—mae hynny'n swnio'n dda. Gall wneud buddsoddiadau ecwiti o hyd at £2 filiwn. Unwaith eto, gwych. Fodd bynnag, canfu adroddiad yr Athro Jones-Evans fod Cyllid Cymru yn cael ei ystyried yn rhy aml gan fusnesau fel y dewis olaf—sydd ar yr olwg gyntaf yn anesboniadwy—a Lloyds yw'r benthyciwr mwyaf i BBaChau yng Nghymru. Mewn gwirionedd, nid yw'n syndod fod busnesau yn teimlo fel hyn, yw hi? Yr allwedd i gefnogi busnesau yw darparu cyfradd fusnes gystadleuol, ac eto dyna'r peth olaf y mae rhai ohonynt wedi bod yn ei gael. Fel y gwyddom o'r adeg pan ddatgelwyd pa mor afresymol oedd y cyfraddau llog, mae rhai o'r cyfraddau sy'n cael eu codi yn chwerthinllyd o uchel—2.5 y cant yn chwarter yr holl achosion, ac mae'n anodd gweld pam. Gallai busnes gyda lefel gyfartalog o sicrwydd cyfochrog a statws credyd gwan fod yn benthycy ar gyfradd llog o 10 y cant—5 y cant yn uwch nag mewn mannau eraill pan gomisiynwyd yr adroddiad. A chyn i ni ddod at fanylion rheolau cymorth gwladwriaethol, a gwn fod rhai wedi eu defnyddio fel dadl sy'n egluro pam y mae cyllid a gefnogir gan y Llywodraeth yn uwch, wel, mae rheolau cymorth gwladwriaethol yn chwarae rhan ac yn codi isafswm o 2 y cant, ond mae 2 y cant yn llawer is na'r hyn a welsom yn ymarferol gyda chyfraddau llog o 8 y cant mewn rhai achosion neu, fel y soniais, 10 y cant.



Now, I would agree with the Minister that, too often, people make the mistake of thinking that Finance Wales should be like a conventional bank and, of course, it's not your average NatWest. It is a branch of Government, but, at the same time, it shouldn't be penalising Government. They should be getting a far better service, those businesses seeking funding. A 2012 survey by the Federation of Small Businesses, found that 64% of their sample—admittedly, of their sample—had never even heard of Finance Wales and that only 4 per cent had secured support—only 4 per cent of those businesses questioned.

Now, of course, capital is limited, so we're not saying that Finance Wales could or should support everyone, and even businesses don't expect that; that would be completely unrealistic—of course it would. What they do expect, of course, is that any applications for funding are dealt with swiftly, so they get a decision quickly—'yes' or 'no'. This is how business operates. This is how the business environment operates. This is how businesses are expected to behave with each other. So, this is the level of the bar—the level at which it is set—and no less than this is necessary for Government lending to businesses too.

Now, aside from this, there are other issues and problems, of course. We need to decide exactly what Finance Wales is for and what we want to achieve. The FSB report into the operation of Finance Wales identified current confusions over it. Professor Jones-Evans's report questioned whether Finance Wales was still operating as a commercially operated fund manager in all but name. So, does the Welsh Government want this or does it want a focus on a broader economic development role? Finance Wales has consistently failed to utilise the full range of financial instruments available under EC regulations. Why weren't interest rates, for instance, being subsidised? I suppose of greatest concern isn't all of these failings because, admittedly, we are now where we are; I think the greatest concern is that processes didn't kick in to deal with these problems earlier in the cycle. No brakes were applied as we were heading downhill.

So, where do we go from here? Well, I think we all agree that things need to change. I think there is that general acceptance across all parties. Whatever your view of the current situation, things have to change. The business demography in Wales is currently imbalanced, and it could be addressed by greater regional banking. In this department, there is no shortage of ideas. The Welsh Government are looking at a development bank—we've welcomed that initial step; it's a step in the right direction. The Welsh Conservatives—well, we've put forward our own proposals, Invest Wales, which puts forward, as I said, our own proposals as to how Finance Wales can play a key role in supporting SMEs. Copies of that are available in the office upstairs, if anyone does want a quick read afterwards.

Nawr, fe fyddwn yn cytuno â'r Gweinidog fod pobl yn gwneud y camgymeriad, yn rhy aml, o feddwl y dylai Cyllid Cymru fod fel banc confensiynol, ac wrth gwrs, nid yw fel eich NatWest arferol. Mae'n gangen o'r Llywodraeth, ond ar yr un pryd, ni ddylai fod yn cosbi'r Llywodraeth. Dylai'r busnesau sy'n gwneud cais am gyllid gael gwasanaeth llawer gwell. Canfu arolwg gan y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn 2012 nad oedd 64 y cant o'u sampl—o'u sampl hwy, rhaid cyfaddef—erioed wedi clywed am Cyllid Cymru hyd yn oed, ac mai 4 y cant yn unig oedd wedi cael cymorth—4 y cant yn unig o'r busnesau a holwyd.

Nawr, wrth gwrs, mae cyfalaf yn gyfyngedig, felly nid ydym yn dweud y gallai neu y dylai Cyllid Cymru gefnogi pawb, ac nid yw'r busnesau, hyd yn oed, yn disgwyl hynny; byddai hynny'n gwbl afrealistig—wrth gwrs y byddai. Yr hyn y maent yn ei ddisgwyl, wrth gwrs, yw bod unrhyw geisiadau am gyllid yn cael eu trin yn gyflym, fel eu bod yn cael ymateb cyflym—'ie' neu 'na'. Fel hyn y mae busnes yn gweithredu. Fel hyn y mae'r amgylchedd busnes yn gweithredu. Fel hyn y disgwylir i fusnesau ymddwyn at ei gilydd. Felly, dyma lefel y bar—y lefel y'i gosodwyd—ac mae'r safon yr un mor angenrheidiol i Lywodraeth sy'n benthyca i fusnesau hefyd.

Nawr, ar wahân i hyn, ceir materion a phroblemau eraill, wrth gwrs. Mae angen i ni benderfynu beth yn union yw diben Cyllid Cymru a'r hyn rydym am ei gyflawni. Nododd adroddiad y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach ar weithrediad Cyllid Cymru fod dryswch yn ei gylch ar hyn o bryd. Cwestiynai adroddiad yr Athro Jones-Evans pa un a yw Cyllid Cymru yn dal i weithredu fel rheolwr cronfa fasnachol ym mhob ffordd heblaw'r enw. Felly, ai hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn dymuno'i gael neu a yw'n dymuno canolbwyntio ar rôl ehangach o ran datblygu'r economi? Mae Cyllid Cymru yn gyson wedi methu â defnyddio'r ystod lawn o offerynnau ariannol sydd ar gael o dan reoliadau'r CE. Pam nad oedd cymhorthdal ar gyfer cyfraddau llog, er enghraifft? Rwy'n tybio nad yr holl ddiffygion hyn sy'n peri'r pryder mwyaf oherwydd, rhaid cyfaddef, dyma lle rydym yn awr; credaf mai'r pryder mwyaf yw na lwyddodd prosesau i fynd i'r afael â'r problemau hyn yn gynharach yn y cylch. Ni wasgwyd y brêc wrth i ni anelu i lawr y rhiw.

Felly, i ble rydym yn mynd o'r fan hon? Wel, rwy'n meddwl ein bod i gyd yn cytuno bod angen i bethau newid. Rwy'n meddwl bod yr holl bleidiau'n derbyn hynny yn gyffredinol. Beth bynnag yw eich barn am y sefyllfa bresennol, rhaid i bethau newid. Mae demograffeg busnes yng Nghymru yn anghybwys ar hyn o bryd, a gellid mynd i'r afael â'r anghybwysedd drwy fwy o fancio rhanbarthol. Yn yr adran hon, nid oes prinder syniadau. Mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn edrych ar fanc datblygu—rydym wedi croesawu'r cam cychwynnol hwnnw; mae'n gam yn y cyfeiriad cywir. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig—wel, rydym wedi cyflwyno ein cynigion ein hunain, Buddsoddi Cymru, sy'n cyflwyno, fel y dywedais, ein cynigion eu hunain ynglŷn â sut y gall Cyllid Cymru chwarae rhan allweddol yn cefnogi busnesau bach a chanolig. Mae copïau ohono ar gael yn y swyddfa i fynd i'r grisiau, os oes unrhyw un eisiau darllen drwyddo'n gyflym wedyn.

The current system certainly needs reform. We believe that Finance Wales should be turned into a localised business-facing customer-friendly bank, with far more of a high-street presence, so it can get on with the job of marketing itself to the businesses that need it, so that, in the first instance, they at least know where it is that they can access finance. That would be a start. It's extraordinary that some businesses don't even know of its existence, and it should be made more accessible to them. We've called it, on these benches, 'finance with a face'. Crucially, a regionalised banking structure would be more attuned to the local problems facing SMEs and would be better placed to use local knowledge for local solutions.

We need to deal with this now, so we're not sitting here, or, indeed, our successors are not sitting here, in years to come discussing the same problems in the same debates about a problem that simply has never been addressed. If the Welsh Government is going to move towards a development bank—and, as I say, we've welcomed that as a step in the right direction—then we need to see timescales, we need to see implementation strategies, we need to see clear goals of where we're going and strategies for how we are going to get there. Above all, let's see scrutiny mechanisms that simply haven't been available up until now with the old model.

I mentioned Invest Wales. That has, at its heart, three important pillars: accountability, business counselling, and it's target driven, with a focus on growth and prosperity. So, let's get on with changing things for the better for businesses in Wales. We're well aware of the problems that businesses have been facing over the last number of years and the problem with the existing funding framework. It doesn't have to be this way. Let's move forward, let's reform Finance Wales, and let's get on with the job of providing the type of accessible, tailored and timely support that businesses need, because, Minister, quite simply, this has gone on for far too long and no change is simply no longer an option.

Yn sicr, mae angen diwygio'r system bresennol. Rydym yn credu y dylai Cyllid Cymru gael ei droi'n fanc lleol sy'n gyfeillgar i gwsmeriaid ac ar gyfer busnesau, gyda llawer mwy o bresenoldeb ar y stryd fawr, er mwyn iddo allu bwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o farchnata ei hun i'r busnesau sydd ei angen, fel eu bod o leiaf yn gwybod ar y cychwyn lle y gallant ddod o hyd i gyllid. Byddai hynny'n dechrau. Mae'n rhyfeddol nad yw rhai busnesau yn gwybod am ei fodolaeth hyd yn oed, a dylid ei wneud yn fwy hygyrch iddynt. Ar y meinciau hyn, rydym wedi ei alw'n 'gyllid gyda wyneb'. Yn hanfodol, byddai strwythur bancio rhanbarthol yn fwy cyfarwydd â'r problemau sy'n wynebu busnesau bach a chanolig lleol a byddai mewn gwell sefyllfa i ddefnyddio gwybodaeth leol ar gyfer atebion lleol.

Mae angen i ni ymdrin â hyn yn awr, fel na fyddwn yn eistedd yma, neu'n wir, fel na fydd ein holynwyr yn eistedd yma, mewn blynyddoedd i ddod yn trafod yr un problemau yn yr un dadleuon ynglŷn â phroblem na wnaed dim yn ei chylch. Os yw Llywodraeth Cymru yn mynd i symud tuag at fanc datblygu—ac fel y dywedais, rydym wedi croesawu hynny fel cam yn y cyfeiriad cywir—yna mae angen i ni weld amserlenni, mae angen i ni weld strategaethau gweithredu, mae angen i ni weld nodau clir o ran lle rydym yn mynd a strategaethau ar gyfer sut i gyrraedd yno. Yn fwy na dim, gadewch i ni gael systemau craffu na fu ar gael hyd yn hyn gyda'r hen fodel.

Soniais am Buddsoddi Cymru. Ceir tri philer pwysig sy'n greiddiol iddo: atebolrwydd, cwnsela busnes, ac mae'n cael ei yrru gan dargedau, gyda ffocws ar dwf a ffyniant. Felly, gadewch i ni fynd ati i newid pethau er gwell i fusnesau yng Nghymru. Rydym yn ymwybodol iawn o'r problemau y mae busnesau wedi bod yn eu hwynebu dros y blynyddoedd diwethaf a'r broblem gyda'r fframwaith ariannu presennol. Nid oes raid iddi fod fel hyn. Gadewch i ni symud ymlaen, gadewch i ni ddiwygio Cyllid Cymru, a gadewch i ni fwrw ymlaen â'r gwaith o ddarparu'r math o gymorth hygyrch, amserol ac wedi'i deilwra sydd ei angen ar fusnesau, oherwydd yn syml iawn, Weinidog, mae'r sefyllfa wedi parhau ers llawer gormod o amser ac nid yw dim newid yn opsiwn o gwbl mwyach.

16:02

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Tynnwyd gwelliant 1 yn ôl. Rwyf wedi dethol y tri gwelliant sy'n weddill i'r cynnig. Galwaf ar Rhun ap Iorwerth i gynnig gwelliannau 2 a 3, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Elin Jones.

Amendment 1 has been withdrawn. I have selected the three remaining amendments to the motion. I call on Rhun ap Iorwerth to move amendments 2 and 3, tabled in the name of Elin Jones.

*Gwelliant 2—Elin Jones*

*Amendment 2—Elin Jones*

*Ym mhwynt 1, ar ôl 'diwallu', mewnosod 'yn llawn'.*

*In point 1, after 'not', insert 'fully'.*

*Gwelliant 3—Elin Jones*

*Amendment 3—Elin Jones*

*Ym mhwynt 2, dileu 'Yn croesawu'r posibilrwydd o Fanc' a rhoi yn ei le 'Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sefydlu Banc'.*

*In point 2, delete 'Welcomes the prospect of' and replace with 'Calls on the Welsh Government to establish'.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliannau 2 a 3.*

*Amendments 2 and 3 moved.*

## Rhun ap Iorwerth [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd, a diolch am y cyfle i siarad ac i gynnig y gwelliannau.

Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer, and thank you for the opportunity to contribute and to move the amendments.

Gwnaf fynd â chi yn ôl i ddatganiad llafar ar 13 Tachwedd, pan wnaeth y Gweinidog amlinellu dwy egwyddor graidd, sy'n sail i benderfyniadau'r Llywodraeth ar gymorth i fusnes. Rwy'n dyfynnu yn y fan hon:

I will take you back to the oral statement made on 13 November, when the Minister outlined two core principles, which are the foundation of the Government's decision on business support. I am quoting here:

'First, every viable business in Wales should get access to funding at an affordable price. Secondly, the primary role of Government-backed funding for SMEs is to drive forward economic development.'

'Yn gyntaf, dylai pob busnes hyfyw fedru cael cyllid am bris fforddiadwy. Yn ail, prif swyddogaeth cyllid sy'n cael ei gefnogi gan y Llywodraeth ar gyfer BBaCh yw ysgogi datblygu economaidd.'

Ond yn hwyrach yn yr un datganiad mae yna wrth-ddweud yn digwydd, mewn difrif. Mae'r Gweinidog yn dweud:

But later in the same statement there is a contradiction, if truth be told. The Minister says:

'In agreement with the Welsh Government, Finance Wales has pursued a commercial strategy that has driven the investments that it has made and the interest rates charged.'

'Mewn cytundeb â Llywodraeth Cymru, mae Cyllid Cymru wedi dilyn strategaeth fasnachol sydd wedi gyrru'r buddsoddiadau y mae wedi'u gwneud a'r cyfraddau llog a godir.'

Efallai mai'r gwrthdaro yna rhwng datblygu economaidd fel nod wrth wneud cyllid yn hygyrch a fforddiadwy i fusnesau yng Nghymru a'r angen, wedyn, i gael strategaeth fasnachol yn codi cyfraddau llog ar lefel fasnachol, sydd wedi tanio'r ddadl yma ynglŷn â Chyllid Cymru a'r cwestiwn: a ydy o'n ateb ei bwrpas?

Perhaps it's that conflict between economic development as an objective in making finance accessible and affordable to business in Wales and the need, then, to have a commercial strategy charging interest rates at a commercial level, which has sparked this debate on Finance Wales and the question of whether it is fit for purpose.

Mae yna, yn sicr, broblemau rydym yn gwybod amdany'n nhw efo bancio masnachol. Mae banciau'r stryd fawr wedi newid eu hagwedd at risg ers y cwmp ariannol; mae newidiadau i 'ratios' cyfalaf banciau'n golygu eu bod yn benthgyl lai er bod ganddyn nhw, mewn egwyddor, yr un faint o arian ar gael i'w fenthgyl ag yn y gorffennol, ac yn y blaen.

There are, certainly, problems that we are aware of with commercial banking. The high-street banks have changed their attitude to risk since the financial collapse; changes to the capital ratios within banks have meant that they are lending less although they have, in principle, the same amount of money available to lend as was the case in the past, and so on.

Y canlyniad wedyn, wrth gwrs, ydy'r gagendor cyllid yma—y 'funding gap'. Faint ydy o? Allwn ni ddim fod yn hollol siŵr. Mae'r ffigur yn newid o hyd, rydym yn siŵr o hynny. Ond mi wnaeth yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans amcangyfrif efallai bod £0.5 biliwn yn ffigur agos ati. Hynny ydy, mae busnesau angen £0.5 biliwn yn fwy na mae'r sefydliadau ariannol yn fodlon rhoi benthgyl iddyn nhw.

The outcome of that, of course, is this funding gap. What's the scale of that gap? We can't be entirely sure. The figure changes continuously, we know that. But Professor Dylan Jones-Evans estimated that some £0.5 billion was close to the mark. That is, businesses need £0.5 billion more than the financial institutions are willing to lend to them.

Felly, i ba raddau mae Cyllid Cymru'n gallu llenwi'r twll yna? Dyna sydd wrth wraidd y cynnig heddiw. Nid yw Cyllid Cymru ei hunain yn gwybod beth ydy maint y gap yna; mi wnaethon nhw gyfaddef hynny yn y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yr wythnos diwethaf. A ydyn nhw'n gallu llenwi'r gap o £0.5 biliwn yna ei hunain? Wel, nac ydyn. Y cwestiwn wedyn, ydy 'pam?' Wel, awgrym Dylan Jones-Evans, yn ogystal â sefydliadau fel yr FSB, ydy bod Cyllid Cymru'n codi mwy o log na sydd yn rhaid iddo fo. Fan hyn, efallai, rydym ni'n gweld y gwrthdaro yna rhwng ei nod datblygu economaidd a'r angen mae o'n ei deimlo i gael strategaeth fasnachol. Yn sicr, ym Mhlaid Cymru, rydym ni eisiau gweld mwy o bwyslais ar y datblygu economaidd.

So, to what extent can Finance Wales fill that gap? That is what is at the heart of this motion today. Finance Wales itself doesn't know the scale of that gap; they admitted as much in the Enterprise and Business Committee last week. Can they fill that gap of £0.5 billion themselves? Well, no, they can't. The question that follows, then, is 'why?' Well, the suggestion made by Dylan Jones-Evans, as well as organisations such as the FSB, is that Finance Wales charges more interest than is necessary. Here, perhaps, we see that conflict between its economic development role and the need it feels to have a commercial strategy. Certainly, in Plaid Cymru, we want to see more of an emphasis on economic development.

It's clear that there is a substantial funding gap, perhaps in the region of around £0.5 billion, a gap that needs to be plugged, and there are a number of proposals on the table on how we should be plugging that gap. Plaid Cymru's been advocating establishing a business development bank for a number of years. We first put forward the proposal back in 2009 in response to the global financial crash. All of the Welsh Government's separate funds and schemes need to be brought under one body, with a focus on economic development, and a Plaid Cymru Government would include, under this body, perhaps, export finance, export support, business mentoring and foreign direct investment—all under one roof. It would be an evolution of Finance Wales. We wouldn't shut down Finance Wales, we'd use the existing licences, perhaps, granted to Finance Wales and we'd use the expertise of the staff within Finance Wales.

Those details, these kinds of proposals, of course, are up for discussion at last, but, whilst I welcome the direction of travel being taken by Welsh Government now, at last, it does say a lot about the dragging of feet that there's been on this matter that we find ourselves here once again debating the merits of a new body, rather than implementing one. There's broad agreement, but still no bank at the end of the day, and it's our SMEs that are paying the price.

I'll turn to our amendments in the name of Elin Jones. Amendment 3 is there in order to focus on action and implementation, after all the talk. Amendment 2 aims to recognise the fact that, actually, Finance Wales does have its merits; it shouldn't be dismissed completely. With the Liberal Democrats' amendment 4, I was minded to vote in favour of it; there are pros and cons in all the suggestions made in that amendment, but given that it's there, really, to take out the Conservatives' suggestion that their idea should be taken on board by Government if appropriate, in the spirit of consensus building, we'll vote to keep that part of the motion intact. It's an important principle, I think, of seeking some sort of consensus on this matter that we recognise no one party has a monopoly on good ideas or, for that matter, bad ideas either.

Mae'n amlwg fod yna fwlch cyllid sylweddol, efallai oddeutu £0.5 biliwn, bwlch y mae angen ei gau, ac mae nifer o gynigion ar y bwrdd ynghylch sut y dylem fod yn cau'r bwlch hwnnw. Mae Plaid Cymru wedi bod yn dadlau dros sefydlu banc datblygu busnes ers nifer o flynyddoedd. Cyflwynwyd yr argymhelliad gennym yn gyntaf yn ôl yn 2009 mewn ymateb i'r cwmp ariannol byd-eang. Mae angen dod â phob un o gronfeydd a chynlluniau gwahanol Llywodraeth Cymru o dan un corff, gyda ffocws ar ddatblygu economaidd, a byddai Llywodraeth Plaid Cymru yn cynnwys cyllid allforio, cymorth allforio, mentora busnes a buddsoddi tramor uniongyrchol o dan y corff hwn o bosibl—y cyfan o dan yr un to. Byddai'n esblygiad o Cyllid Cymru. Ni fyddem yn dod â Cyllid Cymru i ben, byddem yn defnyddio'r trwyddedau presennol, efallai, a roddwyd i Cyllid Cymru a byddem yn defnyddio arbenigedd staff Cyllid Cymru.

Mae'r manylion hynny, argymhellion o'r fath, wrth gwrs, yn destun trafodaeth o'r diwedd, ond er fy mod yn croesawu cyfeiriad teithio Llywodraeth Cymru yn awr, o'r diwedd, mae'n dweud llawer am y llusgo traed a fu ar hyn ein bod yma unwaith eto yn trafod rhinweddau corff newydd, yn hytrach na gweithredu un. Mae yna gytundeb cyffredinol, ond rydym yn dal i fod heb fanc yn y pen draw, a'n busnesau bach a chanolig sy'n talu'r pris.

Trof at ein gwelliannau yn enw Elin Jones. Mae gwelliant 3 yno er mwyn canolbwyntio ar roi camau ar waith a gweithredu ar ôl yr holl siarad. Nod gwelliant 2 yw cydnabod bod gan Cyllid Cymru ei rinweddau mewn gwirionedd; ni ddylid ei ddiystyru'n llwyr. Gyda gwelliant 4 y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol, roeddwn yn ystyried pleidleisio o'i blaid; mae manteision ac anfanteision yn yr holl awgrymiadau a wneir yn y gwelliant hwnnw, ond o ystyried ei fod yno, mewn gwirionedd, i gael gwared ar awgrym y Ceidwadwyr y dylai eu syniad gael ei dderbyn gan y Llywodraeth os yn briodol, yn ysbryd adeiladu consensws, fe bleidleisw'n i gadw'r rhan honno o'r cynnig yn gyfan. Mae'n egwyddor bwysig, rwy'n meddwl, o ran ceisio rhyw fath o gonsensws ar y mater, ein bod yn cydnabod nad oes gan un blaid fonopoli ar syniadau da, na syniadau gwael o ran hynny chwaith.

16:07

## Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Eluned Parrott i gynnis gwelliant 4, a gyflwynwyd yn enw Aled Roberts.

*Gwelliant 4—Aled Roberts*

*Dileu pwynt 3 a rhoi yn ei le:*

*Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i nodi'r camau y bydd yn eu cymryd i ddatblygu Banc Datblygu i Gymru sydd wedi'i gynllunio i:*

*a) cefnogi busnesau bach i gael mynediad at gyllid a chymorth;*

*b) datblygu cysylltiadau rhyngwladol, gan gynnwys allforio a mewnfuddsoddi; ac*

I call on Eluned Parrott to move amendment 4, tabled in the name of Aled Roberts.

*Amendment 4—Aled Roberts*

*Delete point 3 and replace with:*

*Calls on the Welsh Government to set out the steps it will take to develop a Welsh Development Bank that is designed to:*

*a) support small businesses in accessing finance and support;*

*b) develop international links including export and inward investment; and*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

*c) ariannu prosiectau seilwaith mawr, a fyddai hefyd yn egluro rôl Cyllid Cymru yn y dyfodol.*

*c) finance major infrastructure projects, which would also clarify the future role of Finance Wales.*

*Cynigiwyd gwelliant 4.*

*Amendment 4 moved.*

16:07

## **Eluned Parrott** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. I move amendment 4 tabled in the name of Aled Roberts. I think, you know, there's clearly a degree of agreement across the Chamber on the usefulness of a Welsh development bank and the potential it might have to kick-start major investment in Wales in the future. Where I think there might be differences are, firstly, around the degree of success of Finance Wales, clearly, as we've heard already, and, secondly, about the form and role of this new institution when it does take a material form.

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Cynigiau welliant 4 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Aled Roberts. Rwy'n meddwl, wyddoch chi, ei bod yn amlwg fod rhywfaint o gytundeb ar draws y Siambwr ar ddefnyddioldeb banc datblygu Cymru a'r potensial a allai fod ganddo i ysgogi buddsoddiad mawr yng Nghymru yn y dyfodol. Lle rwy'n credu y gallai fod gwahaniaethau yw, yn gyntaf, ynglŷn â graddau llwyddiant Cyllid Cymru, yn amlwg, fel rydym wedi clywed eisoes, ac yn ail, ynglŷn â ffurf a swyddogaeth y sefydliad newydd ar ôl iddo ddod i fodolaeth.

Turning to the first matter, it's fair to say that I've not always been impressed with the work of Finance Wales, and there have been criticisms of their working practices in reports to the Welsh Government and in the press. I have to say I was not particularly impressed when, in Enterprise and Business Committee last week, an institution that states that it exists, at least in part, to overcome the funding gap between what SMEs need and what the market provides in Wales, was unable to agree on a reasonable estimate of that funding gap and had, apparently, taken no steps at all to collect data to inform the question. Now, I take on board that there may be some room for difference and that there may be variability on an almost day-to-day basis in terms of the size of that funding gap. What I find difficult to imagine is demonstrating that you are having a significant impact on an object the size of which you are completely unaware of. Surely, if your job is to tackle a funding gap, you should firstly find out just how big the scale of the problem is and then work out what the causes are. It seems reasonably sensible as an approach to me. Otherwise, what you are, essentially, trying to do is climb a mountain in the dark without ever knowing how big it was in the first place, and never knowing whether you're ever likely to get to the top.

Gan droi at y mater cyntaf, mae'n deg dweud nad yw gwaith Cyllid Cymru bob amser wedi creu argraff dda arnaf, a beirniadwyd eu harferion gwaith mewn adroddiadau i Lywodraeth Cymru ac yn y wasg. Rhaid i mi ddweud na wnaed argraff arbennig arnaf yn y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yr wythnos diwethaf, pan nad oedd sefydliad sy'n datgan ei fod yn bodoli, yn rhannol o leiaf, i gau'r bwlch cyllido rhwng yr hyn sydd ei angen ar fusnesau bach a chanolog a'r hyn y mae'r farchnad yn ei ddarparu yng Nghymru, yn gallu cytuno ar amcangyfrif rhesymol o'r bwlch cyllido a heb roi unrhyw gamau ar waith, yn ôl pob golwg, i gasglu data yn sail i'r cwestiwn. Nawr, rwy'n derbyn y gall fod rhywfaint o le i wahaniaeth ac y gall fod amrywio ar sail ddyddiol bron o ran maint y bwlch cyllido. Yr hyn rwy'n ei gael yn anodd dychmygu yw arddangos eich bod yn cael effaith sylweddol ar wrthrych nad oes gennych unrhyw wybodaeth am ei faint. Os mai eich gwaith yw mynd i'r afael â bwlch cyllido, 'does bosibl na ddylech ganfod yn gyntaf pa mor fawr yw'r broblem a mynd ati wedyn i ddarganfod yr achosion. Mae'n ymddangos yn ddull cymharol resymol o weithredu i mi. Fel arall, yr hyn rydych chi'n ceisio ei wneud yn y bôn yw dringo mynydd yn y tywyllwch heb erioed wybod pa mor fawr yw'r mynydd yn y lle cyntaf, a heb wybod a ydych chi byth yn debygol o gyrraedd y copa.

That being said, I think it is true to say that Finance Wales has also drawn praise from some of the businesses that have succeeded in gaining funding from them, and they do fill partially, we would think, this gap in the market. So, there is a balance between criticism and praise that has to be recognised and, over a period of time, we also have to recognise that Finance Wales has built up a significant amount of experience and an expert staff with skills that are not going to be easy to find in the Welsh employment market. For that reason, I will support Plaid Cymru's amendment 2 today, which I think offers a slightly fairer picture of where we are with Finance Wales.

Ar ôl dweud hynny, rwy'n credu ei bod yn wir dweud bod Cyllid Cymru hefyd wedi denu canmoliaeth gan rai o'r busnesau sydd wedi llwyddo i sicrhau arian ganddynt, a byddem yn meddwl eu bod yn llenwi'r bwlch hwn yn y farchnad yn rhannol. Felly, rhaid cydnabod y cydbwysedd rhwng beirniadaeth a chlôd, a thros gyfnod o amser, rhaid i ni hefyd gydnabod bod Cyllid Cymru wedi cronni cryn dipyn o brofiad a staff arbenigol sydd â sgiliau nad ydynt yn mynd i fod yn hawdd dod o hyd iddynt yn y farchnad gyflogaeth yng Nghymru. Am y rheswm hwnnw, byddaf yn cefnogi gwelliant 2 Plaid Cymru heddiw, ac am fy mod yn meddwl ei fod yn cynnig darlun ychydig bach yn decach o ble rydym arni gyda Cyllid Cymru.

I think the same kind of reasoning is also partially behind my own amendment today. For the staff of Finance Wales, public debate about the future of the organisation must be deeply unsettling, and, when staff morale is low and these individuals fear that their livelihoods may soon be at risk, it's natural that those people will look around for a more stable job. Clearly, then, there's a risk that those skills and experience that Finance Wales does have could be lost if speculation isn't quickly replaced by some kind of certainty as to what the future is going to look like. It's also a truism, of course, that businesses want stability, particularly if they're considering making investments and investing in particular areas. So, it does concern me that uncertainty around Finance Wales, and perhaps some of the funds that it will manage in the future, could potentially be a disincentive to investors coming to Wales.

Clearly, then, we need to minimise the uncertainty surrounding the future of Finance Wales, not only to retain those skilled staff but also to retain business confidence in what may be a transitional period over the next two to three years. I believe that the case for establishing a Welsh development bank has been well made, but, as I mentioned earlier, there may be different views as to what form it should take and what roles it should take on. I can see the potential, as you can see from the amendment, for a broad remit that encompasses a role in defining and addressing that funding gap for our SMEs, but also works to boost the GDP of Wales by taking far bigger steps to encourage export and inward investment too.

There's an exciting growing creative industry sector in south-east Wales, with huge potential for export growth—BBC dramas, for example, but actually a huge number of other creative brands that are growing and starting here in Wales. I would like to see a Welsh development bank working with them to find them new markets and to push and encourage others to follow paths that have been trod by others already.

But I'd also like to see a Welsh development bank working as an investment bank, leveraging in funding for the kind of major infrastructure projects in transport, energy infrastructure, communications—those kinds of things—that Wales will need to continue to invest in to build and then maintain a more prosperous modern economy for the future.

There are lots of opportunities, but, as I said earlier, businesses need stability. To provide that stability, I'd ask the Minister to expand on her previous positive statements on the potential for a Welsh development bank by setting out the steps it now proposes to take and clarifying the role of Finance Wales and the Welsh development bank now and in the future.

Rwy'n meddwl mai'r un math o resymeg sydd wrth wraidd fy ngwelliant innau heddiw hefyd yn rhannol. Rhaid bod dadl gyhoeddus ynghylch dyfodol y sefydliad yn gythryblus iawn i staff Cyllid Cymru, a phan fydd morâl staff yn isel ac unigolion yn ofni y gallai eu bywoliaeth fod mewn perygl cyn bo hir, mae'n naturiol y byddant yn edrych am swydd fwy sefydlog. Yn amlwg, felly, mae perygl y gallai'r sgiliau a'r profiad sydd gan Cyllid Cymru gael eu colli os na ddaw rhyw fath o sicrwydd i gymryd lle'r dyfalu ynglŷn â'r dyfodol, a hynny'n gyflym. Mae'n wir hefyd, wrth gwrs, fod busnesau eisiau sefydlogrwydd, yn enwedig os ydynt yn ystyried gwneud buddsoddiadau a buddsoddi mewn meysydd penodol. Felly, mae'n peri pryder i mi y gallai'r ansicrwydd sydd ynghlwm wrth Cyllid Cymru, a rhai o'r cronfeydd y bydd yn eu rheoli yn y dyfodol efallai, fod yn anghymhelliad i fuddsoddwyr sy'n dod i Gymru.

Yn amlwg, felly, mae angen i ni leihau'r ansicrwydd ynghylch dyfodol Cyllid Cymru, nid yn unig i gadw staff medrus ond hefyd i gynnal hyder busnesau yn yr hyn a allai fod yn gyfnod trosiannol dros y ddwy neu dair blynedd nesaf. Credaf fod yr achos dros sefydlu banc datblygu yng Nghymru wedi cael ei wneud yn dda, ond fel y soniais yn gynharach, gall fod gwahanol safbwyntiau ynglŷn â'i ffurf a pha rolau y dylai eu cyflawni. Fel y gwelwch o'r gwelliant, gallaf weld potensial cylch gwaith eang sy'n cwmpasu rôl yn diffinio a mynd i'r afael â'r bwllch cyllido i'n busnesau bach a chanolig, ond sy'n gweithio hefyd i roi hwb i gynnyrch domestig gros Cymru drwy gymryd camau llawer mwy o faint i annog allforio a buddsoddiad o'r tu allan hefyd.

Mae yna sector diwydiant creadigol cyffrous sy'n tyfu yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru, gyda photensial enfawr ar gyfer allforio—dramâu'r BBC, er enghraifft, ond nifer enfawr o frandiau creadigol eraill mewn gwirionedd, sy'n tyfu ac yn dechrau yma yng Nghymru. Hoffwn weld banc datblygu Cymru yn gweithio gyda'r rhain i ddod o hyd i farchnadoedd newydd ar eu cyfer ac i wthio ac annog eraill i ddilyn llwybrau sydd wedi cael eu troedio gan eraill eisoes.

Ond hefyd hoffwn weld banc datblygu yng Nghymru sy'n gweithio fel banc buddsoddi, gan ddenu cyllid ar gyfer y math o brosiectau seilwaith mawr ym maes trafnidiaeth, seilwaith ynni, cyfathrebu—y mathau hynny o bethau—y bydd angen i Gymru barhau i fuddsoddi ynddynt er mwyn adeiladu a chynnal economi fodern fwy ffyniannus ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Mae yna lawer o gyfleoedd, ond fel y dywedais yn gynharach, mae angen sefydlogrwydd ar fusnesau. I ddarparu sefydlogrwydd o'r fath, byddwn yn gofyn i'r Gweinidog ymhelaethu ar ei datganiadau cadarnhaol blaenorol ar botensial banc datblygu Cymru drwy nodi'r camau y mae bellach yn bwriadu eu cymryd ac egluro rôl Cyllid Cymru a banc datblygu Cymru yn awr ac yn y dyfodol.



In January 2013 the Welsh Conservatives tabled a debate on access to finance for small and medium-sized businesses in Wales. We said then that too many businesses were facing problems in accessing finance. Small and medium-sized businesses are the very lifeblood of the Welsh economy. We warned that this very lifeblood was in danger of being choked due to problems faced in accessing finance. Sadly, our warning has largely gone unheeded.

Welsh Government progress on improving access to finance has been slow and uninspiring. Discussions to improve access to finance in Wales began back in 2011. Finance Wales has been under review for two years after being called unfit for purpose. The Federation of Small Businesses Wales said that they had long-term concerns about the objective of Finance Wales. They claimed a lack of transparency and accountability led to insufficient levels of scrutiny into the performance of Finance Wales.

Our own Finance Committee also highlighted this lack of transparency and accountability. They called for the role of Finance Wales to be made clearer, with greater co-ordination, communication and marketing of the services to be undertaken. It is well to note that the committee also found that a significant proportion of loans made by Finance Wales could have potentially been available commercially at a more competitive rate.

In any review of the system in place to deliver finance to small and medium-sized businesses, I would urge the Welsh Government to give due consideration to the proposal contained in the document that my colleague Nick Ramsay just mentioned—'Invest Wales—A Vision for Welsh Investment'.

We should look into how things are done in other countries. These proposals have been based on successful models from other nations and international bodies, from Germany, Sweden, Canada and the United States, as well as from parts of the United Kingdom. We believe that access to finance needs to be localised to stimulate the economy, and Invest Wales would do this. Its board would sit independently from the Welsh Government, but report directly to and be accountable to it. The six regional board members would each, individually, be responsible for funding businesses in their own region. The repayment from the loans agreed and delivered would stay in the region and go towards further loan funding. Under our proposals, high street banks, building societies, post offices and other financial institutions would be invited to tender for each region to enter into a 50/50 partnership within west Wales. This would ensure that only half the risk would be borne by the state. It would also have the benefit of ensuring extra lending by high street banks, as the administration costs of loans would be borne by Invest Wales. I believe that regionalising the availability of finance, with a regional manager known to the local business community and aware of the needs and requirements of his or her region, will have the benefit of raising awareness of the financial assistance available and the supply of funding.

Ym mis Ionawr 2013 cyflwynodd y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig ddatl ar allu busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru i gael gafael ar gyllid. Fe ddywedasom bryd hynny fod gormod o fusnesau yn wynebu problemau gyda dod o hyd i gyllid. Busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yw anadl einioes economi Cymru, a rhybuddiasom ei fod mewn perygl o gael ei fygu o ganlyniad i broblemau gyda dod o hyd i gyllid. Yn anffodus, ni roddwyd fawr o sylw i'r rhybudd.

Mae cynnydd Llywodraeth Cymru ar wella mynediad at gyllid wedi bod yn araf ac yn ddiffiach. Dechreuodd trafodaethau i wella mynediad at gyllid yng Nghymru yn ôl yn 2011. Mae Cyllid Cymru wedi bod dan adolygiad ers dwy flynedd ar ôl cael eu galw'n anaddas at y diben. Dywedodd Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach Cymru fod ganddynt bryderon hirdymor ynglŷn ag amcan Cyllid Cymru. Roeddent yn honni bod diffyg tryloywder ac atebolrwydd wedi arwain at lefelau annigonol o graffu ar berfformiad Cyllid Cymru.

Hefyd tynnodd ein Pwyllgor Cyllid ein hunain sylw at y diffyg tryloywder ac atebolrwydd hwn. Galwasant am wneud rôl Cyllid Cymru yn gliriach, ac am sicrhau mwy o gydgyssylltiad, cyfathrebu a marchnata gwasanaethau. Mae'n dda nodi bod y pwyllgor hefyd wedi canfod y gallai cyfran sylweddol o fenthyciadau a wnaed gan Gyllid Cymru fod wedi bod ar gael yn fasnachol ar raddfa fwy cystadleuol o bosibl.

Mewn unrhyw adolygiad o'r system sydd ar waith i ddarparu cyllid i fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint, byddwn yn annog Llywodraeth Cymru i roi ystyriaeth ddyladwy i'r argymhelliad a gynhwysir yn y ddogfen y soniodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Nick Ramsay amdani'n awr—'Buddsoddi Cymru: Gweledigaeth gyfer Buddsoddi yng Nghymru'.

Dylem edrych ar sut y mae pethau'n cael eu gwneud mewn gwledydd eraill. Mae'r cynigion hyn wedi'u seilio ar fodolau llwyddiannus o wledydd eraill a chyrrff rhyngwladol, o'r Almaen, Sweden, Canada a'r Unol Daleithiau, yn ogystal ag o rannau o'r Deyrnas Unedig. Credwn fod angen lleoleiddio mynediad at gyllid er mwyn ysgogi'r economi, a byddai Buddsoddi Cymru yn gwneud hyn. Byddai ei fwrdd yn gweithredu'n annibynnol ar Lywodraeth Cymru, ond yn adrodd yn uniongyrchol iddi ac yn atebol iddi. Byddai'r chwe aelod o'r byrddau rhanbarthol yn gyfrifol, fel unigolion, am ariannu busnesau yn eu rhanbarthau eu hunain. Byddai'r ad-daliad o'r benthyciadau a gytunwyd ac a ddarparwyd yn aros yn y rhanbarth ac yn mynd tuag at ariannu benthyciadau pellach. O dan ein cynigion, byddai banciau stryd fawr, cymdeithasau adeiladu, swyddfeydd post a sefydliadau ariannol eraill yn cael eu gwahodd i dendro i bob rhanbarth ymrwymo i bartneriaeth 50/50 yng ngorllewin Cymru. Byddai hyn yn sicrhau mai hanner y risg yn unig y byddai'r wladwriaeth yn gyfrifol amdani. Byddai iddo'r fantais hefyd o sicrhau benthycia ychwanegol gan fanciau'r stryd fawr, gan y byddai costau gweinyddol benthyciadau yn cael eu talu gan Buddsoddi Cymru. Credaf fod rhanbartholi argaeledd cyllid, gyda rheolwr rhanbarthol sy'n gyfarwydd i'r gymuned fusnes leol ac yn ymybodol o anghenion a gofynion ei ranbarth, yn fantais o ran codi ymwybyddiaeth o'r cymorth ariannol sydd ar gael a'r modd y caiff cyllid ei gyflenwi.



Deputy Presiding Officer, our small and medium-sized business in Wales need access to finance to enable them to compete, to grow and thrive. Many are simply unaware of the help that is available there. I call on the Welsh Government to address the problem of Finance Wales and to seriously consider the proposal we have put forward.

Deputy Presiding Officer, I can tell you of a personal experience in my life, in 1975, when I bought my first car. It was a Japanese doctor's who was leaving the United Kingdom, and he came to my office and he said, 'Look, Mr Oscar, I've got a new car. I'm going back. Could you buy it for £600?' That was 1975. I knew a bank manager, Mr Dennis Rollande, in a local bank. I walked into the bank, with that car seller, the doctor, and without any appointment, Mr Rollande said to me, 'Oscar, what do you want?' I said, 'Look, there is a car outside. I want to buy that, Dennis.' His exact words were, 'Go to the counter and take the money.' Job done. No paperwork or anything else. The bank manager had only known me for three years. In 1983, I bought my first property as my office, as an accountant, and what actually happened, Minister, is that I went to the bank—it was another bank—and to Mr Bill Oliver, the manager, and what he told me was, 'Mr Oscar, you don't need £28,000; you need £31,000.' I said, 'Why is that, Bill?', and he said, 'Because you need to improve the property.' This was the vision of these financial institutions' managers—

Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae angen i'n busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yng Nghymru gael mynediad at gyllid i'w galluogi i gystadlu, i dyfu ac i ffynnu. Mae llawer ohonynt yn anymwybodol fod cymorth ar gael. Galwaf ar Lywodraeth Cymru i fynd i'r afael â phroblem Cyllid Cymru ac i ystyried o ddifrif y cynnig a gyflwynwyd gennym.

Ddirprwy Lywydd, gallaf ddweud wrthyfch o brofiad personol yn fy mywyd, yn 1975, pan brynais fy nghar cyntaf. Car meddyg o Japan a oedd yn gadael y Deyrnas Unedig ydoedd, a daeth i fy swyddfa a dweud, 'Edrychwch, Mr Oscar, mae gen i gar newydd. Rwy'n mynd yn ôl. A allech ei brynu am £600?' Roedd hynny yn 1975. Roeddwn i'n adnabod rheolwr banc, Mr Dennis Rollande, mewn banc lleol. Cerddais i mewn i'r banc, gyda gwerthwr y car, y meddyg, a heb drefnu cyfarfod ymlaen llaw, gofynnodd Mr Rollande, 'Oscar, beth ydych chi eisiau?' Dywedais, 'Edrychwch, mae car y tu allan. Rwyf am ei brynu, Dennis.' Ei union eiriau oedd, 'Ewch at y cownter a chymerwch yr arian.' Mor syml â hynna. Dim gwaith papur nac unrhyw beth arall. Ers tair blynedd yn unig roedd y rheolwr banc yn fy adnabod. Yn 1983, prynais fy eiddo cyntaf i fod yn swyddfa i mi, fel cyfrifydd, a'r hyn a ddigwyddodd mewn gwirionedd, Weinidog, yw fy mod wedi mynd at y banc—banc arall oedd hwn—ac at Mr Oliver, y rheolwr, a'r hyn a ddywedodd wrthyf oedd, 'Mr Oscar, nid £28,000 sydd ei angen arnoch; rydych angen £31,000. 'Pam hynny, Bill?' gofynnais, a dywedodd, 'Oherwydd bydd angen i chi wella'r eiddo.' Dyna weledigaeth rheolwyr y sefydliadau ariannol hynny—

- 16:17 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Finish with this now, please. Gorffennwch gyda hyn yn awr, os gwelwch yn dda.
- 16:17 **Mohammad Asghar** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
Those are the types of people we need, Deputy Presiding Officer, in west Wales to improve our businesses. Dyna'r mathau o bobl rydym eu hangen, Ddirprwy Lywydd, yng ngorllewin Cymru i wella ein busnesau.
- 16:18 **Julie Morgan** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#) Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)  
I'm very pleased to speak in this debate today, as a member of the Finance Committee, led by the Chair, Jocelyn Davies. I took part in the inquiry into Finance Wales and we had a follow-up session with Professor Dylan Jones-Evans, again, a week or so ago, about his report on the development bank. The key issue, it seems to me, is whether Finance Wales should be the basis of any new development bank, if that is what the Government decides to go ahead with. I don't think, as Eluned Parrott has said, it's possible or feasible to have two organisations, and the expertise of Finance Wales is obviously too good to lose. I can see no sense in having these two organisations with the limited pool of specialist skills of this kind that is available in Wales. Rwy'n falch iawn o gael siarad yn y ddadl hon heddiw, fel aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid, dan arweiniad y Cadeirydd, Jocelyn Davies. Cymerais ran yn yr ymchwiliad i Cyllid Cymru a chawsom sesiwn ddilynol gyda'r Athro Dylan Jones-Evans, unwaith eto, wythnos neu ddwy yn ôl, am ei adroddiad ar y banc datblygu. Mae'n ymddangos i mi mai'r mater allweddol yw ai Cyllid Cymru a ddylai fod yn sail i unrhyw fanc datblygu newydd, os mai dyna y mae'r Llywodraeth yn penderfynu bwrw ymlaen i'w wneud. Fel y mae Eluned Parrott wedi'i ddweud, nid wyf yn credu ei bod yn bosibl na'n ymarferol i gael dau sefydliad, ac mae arbenigedd Cyllid Cymru yn amlwg yn rhy dda i'w gollu. Ni allaf weld unrhyw synnwyr mewn cael dau sefydliad gyda'r gronfa gyfyngedig o sgiliau arbenigol o'r math hwn sydd ar gael yng Nghymru.

So, I believe that Finance Wales should form the basis of the development bank, if that is what the Government decides to do. I have to say, I think it's really important that we get away from this negative coverage of Finance Wales. I think the Tory party is absolutely obsessed with Finance Wales. The number of times I've heard them attack Finance Wales, it makes you wonder, you know, what they're about, because it certainly wasn't the view of the Finance Committee that Finance Wales was not fit for purpose, which has been said and quoted a few times today by the Tory party and expressed, actually, in the first report of Dylan Jones-Evans. I just want to repeat that, on the whole, we had extremely good reports about Finance Wales. I think it's very important this is remembered, because Eluned Parrott made the point about how demoralising and how destabilising, in a financial world, these irresponsible attacks are.

The people who gave us evidence were really frustrated about the negative coverage that Finance Wales was getting. We were told that Wales was shooting itself in the foot again, and I really think that this coverage of Finance Wales has been Wales shooting itself in the foot again. Finance Wales is well regarded outside Wales. Finance Birmingham was based on Finance Wales. We were told that the European Investment Bank's view is that Finance Wales is actually one of the best JEREMIE fund managers operating in the UK. It's also said that it's possibly one of the best in Europe. It seems totally counterproductive to undermine what Finance Wales does in the way that the Tory party has done. Why destabilise something that is seen as good by the business community? Basically, it's very difficult to look at what changes need to take place—inevitably, changes would be needed, especially if we are going to move ahead to a development bank—in the face of this sort of criticism.

The other point is that Finance Wales has actually had success outside Wales and is responsible for administering funds across the north east and the north west of England. It was actually a feather in their cap that they were asked to do this. And yet, this again was criticised. Talk about an inward-looking sort of way of approaching the economy and approaching Welsh affairs—by looking inward in this sort of way. The opposition Member said that the FSB said their members haven't heard of Finance Wales. I'm not a bit surprised that members haven't heard of Finance Wales. They go through intermediaries. They are referred by accountants; they are referred by other banks. What the FSB members are looking for is something entirely different. Finance Wales is looking at growth, and so I really feel—

Felly, rwy'n credu y dylai Cyllid Cymru fod yn sail i'r banc datblygu, os mai dyna beth y mae'r Llywodraeth yn penderfynu ei wneud. Mae'n rhaid i mi ddweud, rwy'n credu ei bod hi'n bwysig iawn i ni droi cefn ar y sylw negyddol i Cyllid Cymru. Rwy'n meddwl, yn rhannol, fod gan y blaid Doriaidd obsesiwn llwyr gyda Cyllid Cymru. Clywais hwy'n ymosod ar Cyllid Cymru cynifer o weithiau nes gwneud i chi feddwl, wyddoch chi, beth yw eu bwriad, oherwydd yn sicr nid barn y Pwyllgor Cyllid oedd nad oedd Cyllid Cymru yn addas i'r diben, sydd wedi cael ei ddweud a'i ddyfynnu sawl gwaith heddiw gan y blaid Doriaidd a'i fynegi, mewn gwirionedd, yn adroddiad cyntaf Dylan Jones-Evans. Hoffwn ailadrodd yn syml ein bod, ar y cyfan, wedi cael adroddiadau eithriadol o dda am Cyllid Cymru. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn i ni gofio hyn, oherwydd gwnaeth Eluned Parrott y pwynt ynglŷn â pha mor niweidiol yw ymosodiadau anghyfrifol o'r fath o ran morâl a sefydlogrwydd, mewn byd ariannol.

Roedd y bobl a roddodd dystiolaeth i ni yn teimlo rhwystredigaeth go iawn ynglŷn â'r sylw negyddol roedd Cyllid Cymru yn ei gael. Dywedwyd wrthym fod Cymru yn saethu ei hun yn ei throed eto, ac rwy'n meddwl mewn gwirionedd mai'r sylw yma a roddir i Cyllid Cymru sy'n enghraifft o Gymru yn saethu ei hun yn ei throed eto. Mae enw da i Cyllid Cymru y tu allan i Gymru. Roedd Finance Birmingham yn seiliedig ar Cyllid Cymru. Dywedwyd wrthym mai barn Banc Buddsoddi Ewrop yw mai Cyllid Cymru mewn gwirionedd yw un o reolwyr gorau cronfa JEREMIE sy'n gweithredu yn y Deyrnas Unedig. Dywedir hefyd ei fod yn o'r goreuon yn Ewrop o bosibl. Mae'n ymddangos bod tansellio Cyllid Cymru yn y ffordd y mae'r blaid Doriaidd wedi'i wneud yn gwbl wrthgynhyrchiol. Pam ansefydlogi rhywbeth sy'n cael ei ystyried yn dda gan y gymuned fusnes? Yn y bôn, mae'n anodd iawn edrych i weld pa newidiadau sydd eu hangen—yn anochel, byddai angen newidiadau, yn enwedig os ydym yn mynd i symud ymlaen i fanc datblygu—yn wyneb beirniadaeth o'r fath.

Y pwynt arall yw bod Cyllid Cymru wedi cael llwyddiant y tu allan i Gymru ac mae'n gyfrifol am weinyddu cyllid ar draws gogledd-ddwyrain a gogledd-orllewin Lloegr. Roedd yn bluen yn eu het mewn gwirionedd eu bod wedi cael cais i wneud hyn. Ac eto, beirniadwyd hyn hefyd. Am ffordd fewnblyg o ymdrin â'r economi a materion Cymreig—drwy fewnblygrwydd o'r fath. Dywedodd yr Aelod o'r wrthblaid fod y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach wedi dweud nad yw eu haelodau wedi clywed am Cyllid Cymru. Nid yw'n syndod o gwbl i mi nad yw'r aelodau wedi clywed am Cyllid Cymru. Maent yn mynd drwy gyfryngwyr. Cânt eu cyfeirio gan gyfrifwyr; cânt eu cyfeirio gan fanciau eraill. Mae'r hyn y mae aelodau'r Ffederasiwn yn chwilio amdano yn rhywbeth hollol wahanol. Mae Cyllid Cymru yn edrych ar dwf, ac felly rwy'n teimlo mewn gwirionedd—

16:22

**Nick Ramsay** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Will the Member give way?

A wnaiff yr Aelod ildio?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

**Julie Morgan** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

No, I've only got a few minutes. The Tory party is very irresponsible in the way that it continuously attacks Finance Wales, which has a good brand name, and which has been very successful in many ways. That has been externally validated. So, I think it's exciting to talk about moving ahead to a development bank, but to repeat this criticism of Finance Wales, I think, is very counterproductive.

Na, ychydig funodau'n unig sydd gennyf. Mae'r blaid Doriaidd yn anghyfrifol iawn yn y ffordd y mae'n ymosod yn barhaus ar Cyllid Cymru, sydd ag enw brand da, ac sydd wedi bod yn llwyddiannus iawn mewn sawl ffordd. Mae hynny wedi cael ei ddilysu'n allanol. Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod siarad am symud ymlaen i fanc datblygu yn gyffrous, ond mae ailadrodd y feirniadaeth hon o Cyllid Cymru yn wrthgynhyrchiol iawn yn fy marn i.

**Russell George** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I'm grateful to take part in this Conservative debate on the challenges facing new business start-ups, as well as those highly successful small businesses as well, in my constituency. The 1,000 fastest-growing small and medium-size businesses in Britain generated £158 billion in revenues last year, and that accounted for 9 per cent of GDP. Over this period, these companies have increased headcount by 182,000, equal to 45 per cent of the UK's jobs growth. So, it is clear that strong and well-financed SMEs are the backbone of the UK economy. If they unleash their potential, they can be the engine of a vibrant Welsh economy, providing innovation and generating higher paid employment for thousands of people. I say 'higher paid' because, in my constituency, the unemployment rate is relatively low—under 500—which is very welcome news, but the rate of pay, unfortunately, for many of those jobs is low. So, in areas such as my constituency, an area that is heavily reliant on micro and small businesses, improving the way in which SMEs are able to access finance is crucial.

At present, businesses often struggle to get access to the finance that allows them to invest and grow. It's clear from my postbag that too many businesses are hamstrung by red tape and other barriers that prevent them from growing and becoming medium-size businesses with the ability to employ more people. I should say that there is a number of interventions I have made myself with businesses. I've corresponded with the Minister in recent weeks, and there's been some very successful progress with the Minister with regard to funding some businesses in my constituency, which will help them grow and help them employ more people. But I do have significant concern over Finance Wales's ability to access finance and provide support to Welsh SMEs after receiving complaints from several constituents in my constituency. As a result, yes, I am obsessed with Finance Wales in that regard, and I think it's right that I am.

But one business was in discussions with Finance Wales for over two years regarding a business loan. It was finally offered a potential deal, but the indicative offer of that was well below what the business was led to believe in the first place, and, as a result, also at a much higher rate of interest. And the business had sound management, it had a good structure, and had shown growth year on year, but Finance Wales took two years to come up with what was a second-rate deal. I also note, as well—I think Nick Ramsay said the same—that Professor Dylan Jones-Evans reported on Finance Wales and also highlighted the fact that the organisation had been lending to businesses at a much higher rate of interest. So, I think the Welsh Government should take note of examples such as this.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar am gael cymryd rhan yn nadl y Ceidwadwyr ar yr heriau sy'n wynebu busnesau newydd, yn ogystal â'r busnesau bach llwyddiannus iawn sydd yn fy etholaeth i. Cynhyrchodd y 1,000 o fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint sy'n tyfu gyflymaf ym Mhrydain £158 biliwn mewn refeniw y llynedd, sef 9 y cant o'r cynnyrch domestig gros. Dros y cyfnod hwn, cafwyd cynnydd o 182,000 yn nifer y gweithwyr yn y cwmnïau hyn, sy'n gyfystyr â 45 y cant o'r cynnydd yn nifer y swyddi yn y DU. Felly, mae'n amlwg mai busnesau bach a chanolig cryf ac wedi'u hariannu'n dda yw asgwrn cefn economi'r DU. Os yw eu potensial yn cael ei ryddhau, gallant ysgogi economi fywiog yng Nghymru, gan ddarparu arloesedd a chreu swyddi sy'n talu'n well i filoedd o bobl. Dywedaf 'talu'n well' oherwydd, yn fy etholaeth i, mae'r gyfradd diweithdra yn gymharol isel—o dan 500—sy'n newyddion da iawn, ond mae cyfraddau cyflogau, yn anffodus, yn isel yn achos llawer o'r swyddi hyn. Felly, mewn ardaloedd fel fy etholaeth i, ardal sy'n dibynnu'n drwm ar ficrofusnesau a busnesau bach, mae gwella'r ffordd y gall busnesau bach a chanolig gael gafael ar gyllid yn hollbwysig.

Ar hyn o bryd, mae busnesau yn aml yn ei chael yn anodd dod o hyd i'r cyllid sy'n eu galluogi i fuddsoddi a thyfu. Mae'n amlwg o fy ngohebiaeth fod gormod o fusnesau yn cael eu llyffetheirio gan firocratiaeth a rhwystrau eraill sy'n eu hatal rhag tyfu a dod yn fusnesau canolig eu maint gyda'r gallu i gyflogi mwy o bobl. Dylwn ddweud fy mod wedi cyflawni nifer o ymyriadau fy hun ar ran busnesau. Rwyf wedi gohebu â'r Gweinidog dros yr wythnosau diwethaf, a chafwyd rhywfaint o gynnydd llwyddiannus iawn gyda'r Gweinidog o ran ariannu rhai busnesau yn fy etholaeth a fydd yn eu helpu i dyfu ac yn helpu i gyflogi mwy o bobl. Ond rwy'n pryderu cryn dipyn ynghylch gallu Cyllid Cymru i gael cyllid a darparu cymorth i fusnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru ar ôl cael cwynion gan nifer o etholwyr yn fy etholaeth. O ganlyniad, oes, mae gennyf obsesiwn gyda Cyllid Cymru yn hynny o beth, a hynny'n ddigon teg yn fy marn i.

Ond roedd un busnes mewn trafodaethau gyda Cyllid Cymru ers dros ddwy flynedd yn ymwneud â benthyciad busnes. Cafodd gynnig cytundeb posibl yn y diwedd, ond roedd y cynnig dangosol arno'n llawer is na'r hyn yr arweiniwyd y busnes i gredu y byddai yn y lle cyntaf, ac o ganlyniad hefyd, ar gyfradd llog lawer uwch. Roedd gan y busnes drefniadau rheoli cadarn a strwythur da, ac roedd wedi dangos twf flyyddyn ar ôl blwyddyn, ond cymerodd Cyllid Cymru ddwy flynedd—gynnig cytundeb eilradd. Sylwaf hefyd, yn ogystal—rwy'n meddwl bod Nick Ramsay wedi dweud yr un peth—fod yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans wedi cyflwyno adroddiad ar Cyllid Cymru a hefyd wedi tynnu sylw at y ffaith fod y sefydliad wedi bod yn benthycia i fusnesau ar gyfradd llog lawer uwch. Felly, rwy'n meddwl y dylai Llywodraeth Cymru roi sylw i enghreifftiau fel hyn.

Another business in my constituency was also frustrated at the length of time Finance Wales took to approve a loan for a management buyout. Now, Finance Wales had not seemed to have any appreciation of the need to act quickly in a buyout situation. It kept asking for further information and querying account details. Now, when you're spending public money, you have to be accountable, you expect correct information, and you're right to query also some of the accounting information. I accept that, but the balance of this was disproportionate and wrong.

Now, in the last Parliament, the UK Government took a number of positive steps to help improve the finance availability for firms—the British Business Bank was established to finance markets. It worked better for smaller businesses and it has already facilitated billions of pounds of new lending and investment to thousands of businesses. The start-up loans programme has also supported entrepreneurs looking to start their own business with a start-up loan of up to £25,000 for up to five years, and the previous UK Government also announced earlier this year that it would create a help-to-grow scheme—an ambitious plan that will help Britain's fastest-growing small firms access finance in an effort to plug the £1 billion funding gap in finance for thousands of businesses with a turnover of up to £25 million. This is all to be welcomed; I think there needs to be greater clarity on behalf of the Welsh Government on how it intends to dovetail its policies with positive UK Government reforms in order to further support SMEs across Wales.

So, in conclusion, Deputy Presiding Officer, too many of the most dynamic businesses don't live up to their growth potential due to the lack of finance. Facilitating access to finance will help more Welsh firms scale up rather than scale-down and make today's small firms tomorrow's Apple or Google.

16:27

## **Paul Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I'm grateful for the opportunity to take part in this debate this afternoon. Today's debate, of course, calls on the Welsh Government to better support small businesses in Wales by improving their access to finance, and at the very heart of this debate is the Welsh Conservatives' absolute desire to support small and medium-sized enterprises and to stimulate the local economy. It won't surprise Members that this is a matter that we on this side of the Chamber have been focusing on for some time. We welcome the comprehensive and constructive work commissioned by the Welsh Government that has highlighted the inadequacies of access to finance in Wales for SMEs. However, clearly, from the conversations we're having with our constituents, access to finance is still a huge obstacle for SMEs, which largely only require small-scale loans to support their businesses. We believe that, by adopting a policy of Invest Wales and localising access to finance, our regional Invest Wales banks would be in a far better position to understand the local economy and, therefore, identify gaps in the market.

Roedd busnes arall yn fy etholaeth yn teimlo'n rhwystredig hefyd ynglŷn â faint o amser a gymerodd Cyllid Cymru i gymeradwyo benthyciad i reolwyr brynu cwmni'n gyfan gwbl. Yn awr, nid oedd Cyllid Cymru i'w weld yn gwerthfawrogi'r angen i weithredu'n gyflym mewn sefyllfa o brynu'n gyfan gwbl. Dalai i ofyn am ragor o wybodaeth ac i gwestiynu manylion cyfrifon. Nawr, pan fyddwch yn gwario arian cyhoeddus, rhaid i chi fod yn atebol, rydych yn disgwyl gwybodaeth gywir, ac mae'n iawn i chi gwestiynu rhywfaint o wybodaeth am gyfrifon hefyd. Rwy'n derbyn hynny, ond roedd y cydbwysedd yn anghymesur ac yn anghywir.

Nawr, yn ystod y Senedd ddiwethaf, cymerodd Llywodraeth y DU nifer o gamau cadarnhaol i helpu i sicrhau bod mwy o gyllid ar gael ar gyfer cwmnïau—sefydlwyd Banc Busnes Prydain i ariannu marchnadoedd. Gweithiai'n well ar gyfer busnesau llai o faint ac mae eisoes wedi galluogi miloedd o fusnesau i fenthycia a buddsoddi biliynau o bunnoedd o'r newydd. Mae'r rhaglen benthyciadau cychwyn busnes hefyd wedi cynorthwyo entrepreneuriaid sydd am ddechrau eu busnesau eu hunain gyda benthyciad cychwyn busnes o hyd at £25,000 am hyd at bum mlynedd, a chyhoeddodd Llywodraeth flaenorol y DU yn gynharach eleni y byddai'n creu cynllun cymorth i dyfu—cynllun uchelgeisiol a fydd yn helpu'r cwmnïau bach sy'n tyfu gyflymaf ym Mhrydain i gael arian mewn ymdrech i gau'r bwch cyllido £1 biliwn mewn cyllid ar gyfer miloedd o fusnesau sydd â throiant o hyd at £25 miliwn. Mae hyn i gyd i'w goesawu; rwy'n credu bod angen mwy o eglurder ar ran Llywodraeth Cymru ynglŷn â sut y mae'n bwriadu ymblethu ei pholisiau gyda diwygiadau cadarnhaol Llywodraeth y DU er mwyn rhoi rhagor o gymorth i fusnesau bach a chanolig ar draws Cymru.

Felly, i gloi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae gormod o'r busnesau mwyaf dynamig yn methu cyflawni eu potensial i dyfu oherwydd diffyg cyllid. Bydd hwyluso mynediad at gyllid yn helpu mwy o gwmnïau yng Nghymru i ehangu yn hytrach na chrebachu, a throi cwmnïau bach heddiw yn Apple neu Google yfory.

Diolch am y cyfle i gymryd rhan yn y ddadl y prynhawn yma. Mae'r ddadl heddiw, wrth gwrs, yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i gefnogi busnesau bach yng Nghymru yn well drwy wella eu mynediad at gyllid, ac yn ganolog iawn i'r ddadl hon y mae awydd pendant y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig i gefnogi busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint ac i ysgogi'r economi leol. Ni fydd yn syndod i'r Aelodau fod hwn yn fater rydym ni ar yr ochr hon i'r Siambwr wedi bod yn canolbwyntio arno ers peth amser. Rydym yn croesawu'r gwaith cynhwysfawr ac adeiladol a gomisiynydd gan Lywodraeth Cymru sydd wedi tynnu sylw at ddiffygion mynediad at gyllid yng Nghymru i fusnesau bach a chanolig. Fodd bynnag, o'r sgorsiau a gawn â'n hetholwyr, mae mynediad at gyllid yn dal i fod yn rhwystr enfawr i fusnesau bach a chanolig, sydd at ei gilydd ond angen benthyciadau ar raddfa fach i gefnogi eu busnesau. Trwy fabwysiadu polisi Buddsoddi Cymru a lleoleiddio mynediad at gyllid, credwn y byddai ein banciau Buddsoddi Cymru rhanbarthol mewn sefyllfa lawer gwell i ddeall yr economi leol ac felly, i nodi bylchau yn y farchnad.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I'm surprised that some members of the governing party are criticising us for scrutinising Finance Wales, given that the Minister herself thinks it's not doing what it should be doing; otherwise she wouldn't have commissioned Professor Dylan Jones-Evans to review access to finance in the first place. So, let me help some Members to understand what we would do. In terms of the structure and implementation of our policy, our regional investment banks would broadly follow the shape of Finance Wales, and our policy is absolutely clear. As my colleague Mohammad Asghar said, the Invest Wales board would report to the Welsh Government, but would sit independently, alongside it. The Invest Wales director would be responsible for overseeing the investments made and would produce quarterly reports for the Welsh Government. The regional offices would ensure that the service given throughout Wales is consistent, and the board would be responsible for monitoring the regional hubs and businesses they are investing in, as well as setting branding, business counselling advice and online banking. Now, in my previous life as a bank manager, I was only too aware that some businesses require more than just finance to help their enterprises. That's why, as part of our policy, the Invest Wales manager would be able to provide expertise and advice on business plans, marketing and PR. They would be the people who know the local area and have a portfolio of contacts that would be able to strengthen the amount of advice and training available to an SME. By encouraging healthy support networks, other businesses would in turn benefit from having Invest Wales in their community.

I was also fortunate enough to have been a member of the Finance Committee when it launched an inquiry into Finance Wales, and there were certainly concerns about its performance and transparency. I understand that the Welsh Government is ensuring performance information will be made more transparent and accessible through the Finance Wales website, and I hope that the Minister will, at the very least, continue to liaise with her officials to ensure that Finance Wales, if it continues in its current format, becomes more open and transparent for the future. I hope that the Minister has also taken on board the committee's recommendations, notably around communication, working with SMEs, and transparency. Perhaps the Minister will use this debate as an opportunity to update Members on what the Welsh Government has done to implement these specific recommendations.

Now, the Minister will be well aware that her former leader, Ed Miliband, recognised some of the challenges facing small businesses, and he committed to establishing a network of regional banks in England to help small businesses get access to finance. He called for a network of lenders in every major region of England, based on the Sparkassen model in Germany, similar to our proposals. These banks would of course have a civic duty to promote local growth and lend to firms operating in their local area. We believe that, when a high street bank can't provide support, the various levers that the state has at its disposal must be used to its best advantage. Ultimately, this is about forging a strong and healthy relationship between small businesses, banks and the local community, and the FSB has rightly said that, and I quote,

Rwy'n synnu bod rhai aelodau o'r blaidd sy'n llywodraethu yn ein beirniadu am graffu ar Cyllid Cymru, o gofio bod y Gweinidog ei hun yn credu nad yw'n gwneud yr hyn y dylai fod yn ei wneud; fel arall ni fyddai wedi comisiynu'r Athro Dylan Jones-Evans i adolygu mynediad at gyllid yn y lle cyntaf. Felly, gadewch i mi helpu rhai o'r Aelodau i ddeall yr hyn y byddem ni yn ei wneud. O ran strwythur a gweithrediad ein polisi, byddai ein banciau buddsoddi rhanbarthol yn dilyn ffurf Cyllid Cymru at ei gilydd, ac mae ein polisi yn gwbl glir. Fel y dywedodd fy nghyd-Aelod, Mohammad Asghar, byddai bwrdd Buddsoddi Cymru yn llunio adroddiadau i Lywodraeth Cymru, ond byddai'n annibynnol, ochr yn ochr â'r Llywodraeth. Byddai cyfarwyddwr Buddsoddi Cymru yn gyfrifol am oruchwylio'r buddsoddiadau a wneid ac yn cynhyrchu adroddiadau chwarterol ar gyfer Llywodraeth Cymru. Byddai'r swyddfeydd rhanbarthol yn sicrhau cysondeb o ran y gwasanaeth a ddarperid drwy Gymru, a byddai'r bwrdd yn gyfrifol am fonitro'r canolfannau a'r busnesau rhanbarthol y maent yn buddsoddi ynddynt, yn ogystal â nodi cyngor ar frandio, cwnsela busnesau a bancio ar-lein. Nawr, yn fy mywyd blaenorol fel rheolwr banc, roeddwn yn ymwybodol iawn fod rhai busnesau angen mwy na chyllid yn unig i helpu eu mentrau. Dyna pam, fel rhan o'n polisi, y byddai'r rheolwr Buddsoddi Cymru yn gallu darparu arbenigedd a chyngor ar gynlluniau busnes, marchnata a chysylltiadau cyhoeddus. Dyma'r bobl sy'n adnabod yr ardal leol ac yn meddu ar bortffolio o gysylltiadau i ychwanegu at y cyngor a'r hyfforddiant sydd ar gael i fusnes bach neu ganolig. Trwy annog rhwydweithiau cefnogi iach, byddai busnesau eraill yn eu tro yn elwa o gael Buddsoddi Cymru yn eu cymuned.

Roeddwn yn ddigon ffodus hefyd i fod yn aelod o'r Pwyllgor Cyllid pan lansiodd ymchwiliad i Cyllid Cymru, ac yn sicr, roedd yna bryderon am ei berfformiad a'i dryloywder. Deallaf fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn sicrhau y bydd gwybodaeth am berfformiad yn cael ei wneud yn fwy tryloyw a hygyrch drwy wefan Cyllid Cymru, ac rwy'n gobeithio y bydd y Gweinidog o leiaf yn parhau i gysylltu gyda'i swyddogion i sicrhau bod Cyllid Cymru, os yw'n parhau ar ei ffurf bresennol, yn dod yn fwy agored a thryloyw yn y dyfodol. Rwy'n gobeithio hefyd fod y Gweinidog wedi ystyried argymhellion y pwyllgor, yn enwedig mewn perthynas â chyfathrebu, gweithio gyda busnesau bach a chanolig, a thryloywder. Efallai y bydd y Gweinidog yn defnyddio'r ddadl hon fel cyfle i roi'r wybodaeth ddiweddaraf i'r Aelodau am yr hyn y mae Llywodraeth Cymru wedi'i wneud i weithredu'r argymhellion penodol hyn.

Nawr, bydd y Gweinidog yn ymwybodol iawn fod ei chyn-arweinydd, Ed Miliband, wedi cydnabod rhai o'r heriau sy'n wynebu busnesau bach, a'i fod wedi ymrwymo i sefydlu rhwydwaith o fanciau rhanbarthol yn Lloegr i helpu busnesau bach gael mynediad at gyllid. Galwodd am rwydwaith o fenthycwyr ym mhob prif ranbarth yn Lloegr, yn seiliedig ar fodel Sparkassen yn yr Almaen, ac yn debyg i'n cynigion ni. Byddai gan y banciau ddyletswydd ddinesig, wrth gwrs, i hyrwyddo twf lleol ac i fenthycia i gwmnïau sy'n gweithredu yn eu hardal leol. Pan na all banc y stryd fawr ddarparu cymorth, credwn fod yn rhaid manteisio i'r eithaf ar y gwahanol ddulliau sydd gan y wladwriaeth ar gael iddi. Yn y pen draw, mae'n ymwneud â chreu perthynas gref ac iach rhwng busnesau bach, banciau a'r gymuned leol, ac mae'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach wedi dweud yn gywir, mai:

'It is those smallest businesses that have been the key to job creation here in Wales yet...they are currently served very poorly when it comes to accessing finance.'

Therefore, quite clearly, more needs to be done to support our small businesses.

Therefore, in closing, Deputy Presiding Officer, Wales has a strong entrepreneurial spirit with almost all of Welsh businesses being micro or small in size. They need to be rewarded with the support they deserve, nurtured and encouraged. Welsh Conservatives are ambitious for Wales and we believe in the Welsh people and Welsh business. We want them to succeed and we believe that the Welsh Government could be doing more right now to ensure small local businesses aren't turned down outright when they try to access finance. I urge Members to support this motion.

'Y busnesau lleiaf hynny a fu'n allweddol i greu swyddi yma yng Nghymru ac eto... ar hyn o bryd maent yn cael eu gwasanaethu'n wael iawn pan ddaw'n fater o gael cyllid.'

Felly, yn amlwg iawn, mae angen gwneud mwy i gefnogi ein busnesau bach.

Felly, wrth gloi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, mae gan Gymru ysbryd entrepreneuriaidd cryf gyda bron bob un o fusnesau Cymru yn microfusnesau neu'n fusnesau bach eu maint. Mae angen eu meithrin, eu hannog a'u gwobrwyo â'r gefnogaeth a haeddant. Mae'r Ceidwadwyr Cymreig yn uchelgeisiol dros Gymru ac rydym yn credu ym mhobl Cymru a busnesau Cymru. Rydym am iddynt lwyddo a chredwn y gallai Llywodraeth Cymru wneud mwy yn awr i sicrhau nad yw busnesau bach lleol yn cael eu gwrthod yn llwyr pan fyddant yn ceisio cael gafael ar gyllid. Anogaf yr Aelodau i gefnogi'r cynnig hwn.

16:33 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth, Edwina Hart.

I call the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport, Edwina Hart.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:33 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

*Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth / The Minister for Economy, Science and Transport*

Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. I will first tackle the amendments. We will be supporting the amendments from Plaid Cymru because the Welsh Government accepts that Finance Wales does not fully meet the needs of small businesses as there is still clearly a funding gap, and we are looking at improvements through Dylan Jones-Evans's work.

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Rwyf am fynd i'r afael â'r newidiadau yn gyntaf. Byddwn yn cefnogi'r gwelliannau gan Plaid Cymru am fod Llywodraeth Cymru yn derbyn nad yw Cyllid Cymru yn ateb anghenion busnesau bach yn llawn gan fod bwlch cyllido amlwg yn dal i fodoli, ac rydym yn edrych ar welliannau drwy waith Dylan Jones-Evans.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

In addition, we support the second amendment from Plaid Cymru, which is about carrying on with the work on the creation of the development bank for Wales. I am pleased to advise you that, upon receipt of letters or reports from the various committees that have actually looked at the recommendations in Dylan Jones-Evans's report, I will be announcing to the Chamber in due course how I intend to take forward the implementation of the report, so you can be assured that all the hard work that has been done will come to fruition. But we have to recognise as well—and I think Rhun recognised in his contribution—that this is quite a big step for us to take, as a development bank. There are many things we might like, like in the Liberal Democrat amendment—which we will not be supporting—that we might well like to look at in the future. But we do have a brand, as I think others said, and Julie Morgan, that is instantly recognisable, and we have to work where that brand is, and we have to take that forward in terms of establishing a development bank.

Yn ogystal, rydym yn cefnogi ail welliant Plaid Cymru, sy'n ymwneud â pharhau gyda'r gwaith o greu'r banc datblygu i Gymru. Ar ôl cael llythyrau neu adroddiadau gan y gwahanol bwyllgorau sydd wedi mynd ati i edrych ar argymhellion adroddiad Dylan Jones-Evans, rwy'n falch o'ch hysbysu y byddaf yn cyhoeddi i'r Siambr maes o law sut y bwriadaf frwr ymlaen â gweithredu'r adroddiad, er mwyn eich sicrhau y bydd yr holl waith caled a wnaed yn dwyn ffrwyth. Ond rhaid i ni gydnabod hefyd—ac rwy'n meddwl bod Rhun wedi cydnabod hyn yn ei gyfraniad—fod hwn yn gam go fawr i ni ei gymryd, fel banc datblygu. Mae llawer o bethau y byddem yn eu hoffi, fel yng ngwelliant y Democratiaid Rhyddfrydol—na fyddwn yn ei gefnogi—y gallen yn bendant fod yn awyddus i edrych arnynt yn y dyfodol. Ond fel y dywedodd eraill rwy'n credu, a Julie Morgan, mae gennym frand y gall pawb ei adnabod ar unwaith, ac mae'n rhaid i ni weithio gyda'r brand, a rhaid i ni frwr ymlaen â hynny o ran sefydlu banc datblygu.

It is always interesting that there are very mixed opinions about Finance Wales. You have high praise from the companies that have been engaged with them, and that have had loans from them, and when you look at the record in terms of what they've done in jobs secured and businesses supported, it's very good. But you also then have the other issues, of course, with the banks being so difficult in terms of lending to small businesses, which is the view that we need to take forward in terms of how we support those small and microbusinesses.

Mae bob amser yn ddiddorol fod yna farn gymysg iawn am Cyllid Cymru. Mae yna ganmoliaeth uchel gan y cwmnïau sydd wedi bod yn ymwneud â hwy, ac sydd wedi cael benthyciadau ganddynt, a phan edrychwch ar yr hanes o ran yr hyn y maent wedi ei wneud i ddiogelu swyddi a chynorthwyo busnesau, mae'n dda iawn. Ond wedyn mae yna faterion eraill hefyd, wrth gwrs, gyda'r banciau'n bod mor anodd o ran benthycia i fusnesau bach, sef y safbwynt sydd angen i ni symud ymlaen arno o ran sut rydym yn cefnogi busnesau bach a microfusnesau.



Now, in responding to this motion from the Conservatives today, I think we can all agree in the Chamber on the importance of access to finance for SMEs, and I think, as Paul indicated, this is a real big issue when you're trying to get those small businesses to make sure they have the appropriate access. We also need to recognise that we have to work closely with the private sector, and are helping businesses to deliver real and lasting benefits for the Welsh economy. This is not going to be a state bank that's going to take over the role from the private sector. That is not the role and function of anything we might develop here. As a Government, to ensure long-term economic growth, we've fostered improvements in the economic conditions in Wales recently and we'll continue to support jobs and growth across Wales, investing in infrastructure business skills. We have worked hard, I think, to address the need for businesses to access finance to help them invest and grow. Of course, we've got all the schemes that we've developed.

There were some very interesting points made by Rhun about all the funds coming together, how they should be focused, and how they could be utilised in the future. These funds represented a direct response and provided specific solutions to key sectors of the business economy in Wales. I am also interested, I have to say, Rhun, and I will make a point here, that you indicated it had been Plaid policy since 2009. Well, it wasn't a Labour Minister who was responsible for Finance Wales between 2009 and 2011. In fact, at the end of the day, the person who has, as Minister, decided to shine a light on Finance Wales is actually a Labour Government Minister here, who thought it was very important to be able to do so in light of the issues that were raised with me. I give way.

Nawr, wrth ymateb i'r cynnig hwn gan y Ceidwadwyr heddiw, rwy'n meddwl y gallwn i gyd gytuno yn y Siambr ar bwysigrwydd mynediad at gyllid i fusnesau bach a chanolig, ac rwy'n credu, fel y nododd Paul, fod hon yn broblem go iawn pan fyddwch yn ceisio cael y busnesau bach hynny i sicrhau eu bod yn cael mynediad priodol. Mae angen i ni hefyd gydnabod bod yn rhaid i ni weithio'n agos gyda'r sector preifat, a'n bod yn helpu busnesau i sicrhau manteision gwirioneddol a pharhaol i economi Cymru. Nid banc y wladwriaeth fydd hwn sy'n mynd i ysgwyddo'r rôl gan y sector preifat. Nid dyna rôl a swyddogaeth unrhyw beth y gallem ddatblygu yma. Fel Llywodraeth, er mwyn sicrhau twf economaidd hirdymor, rydym wedi cymell gwelliannau yn yr amodau economaidd yng Nghymru yn ddiweddar, a byddwn yn parhau i gefnogi swyddi a thwf ar draws Cymru, gan fuddsoddi yn y seilwaith a sgiliau busnes. Rydym wedi gweithio'n galed, rwy'n meddwl, i fynd i'r afael â'r angen i fusnesau gael gafael ar gyllid i'w helpu i fuddsoddi a thyfu. Wrth gwrs, mae gennym yr holl gynlluniau rydym wedi datblygu.

Cafwyd rhai pwyntiau diddorol iawn gan Rhun am yr holl gronfeydd yn dod at ei gilydd, sut y dylent gael ffocws, a sut y gellid eu defnyddio yn y dyfodol. Roedd y cronfeydd hyn yn ymateb uniongyrchol ac yn darparu atebion penodol i sectorau allweddol o'r economi fusnes yng Nghymru. Mae gennyf ddiddordeb hefyd, rhaid i mi ddweud, Rhun, ac rwyf am wneud pwynt yn y fan hon, eich bod wedi dweud mai dyma yw polisi Plaid Cymru wedi bod ers 2009. Wel, nid Gweinidog Llafur oedd yn gyfrifol am Cyllid Cymru rhwng 2009 a 2011. Yn wir, yn y pen draw, mae'r person a benderfynodd edrych yn fanylach, fel Gweinidog, ar Cyllid Cymru yn Weinidog yn y Llywodraeth Lafur yma, a gredai ei bod yn bwysig iawn i allu gwneud hynny yng ngoleuni'r materion y tynnwyd fy sylw atynt. Rwy'n ildio.

16:36 **Rhun ap Iorwerth** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Just on a point of clarity, the point that I made very clearly was that we had made the suggestion that it would be beneficial for the Welsh economy to have a development bank for Welsh business, and that suggestion was raised by Plaid Cymru in 2009 in response to the financial crash.

Ar bwynt o eglurder yn unig, y pwynt a wneuthum yn glir iawn oedd mai ni a awgrymodd y byddai o fudd i economi Cymru gael banc datblygu i fusnesau yng Nghymru, a chrybwyllwyd yr awgrym hwnnw gan Blaid Cymru yn 2009 mewn ymateb i'r cwmp ariannol.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:36 **Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I think I understood the point you made in the first place, and I think what I said dealt with some of the issues around it.

Rwy'n credu fy mod wedi deall y pwynt a wnaethoch yn y lle cyntaf, ac rwy'n meddwl bod yr hyn a ddywedais yn ymdrin â rhai o'r materion sydd ynghlwm wrth hynny.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)



The 'Access to Finance' review carried out by Professor Dylan Jones-Evans resulted in a first report published in June 2013, which focused on the role of the banks, and a second in November 2013, which focused on alternative lending sources and the role of Finance Wales. In terms of the problems faced by SMEs in accessing funding, the professor's research has analysed data that suggests the funding gap is £500 million. I think that is a fair estimate and I think there is an element of consensus across the Chamber. The research also shows that the areas where the biggest problems are the micros and the very small SMEs. We have seen the banks continue to lend to companies that are slightly larger, but it has been those companies that have found it difficult to expand their businesses. Of course, they are the backbone, in many ways, of the Welsh economy and they have had these particular problems. The problems are usually linked to collateral and affordability issues and I think these are big issues for us to actually address.

So, when I appointed Professor Dylan Jones-Evans to lead a task and finish group in June of last year, to produce a feasibility study on it, it was to look at options, recommendations and to have discussions. That work has finished. We've had contributions from expert members and of course both committees have now looked at it. Of course, the prime aspiration of this is to improve the level of support to SMEs and to actually just get through the hoop and decide how we're going to take these forward.

But, I have to say, in terms of Finance Wales, as Julie Morgan and Eluned Parrott said, we don't want to throw babies out with the bathwater. We have extremely good personnel within those institutions who work very hard. I always have to remember, as Minister, I set their remit. In many ways, the buck stops with me, because I wanted to look at what their remit was, and I'm now going to look at what their remit is in the future. I would reiterate, in terms of Finance Wales, they have taken us forward, but the world has changed. We've had the banking crisis; we've had difficulties. So, that's why we have to make this further step.

A key principle of the development bank will of course be not to displace the private sector, because we must successfully engage with them. We've been working with NatWest bank and Finance Wales through Business Wales to look at co-operative solutions to helping businesses. That pilot, for me, represents an immediate response to businesses, who will be helped to understand the reasons they've been declined and often an opportunity to identify alternative finance solutions. I think that is also quite important. I think it's very important that you look at the 'Lending Ready' review, undertaken by Robert Lloyd Griffiths. He sought ways to better align Welsh Government non-financial advisory support for SMEs to support effective answers to solutions.

Arweiniodd yr 'Adolygiad o'r Cyllid sydd ar gael i Fusnesau yng Nghymru' a gynhaliwyd gan yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans at gyhoeddi adroddiad cyntaf ym mis Mehefin 2013 a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar rôl y banciau, ac ail adroddiad ym mis Tachwedd 2013, a oedd yn canolbwyntio ar ffynonellau benthyca amgen a rôl Cyllid Cymru. O ran y problemau a wynebwr gan fusnesau bach a chanolig i ddod o hyd i gyllid, mae ymchwil yr athro wedi dadansoddi data sy'n awgrymu bod y bwlch cyllido yn £500 miliwn. Credaf fod hwn yn amcangyfrif teg ac rwy'n credu bod elfen o gonsensws ar draws y Siambr. Mae'r ymchwil hefyd yn dangos mai'r meysydd lle y ceir y problemau mwyaf yw microfusnesau a BbaCh bychan iawn. Rydym wedi gweld y banciau yn parhau i roi benthyg i gwmnïau sydd ychydig yn fwy, ond y cwmnïau hynny sydd wedi ei chael yn anodd ehangu eu busnesau. Wrth gwrs, y rhain yw asgwrn cefn economi Cymru mewn sawl ffordd ac maent wedi cael y problemau penodol hyn. Mae'r problemau fel arfer yn gysylltiedig â materion yn ymwneud â sicrydd cyfochrog a fforddiadwyedd ac rwy'n meddwl bod y rhain yn faterion mawr i ni fynd i'r afael â hwy mewn gwirionedd.

Felly, pan benodais yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans i arwain grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ym mis Mehefin y llynedd, i lunio astudiaeth ddichonoldeb arno, roedd i fod i edrych ar ddewisiadau ac argymhellion, ac i gael trafodaethau. Mae'r gwaith hwnnw wedi dod i ben. Rydym wedi cael cyfraniadau gan aelodau arbenigol ac wrth gwrs mae'r ddau bwyllgor wedi edrych arno bellach. Wrth gwrs, prif amcan hyn yw gwella lefel y cymorth i fusnesau bach a chanolig ac yn syml, gwneud yr hyn sy'n ofynnol a phenderfynu sut rydym yn mynd i fwrw ymlaen â'r rhain.

Ond rhaid i mi ddweud, o ran Cyllid Cymru, fel y dywedodd Julie Morgan ac Eluned Parrott, nid ydym am luchio'r babi allan gyda'r dŵr. Mae gennym bersonél arbennig o dda yn y sefydliadau hynny sy'n gweithio'n galed iawn. Rhaid i mi gofio bob amser, fel Gweinidog, mai fi sy'n gosod eu cylch gwaith. Mewn sawl ffordd, fy nghyfrifoldeb i yw hyn yn y pen draw, am fy mod eisiau edrych ar beth oedd eu cylch gwaith, ac rwy'n awr yn mynd i edrych ar beth yw eu cylch gwaith yn y dyfodol. Byddwn yn ailadrodd, o ran Cyllid Cymru, eu bod wedi ein symud ymlaen, ond mae'r byd wedi newid. Rydym wedi cael yr argyfwng bancio; rydym wedi cael anawsterau. Felly, dyna pam y mae'n rhaid i ni fynd gam ymhellach ar hyn.

Un o egwyddorion allweddol y banc datblygu, wrth gwrs, fydd peidio â disodli'r sector preifat, gan fod rhaid i ni ymgysylltu'n llwyddiannus â hwy. Rydym wedi bod yn gweithio gyda banc y NatWest a Cyllid Cymru drwy Busnes Cymru i edrych ar atebion cydweithredol ar gyfer helpu busnesau. I mi, mae'r cynllun peilot hwnnw'n ymateb uniongyrchol i helpu busnesau i ddeall y rhesymau pam y maent wedi cael eu gwrthod ac yn aml yn gyfle i nodi atebion ariannu amgen. Credaf fod hynny'n eithaf pwysig hefyd. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn i chi edrych ar adolygiad 'Parod i Fenthyca', a gynhaliwyd gan Robert Lloyd Griffiths. Chwilai am ffyrdd o sicrhau bod cymorth ymgynghorol anariannol Llywodraeth Cymru ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig yn cydweddu'n well er mwyn cefnogi atebion effeithiol.

So, we are taking this particular work forward. I did pick up on some of the points that Members did raise with me, particularly about looking at staff morale, the steps that need to be taken and the fact that we've got to take these steps very positively and be alert to all the problems—where we are in terms of how we form this bank. But, I'm very hopeful now, in the course of the next few weeks, that I will be able to put pen to paper and indicate how we are going to go forward with the implementation of the development bank. I think it's very important that we recognise that Finance Wales has done a job, a job for its time, and the Finance Committee were quite clear in its report on Finance Wales on what they found. Also, in terms of Finance Wales, when people have talked in this debate about scrutiny—I think it was Mohammad Asghar—I accepted the recommendations of the Finance Committee's report and also suggested that Finance Wales should be subject to scrutiny by an appropriate committee of the Assembly every year, because I thought that would be helpful in terms of having more transparency in the process.

So, I think everybody has had their comments to make. This is not an easy area, because we will be changing Finance Wales, but we have to change it in the appropriate manner, taking every decision appropriately, recognising what we're doing, because there's no point in changing anything unless we can do something better. So, on that note, I'd like to thank Members very much for their contributions across the piece, but remember, it doesn't help to run down Finance Wales, because in the rest of the world, I have to say, they regard it as a success.

Felly, rydym yn symud y gwaith hwn yn ei flaen. Nodais rai o'r pwyntiau a grybwyllodd yr Aelodau, yn enwedig o ran edrych ar forâl staff, y camau sydd angen eu cymryd a'r ffaith fod yn rhaid i ni roi'r camau ar waith yn gadarnhaol iawn a bod yn effro i'r holl broblemau—ble rydym o ran y ffordd yr awn ati i ffurfio'r banc. Ond rwy'n obeithiol iawn yn awr y gallaf nodi'n ysgrifenedig dros yr ychydig wythnosau nesaf sut rydym yn mynd i symud ymlaen ar weithredu'r banc datblygu. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig iawn i ni gydnabod bod Cyllid Cymru wedi gwneud gwaith, gwaith yn ei amser, ac roedd y Pwyllgor Cyllid yn glir yn eu hadroddiad ar Cyllid Cymru ynglŷn â'r hyn a welsant. Hefyd, o ran Cyllid Cymru, pan oedd pobl yn sôn am graffu yn y ddatl hon—credaf mai Mohammad Asghar a wnaeth—derbyniais argymhellion adroddiad y Pwyllgor Cyllid ac awgrymais hefyd y dylai Cyllid Cymru fod yn destun craffu gan bwyllgor priodol o'r Cynulliad bob blwyddyn, gan fy mod yn meddwl y byddai hynny o gymorth i sicrhau mwy o dryloywder yn y broses.

Felly, rwy'n meddwl bod gan bawb eu sylwadau i'w gwneud. Nid yw hwn yn faes hawdd, oherwydd byddwn yn newid Cyllid Cymru, ond mae'n rhaid ei newid yn y modd priodol, gan wneud pob penderfyniad yn briodol, a chydabod yr hyn rydym yn ei wneud, oherwydd nid oes diben newid dim oni allwn wneud rhywbeth yn well. Felly, ar y nodyn hwnnw, hoffwn ddiolch yn fawr iawn i'r Aelodau am eu holl gyfraniadau, ond cofiwch, nid yw'n helpu i ladd ar Cyllid Cymru, oherwydd yng ngweddill y byd, rhaid i mi ddweud, maent yn ei ystyried yn llwyddiant.

16:41 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Galwaf ar Suzy Davies i ymateb i'r ddatl.

I call on Suzy Davies to reply to the debate.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

16:41 **Suzy Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

A big thank you to everyone who has taken part in the debate today. I think it's been about two central things, really: firstly, the fact that small and medium-sized enterprises make up about 98 per cent or 99 per cent of our employers, but being small and medium-sized enterprises does make the susceptible to big economic trends. The second point is: how can Welsh Government, supported by this Assembly, help them remain or develop into sustainable businesses that can provide jobs and economic benefits locally, as well as being part of the fabric of our national economy, and even our international economy? I think our conclusion as Welsh Conservatives was that Finance Wales, as it currently operates, was not really best equipped to do the latter in order to support SMEs to ride through risks or, indeed, capitalise on the opportunities of those economic trends. I think, Minister, you felt broadly the same on that, so thank you for appointing Dylan Jones-Evans to advise you on the reform of Finance Wales. I'm not entirely sure that you completely updated us on progress, as Paul Davies asked, so we look forward to the publication of the information that you mentioned in your response.

Diolch yn fawr i bawb sydd wedi cymryd rhan yn y ddatl heddiw. Rwy'n credu ei fod wedi ymwneud â dau beth canolog, mewn gwirionedd: yn gyntaf, y ffaith mai busnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yw tua 98 y cant neu 99 y cant o'n cyflogwyr, ond mae bod yn fusnesau bach a chanolig eu maint yn eu gwneud yn agored i dueddiadau economaidd mawr. Yr ail bwynt yw: sut y gall Llywodraeth Cymru, gyda chefnogaeth y Cynulliad hwn, eu helpu i barhau neu ddatblygu i fod yn fusnesau cynaliadwy a all ddarparu swyddi a manteision economaidd yn lleol, yn ogystal â bod yn rhan o wead ein heconomi genedlaethol, a hyd yn oed ein heconomi ryngwladol? Rwy'n meddwl mai ein casgliad fel Ceidwadwyr Cymreig oedd nad yw Cyllid Cymru, fel y mae'n gweithredu ar hyn o bryd, yn y sefyllfa orau i wneud yr olaf er mwyn cefnogi busnesau bach a chanolig i fwrw drwy risgiau neu'n wir i fanteisio ar y cyfleoedd sy'n codi o'r tueddiadau economaidd hynny. Rwy'n meddwl, Weinidog, eich bod yn teimlo'r un fath ynghylch hynny ar y cyfan, felly diolch i chi am benodi Dylan Jones-Evans i'ch cynghori ar ddiwygio Cyllid Cymru. Nid wyf yn hollol siŵr eich bod wedi rhoi'r diweddaraf yn llawn i ni ar y cynnydd, fel y gofynnodd Paul Davies, felly edrychwn ymlaen at gyhoeddi'r wybodaeth a grybwyllwyd gennych yn eich ymateb.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I think the Assembly should acknowledge that Finance Wales has invested more in Welsh business in this particular year, but for me questions still remain. The UK economy is steadily improving and Wales, of course, should be open to the opportunities that that presents, especially when European countries are, perhaps, less stable financially at the moment, and I think it's fair to say that it's comparatively easier to find and be confident in either giving birth to businesses or expanding businesses in the current climate. But, my question is this, then: where was Finance Wales in times of recession, when businesses, viable businesses, were squeaking pretty close to closure? I remember that Welsh Government actually invested quite a lot of time and money in ProAct and ReAct in order to support jobs, but there was no equivalent support from Finance Wales to support the creators of those jobs, private sector jobs, when perhaps they could have been doing that. I think we should all accept that, if businesses can survive in hard times with a little investment and then fly when times are better, then that is an investment well made. Water the seeds in the times of drought and you should get a good crop.

Now, I think from what Nick Ramsay was saying—and I think Mohammad Asghar was saying something pretty similar—Finance Wales perhaps hasn't been the watering can it could have been. Nick drew our attention to the fact that Finance Wales's interest rates are on the high side, making them, perhaps, something of an expensive, but slightly limited in scope, fertiliser for growth and available only to those who know about it.

Julie Morgan, I must admit that I was slightly baffled by your contribution on this, because what you call 'negativity' we call 'scrutiny', and actually it's the job of opposition Members and backbenchers to scrutinise Government on this. The reason I was confused is because, in the same contribution, you said that you were looking forward to Finance Wales being the basis of the growth of a bank. So, either you want change, or you don't want change. Myself, I think we do need change, because I don't suppose Finance Wales should be proud of taking two years to offer a second-class deal, which is what Russell George was talking about. If there's confusion about Finance Wales, then let's talk about change and, actually, the consensus about the need for that has been something quite pleasant to hear in the Chamber today.

Rwy'n credu y dylai'r Cynulliad gydnabod bod Cyllid Cymru wedi buddsoddi mwy mewn busnes yng Nghymru yn y flwyddyn benodol hon, ond i mi, mae'r cwestiynau'r aros. Mae economi'r DU yn gwella'n raddol a dylai Cymru, wrth gwrs, fod yn agored i'r cyfleoedd y mae hynny'n eu creu, yn enwedig pan fo gwledydd Ewropeaidd, efallai, yn llai sefydlog yn ariannol ar hyn o bryd, ac rwy'n meddwl ei bod yn deg dweud ei bod yn gymharol haws dod o hyd i arian a bod yn hyderus ynghylch dechrau neu ehangu busnes yn yr hinsawdd bresennol. Ond fy nghwestiwn yw hwn: lle oedd Cyllid Cymru adeg y dirwasgiad, pan oedd busnesau, busnesau hyfyw, yn ei chael hi'n anodd ac yn agos at gau? Rwy'n cofio bod Llywodraeth Cymru wedi buddsoddi cryn dipyn o amser ac arian yn ProAct a ReAct er mwyn cynnal swyddi, ond nid oedd unrhyw gefnogaeth gyfatebol gan Cyllid Cymru i gefnogi'r rhai a fyddai'n creu'r swyddi, swyddi yn y sector preifat, pan allent fod wedi gwneud hynny o bosibl. Rwy'n meddwl y dylem i gyd dderbyn, os gall busnesau oroesi mewn cyfnodau anodd gydag ond ychydig o fuddsoddiad a chodi fry pan fydd pethau'n well, yna mae'n fuddsoddiad da. Dyfriwch yr hadau ar adegau o sychder a dylech gael cnwd da.

Nawr, o'r hyn a ddywedodd Nick Ramsay—ac rwy'n meddwl bod Mohammad Asghar yn dweud rhywbeth yn lled debyg—efallai nad yw Cyllid Cymru wedi bod yn gystal can dŵr ag y gallai fod wedi bod. Tynnodd Nick ein sylw at y ffaith fod cyfraddau llog Cyllid Cymru ar yr ochr uchel, gan eu gwneud, o bosibl, yn wrtaith braidd yn ddrud, ond braidd yn gyfyngedig o ran ei allu i sicrhau twf ac ond ar gael i'r rhai sy'n gwybod amdano'n unig.

Julie Morgan, rhaid i mi gyfaddef fy mod wedi cael fy nrysu braidd gan eich cyfraniad ar hyn, oherwydd yr hyn rydych chi'n ei alw'n 'negyddiaeth' yw'r hyn rydym ni'n ei alw'n 'graffu', ac mewn gwirionedd gwaith Aelodau'r gwrthbleidiau ac Aelodau'r meinciau cefn yw craffu ar y Llywodraeth yn hyn o beth. Yr hyn a wnaeth i mi ddrysu oedd eich bod wedi dweud yn yr un cyfraniad eich bod yn edrych ymlaen at weld Cyllid Cymru yn sail i dwf banc. Felly, naill ai rydych am newid, neu nid ydych am newid. Fy hun, rwy'n credu ein bod angen newid, oherwydd nid wyf yn tybio y dylai Cyllid Cymru fod yn falch ei fod wedi cymryd dwy flynedd i gynnig cytundeb eilradd, sef yr hyn y soniai Russell George amdano. Os oes dryswch ynghylch Cyllid Cymru, yna gadewch i ni siarad am y newid ac mewn gwirionedd, mae'r consensws ynglŷn â'r angen am hynny wedi bod yn rhywbeth eithaf dymunol i'w glywed yn y Siambr heddiw.

Rhun, you spoke about the funding gap and I think that this funding gap is exactly where Finance Wales, or whatever its new reiteration is, should be working, really, where there is market failure, but also for smaller businesses who perhaps only need small loans in order to either survive or develop. I think this is the point Paul Davies was making. Eluned Parrott, you said that Finance Wales at some points was working in the dark. That might have been why there'd been an element of mission slip on this. I have some sympathy with Finance Wales on this one because, from time to time, I struggle to get any figures on spending decisions made by the Minister's department. But Finance Wales has done itself no favours in this respect either. Both the Federation of Small Businesses, and I think it was Mohammad, actually, who pointed it out— There has been a lack of transparency and accountability leading to difficulties in us scrutinising Finance Wales's performance. I think that in itself has contributed to the uncertainty that you spoke about.

Small businesses need stable conditions to plan and, where those conditions don't exist, they need to be sure of the sources of support they have to mitigate, rather than contribute to, uncertainty. It is certainly worth it, isn't it, if that time is taken. We heard from Russell about the 1,000 fastest-growing SMEs generating, what was it, £158 billion in revenue in one year? That's more than 10 times the budget of this Assembly. So, I have to raise an eyebrow at Julie Morgan's suggestion that the FSB members don't know about Finance Wales because intermediaries are involved. Businesses looking for growth know exactly who they are dealing with and I'm pretty confident that those 1,000 businesses will have known precisely which UK Government initiatives helped them achieve their ambitions.

To conclude, Dirprwy Lywydd, I commend Invest Wales to this Assembly. We heard quite a lot of detail about it today, which time prevents me from repeating, but that regional lending idea, that sort of receptive and responsive body that can really have a relationship with local businesses, is pretty important. These are relationships that contribute to social cohesion just as much as to the viability of individual businesses. Those face-to-face conversations about small-scale lending—. Because, Paul Davies, you were right on this—small-scale lending has a bigger effect in small businesses than you might expect. Their leverage value is quite considerable and, of course, if we can help small businesses achieve their great ambitions that's good for them, it's good for the locality and it's certainly good for our economy. So, in this spirit of consensus, I'm more than happy to recommend that all parties' views on this are listened to. You're right, Minister: it is a different world, and it is time to move forward. Thank you.

Rhun, rydych yn siarad am y bwlch cyllido a chredaf mai yn y bwlch cyllido hwn yw lle y dylai Cyllid Cymru, neu beth bynnag fydd ei ffurf newydd, fod yn gweithio mewn gwirionedd, lle y ceir methiant yn y farchnad, a hefyd ar gyfer busnesau llai sydd ond angen benthyciadau bach efallai er mwyn goroesi neu ddatblygu. Rwy'n credu mai dyma'r pwynt roedd Paul Davies yn ei wneud. Eluned Parrott, dywedasoch fod Cyllid Cymru ar rai pwyntiau yn gweithio yn y tywyllwch. Efallai mai dyna pam y gallai fod yna elfen o fethu cyflawni cenhadaeth yn hyn o beth. Mae gennyf rywffaint o gydymdeimlad gyda Cyllid Cymru ar hyn oherwydd, o bryd i'w gilydd, rwy'n ei chael yn anodd cael unrhyw ffigurau ar benderfyniadau gwariant a wnaed gan adran y Gweinidog. Ond nid yw Cyllid Cymru wedi gwneud pethau'n haws iddo'i hun yn hyn o beth chwaith. Nododd y Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach, a Mohammad, rwy'n meddwl—. Gwelwyd diffyg tryloywder ac atebolrwydd a'i gwnaeth yn anodd i ni graffu ar berfformiad Cyllid Cymru. Credaf fod hynny ynddo'i hun wedi cyfrannu at yr ansicrwydd y sonioch amdano.

Mae busnesau bach angen amodau sefydlog i gynllunio, a lle nad yw'r amodau hynny'n bodoli, mae angen iddynt fod yn sicr o'r ffynonellau cefnogaeth sydd ganddynt i liniaru'r ansicrwydd, yn hytrach na chyfrannu ato. Mae'n sicr yn werth treulio amser ar hyn, onid yw. Clywsom gan Russell fod y 1,000 o fusnesau bach a chanolig sy'n tyfu gyflymaf yn cynhyrchu, beth oedd y ffigur, £158 biliwn o refeniw mewn un flwyddyn? Mae hynny'n fwy na 10 gwaith cyllideb y Cynulliad hwn. Felly, rhaid i mi godi ael ar awgrym Julie Morgan nad oedd aelodau'r Ffederasiwn Busnesau Bach yn gwybod am Cyllid Cymru am fod cyfryngwyr yn rhan o'r broses. Mae busnesau sy'n ceisio tyfu yn gwybod yn union â phwy y maent yn ymwneud ac rwy'n eithaf hyderus y byddai'r 1,000 o fusnesau'n gwybod yn union pa gynlluniau Llywodraeth y DU a'u cynorthwyodd i gyflawni eu huchelgeisiau.

I gloi, Ddirprwy Lywydd, cymeradwyaf Buddsoddi Cymru i'r Cynulliad hwn. Clywsom gryn dipyn o fanylion am y peth heddiw, ac mae amser yn fy rhwystro rhag eu hailadrodd, ond mae'r syniad o fenthyca rhanbarthol, y math hwnnw o gorff derbyngar ac ymatebol a all gael perthynas go iawn gyda busnesau lleol, yn bwysig iawn. Dyma gysylltiadau sy'n cyfrannu at gydlyniant cymdeithasol lawn cymaint ag at hyfywedd busnesau unigol. Y sgrysiâu wyneb yn wyneb am fenthyca ar raddfa fach—. Oherwydd, Paul Davies, roeddech yn iawn ar hyn—mae benthycia ar raddfa fach yn cael effaith fwy ar fusnesau bach nag y byddech yn ei ddisgwyl. Mae eu gwerth llawn yn eithaf sylweddol ac wrth gwrs, os gallwn helpu busnesau bach i gyflawni eu huchelgeisiau gwych mae hynny'n dda iddynt, mae'n dda i'r ardal ac mae'n sicr yn dda i'n heconomi. Felly, yn yr ysbryd hwn o gonsensws, rwy'n fwy na hapus i argymhell fod barn pob plaid ar hyn yn cael ei chlywed. Rydych yn llygad eich lle, Weinidog: mae'n fyd gwahanol, ac mae'n bryd symud ymlaen. Diolch yn fawr.

16:48

## **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Y cwestiwn yw: a ddylid derbyn y cynnig heb ei ddiwygio? A oes unrhyw wrthwynebiad? [Gwrthwynebiad.] Gohiriaf y bleidlais ar yr eitem hon tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.

*Gohiriwyd y pleidleisio tan y cyfnod pleidleisio.*

The proposal is to agree the motion without amendment. Does any Member object? [Objection.] I will defer voting under this item until voting time.

*Voting deferred until voting time.*

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:48

## 7. Cyfnod Pleidleisio

## 7. Voting Time

Y Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

### Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Voting time now follows. Before I conduct the vote, are there three Members who wish for the bell to be rung? There are not. So, we will vote on the Welsh Conservatives debate. I call for a vote on the motion tabled in the name of Paul Davies. If the proposal is not agreed we will vote on the amendments tabled to the motion. Open the vote. Close the vote. There voted in favour nine. There voted against 39. Therefore, the motion without amendment is not agreed and we will now vote on the amendments.

Mae'r cyfnod pleidleisio yn dilyn yn awr. Cyn i mi gynnal y bleidlais, a oes tri Aelod sy'n dymuno i'r gloch gael ei chanu? Nac oes. Felly, pleidleiswn ar ddadl y Ceidwadwyr Cymreig. Galwaf am bleidlais ar y cynnig a gyflwynwyd yn enw Paul Davies. Os na fydd y cynnig yn cael ei dderbyn, byddwn yn pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau a gyflwynwyd i'r cynnig. Agorwch y bleidlais. Caewch y bleidlais. Pleidleisiodd 9 o blaid. Pleidleisiodd 39 yn erbyn. Felly, nid yw'r cynnig heb ei ddiwygio yn cael ei dderbyn, a byddwn yn awr yn pleidleisio ar y gwelliannau.

*Gwrthodwyd y cynnig: O blaid 9, Yn erbyn 39, Ymatal 0.*

*Motion not agreed: For 9, Against 39, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnig NDM5765](#)

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5765](#)

16:49

### Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

We move straight to amendment 2, then, and I call for a vote on amendment 2 tabled in the name of Elin Jones. Open the vote. Close the vote. There voted in favour 39. There voted against nine. Therefore, amendment 2 is agreed.

Symudwn yn syth at welliant 2 felly, a galwaf am bleidlais ar welliant 2 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Elin Jones. Agorwch y bleidlais. Caewch y bleidlais. Pleidleisiodd 39 o blaid. Pleidleisiodd 9 yn erbyn. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 2.

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 39, Yn erbyn 9, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment agreed: For 39, Against 9, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 2 i gynnig NDM5765](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 2 to motion NDM5765](#)

16:49

### Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I call for a vote on amendment 3 tabled in the name of Elin Jones. Open the vote. Close the vote. There voted in favour 39. There voted against 9. Therefore, amendment 3 is agreed.

Galwaf am bleidlais ar welliant 3 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Elin Jones. Agorwch y bleidlais. Caewch y bleidlais. Pleidleisiodd 39 o blaid. Pleidleisiodd 9 yn erbyn. Felly, derbynnir gwelliant 3.

*Derbyniwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 39, Yn erbyn 9, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment agreed: For 39, Against 9, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 3 i gynnig NDM5765](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 3 to motion NDM5765](#)

16:49

### Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I call for a vote on amendment 4 tabled in the name of Aled Roberts. Open the vote. Close the vote. There voted in favour 4. There voted against 44. Therefore, amendment 4—lots of fours—is not agreed.

Galwaf am bleidlais ar welliant 4 a gyflwynwyd yn enw Aled Roberts. Agorwch y bleidlais. Caewch y bleidlais. Pleidleisiodd 4 o blaid. Pleidleisiodd 44 yn erbyn. Felly, nid yw gwelliant 4—llawer o bedwarau—wedi'i dderbyn.

*Gwrthodwyd y gwelliant: O blaid 4, Yn erbyn 44, Ymatal 0.*

*Amendment not agreed: For 4, Against 44, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar welliant 4 i gynnig NDM5765](#)

[Result of the vote on amendment 4 to motion NDM5765](#)

16:50

### Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer [Bywgraffiad Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

I now call for a vote on the motion as amended.

Galwaf yn awr am bleidlais ar y cynnig wedi'i ddiwygio.

Cynnig NDM5765 fel y'i diwygiwyd:

Motion NDM5765 as amended:

Cynnig bod Cynulliad Cenedlaethol Cymru:

To propose that the National Assembly for Wales:

1. Yn nodi nad yw Cyllid Cymru yn diwallu yn llawn anghenion busnesau bach ledled Cymru a bod mynediad at gyllid yn parhau i fod yn broblem i lawer o fusnesau bach a chanolig;

2. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i sefydlu Banc Datblygu i Gymru, fel y cydnabyddir yn yr adroddiad a gyhoeddwyd gan yr Athro Dylan Jones-Evans; a

3. Yn galw ar Lywodraeth Cymru i ystyried rhinweddau'r cynigion a amlinellir yn 'Gweledigaeth ar gyfer Buddsoddi yng Nghymru: Buddsoddi Cymru' a, lle y bo'n briodol, ystyried eu hymgorffori yn y gefnogaeth y mae Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei rhoi i fusnesau bach a chanolig yng Nghymru.

1. Notes that Finance Wales does not fully meet the needs of small businesses across Wales and that access to finance is still a problem for many SMEs;

2. Calls on the Welsh Government to establish a Welsh Development Bank, as recognised in the report published by Professor Dylan Jones-Evans; and

3. Calls on the Welsh Government to consider the merits of the proposals outlined in 'A Vision for Welsh Investment: Invest Wales' and, where appropriate, consider incorporating them into Welsh Government support for SMEs in Wales.

16:50 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Open the vote. Close the vote. There voted in favour 44. There voted against 4. Therefore, the motion as amended is agreed.

Agorwch y bleidlais. Caewch y bleidlais. Pleidleisiodd 44 o blaid. Pleidleisiodd 4 yn erbyn. Felly, caiff y cynnig fel y'i diwygiwyd ei dderbyn.

*Derbyniwyd cynnig NDM5765 fel y'i diwygiwyd: O blaid 44, Yn erbyn 4, Ymatal 0.*

*Motion NDM5765 as amended agreed: For 44, Against 4, Abstain 0.*

[Canlyniad y bleidlais ar gynnig NDM5765 fel y'i diwygiwyd](#)

[Result of the vote on motion NDM5765 as amended](#)

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:50 **Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I would ask those Members who are leaving the Chamber to do so quickly and quietly.

Gofynnaf i'r Aelodau sy'n gadael y Siambr wneud hynny'n gyflym ac yn dawel.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:51 **8. Dadl Fer: Ysgogi'r Economi yng Ngorllewin Cymru**

**Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Eitem 8 yw'r ddadl fer. Galwaf ar Keith Davies i siarad am y pwnc a ddewiswyd ganddo.

**8. Short Debate: Stimulating the Economy in West Wales**

Item 8 is the short debate. I call on Keith Davies to speak on the topic he has chosen.

**Y** [Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

16:51 **Keith Davies** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. Rwyf wedi caniatáu i Joyce Watson a Bill Powell gyfrannu i'r ddadl y prynhawn yma.

Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. I have given Joyce Watson and Bill Powell an opportunity to contribute to this debate this afternoon.

[Senedd.tv](#)  
[Fideo Video](#)

Drwy'r system dadl fer mae cydnabod llais cryf Aelodau meinciau cefn, gan roi cerbyd i ni roi materion gwahanol ar yr agenda a chodi pryderon penodol etholwyr yn fwy eang. Mae'n gyfle estynedig heno i drafod pwnc o bwysigrwydd pendant i'r holl bobl sy'n byw ac/neu'n gweithio yn y gorllewin.

Through the short debate system we acknowledge the strong voice of backbench Members, giving us a vehicle to put different matters on the agenda and to raise specific concerns of constituents more widely. It's an extended opportunity tonight to discuss a subject of definite importance to all of those people who live and/or work in west Wales.

Business rates are by far the most common theme local businesses raise with me in conversations. For SMEs and microbusinesses, they are a big outgoing that can be pivotal to success or otherwise, as has been mentioned already this afternoon. The Open for Business scheme, the extension of the Wales retail relief scheme, and the small business rate relief scheme, really are a relief to many small and independent Llanelli businesses who are struggling to make their business a success in a very competitive market dominated by large players and the internet.

It's very welcome news on the devolution of business rates to the Welsh Government. We can now put under way a system that works for the Welsh economy. I would urge the Minister to pay particular attention to the west Wales economy. With its high reliance on SMEs and microbusinesses, local market traders and the tourism economy, it is a very different kettle of fish to other, more urban, areas of Wales. I note in particular the business rates task and finish group and ask how it has informed discussions with the UK Government.

Coming out of very tough economic times, start-up loans are a precious assistance tool: help for those with creative ideas and business drive, but lacking the full capital needed. Eight thousand, three hundred and twenty-five new enterprises and over 15,000 jobs have been created since its establishment. It pushes our entrepreneurship agenda, creates variation across town centres and diversifies the talent of the Welsh workforce, producing role models and a deviation from the old way of doing business.

A main point for me today is local retail strategies, ideally stemming from the city region boards, leading strategically to create town centres and retail outlets that complement rather than compete with each other, especially down west, where we are dependent on loyal customers to shop local. To do this, we need to develop each area's offer by looking critically, yet strategically, on what the draw is. How can we expand that offer and how can we use the current transport system, shopping habits and geographical factors to make it as easy as possible?

I very much welcome the city region idea envisaged and implemented by the Minister. That's why I'm calling for increased partnership working between the Welsh Government and local authorities in west Wales to develop bespoke local retail strategies.

Ardrethi busnes yw'r thema fwyaf cyffredin o bell ffordd y bydd busnesau lleol yn ei chrybwyll wrthyf mewn sgysiau. I fusnesau bach a chanolig a microfusnesau, maent yn wariant mawr a all fod yn ganolog i lwyddiant neu fel arall, fel y crybwyllwyd eisoes y prynhawn yma. Mae Cynllun Ar Agor am Fusnes, ymestyn cynllun rhyddhad manwerthu Cymru, a'r cynllun rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach, yn rhyddhad go iawn i lawer o fusnesau bach ac annibynnol Llanelli sy'n cael trafferth i sicrhau bod eu busnesau yn llwyddo mewn marchnad gystadleuol iawn sy'n cael ei dominyddu gan y cwmnïau mawr a'r rhyngwyd.

Mae'r newyddion am ddatganoli ardrethi busnes i Lywodraeth Cymru i'w groesawu'n fawr. Gallwn yn awr roi system ar waith sy'n gweithio dros economi Cymru. Byddwn yn annog y Gweinidog i roi sylw arbennig i economi gorllewin Cymru. Gyda'i dibyniaeth uchel ar fusnesau bach a chanolig a microfusnesau, masnachwyr marchnad lleol a'r economi dwristiaeth, mae'n ardal wahanol iawn i ardaloedd eraill mwy trefol yng Nghymru. Nodaf yn arbennig y grŵp gorchwyl a gorffen ar ardrethi busnes a gofyn sut y mae wedi llywio trafodaethau gyda Llywodraeth y DU.

Wrth ddod allan o gyfnod economaidd anodd iawn, mae benthyciadau i gychwyn busnes yn gymorth gwerthfawr: mae'n help i rai sydd â syniadau creadigol ac ysgogiad busnes, ond heb y cyfalaf llawn sydd ei angen. Crëwyd 8,325 o fentrau newydd a thros 15,000 o swyddi ers sefydlu'r cynllun. Mae'n gwthio ein hagenda entrepreneuriaeth yn ei blaen, yn creu amrywiaeth ar draws canol trefi ac yn arallgyfeirio talent y gweithlu yng Nghymru, gan gynhyrchu modelau rôl a gwyro oddi wrth yr hen ffordd o wneud busnes.

Un prif bwynt i mi heddiw yw strategaethau manwerthu lleol, sy'n deillio, yn ddelfrydol, o fyrdau'r dinas-ranbarthau, gan arwain yn strategol at greu canol trefi a mannau manwerthu sy'n ategu ei gilydd yn hytrach na chystadlu â'i gilydd, yn enwedig yn y gorllewin, lle rydym yn dibynnu ar gwsmeriaid ffyddlon i siopa'n lleol. Er mwyn gwneud hyn, mae angen i ni ddatblygu cynnig pob ardal drwy edrych yn feirniadol, ac eto yn strategol, ar beth sydd gennym. Sut y gallwn ehangu'r cynnig a sut y gallwn ddefnyddio'r system drafnidiaeth bresennol, arferion siopa a ffactorau daearyddol i'w gwneud mor hawdd â phosibl?

Rwy'n croesawu'r syniad o ddinas-ranbarthau a ragwelwyd ac a weithredwyd gan y Gweinidog. Dyna pam rwy'n galw am fwy o weithio mewn partneriaeth rhwng Llywodraeth Cymru ac awdurdodau lleol yng ngorllewin Cymru i ddatblygu strategaethau manwerthu lleol pwrpasol.



European funding is another aspect that has been used to great effect in west Wales. Young people benefit hugely from the success of Jobs Growth Wales: 900 job opportunities have been created in Carmarthenshire under the latest figures. That's nearly 1,000 young people who are offered opportunities for better and faster jobs than they would otherwise have gotten in today's market. Swansea University's engineering department recently advertised around 60 jobs. They've received over £100 million from European funding sources—from the European Investment Bank and also from the European regional development fund—not only capitalising on research and development in west Wales, but growing the local economy and skills too. Today, the Confederation of British Industry has called on businesses to speak positively about EU membership. It is in our national interest. I know the Minister will have given plenty of thought to a concerted Welsh industry voice in light of the looming referendum. Again, I'm interested in the detail of that. The First Minister, in First Minister's questions this week, referred to businesses like Tata, who are rooted in the west with works at Llanelli and Port Talbot. We have to expand the debate and combine the voices of Government and industry to give a national campaign a strong regional voice.

No debate on the west Wales economy can go past without me taking the chance again to push the agenda for a creative industries zone in Carmarthenshire. I don't need to repeat what I've said about the S4C relocation and the companies we already have in Llanelli. I also congratulate Llangennech Junior School on winning BBC Songs of Praise School Choir of the Year on Sunday, adding further to our creative talent pool. But we must do more to create opportunities for young people to remain within their own communities and to return home to contribute to their home communities once they have studied. It is essential to maintain strong, viable and sustainable communities, which, in turn, protects and futureproofs our rural economies.

SMEs, as I've said already, are the backbone of the Welsh economy, with a much higher prevalence down west. The needs of these were at the top of our agenda in Whitland on Sunday, where Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire representatives got together and talked about SMEs being such a crucial part of keeping the economy going in west Wales.

Car-parking charges and their impact have been a topic when we've tried to reinvigorate town centres. The Enterprise and Business Committee recently looked at a report commissioned by the Minister for Communities and Tackling Poverty on car-parking charges. The key finding was the complexity of the issue, including journey times, disposable income and business activity, and the difficulty in separating the influence of charges from these factors. For instance, we can open up areas, in my opinion, where we can separate those issues, and open up areas previously developed for pedestrianisation for short stay parking. Convenience made the corner shop attractive in the past; convenient parking should spark life back into our town centres, too.

Mae cyllid Ewropeaidd yn elfen arall a ddefnyddiwyd yn effeithiol iawn yng ngorllewin Cymru. Mae pobl ifanc yn elwa'n aruthrol o lwyddiant Twf Swyddi Cymru: crëwyd 900 o gyfleoedd gwaith yn Sir Gaerfyrddin yn ôl y ffigurau diweddaraf. Dyna bron 1,000 o bobl ifanc sy'n cael cynnig cyfleoedd i gael swyddi gwell yn gyflymach nag y byddent wedi'u cael fel arall yn y farchnad heddiw. Yn ddiweddar, hysbysebodd adran beirianeg Prifysgol Abertawe tua 60 o swyddi. Maent wedi cael dros £100 miliwn o ffynonellau cyllid Ewropeaidd—o Fanc Buddsoddi Ewrop a hefyd o gronfa datblygu rhanbarthol Ewrop—gan fanteisio ar ymchwil a datblygu yng ngorllewin Cymru, a sicrhau twf yr economi a sgiliau lleol hefyd. Heddiw, mae Cydffederasiwn Diwydiant Prydain wedi galw ar fusnesau i siarad yn gadarnhaol ynglŷn â bod yn aelodau o'r UE. Mae o fudd i ni'n genedlaethol. Rwy'n gwybod y bydd y Gweinidog wedi rhoi llawer o sylw i lais cydunol diwydiant yng Nghymru yn sgil y refferendwm sydd ar y gorwel. Unwaith eto, mae gennyf ddiddordeb yn y manylion hynny. Cyfeiriodd y Prif Weinidog, mewn cwestiynau i'r Prif Weinidog yr wythnos hon, at fusnesau fel Tata, sydd wedi gwreiddio yn y gorllewin gyda gweithfeydd yn Llanelli a Phort Talbot. Mae'n rhaid i ni ehangu'r drafodaeth a chyfuno lleisiau Llywodraeth a'r diwydiant i roi llais rhanbarthol cryf i ymgyrch genedlaethol.

Ni allaf adael i unrhyw ddadl ar economi gorllewin Cymru fynd heibio heb achub ar y cyfle eto i wthio'r agenda i gael ardal diwydiannau creadigol yn Sir Gaerfyrddin. Nid oes angen i mi ailadrodd yr hyn rwyf wedi ei ddweud am adleoli S4C a'r cwmnïau sydd gennym yn barod yn Llanelli. Rwyf hefyd yn llongyfarch Ysgol Gynradd Llangennech ar ennill Côr Ysgol y Flwyddyn rhaglen Songs of Praise ar y BBC ddydd Sul, gan ychwanegu ymhellach at ein cronfa o dalent creadigol. Ond rhaid i ni wneud mwy i greu cyfleoedd i bobl ifanc aros yn eu cymunedau eu hunain a dychwelyd adref i gyfrannu at eu cymunedau eu hunain ar ôl iddynt gwblhau eu haddysg. Mae'n hanfodol er mwyn cynnal cymunedau cryf, hyfyw a chynaliadwy, a fydd, yn eu tro, yn diogelu ein heconomiâu gwledig ar gyfer y dyfodol.

Busnesau bach a chanolig, fel y dywedais eisoes, yw asgwrn cefn economi Cymru, gyda llawer mwy ohonynt i lawr yn y gorllewin. Roedd anghenion y rhain ar frig ein hagenda yn Hendy-gwyn ddydd Sul, lle y daeth cynrychiolwyr o Sir Gaerfyrddin a Sir Benfro at ei gilydd i siarad am ran hanfodol busnesau bach a chanolig yn cadw'r economi'n fyw yng ngorllewin Cymru.

Mae taliadau parcio a'u heffaith wedi bod yn bwnc trafod wrth i ni fynd ati i adfywio canol trefi. Yn ddiweddar, edrychodd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ar adroddiad a gomisiynwyd gan y Gweinidog Cymunedau a Threchu Tlodi ar daliadau parcio. Y canfyddiad allweddol oedd cymhlethdod y mater, gan gynnwys amseroedd teithio, incwm gwario a gweithgarwch busnes, a'r anhawster i wahanu dylanwad taliadau oddi wrth y ffactorau hyn. Er enghraifft, yn fy marn i, gallwn agor mannau lle y gallwn wahanu'r materion hynny, ac agor mannau a ddatblygwyd yn flaenorol i greu parthau cerddwyr ar gyfer parcio arhosiad byr. Roedd cyfleustra yn gwneud siop y gornel yn ddeniadol yn y gorffennol; dylai parcio cyfleus anadlu bywyd yn ôl i ganol ein trefi hefyd.

The business improvement district development is exciting, and I've been involved in the discussion meetings locally. There are academic studies produced on the success of Merthyr and Swansea. I don't have the time to delve fully into these findings, except to say that we must strive to incorporate the local business voice and learn lessons from elsewhere. But we must also depart where necessary. The BID model is, by definition, a local one, shaped by local business needs, and it must capture what's needed in particular areas instead of replicating best practice blindly.

Finally, the one-stop shops have played a key part in Business Wales's strategy of tailored support as part of an 11-strong network in Wales. My office has been in close contact with the Beacon Centre for Enterprise in Dafen, and I will be raising further points with the Minister on its success.

As far as west Wales is concerned, amongst our economic sectors, tourism plays a dominant role. Last week's tourism figures show Wales bucking the UK downward trend and instead hitting 10 million visitors—fantastic progress. I believe that Carmarthenshire's and Pembrokeshire's offers rival any in any part of Wales. You have the examples of Llanelly House, Ffos Las racecourse, Pembrey Country Park, Kidwelly Castle, the National Botanic Garden of Wales and so on. It is similar in Pembrokeshire. The outlook is optimistic. However, in terms of the challenges this brings, it's difficult to establish a year-round economy. We need to decide how we can support them at different times of the year.

On transport, it's interesting to see metro developments in south-east Wales. Obviously, in the south-west, our plans are for a bus network. Appreciating that each city region transport plan will react to local infrastructure and needs, I have questions over the resources available to the west by comparison. The Enterprise and Business Committee visited local authorities in the greater Manchester region to see how they use transport to integrate areas within that region. Its main focus was on jobs and growth, using infrastructure as a building block to support that. Lead authorities were able to take the lead and attract match funding, a model I believe can be used as an example in west Wales. We will be benefitting from electrification to Swansea, throwing up the need for travel times further west to be streamlined and integrated.

In the short debate I had last autumn, I suggested the idea of a cockle card in west Wales to mimic the Oyster Card of Transport for London, which the Enterprise and Business Committee will be visiting tomorrow. This also incorporates the idea of integrated ticketing for young people and part-time workers. Both are groups that rely heavily on public transport and both are opportunities to open up access to the workforce. I ask the Minister for an update on work here.

Mae datblygiad yr ardal gwella busnes yn gyffrous, ac rwyf wedi bod yn cymryd rhan yn y cyfarfodydd trafod yn lleol. Cynhyrchwyd astudiaethau academiaidd ar lwyddiant Merthyr Tudful ac Abertawe. Nid oes gennyf amser i fanylu'n llawn ar y canfyddiadau hyn, heblaw dweud bod rhaid i ni ymdrechu i gynnwys llais busnesau lleol a dysgu gwersi o fannau eraill. Ond rhaid i ni hefyd gefnu ar hynny lle y bo angen. Model lleol yw'r model ardal gwella busnes, drwy ddiffiniad, wedi'i ffurfio gan anghenion busnesau lleol, ac mae'n rhaid iddo grynhoi'r hyn sydd ei angen mewn ardaloedd penodol yn hytrach na dyblygu arferion gorau yn ddall.

Yn olaf, mae'r siopau un stop wedi chwarae rhan allweddol yn strategaeth Busnes Cymru o gymorth wedi'i deilwra yn rhan o rwydwaith o 11 yng Nghymru. Mae fy swyddfa wedi bod mewn cysylltiad agos â Chanolfan Fenter Beacon yn Nafen, a byddaf yn tynnu sylw'r Gweinidog at bwytiau pellach ynglŷn â'i lwyddiant.

O ran gorllewin Cymru, ymhlith ein sectorau economaidd, mae twristiaeth yn chwarae rhan amlwg. Mae ffigurau twristiaeth yr wythnos diwethaf yn dangos bod Cymru yn mynd yn groes i'r duedd ar i lawr yn y DU ac yn lle hynny'n cyrraedd 10 miliwn o ymwelwyr—cynnydd gwych. Credaf fod cynigion Sir Gaerfryddin a Sir Benfro cystal ag unrhyw ran arall o Gymru. Mae gennych enghreifftiau fel Plas Llanelly, cae ras Ffos Las, Parc Gwledig Pen-bre, Castell Cydweli, Gardd Fotaneg Genedlaethol Cymru ac yn y blaen. Mae'n debyg yn Sir Benfro. Mae'r rhagolygon yn optimistaidd. Fodd bynnag, o ran yr heriau a ddaw yn sgil hyn, mae'n anodd sefydlu economi gydol y flwyddyn. Mae angen i ni benderfynu sut y gallwn eu cefnogi ar wahanol adegau o'r flwyddyn.

O ran trafndiaeth, mae'n ddiddorol gweld datblygiadau metro yn ne-ddwyrain Cymru. Yn amlwg, yn y de-orllewin, cynlluniau'n ymwneud â rhwydwaith bysiau sydd gennym. Gan dderbyn y bydd cynllun trafndiaeth pob dinas-ranbarth yn ymateb i seilwaith ac anghenion lleol, mae gennyf gwestiynau ynglŷn â'r adnoddau sydd ar gael i'r gorllewin mewn cymhariaeth. Ymwelodd y Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes ag awdurdodau lleol yn rhanbarth Manceinion Fwyaf i weld sut y maent yn defnyddio trafndiaeth i integreiddio ardaloedd o fewn y rhanbarth. Roedd ei brif ffocws ar swyddi a thwf, gan ddefnyddio seilwaith fel bloc adeiladu i gefnogi hynny. Gallodd awdurdodau arweiniol gymryd yr awenau a denu arian cyfatebol, model y credaf y gellid ei ddefnyddio fel enghraifft yn y gorllewin. Byddwn yn elwa o drydaneiddio i Abertawe, gan greu angen i symleiddio ac integreiddio amserau teithio ymhellach i'r gorllewin.

Yn y ddadl fer a gefais yr hydref diwethaf, awgrymais y syniad o gerdyn cocos yng ngorllewin Cymru i ddynwared Cerdyn Oyster ar gyfer trafndiaeth Llundain, lle y mae'r Pwyllgor Menter a Busnes yn mynd yfory. Mae hyn hefyd yn ymgorffori'r syniad o system docynnau integredig ar gyfer pobl ifanc a gweithwyr rhan-amser. Dyma ddau grŵp sy'n dibynnu'n helaeth ar drafndiaeth gyhoeddus ac mae'r ddau'n gyfle i agor mynediad at y gweithlu. Gofynnaf i'r Gweinidog am y wybodaeth ddiweddaraf ar y gwaith yma.

I'll end on a separate policy issue, yet one that, arguably has the biggest effect: the impact of welfare and austerity on consumer disposable income. The main support for a local economy is its consumers—fact. Llanelli does pull people in from wider afield, but we are not a city like Cardiff or Swansea that pulls shoppers from a 50-mile radius. We are dependent on local supply chains and a local workforce. In the town centre, the main support continues to stem from loyal customers shopping locally and expanding that consumer profile, so that 'locally' expands further afield.

I do worry about the proposed cuts to the welfare bill at Westminster. A very large proportion of those reliant on welfare are in work, low-to-medium earners. The effect on household budgets and disposable income is sure to trickle down to our high street. Purchasing power fuels businesses, which in turn, creates jobs. It's a natural circle that I wish to see continue. So, as for stimulating the economy in west Wales, outlining issues of policy, local significance, transport, disposable income and strategy, I've shown the complexity of the task at hand. I do very much welcome the initiatives taken by the Minister and the Welsh Government as a whole, appreciating that this is a cross-portfolio issue.

In summary, what I ask today is for the Minister to continue further engaging with Cabinet colleagues to develop an overarching strategy that appreciates the complex nature and wide-ranging scope of economic issues and levers. My main call is for the distinctive needs of the west Wales economy—be that strengths or challenges—to be pushed to the forefront as a regional consideration when forming national policy and strategy. Diolch yn fawr.

Dof i ben ar fater polisi ar wahân, ac eto un y gellid dadlau sy'n cael yr effaith fwyaf: effaith lles a chaledi ar incwm gwario defnyddwyr. Y brif elfen sy'n cynnal yr economi leol yw ei defnyddwyr—ffaith. Mae Llanelli yn denu pobl o ymhellach i fwrdd, ond nid ydym yn ddinas fel Caerdydd neu Abertawe sy'n denu siopwyr o radiws o 50 milltir. Rydym yn dibynnu ar gadwyni cyflenwi lleol a gweithlu lleol. Yng nghanol y dref, daw'r brif gefnogaeth o hyd gan gwsmeriaid ffyddlon sy'n siopa'n lleol ac ehangu'r proffil defnyddwyr hwn, fel bod 'lleol' yn ymestyn ymhellach i fwrdd.

Rwy'n poeni am y toriadau arfaethedig i'r bil lles yn San Steffan. Mae cyfran fawr iawn o'r rhai sy'n ddbynnu ar les yn weithwyr sy'n ennill cyflogau bach i ganolig. Mae'r effaith ar gyllidebau aelwydydd ac incwm gwario yn sicr o ddiferu i lawr i'n stryd fawr. Pŵer prynu sy'n tanio busnesau, a hynny yn ei dro, yn creu swyddi. Mae'n gylch naturiol rwy'n dymuno ei weld yn parhau. Felly, o ran ysgogi'r economi yng ngorllewin Cymru, gan amlinellu materion polisi, arwyddocâd lleol, trafndiaeth, incwm gwario a strategaeth, rwyf wedi dangos cymhlethdod y dasg dan sylw. Rwy'n croesawu'n fawr y mentrau a roddwyd ar waith gan y Gweinidog a Llywodraeth Cymru yn ei chyfanrwydd, gan dderbyn bod hwn yn fater ar draws y portffolios.

I grynhoi, yr hyn rwy'n ei ofyn i heddiw yw i'r Gweinidog barhau i ymgysylltu â chydweithwyr yn y Cabinet i ddatblygu strategaeth drosfwaol sy'n gwerthfawrogi natur gymhleth ac amrywiol materion economaidd a ffactorau eraill. Yr hyn rwy'n galw amdano'n bennaf yw i anghenion unigryw economi gorllewin Cymru—boed yn gryfderau neu'n heriau—gael eu gwthio i'r blaen fel ystyriaeth ranbarthol wrth ffurfio polisi a strategaeth genedlaethol. Diolch yn fawr.

17:02

## Joyce Watson [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

I thank Keith, first of all, for bringing the debate, and secondly, for giving me some time in it. I agree with just about everything that he said, so I'm not going to try—and I wouldn't have the time—to repeat it all. But, it is the case that our urban centres and city regions do have a sort of economic gravitational pull. The challenge for west Wales is, and always will be, to create our own draw for business. Major industries, like the energy sector in Pembrokeshire, do act as an economic anchor.

The Welsh Government and you, Minister, particularly, have done some sterling work to safeguard and promote the industry through the enterprise zone, the Murco taskforce and the Puma deal. One other point that I'd like to raise is that transport links are the circulation system of any economy. Looking ahead, today you agreed the latest local transport plans, Minister; are there any standout schemes in west Wales that you think can deliver an economic shot in the arm to the region?

Diolch i Keith, yn gyntaf oll, am gyflwyno'r ddadl, ac yn ail, am roi rhywfaint o amser i mi ynddi. Rwy'n cytuno â bron bopeth a ddywedodd, felly nid wyf am geisio—ac ni fyddai gennyf yr amser—i'w hailadrodd. Ond mae'n wir fod rhyw fath o dynfa ddisgyrchol economaidd gan ein canolfannau trefol a'n dinas-ranbarthau. Yr her ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru yw creu ein tynfa ein hunain ar gyfer busnes, a dyna fydd yr her bob amser. Mae prif ddiwydiannau, megis y sector ynni yn Sir Benfro, yn gweithredu fel angor economaidd.

Mae Llywodraeth Cymru a chithau'n arbennig, Weinidog, wedi gwneud gwaith rhagorol i ddiogelu a hyrwyddo'r diwydiant drwy'r ardal fenter, tasglu Murco a chytundeb Puma. Un pwynt arall y byddwn yn hoffi ei grybwyll yw mai cysylltiadau trafndiaeth yw system gylchrediad unrhyw economi. Gan edrych i'r dyfodol, heddiw rydych wedi cytuno'r cynlluniau trafndiaeth lleol diweddaraf, Weinidog; a oes unrhyw gynlluniau arbennig yn y gorllewin y credwch y gallant roi hwb economaidd i'r rhanbarth?

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo Video](#)

17:03

**William Powell** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

I'm very grateful to Keith Davies for bringing forward this important debate and also for granting me a minute of his time. Keith has enumerated, in a very wide range of points, the key issues that affect the Llanelli economy as part of the wider west Wales economy, and I think he's made some excellent points on a number of areas.

Rwy'n ddiolchgar iawn i Keith Davies am gyflwyno'r ddadl bwysig hon, a hefyd am roi munud o'i amser i mi. Mae Keith wedi rhestru, mewn ystod eang iawn o bwytiau, y prif faterion sy'n effeithio ar economi Llanelli fel rhan o economi ehangach gorllewin Cymru, ac rwy'n meddwl ei fod wedi gwneud rhai pwyntiau ardderchog ar nifer o feysydd.

I think the concept of a loyalty to local businesses is very, very important and that needs to be enhanced further. I think particularly of traditional long-standing businesses like Jenkins Bakery that has got a really strong profile and has embraced technology and social media to promote that further. I think that needs to be taken further, maybe in the context of a growth zone approach, such as has been very successful with the FYI network in Brecon. That could help to expand that.

Rwy'n meddwl bod y cysyniad o deyrngarwch i fusnesau lleol yn eithriadol o bwysig ac mae angen gwella hynny ymhellach. Rwy'n meddwl yn arbennig am fusnesau hirsefydlog traddodiadol fel Jenkins Bakery sydd â phroffil cryf iawn ac wedi manteisio ar dechnoleg a chyfryngau cymdeithasol i hyrwyddo hynny ymhellach. Credaf fod angen ymestyn hynny, efallai yng nghyd-destun dull ardal dwf, fel a fu'n llwyddiannus iawn gyda'r rhwydwaith FYI yn Aberhonddu. Gallai helpu i ehangu hynny.

One final point that I would like to make is something that I've raised previously in the Chamber and that is the potential for an enhancement scheme covering Llanelli railway station, because that's very much the first experience that many visitors have. I think that that would be greatly enhanced if we could have a joint venture there to enhance that experience for travellers and potential businesspeople in the area.

Mae'r pwynt olaf yr hoffwn ei wneud yn rhywbeth rwyf wedi'i grybwyll o'r blaen yn y Siambr, sef y potensial ar gyfer cynllun gwella sy'n cwmpasu gorsaf reilffordd Llanelli, am mai dyna'r profiad cyntaf y mae llawer o ymwelwyr yn ei gael i raddau helaeth. Rwy'n meddwl y gellid ei wella'n fawr pe galleu gael menter ar y cyd yno i wella'r profiad ar gyfer teithwyr a phobl fusnes a allai ddod i'r ardal.

17:05

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

Galwaf ar Weinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth i ymateb i'r ddadl—Edwina Hart.

I call on the Minister for Economy, Science and Transport to respond to the debate—Edwina Hart.

17:05

**Edwina Hart** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*Gweinidog yr Economi, Gwyddoniaeth a Thrafnidiaeth / The Minister for Economy, Science and Transport*

Thank you, Deputy Presiding Officer. Can I also join in Keith's congratulations to the choir from Llangennech who won the BBC choir of the year? I had the pleasure of hearing them performing in Pontarddulais on Saturday evening, when they urged us all to watch 'Songs of Praise' on the Sunday to see how they were performing. It's certainly wonderful, and perhaps there will be an opportunity to bring the choir here to sing, Deputy Presiding Officer, because I'm sure Members would enjoy their excellent vocal skills.

Diolch, Ddirprwy Lywydd. A gaf fi hefyd ategu llongyfarchiadau Keith i'r côr o Llangennech a enillodd gôr y flwyddyn y BBC? Cefais y pleser o'u clywed yn perfformio ym Mhontarddulais nos Sadwrn, pan gawsom oll ein hannog i wyllo 'Songs of Praise' ar y dydd Sul i weld sut hwyl roeddent yn ei gael. Mae'n sicr yn wych, ac efallai y bydd cyfle i ddod â'r côr yma i ganu, Ddirprwy Lywydd, gan fy mod i'n siŵr y byddai'r Aelodau yn mwynhau eu sgiliau lleisiol ardderchog.

Can I say today has actually been a very important day for west Wales, because there was an innovation summit in west Wales in Swansea today, and it's very important for the region? Sir Terry Matthews and I opened this particular summit at the Liberty, where we made some important announcements, including a BT enterprise broadband testbed, which is very important, that they are bringing to the area, and the branding of Swansea as the city of innovation and the region as being the region of innovation. This is a credit to the board and chairs, but it's also, I have to say, a credit to the four local authorities in that area—Neath Port Talbot, Swansea, Carmarthenshire and Pembrokeshire—in the way that they've worked together to look at what is good for the region as a whole.

A gaf fi ddweud bod heddiw wedi bod yn ddiwrnod pwysig iawn ar gyfer gorllewin Cymru mewn gwirionedd, oherwydd roedd uwchgynhadledd arloesedd yng ngorllewin Cymru yn Abertawe heddiw, ac mae'n bwysig iawn ar gyfer y rhanbarth? Agorodd Syr Terry Matthews a minnau yr uwchgynhadledd arbennig hon yn y Liberty, lle y gwnaethom gyhoeddiadau pwysig, gan gynnwys menter profion band eang BT y maent am ei chyflwyno yn yr ardal, sy'n bwysig iawn, a brandio Abertawe fel dinas arloesedd a'r rhanbarth fel rhanbarth arloesedd. Mae hyn yn glod i'r bwrdd a'r cadeiryddion, ond mae hefyd, rhaid i mi ddweud, yn glod i'r pedwar awdurdod lleol yn yr ardal—Castell-nedd Port Talbot, Abertawe, Sir Gaerfyrddin a Sir Benfro—o ran y ffordd y maent wedi gweithio gyda'i gilydd i edrych ar yr hyn sy'n dda ar gyfer y rhanbarth cyfan.

There are a number of issues that have been raised in this discussion. If I may start off with business rate support, I think we all recognise how important this is. I think it is important that we've extended small business rate relief, capping business rates bills increases at 2 per cent and extending and enhancing the Wales retail relief scheme. Following the devolution of business rates last month, I wanted to ensure we had the right regime in place for Wales, and the recommendations of my business panel are important in that regard. Now, I'll continue to constantly look at what's happening in terms of support in Wales, and my panel has been the one that has really allowed me to develop policy and, of course, formed the basis of any discussions I may have with UK Government about any reviews they might be doing on business rates that, of course, could have an impact in Wales on our particularly porous border.

Also, as well, there has been mention of business improvement districts. Funding was announced in January 2014, and there are places getting money, obviously, in west Wales—there's Llanelli itself. We're expecting ballots in these areas pretty shortly; I think they're going to take place over the summer. There's no doubt that BIDs have been very useful vehicles, when you look at the success, I think, particularly in Swansea.

Thank you for your comments regarding Business Wales in Dafen, because the beacon centre is one of the few locations in Wales where there's multiple agency support co-located in the same building. The centre's become a hub of support, I think, for the Llanelli area with Business Wales. Finance Wales is there, going back to another debate; they're actually out in the world. Coleg Sir Gâr and the local authority are in occupation. In the financial year of 2014-15, the centre has dealt with 1,573 inquiries, covering businesses from across Carmarthenshire. So I think it shows that people know it's there and it's very much open for business.

There's also been reference to the work we need to do further west, I think, in terms of what we've done on the Haven waterway and that enterprise zone. Obviously, the Murco announcement and closure had a devastating effect, but I have to say that we introduced an enterprise zone business rates scheme, which we made available to eligible businesses in the area, and that's made a difference. An SME business interaction group has been established by Chris Davies of Haven Waterway Enterprise Zone. That's outlined a programme of work to support businesses to increase their capacity and capability to win new contracts. So, out of adversity, actually, has come some novel ideas about how you can deal with some of the issues.

Mae nifer o faterion wedi'u crybwyll yn y drafodaeth hon. Os caf ddechrau gyda chymorth ardrethi busnes, rwy'n meddwl ein bod i gyd yn cydnabod pa mor bwysig yw hyn. Credaf ei bod yn bwysig ein bod wedi ymestyn rhyddhad ardrethi i fusnesau bach, capio cynnydd mewn biliau ardrethi busnes ar 2 y cant ac ymestyn a gwella cynllun rhyddhad manwerthu Cymru. Yn dilyn datganoli ardrethi busnes y mis diwethaf, roeddwn am sicrhau bod gennym y drefn gywir ar waith ar gyfer Cymru, ac mae argymhellion fy mhanel busnes yn bwysig yn hynny o beth. Nawr, byddaf yn parhau i edrych yn barhaus ar yr hyn sy'n digwydd o ran cymorth yng Nghymru, wrth gwrs, a fy mhanel yw'r un sydd wedi fy ngalluogi mewn gwirionedd i ddatblygu polisi ac sydd wedi ffurfio sail i unrhyw drafodaethau y gallwn eu cael gyda Llywodraeth y DU ynghylch adolygiadau y gallent fod yn eu cynnal ar ardrethi busnes a allai gael effaith yng Nghymru wrth gwrs, ar ein ffin sydd heb fod yn soled o gwbl.

Hefyd, bu sôn am ardaloedd gwella busnes. Cyhoeddwyd ym mis Ionawr 2014 y byddai cyllid ar gael, ac mae lleoedd yn cael arian, yn amlwg, yng ngorllewin Cymru—Llanelli ei hun er enghraifft. Rydym yn disgwyl pleidleisio yn yr ardaloedd hyn cyn bo hir; rwy'n credu eu bod yn mynd i ddigwydd dros yr haf. Nid oes amheuaeth fod ardaloedd gwella busnes wedi bod yn gyfryngau defnyddiol iawn, pan edrychwch ar y llwyddiant, rwy'n meddwl, yn enwedig yn Abertawe.

Diolch i chi am eich sylwadau ynglŷn â Busnes Cymru yn Nafen, gan fod canolfan Beacon yn un o'r ychydig leoliadau yng Nghymru lle y mae cefnogaeth asiantaethau lluosog wedi'u cydleo'i yn yr un adeilad. Mae'r ganolfan wedi dod yn ganolfan gymorth, rwy'n credu, ar gyfer ardal Llanelli gyda Busnes Cymru. Mae Cyllid Cymru yno, gan fynd yn ôl at ddatl arall; maent allan ar lawr gwlad mewn gwirionedd. Coleg Sir Gâr a'r awdurdod lleol sydd â meddiant ar y lle. Yn y flwyddyn ariannol 2014-15, mae'r ganolfan wedi ymdrin â 1,573 o ymholiadau, sy'n cynnwys busnesau o bob rhan o Sir Gaerfyrddin. Felly rwy'n meddwl ei fod yn dangos bod pobl yn gwybod ei bod yno ac yn bendant ar agor i fusnes.

Cyfeiriwyd hefyd at y gwaith y mae angen ei wneud ymhellach i'r gorllewin, rwy'n meddwl, o ran yr hyn rydym wedi ei wneud ar ddyfrffordd y Daugleddau a'r ardal fenter yno. Yn amlwg, mae cyhoeddiad Murco a chau'r gwaith wedi cael effaith ddinistriol, ond rhaid i mi ddweud ein bod wedi cyflwyno cynllun ardrethi busnes ar gyfer yr ardal fenter, sydd ar gael i fusnesau cymwys yn yr ardal, ac mae hynny wedi gwneud gwahaniaeth. Sefydlwyd grŵp rhyngweithio ar gyfer busnesau bach a chanolig gan Chris Davies o Ardal Fenter Dyfrffordd y Daugleddau. Mae hynny wedi amlinellu rhaglen waith i gynorthwyo busnesau i wella'u gallu i ennill contractau newydd. Felly, o adfyd, daeth syniadau newydd, mewn gwirionedd, ynglŷn â sut y gallwch ymdrin â rhai o'r problemau.

But if I can also, as well—. Keith alluded to the importance of sector activity, particularly tourism, and there have been excellent figures this year in tourism, but, of course, there is a seasonal element to it. We want to make tourism an all-round thing, because, at the end of the day, people want to come, whether there's sunshine or showers, to some of the attractions we have in Wales. But in terms of sector activity, in Llanelli, we've got excellent sector activity in terms of automotives with Gestamp, which has taken a lot of people on and undertaken a lot of work. I secured the creation of 380 new jobs, and it's a tier 1 contractor into a Jaguar Land Rover supplier, which I think is very important.

But one of the key issues in west Wales, and I think, as a west Walian, I can say this, is, actually, transport, because there is an issue about the transport infrastructure. I know people look longingly towards the discussions that are going on regarding the metro. It is important that we understand that transport isn't just about the metro—it's about north Wales, it's about south Wales, it's about west Wales. So, the public transport priorities are to ensure we have a public transport system. Also as well, we need to do road improvements. We've had the improvement from St Clears to Red Roses. We've now got to look at further developments, I think, with the A40.

Also, in terms of trains, I particularly asked them to look at various stops, and have discussions with Arriva Trains Wales, particularly in the summer period, I think, when you've got tourists utilising that as well. I think it's important that we recognise that transport and buses are a really key area. I would love to have the regulation of buses, to see what more we could do if we had the opportunity to give more guidance, as it were, in how we can deal with buses.

Also, another point was made about what goes on in town centres. There was a very interesting report, in fact, that I actually commissioned on the impact of car parking charges. I think that you're quite right, Keith: this is not a straightforward matter at all, in any shape. It's not one size fits all. I think that local authorities need to develop proper strategies, look at the layout of their towns and their retail offerings, where they link, look at the blanket free parking strategy and start to engage with businesses in the town about how, by changing things that might have historically been pedestrianised—. If you have pedestrianisation in another place, do you open it up in another way? Local authorities are responsible for all of that. Can I say, in general terms with west Wales, that I've started to ask Stuart Cole now to do some further work for me about what we can do in the centre of Swansea, in the city region, about looking at some of the transport issues, particularly looking at some of the issues around cycle routes and something different? So, Stuart Cole will be starting a strand of work.

Ond os caf hefyd—. Cyfeiriodd Keith at bwysigrwydd gweithgarwch sector, yn enwedig twristiaeth, a chafwyd ffigurau twristiaeth ardderchog eleni, ond wrth gwrs, mae yna elfen dymhorol iddo. Rydym am wneud twristiaeth yn beth gydol y flwyddyn, oherwydd, yn y pen draw, mae pobl eisiau dod, mewn glaw neu hindda, i rai o'r atyniadau sydd gennym yng Nghymru. Ond o ran gweithgarwch y sector, yn Llanelli, mae gennym weithgarwch sector rhagorol o ran y sector moduro gyda Gestamp, sydd wedi cyflogi llawer o bobl ac wedi gwneud llawer o waith. Rwyf wedi sicrhau bod 380 o swyddi newydd yn cael eu creu, ac mae'n gontractwr haen 1 i gyflenwr Jaguar Land Rover, sy'n bwysig iawn yn fy marn i.

Ond un o'r materion allweddol yn y gorllewin, ac rwy'n meddwl y gallaf ddweud hyn fel un o orllewin Cymru, yw trafndiaeth, oherwydd mae yna broblem gyda'r seilwaith trafndiaeth. Rwy'n gwybod bod pobl yn edrych yn hiraethus tuag at y trafodaethau sy'n digwydd ynglŷn â'r metro. Mae'n bwysig ein bod yn deall nad yw trafndiaeth yn ymwneud yn unig â'r metro—mae'n ymwneud â gogledd Cymru, mae'n ymwneud â de Cymru, mae'n ymwneud â gorllewin Cymru. Felly, y blaenoriaethau o ran trafndiaeth gyhoeddus yw sicrhau bod gennym system drafndiaeth gyhoeddus. Hefyd, mae angen i ni gyflawni gwelliannau ffyrdd. Rydym wedi cael y gwelliant o Sancêr i Ros-goch. Nawr, mae'n rhaid i ni edrych ar ddatblygiadau pellach, rwy'n credu, gyda'r A40.

Hefyd, o ran trenau, gofynnais yn benodol iddynt edrych ar wahanol arosfannau, a chael trafodaethau gyda Trenau Arriva Cymru, yn enwedig yn yr haf, rwy'n credu, pan fydd gennych dwristiaid yn eu defnyddio hefyd. Rwy'n credu ei bod yn bwysig i ni gydnabod bod trafndiaeth a bysiau yn faes gwirioneddol allweddol. Byddwn wrth fy modd yn gweld y bysiau'n cael eu rheoleiddio er mwyn gweld beth arall y gallem ei wneud pe baem yn cael cyfle i roi mwy o arweiniad, fel petai, o ran sut y gallwn fynd i'r afael â bysiau.

Hefyd, gwnaed pwynt arall am yr hyn sy'n digwydd yng nghanol trefi. Cafwyd adroddiad diddorol iawn, a gomisiynwyd gennyf, a dweud y gwir, ar effaith taliadau parcio. Rwy'n meddwl eich bod yn llygad eich lle, Keith: nid yw hwn yn fater syml o gwbl, mewn unrhyw ffordd. Nid oes un ateb sy'n gweddu i bawb. Rwy'n credu bod angen i awdurdodau lleol ddatblygu strategaethau priodol, ac edrych ar gynllun eu trefi a'u cynigion manwerthu, lle y maent yn cysylltu â'i gilydd, edrych ar strategaeth parcio am ddim cyffredinol a dechrau ymgysylltu â busnesau yn y dref ynglŷn â sut, drwy newid parthau a allai fod wedi eu creu yn hanesyddol ar gyfer cerddwyr—. Os ydych chi wedi creu parth cerddwyr mewn man arall, a ydych yn ei agor mewn ffordd arall? Awdurdodau lleol sy'n gyfrifol am hynny i gyd. A gaf fi ddweud, yn gyffredinol yng ngorllewin Cymru, rwyf wedi dechrau gofyn i Stuart Cole wneud rhywfaint o waith pellach i mi yn awr ynghylch yr hyn y gallwn ei wneud yng nghanol Abertawe, yn y ddinas-ranbarth, o ran edrych ar rai o'r materion trafndiaeth, yn arbennig rhai o'r materion sy'n ymwneud â llwybrau beicio a rhywbeth gwahanol? Felly, bydd Stuart Cole yn dechrau ar un elfen o'r gwaith.

I think that the regeneration Vibrant and Viable Places programme has helped in places in terms of generating interest. What we are talking about in terms of west Wales is to get a clear focus into what we want to do between all of the organisations that have a role and function. I believe that the city region board, in the way that they're branding the region, has significant further work to do but has had a very good start. I think that the level of co-operation that is happening with that board, with the local authorities, HE and FE and, of course, Government, will be invaluable in the future. When you look at these boards, businesspeople on them turn in day in, day out to help and give their assistance. I think that's the way to develop the economy within west Wales. So, thank you very much.

Rwy'n meddwl bod y rhaglen adfywio Lleoedd Llewyrchus Llawn Addewid wedi helpu mewn mannau o ran creu diddordeb. Yr hyn rydym yn sôn amdano o ran gorllewin Cymru yw cael ffocws clir ar beth rydym am ei wneud rhwng yr holl sefydliadau sydd â rôl a swyddogaeth. Rwy'n credu bod cryn dipyn o waith pellach gan fwrdd y ddinas-ranbarth i'w wneud o ran y ffordd y maent yn brandio'r rhanbarth, ond mae wedi cael dechrau da iawn. Credaf y bydd y lefel o gydweithio sy'n digwydd gyda'r bwrdd hwnnw, gyda'r awdurdodau lleol, Addysg Uwch ac Addysg Bellach ac wrth gwrs, y Llywodraeth, yn amhrisiadwy yn y dyfodol. Pan edrychwch ar y byrddau hyn, mae pobl fusnes arnynt yn dod i mewn ddydd ar ôl dydd i helpu a rhoi eu cymorth. Rwy'n credu mai dyna'r ffordd i ddatblygu'r economi yng ngorllewin Cymru. Felly, diolch yn fawr iawn.

17:12

**Y Dirprwy Lywydd / The Deputy Presiding Officer** [Bywgraffiad](#) [Biography](#)

Diolch yn fawr. Daw hynny â thrafodion heddiw i ben.

Thank you very much. That brings today's proceedings to a close.

Senedd.tv  
[Fideo](#) [Video](#)

*Daeth y cyfarfod i ben am 17:12.*

*The meeting ended at 17:12.*